

**DECIPHERING THE MILLENNIAL GENERATION: HOW THEY PERCEIVE  
HR PRACTICES IN PUBLIC BANK OF PAKISTAN**



**SAMEEN SOHAIL  
MSHRM 2K17**

**DR ZUNAIRA SAQIB**

A thesis submitted to NUST Business School for the degree of Master of Science in Human  
Resource Management

**2020**

## THESIS ACCEPTANCE CERTIFICATE

It is Certified that final copy of MSHRM thesis written by **Ms Sameen Sohail** Registration **No. 206939** of **MS HRM** has been vetted by undersigned, found complete in all aspects as per NUST Statutes/Regulations/MS Policy, is free of plagiarism, errors, and mistakes and is accepted as fulfilment for award of MS degree. It is further certified that necessary amendments as pointed out by GEC members and foreign/local evaluators of the scholar have also been incorporated in the said thesis.

Signature of Supervisor with stamp: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Programme Head Signature with stamp: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of HoD with stamp: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

### Countersign by

Signature (Dean/Principal): \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

## **DECLARATION**

I hereby state that no portion of the work referred to in this dissertation has been submitted in support of an application for another degree or qualification of this or any other University or other institute of learning.

Name: Sameen Sohail

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Date:

## Table of Contents

ABSTRACT.....	1
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	2
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .....	3
1.1 Rationale of the study .....	3
DISSERTATION STRUCTURE.....	4
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW .....	5
2.1 ORIGIN OF GENERATIONS.....	5
2.2 GENERATIONAL IDENTITY.....	6
2.3 GENERATIONAL DIVERSITY CURRENTLY IN THE WORKPLACE.....	8
<i>Baby boomers</i> .....	8
<i>Gen X</i> .....	9
<i>Millennials</i> .....	9
Table 2: Common Characteristics of Three Generations of Employees in Comparison .....	11
2.4 DISTINCT MILLENNIAL GENERATION IN THE WORKPLACE .....	12
2.5 HR PRACTICES .....	13
2.5.1 Compensation .....	14
2.5.2 Recruitment.....	15
2.5.3 Training and development .....	15
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .....	17
3.1 RESEARCH GAPS, OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS .....	17
3.1.2 RESEARCH GAP IDENTIFICATION.....	17
3.1.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES .....	19
3.1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	19
3.2 PHILOSOPHICAL STANCE AND THEORETICAL FOUNDATION.....	20
3.2.1 THEORY AS GUIDING EXPLANATION .....	20
3.2.2 ONTOLOGICAL CONSIDERATION.....	20
3.2.3 EPISTEMOLOGICAL CONSIDERATION .....	21
3.3 RESEARCH METHODS.....	23
3.4 SAMPLING PROCEDURE FOR QUALITATIVE RESEARCH.....	25
3.4.1 Sampling strategy.....	25
3.4.2 Selection of the Participating Company.....	26

3.4.3 Selection of Interviewees .....	27
3.4.4 Sample size and saturation .....	28
3.4.5 Sample Summary .....	28
3.4.6 Data analysis .....	29
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS .....	31
4.1 PERCEPTION OF MILLENNIAL GENERATION IN THE WORKPLACE: .....	32
The first theme that emerged was the perception of millennial generation in the workplace.....	32
4.1.2 Difference in Personality and Behaviors .....	33
4.1.3 Millennials Need for Guidance .....	34
4.1.4 Conflicts between Generations .....	35
4.2 HR PRACTICE OF RECRUITMENT .....	38
4.2.1 Millennials On-line job search.....	38
4.2.2 Recruitment Process at Pakistan Bank.....	39
4.2.3 MTO Recruitment at Pakistan Bank .....	40
4.3 HR PRACTICE OF COMPENSATION .....	42
4.3.1 Compensation in banking sector .....	42
4.3.2 Satisfaction of millennials with their salaries at Pakistan Bank .....	43
4.3.3 Compensation According to Education .....	44
4.3.4 Perks and benefits at Pakistan Bank .....	45
4.3.5 Salary Vs Benefits & Perks.....	45
4.3.6 Compensation: Reason for millennial job hopping?.....	46
4.4 HR PRACTICE OF TRAINING: .....	47
4.4.1 Trainings at Pakistan Bank .....	48
4.4.2 Millennials response to training.....	49
4.4.3 Digital Vs Instructor Led Trainings .....	50
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION .....	52
5.1 PERCEPTION OF MILLENNIALS IN THE WORKPLACE.....	52
5.1.1 Millennials technology dependence.....	53
5.1.2 Co-existing generations .....	53
5.2 HR PRACTICES IN PUBLIC BANKS OF PAKISTAN.....	54
5.2.1 RECRUITMENT .....	55
a) Actively Job Searching Youth .....	56

b) Pakistan’s demographic Digital divide .....	57
c) Generation Based Digital Divide .....	57
5.2.2 TRAININGS .....	58
a) Cost Consciousness.....	59
b) Two Distinct Generations .....	59
c) Lack of Open Communication.....	60
5.2.3 COMPENSATION .....	60
a) Public sector bank .....	61
b) Job security .....	61
c) Long term benefits .....	61
d) Influx of fresh graduates .....	62
5.3 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS.....	62
5.4 LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE RESEARCH DIRECTIONS .....	64
CONCLUSION.....	65
REFERENCES .....	66
APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW GUIDE: MILLENNIALS .....	76
RECRUITMENT.....	77
COMPENSATION .....	77
TRAINING .....	78
APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW GUIDE HR MANAGERS.....	80
RECRUITMENT.....	80
COMPENSATION .....	81
TRAINING .....	81
APPENDIX C: GENERATION X INTERVIEW GUIDE.....	83
RECRUITMENT.....	83
COMPENSATION .....	84
TRAINING .....	85

## ABSTRACT

Managing people in the workplace has always been tricky and complex. With the emergence of new generation with different beliefs, values and attitudes, managing human capital has become more complicated. Generational research has been able to get a lot of attention as multiple generations are working side by side for the first time however it is unclear how these different generations interact with each other and how it effects the workplace. Therefore, aim of this research is to present the current literature on generational research and to identify challenges faced by millennials in Pakistan, to see whether HR practices in public bank are designed keeping in mind this generation. For this purpose, qualitative single case study research is carried out by conducting 13 semi structured interviews from millennials, generation X and HR managers. These interviews were recorded, transcribed and analyzed after getting permission from the participants. By focusing on multiple perspectives in the workplace, this study adds to the body of literature by diversifying the range of perspectives available. The number of millennial workers will be on the rise in the coming years hence this study will help organizations and managers to understand millennials and design HR practices keeping in mind the generations preferences so that millennials can be satisfied and retained in the organization. The study concluded that public bank in Pakistan has been unable to design HR practices according to millennial perceptions whereas organizations worldwide are rapidly changing to indulge this generation. It then discusses the reasons as to why this is happening and why millennials keep working for these banks in Pakistan's context.

*Keywords:* millennials, generation X, HR practices, recruitment, training, compensation

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I started my Masters with fears in my mind about research as I never had the experience of doing it in bachelors however doing it at NUST was a good decision. I was able to make great friends, find amazing teachers and had the privilege to study in this university. Gladly, I chose Dr Zunaira Saquib as my research supervisor and it turned out to be the perfect decision. She was always there to help, through her emails, in her office and even through her phone. It was due to her that I was able to understand truly what research is about and how it is done.

I would like to thank Mama and Papa, who were always there to support me in difficult times and urged me to start Masters. Thankyou both for giving me the strength to chase my dreams and be where I am today, for it would have been impossible without your constant guidance and hard work on me since I was born. As I started my thesis by support from my family, it wouldn't be wrong to say I finished it due to my Husband. After getting married and having a daughter I would sometimes become unsure if I will be able to complete my degree however due to his trust in me and my potential, I did not give up and completed the journey I started three years ago. Last but not the least, I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to the employees who gave me interviews for this research as without their willingness to share data this thesis could not have completed.



## **CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

Business organizations of today are constantly evolving and ready to face challenges however today they are faced with unavoidable changes due to drastic technological changes, social and economic issues (Mariasavery and Rajmohan, 2020). Therefore, to be successful, organizations need to have clear insights about their workforce; starting from top leadership to lowest employee levels. Understanding similarities and differences between generations acts as a good starting point to understand the needs and wants of the diverse employees (Smith and Garriety, 2020). The workplace of today consists of four generations namely baby boomers, generation X, millennials and newly entering generation Z (Hamilton, 2020). Defining generations and exploring differences between them has gained much attention in both political and economic world.

In the context of economic world, there has been a generational shift where the new digital natives have stepped inside the workplace (Yap and Badri, 2020). Hence in order to be successful organizations today need to know how to handle different generations of varying beliefs, values, attitudes and lifestyles (Calk & Patrick, 2017). As millennials have become the biggest generational cohort and have eclipsed even the baby boomer generation, it has become sufficiently prime to study this group (Taylor, 2018). This generation is different from its predecessor generation in various ways as they always had access to technology and said to be realistic and value diversity, autonomy, teamwork and consciousness (Hamilton, 2020). Research claims that millennials are quick at job hopping and organizations face difficulty in retaining them hence this generation exerts pressure on organizations to radically change how they function (Pyoria et al., 2017). One of the biggest challenges for HR remains to actively engage the workforce and this problem has increased with the entrance of millennial generation in the workplace hence organizations are facing difficulty to engage this generation (Jha et al., 2018).

### **1.1 Rationale of the study**

The rationale of this study is to study the millennials in an emerging economy namely Pakistan. This will help address the contextual gap by studying millennial in a developing country to see if the concepts that hold true for western countries hold true in other regional contexts as well. There has been a percentage increase in growth of developing countries in Asia specifically, which is expected to stabilize at 6.5% and is one of the fastest growing regions across the world (see Pakistan's economic survey, 2018-2019). As this generation entered the workforce, they gave a

which were considered appropriate for previous generations but do not align with millennials preferences (Heizman, 2019). The goal of this study is to look at the human resource practices in Pakistan to see if they suit millennials or not. Therefore, keeping the contextual gap in mind and to study one country out of Asian regions as pleaded by Gallardo-Gallardo (2016) and furthermore being a citizen, Pakistan is selected to study the millennials in its context. The findings of this study will also provide a more in depth understanding of millennials on how to make them productive and how interactions with this young generation can be made positive by helping them assimilate in the work environment by understanding what HR practices attract them.

## DISSERTATION STRUCTURE

Chapter 2: Literature review	Chapter 2 discusses the literature review structure which aims to highlight previous scholars work in the field of generations in the workplace followed by gaps in research and Research questions
Chapter 3: Research methodology	Discusses the research methodology, epistemology, ontology followed by data collection process
Chapter 4: Findings and analysis	Discusses findings of the research and analysis of data collected from the organization
Chapter 5: Discussion and conclusion	Chapter 5 covers the discussion, research contributions, limitations and conclusion

**Table 1: Dissertation structure for current study**

## **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW**

The literature review chapter revolves around describing the concept of generations and then generational identity followed with the different generations that are currently present in the organization with focus on millennial generation. The focus of this chapter is threefold, first discussing the detailed extant literature present on generations to understand what is already been researched upon. Secondly, to focus on what is happening in the developing body of generational literature and third to synthesize the findings and formulating research questions that will guide the dissertation.

### **2.1 ORIGIN OF GENERATIONS**

Statistician Adolph Quetelet, in 1835, gave the concept of taking birth years into account when studying human development (Tremblay and Cote, 2019). Many commentators seem to be unaware of the heritage of generations however generational differences have their origins back in 1950's. Mannheim (1952,1997) concluded that the term generation has two important elements. First is the common location in historical time and the second is the consciousness of that historical position or your “mentelite”, that is shaped by the experiences and the events during that time. Both factors, location and consciousness, must exist for a generation to function.

Jones et al (2008) stated that the “location” factor of generation by Mannheim can be better explained by the concept of cohorts. Cohort has been defined by Ryder (1985) as the individuals who experience same events within the same time interval and the typical defining event has been their birth. It has certain values and priorities that persist throughout the life of the individual and these are unique to that cohort (Jackson et al., 2011). Individuals in a cohort pass through some important crucial stages at the same time such as marriage or first employment and especially birth (Carlsson and Karlsson, 1970). By using cohorts, it is easy to distinguish, for example people born from 1911- 1915 cohort can be differentiated from 1916 – 1920 (ibid, 1970). This concept of cohorts can also be credited to Mannheim (1970) who explained that social change occurs through a succession of cohorts in many ways. First via the emergence of new individuals in the cultural process, second by the withdrawal of previous individuals in the cultural process and third that individuals belonging to one cohort (generation) can participate in a limited number of historical process.

Previously in literature the word “cohort” and “generation” were used interchangeably but the modern sense of generation only developed after the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century and was used to study the distinctive kinds of people and attitudes (Williams, 1983). Harrison white (1992, p. 31) stated that ‘cohorts only become [social] actors when they cohere enough around events...to be called generations.’ He further added that generation can be explained as a cohort’s “consciousness of itself” and this consciousness revolves around how it is different from other cohorts. This “consciousness”, according to Ryder (1965), is due to socialization which starts when an individual is born and the agents of socialization such as; rules, schools and families, equip him with society. The newcomers in turn start to react to these socialization agents leading to shared experiences with other individuals. This phenomenon contributes towards unique characteristics (personality, attitudes and values) in individuals that differentiate one generation from another and drive societal change (ibid, 1965). Family has been regarded as the primary agent of socialization (Hyman, 1959) and generations together with socialization are the fundamental elements in explaining the changes that occur in values over time (Fuks et al., 2018).

There are varying opinions about specific birth years of generations which causes difficulty in understanding but to remain consistent with majority of the literature on generations (Zemke et al., 2000, Hansen and Leuty, 2012, Bencsik et al., 2016, Lancaster and Stillman, 2002) following birth years are adopted for this study: Baby Boomers are born between 1945 and 1964; Generation X are born between 1965 and 1980 while millennial generation is comprised of individuals born after 1980 (Lancaster and Stillman, 2002, Bencsik et al., 2016). Although there is disagreement over birth years, there is agreement about the attributes that each generation possesses (Hansen and Leuty, 2012). This study will be discussing the baby boomers, X and millennial generation, focusing on Millennials.

## **2.2 GENERATIONAL IDENTITY**

Many publications have focused on issues of generations in the workforce and lot of research questions the existence of generational differences. One issue being that older employees instead of retiring continue to work and when younger members join the organization they have to communicate and function together although they have different motivations and expectations. These differences are said to occur due to generational identity (Huynh et al., 2018).

Generational identity is defined as an individual's awareness of his or her membership in a generational group and the significance of this group to the individual (Ashforth et al., 2008, Joshi et al., 2010). The term "generational differences" has become a topic of interest so much so that it has become a buzzword in today's organizations (Lyons et al., 2015). Finkelstein et al. (2001) stated that in addition to knowledge one has about belonging to a group (cognitive awareness) and emotional investment with the group, the concept of generational identity involves perceived importance or value in group membership. According to Urick (2017) there are multiple generations coexisting in organizations and although there are many ways to conceptualize generations, generational identity in a certain context is likely to have enormous and distinguishable effects on the behavior and attitude of the person.

Generational identity has been explained using "social identity theory" (Davis, Love & Faris, 2019) in which researchers have become immensely interested in how individuals associate themselves with social groups. The theories of social identity, that are the underlying basis of the concept of social identity, state that people classify themselves to impose order in the social environment and to make sense of who they are, hence they begin to identify with a particular social group and perceive a sense of oneness with them. This is done by invoking social categories to explain people's attitudes and beliefs (Hogg, 2016). Huynh et al., (2018) explained that individuals can categorize themselves with a professional group, a fan base or even to a group with or without children.

For generating a social identity age is an important factor (Yeo, 2019) and values tend to be very similar within members of a generations by using the age-based perspective, labeled as generation X, baby boomers and millennials (Urick, 2012). For example, it is perceived that members of generation X give more value to extrinsic rewards when compared to other generation and those social and other intrinsic values are much less important for millennial generation (Twenge et al., 2010). Giles and Turner (1981) state that social identity theory assumes that individual's self-concept exists because of his knowledge as being part of the group as when an individual defines himself as being part of the generation which he considers himself a member of. Individuals who are members of a certain group define themselves in terms of their group membership and social identity theory explains this phenomenon. Therefore, individuals classify themselves with a

particular cohort, age group or a particular role because they perceive oneness with them (Hogg, 2016).

The second theory supporting generational identity is “Self-categorization”, which is the process of identifying oneself and others as members of a reference group and then using that group to judge attitudes, beliefs and values (Beauchamp, 2019). Consequently along categorization, individuals also evaluate the groups that they feel they belong to (In groups) and groups they do not feel they belong to (out groups). Lyons et al. (2014) viewed generations as a source for creating identity for individuals to examine the degree to which people have the same generational memories, norms and values. A relationship exists between Identification and in group favoritism and when the in group feels threatened by out group, the relationship between identification and favoritism is said to be strong. Rossem (2019) discussed that there is a need for deeper understanding of generational identity as it has implications for several workplace phenomenon such as organizational diversity, team building and knowledge transfer etc.

### **2.3 GENERATIONAL DIVERSITY CURRENTLY IN THE WORKPLACE**

Generational diversity has gained widespread attention in the workplace and is termed as an “Ongoing organizational phenomenon” (Tsoukas and Chia, 2002, Herzig and Treffler, 2018). When norms, behaviors and values of one cohort are challenged or defied by another cohort, clashes occur because of this Phenomenon. Many mainstream publications have focused on differences and stereotypes associated with different generations. As the interest in this topic of generational differences is arising, it is important that these issues be studied more rigorously.

There are currently three generations in the workplace Baby Boomers, generation X and generation Y (Millennials).

*Baby boomers* are born between the years 1945 to 1964 (Bencsik et al., 2016) and are currently between the ages of 58 to 75. They tend to typically be more diligent at their job and prefer to work in stable environments (Loomis, 2000). Baby boomers are hardworking, loyal to their employers, like working in groups and accept a chain of command. They expect their managers to give them a sense of direction and lead them towards the goals however they are not tech savvy and do not like change (Raths, 1999). White (2011) describes them as being optimistic and dedicated and

having the ability to add great knowledge and experience in the workplace. Baby boomers span over a long period hence the experiences within this generation differ as well, the baby boomers of the first wave grew up in peace time and liberalization of civil rights. When they became adults, consumerism was wide spread and was supported by welfare state, later they also experienced the socio economic changes of 1970s (Venter, 2017). According to Van Solinge and Henkens (2018) baby boomers have reached retirement age and data reveals that for many workers of this generation, retirement is seen as a period of rest and relaxation although many see it as a phase that would give them opportunity to explore new avenues. It was also noted that members with a stronger identification with the 60's culture in their youth had a more relaxed views about retirement (ibid,2018). According to AARP in 2016, everyday 10,000 baby boomers are turning 65 and are retiring every day from the workplace and this is expected to continue till 2030's. It was noted by Byles et al. (2013) that baby boomers are not only seeking work life balance and self fulfilment but also want to remain engaged in the workplace even after retiring either through part time or full time employment

*Gen X* are born between the year 1965 to 1980 comprising 65 million people (Beutal & Berman, 2008) and makes up 31% of the total US income and 35% of the population (Johns, 2017). In contrast to Baby boomers Xers are loyal to their profession rather than their employer and prefer autonomy and flexibility in their lives, hence have less need for leadership (Yu and Miller, 2005). Gibson et al. (2009) explain that this generation generally tech savvy and like updating knowledge and applications in their jobs. (Singh and Shukla, 2016) claim that they are more mobile at their jobs and are likely to move from one job to another, in order to improve career prospects. For them, job satisfaction ranks higher than promotions as they believe their life outside work including their family, leisure and lifestyle is as important as their jobs. Levin (2000) suggests that money and recognition is more enticing to Baby boomers however Xers do want pats on their back for their work and like to do things that would lead them to rewards.

*Millennials* also known as Generation Y, are individuals born between the years 1980 to 1994 and are between 24 to 38 years old in year 2018 (Pew Research Center, 2010; Zemke et al., 2000 cited by Bencsik et al. (2016). They are also named as MySpace generation, Nexters, Internet Generation and "Great Generation" (Silva et al., 2020). In this paper they will be referred to as "Millennials". They are characterized as being extroverts, detail oriented, thinkers, self-confident, narcissists,

self-expressive and are more highly educated than their predecessors (Pew Research Center, 2010; PR Newswire US, 2017).

Similarly, Silva et al., (2020) claim that millennials are goal oriented, very confident and empowered because of the parenting style they were raised in. This has been credited to their use of technology, which is the biggest factor differentiating them from older generations. They use cell phones and social media excessively, that always helps them staying connected. Millennials, because of their impatience and speed can sometimes cause a threat to their own safety, for example using cell phones while driving (Calk and Patrick, 2017). They are 32% more likely to use their cell phones and 45% more likely that they have a social networking site, when compared to baby boomers (Pew Research Center, 2017). They have blurred the line between their professional and personal lives and say that being connected and having access to personal technology makes them more motivated and effective at work (PWC, 2011). This generation is comfortable with technology and digitalization, as they use social media platforms a lot and are “mobile and app-natives” (Loveland, 2017).

Millennials have also been considered as a point of contention, an article was published in the Times Magazine titled “Millennials: the ME ME ME generation” by (Stein, 2013). He labeled millennials as self-entitled, cocky, highly demanding and having no respect for authority and claimed that narcissist personality disorder is nearly three times higher for people in their 20’s compared to people 65 or older. However, Stein believed that because of these negative reasons millennials will be a driving force for positive change in the organizations. As they have no respect for authority, they won’t resent it. Similarly, since they are always using technology, millennial will know how to use it to their benefit and the benefit of their organization (ibid, 2013). Yap and Bradari (2020) also believed that Millennials approach towards the world is a smart one as they find new and better ways of doing things. Although some might say millennials are not suited for today’s workplace , it is believed that they are prepared for tomorrow’s as they are better equipped for a workplace that rapidly changes , more complexed and more digitally challenging (Gregg, 2017). Therefore, in this era of war for talent organizations should be looking at ways to attract, engage and retain this generation (Hamilton, 2020)

In a report published by PricewaterhouseCoopers (2011) it was discussed that the economic crisis caused a decrease in loyalty of millennials towards their employers and about 25% of young



millennials feel that they will change over 6 jobs in their lifetime. This suggests that this generation's views about changing jobs are more relaxed. Hence, it becomes important to study how to attract and more importantly retain this difficult and different generation and bring them into the spotlight (Kaur et al., 2018). This can only be done by first understanding how millennials see HR practices differently, only after knowing this can we work towards attracting and retaining them, after we have adapted the HR practices according to their needs.

Table 2: Common Characteristics of Three Generations of Employees in Comparison

	<u>Baby Boomers</u>	<u>Gen X</u>	<u>Millennials</u>
<u>Birth years</u>	1945-1964	1965 - 1980	1980 - 1994
<u>Social influences</u>	Political and economic instability	New era of computer usage	Era of social networking and common internet usage
<u>Work attitudes</u>	Dedicated Loyal Diligent Self-motivated Rarely job hop Value job security	Materialistic Skeptic Idealistic Pro work life balance May job hop Value recognition	Creative Fun loving Pro diversity Liberal Casual Team players Mobile Adaptable to new technology
<u>Philosophy</u>	Proactive workaholics	Reactive Work to live	Impulsive First live, then Work

Adapted from Zemke et al. (2000), Dries et al., (2008) and Clark (2017)

## 2.4 DISTINCT MILLENNIAL GENERATION IN THE WORKPLACE

HR professionals will face challenges in the coming years as many employees will retire and be replaced. This will require HRM functions to be designed in a way that helps to attract and retain the young millennial generation (Kultalahti and Viitala, 2015). By all definitions, millennials are different from their previous generations and have redefined the meaning of success, work and leisure. Therefore, business leaders are realizing their unique competencies and capabilities and employers are looking for ways in which they can utilize their strengths (Brack et al., 2018).

Research has been done on the previous generations in order to understand their workplace behaviors, motivations and cognitive abilities however organizations now want to make use of this generation and want to adapt themselves better to the needs of millennials (Hershatler and Epstein, 2010, Deloitte, 2017, Barreto, 2018). Follmer et al. (2018) claimed that this generation is the hardest generation to retain in the workplace and have significantly higher turnover intentions but despite all the positives there is a high volatility rate within millennials that effects company negatively in the form of increased costs. Hence successful engagement and retention of this generation would result in improved productivity, advanced innovation and adaptation of new technologies (Stein, 2013). The millennials entering the workplace will drastically change the way business is carried out in the future hence HR policies and practices should be designed to attract and retain this generation and must change to reflect millennials work and life expectations (Thompson et al., 2018).

When compared, Baby boomers and millennials are the most opposite generations working in the workplace. Baby boomers have been working all their lives and are about to retire from the workplace whereas millennials are the generation who have currently entered the workplace and have shifting values from their preceding generation (Herzig and Treffler, 2018). It has been accredited to culture, upbringing and other forces acting on an individual's life and shaping their skill set (Weber, 2017). Now, as millennials have surpassed baby boomers, they are the largest cohort in the world and it has become very important to study them because they have massive potential and are ready to be engaged in the workplace (Fry, 2016). Investing in this generation would be a wise step as it would make the work of future leaders and HR managers easy (Robertson, 2017).

Literature suggests that generational differences impact all areas of management including training and development, recruitment, career development and rewards and leaders need to be aware of the values and perceptions of different generations and adapt the management practices accordingly (Treffler and Herzig, 2018). If not managed timely, poor communication, tension, distrust and misunderstanding are the outcomes of these inter-generational conflicts and effect organizational outcomes (Urlick, Hollensbe & Fairhurst, 2017). According to Lee et al., (2019) nearly 46% of young adults claimed that they lacked the desired education and training for their jobs and despite their compensation packages and workplace offerings, there's difficulty retaining this young generation. Hence after thoroughly reviewing the literature and confirming that millennials are indeed different, following three HR practices will be the basis of this research paper; Compensation, recruitment and Training and development. These three HR practices have been asked to be researched on by (Sakdiyakorn & Wattanacharoensil 2017, Urick 2017, Dalessandro, 2018)

## **2.5 HR PRACTICES**

Research has supported that well designed HR practices result in favorable organizational performance. Although all researchers believe that good HR practices have an effect on employee attitudes and behaviors but it has been noted that this casual chain is much more complex than previously thought (Nishii et al., 2008). It has been noted that employee's perceptions about HR practices precede their attitudes and behaviors, which means that in order for these practices to have desired effect on employees, they should first be perceived by employees in a way that affects their behavior (Follmer et al., 2018).

HR practices can be thought of as signaling and communication mechanisms that are sent by employers to employees, which are then understood and interpreted by employees (Kundu and Gahlawat, 2018). According to Boehm et al. (2014) having HR practices that are adjusted to an age diverse workforce will be beneficial as in many organizations, 3 to 4 generations will work together and therefore having joint engagement of all these generations will be a success factor for organizations. It is suggested that there is a big generational divide at workplace and millennials are at the center of it (Folmer et al., 2018).

Previous literature suggests that when there are different generations in a workplace, the requirements for all aspects of people management such as recruitment, training and development,

career development, rewards and recognition and management style change (Parry & Urwin, 2011). According to Follmer et al. (2018) exploring the extent to which managerial and HR practices have changed overtime to meet the needs of generation at work would be a useful line of inquiry. Hence data will also be collected, not only from millennials but also from managers and generation X to understand their perception about how millennials perceive HR practices of recruitment, compensation and training.

### **2.5.1 Compensation**

It is evident from daily life that compensation is an important part of people's lives. We can find many stories on the newspaper regarding issues and benefits associated with pay and compensation – an extreme example being people motivated to lose weight by giving them financial benefits (Kullgren et al., 2013). From organizations perspective, compensation not only affects employee's behaviors but also attitudes and unless a compensation system is done right, other organization policies and practices will not be able to get the desired results (Shaw and Gupta, 2015).

According to Feren et al., (1980) money is in fact the most crucial incentive and no other incentive and motivational technique comes closer to this incentive but as millennials have entered the workplace, practitioners are noticing that millennials have different values, motivations and make different decisions when it comes to their jobs (Lyons et al., 2014). It is believed that providing a pay slightly above the industry average is an excellent way of attracting this generation plus as many millennials believe that they would not be seeing pension and social retirement so providing a 401(K) eligibility can also help attract them (Brack and Kelly, 2012). (Campione, 2015) on the other hand claims that paying high (promotion with pay rises or emphasis on pay rises) can be used to attract millennials initially but this factor alone would not be enough to keep them

After millennials have reached a certain compensation level, they are less likely to be motivated by increases in their salary. Hence it becomes important to identify that specific threshold so companies can have a better insight of how and when to use monetary compensation and how to better retain these employees. Sakdiyakom & Wattanacharoensil (2017) suggested that research could investigate about whether this threshold actually exists and could identify whether this threshold is subjective employee to employee or not. According to Costa (2018) companies can then use this information to structure their payment and promotion strategies that would help

understand millennial expectations and would help to better retain these employees. As millennials are the agents of change, the workplace must change.

### **2.5.2 Recruitment**

One of the most pressing challenges for today's workplace is the recruitment and motivation of the generation whose individuals are digital natives. Multiple pressures are on today's business environment in the form of cost pressures, aging population, digitalization and changing perceptions towards HR practices (Pinzaru et al., 2017).

As discussed above, millennials have grown in the era of rapid proliferation of digitalization (Myers and Sadaghiani, 2010) so digital technology like laptops, mobile phones and smart phones etc have become a central part of their social world and workplace (Gibson and Sodeman, 2014). A large number of millennial workers who use digital technologies would be difficult to be reached without it. Millennials look for jobs online and they are much less likely to stop and view advertisements in newspapers and community boards (ibid, 2014). Recruitment for millennials should be in line with their expectations and characteristics in order to attract them and those elements that are used to attract millennials should then be used to retain them (Calloway, 2018). There has been less research on how digital technologies maybe important for recruitment of participants belonging to millennial generation, hence future research should use digitally mediated recruitment methods for this purpose (Dalessandro, 2018). He argued that despite his research, much work is needed to confirm that millennials do instead pay more attention to electronic advertisements compared to physical advertisement when looking for jobs.

### **2.5.3 Training and development**

Goldstein and Ford (2002) state that training is a systematic approach to learning and development in order to improve effectiveness of an individual, group or an organization whereas development is the activity which leads to acquisition of skills and knowledge, that would help in personal growth of the individual. In order to remain competitive in the fast-paced environment, organizations make sure their individuals are always learning new skills and knowledge and in this matter T&D activities help by allowing organizations to adapt, excel and to reach desired goals (Salas et al., 2012). Therefore, employees must continuously learn and develop job related and other generalizable skills in order to stay successful. Companies invest in their employees by providing them opportunities to learn and to make them motivated to perform better (Salas et al., 2012).

Hence, understanding the right type of training helps organizations to build a talent pool that is skilled and competitive.

The 21<sup>st</sup> century organizations have started to reevaluate their training and development approaches as a means to engage and retain millennials as modernizing training has become necessary for organizations in order to remain competitive and to maintain their name in the market place (Saunders, 2017). According to “The Hartford’s 2014 Millennial Leadership Survey” the primary concern of millennials is that there is adequate training and development in the organization so they seek opportunities where there are forward thinking leaders who can develop their skills and empower them. Millennials give importance to individualist aspects of job and have realistic expectations of their salary and their first job but they look for rapid means to increase their development of skills while balancing their life outside their jobs (Ng et al., 2010).

Preference for type of training can be different between different generations as training can differ according to the way that people process information and it is stated that training should be adjusted according to the variety of preferences and styles (Urlick, 2017). Generations can have a “collective conscious” which means that member of one generation can have similar preferences and styles because they have been exposed to same situations and influences (Joshi et al., 2011). Previous generations preferred face to face interactions however millennials prefer technology based and electronic communication hence they also like technology based training (Weber, 2018). Many practitioners have become involved in finding differences between generation (Lyons and Kuron, 2014) and although research has indicated differences in training related outcomes, very few studies have been done that examine the perceptions that different generations have regarding the preferences for the style and type of training and the delivery of training (Urlick,2017).

## **CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This chapter revolves around four objectives. First, the research gaps are discussed on the basis of which research objectives and questions are formulated. Secondly, Philosophical stance is represented and third the rationale behind adopting case study is discussed in detail. In the end, the methods for data collection and analysis are presented.

### **3.1 RESEARCH GAPS, OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS**

#### **3.1.2 RESEARCH GAP IDENTIFICATION**

Keeping the above literature in mind, it can be concluded that there is dearth of research on the kind of HR practices that attract and help in retaining millennials especially in Asian context and to fulfil this gap more research is needed to be done on generational differences focusing on millennials. This new generation is crucial to be understood as they are the current and future worker (Barreto, 2018). Heyns and Kers (2018) confirm that although previous research has focused on general differences between generations but have paid meagre attention on how these manifests within the work place. In this paper, we will examine the expectation of millennial workers in order to understand this group as a client of HRM in workplaces. The notion of viewing employees in organization as different segments has received minor importance in the HR literature and has been criticized for being a slow process (Kultahlati & Viitala, 2015). Hence, we will particularly be interested in the factors that are central to HRM efforts to attract millennials to the organization and make them a committed workforce.

Previous research findings done on generational differences have been contradictory and inconsistent and few conclusions have been generated (Huynh et al., 2018) therefore we answer the call for more theory on generation as a workplace phenomenon (Costanza & Finkelstein 2015, Lyons et al., 2015). Cucina et al. (2018) suggested in their paper that generational differences are best defined in terms of perceptions and further confirm that a small number of such studies exist. These perceptions can lead to intergenerational conflict in the workplace as explained by Urick et al., (2017) hence, they should be studied. Furthermore, as majority of studies have taken a self-perception view point in which representatives of each generation are asked to provide insights about their own generation, it would be interesting to see how one generation sees themselves in comparison to the perception's others have about them (Sakdiyakorn & Wattanacharoensil, 2017). For this purpose, interviews will not be taken only from millennials but also their bosses from

other generations, and HR managers which would provide a more detailed picture of the phenomenon and help in understanding the generation better.

Sakdiyakorn and Wattanacharoensil (2017) state that existing studies on this topic have covered broad geographical locations, but country specific analysis is needed. Previous studies have been conducted in UK, USA , Australia (Kultalahti and Viitala, 2015) therefore in order to find out how millennial's work related expectations manifest themselves in Asian context, this study will be conducted in Pakistan which is a central Asian country. Additionally, some of the methodological limitations of the existing studies on generations is that they are dominated by cohort based quantitative studies, especially researches on millennials (Ibid 2015,2017). Therefore, a deeper analysis of generational phenomenon is needed using qualitative methods such as in-depth interviews, ethnography, personal experiences, conversations and ethnography (ibid, 2017). This study will be employing qualitative method (interviews) and try to fulfil this gap. This method will help understand the complex and unique thoughts of individuals which might relate to other socio cultural and time related effects, rather than just relating purely to birth year.



### **3.1.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES**

1. To find out managers perceptions about how millennial workers are different compared to other generations.
2. To review manager's perceptions about whether the current HR policies and practices (Compensation, training & recruitment) are designed according to millennial worker's needs in the workplace.
3. To find out millennials self-perception about their generation compared to other generations.
4. To review millennials perceptions about whether the HR practices (Compensation, training & recruitment) are designed according to millennial worker's needs.

### **3.1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

1. How do managers perceive millennial workers compared to other generations in the workplace?
2. Are HR practices and policies (Compensation, recruitment and training) designed by managers keeping in mind the millennial workers in the workplace? How and why?
3. How do millennial workers compare themselves to other generations in the workplace?
4. According to millennials, are HR practices and policies (Compensation, recruitment and training) designed keeping in mind the millennial generation in the workplace? How and Why?

## 3.2 PHILOSOPHICAL STANCE AND THEORETICAL FOUNDATION

### 3.2.1 THEORY AS GUIDING EXPLANATION

In case study research, theory plays a very critical role in generalizing lessons (Yin, 2013). In this study the social identity theory is etched as the role of theory is for analytical generalization in case study research (Yin, 2018). To address the issue of external validity, identifying the right theory is of utmost importance. Another important consideration is the structuring of the research questions as research questions with *how* and *why* makes analytical generalizations easy (ibid, 2018). For this purpose, “social identity theory” is important because it explains how individuals associate themselves with social groups. It explains how people, in order to make sense of who they are, start identifying themselves with one social group and develop a sense of oneness with them. The “self-categorization theory” also has relevance as it is the process of identifying oneself and others as members of a reference group and then using that group to judge attitudes, beliefs and values (Beauchamp, 2019). Hence these theories are used as a guiding principle for the research.

### 3.2.2 ONTOLOGICAL CONSIDERATION

Ontology refers to assumptions about the nature of reality (Hesse-Biber and Leavy, 2011) and the study of the being (Crotty, 1998). In other words, it deals with whether the social entity should be considered as objective or subjective. Ontology deals with what constitutes reality and the researcher would need to take a position regarding his perception of how things really are and how they work (Mack, 2010). Subjectivism believes that the truth resides only in the mind as in, for a subjectivist, a statement can be true for one person and false for another person simply because of one's mental choices and subjective processing (Mouzelis, 2000). On the other hand, objectivism believes that social phenomena are independent of social actors and the realities are external to social actors. In a qualitative research design, researchers accept the idea of multiple realities instead of one (Creswell, 2007).

Researcher believes that the social phenomenon is created from the perceptions and actions of social actors and this subjective knowledge is based on personal opinions, emotions and judgments (Saunders et al. 2007). In this type of research, the perspective of researcher is there in the research and is not detached from it unlike positivist research where the researcher keeps himself detached from his subjects and does not want to include their personal opinions and experiences. Subjective

research allows incorporation of the individual's experience as well and is based on data collected from observations or interviews. Farghaly (2018) explain that the focus of a subjectivist researcher is on how people think and feel and how they communicate, then they focus on explaining and understanding how and why people behave and think differently.

The current study found subjectivism more appropriate as there are multiple realities and social reality is constructed by the intimate relationship between the researcher, what is being studied and the situational constraints present. As this research is exploring perceptions of the social actors involved, it becomes necessary to report point of views and these point of views and perceptions can be multiple. The social actors involved constitute managers, Gen X and the millennials working in the banking sector. As explained above, in this study there is a need to understand how millennial generation perceives the HR practices and how their managers view the situation. This study will be following an interpretivist paradigm. The researcher would place himself in a qualitative study and would have to report multiple realities, hence would have to set aside all previous misconceptions or judgments that he might have about the subject in hand. By doing so, an objective analysis can be done by him of the information given by the participants (Padilla-Díaz, 2015).

### 3.2.3 EPISTEMOLOGICAL CONSIDERATION

There are basically two ideals that emerge from the interpretation at hand; positivism and the interpretivism. Questions that confront the researcher include the following; whether explanations of the social world should be deduced from people's understandings (Interpretivists approach) or from observable facts (Positivist approach) (Leitch et al., 2010). These ideals are at the opposite ends of the spectrum and the researcher may place him any way along the line.

Positivism is of the view that reality is different from the one perceiving it and it considers subject (The researcher) and object (The phenomenon) as two separate entities (Weber, 2004). On the other hand, Interpretivists believe that every human is different from another and acts in a different way to an "objective reality" hence scientific models don't really work on them (Hughes and Sharrock, 2016). Their focus is on empathetic listening which means they see the world from the eyes of the subject they are carrying their research on. In Interpretivists research qualitative data is collected which is neither measurable nor quantifiable (Goldman, 2004). Interpretivism advocates that understanding differences among humans is mandatory, while criticizing that rich

insights are lost in this complex world as researchers are reducing its complexity by opting lawlike generalizations (Saunders, et al., 2009). Karin A. (2018) highlighted that focus of qualitative research is inherently humanistic whereby is well suited for real-life settings (Gephart, 2004), therefore it is suitable for exploring employee's perceptions regarding HR practices in the current study. As this study aims to identify employee perceptions and perspectives in a single case study.

This research goes towards interpretivism as researchers' values, perspectives and social experiences will be influencing the research. Questions were asked based on already set interview guide but additional questions that were not a part of the semi structured interview guide were also asked according to the need to probe more. The purpose of the research was told to all respondents and it was their voluntary decision to be the part of the research and their identity is kept confidential. The research questions look into millennials, Gen X and managers POV and perceptions about each other and themselves so without researcher's involvement as someone who is there and asking the questions at the right time, the issue at hand cannot be explored in depth and properly. It is accepted that in social sciences subjectivity plays an important role to make sense of human behaviors and since this study will be studying human interactions interpretivism is the suitable approach. A qualitative researcher is to understand how and why people make structures in their mind to make the sense of what is going on around them (Easterby-Smith et al. 2002). Epistemology viewed by a qualitative researcher focuses on trying to get as close to the subject as possible and to be able to report the multiple realities he believes in (Faghaly, 2018). The research questions of this study revolve around perceptions hence it also stresses on the role of researcher as being that of involvement.

An Interpretivists paradigm that will help in recovering trends in opinions and thoughts and dive deeper into the problem as it is aimed to study millennials perceptions about HR practices in Banking sector of Pakistan. Reliance on Interpretivists paradigm will assist the researcher in believing that humans behave in a complex and complicated web of behavioral, social and cultural variables and everyone perceives reality differently (Holden and Lynch, 2004). Thus, in order to seek answer of the underlying research questions, interpretivist paradigm is most suited, and this philosophy is also in accordance with qualitative research design.

### 3.3 RESEARCH METHODS

#### 3.3.1 Rationale Behind Qualitative Methods and Case Study Research

The identification of research methods is of critical importance when it comes to determination of procedures that are to be used in research process. In order to fulfil the theoretical gap, exploratory research using qualitative research methodology is implied. As subjectivist ontological stance is identified, it leads to the selection of interpretivist epistemology therefore inductive approach and qualitative methods of data analysis are used. Qualitative data is collected when the researcher wants to study the beliefs, norms and behaviors of the participants. Moreover, rationale behind qualitative research approach for this study is in its widely cited benefits in literature which includes its strength to explore, rich descriptions it produced, and its potential of generating inductive theorizing (see Welch et al., 2011; Bryman & Bell, 2003; Eisenhardt, 1989; Stake, 1995). The qualitative methods are meant for providing an in-depth understanding of the social phenomenon (Heneman & Judge, 2000; Werner & N Ward, 2004) through underpinning the uncovered issues, reasons, and descriptions. Because of the current study's reliance on researcher's subjective interpretations, qualitative research helps in providing rich immersion data, and facilitates the understanding of behavioral outcomes, as suggested by Payne and Williams (2005). According to Cornelison (2017) Qualitative research is an ideal approach to look at multiple realities, individual experiences, culture, perceptions and qualitative methodology helps in getting deeper insights by answering how and why questions.

There are different types of strategies available to a researcher but for this research a single case study method is used. According to Yin (2013) case study is “a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between a phenomenon and context are not clear and the researcher has little control over the phenomenon and context”. Yin (2013) claimed there are three conditions which if present can direct towards a case study, the first one being if your research roams around “how” and “why” questions, as the purpose of the case study is to get in depth information of how HR practices are designed in the banking sector and if it matches millennial perceptions. Authors like Welch, Pickkari, Plakoyiannaki & Paavilainen-Mantmayki (2011) claim that case studies help in interpretive sense making of the phenomenon under study that helps to generate contextualized explanations. The second condition for choosing case study,

according to Yin (2011, 2013) is when the study does not require control over behavioral events. In this study relevant behaviors would not be manipulated as we are looking at how millennials are perceived in the organization and whether HR practices have changed for them or not, taking interviews from millennials HR managers and Gen X members. Therefore, research study has designed the interview guide such that it reflects the true evidence that researcher's own beliefs and frame of reference is not being imposed on the participants of this study. Third condition to compel to a case study is that the research must be on a contemporary event in which the researcher investigates the event in depth and within its real-world context (ibid). The event to be studied should have happened in the recent past or should be an ongoing event so that information (for example interviewee's) is available about this event. Millennials is the generation born from 1980 – 1994 and the youngest millennial is currently 26 years of age. Many of the millennials are young professionals that have recently stepped into the organization and researchers are trying to understand their behaviors and attitudes hence making the research topic a contemporary one. Therefore, case study is appropriate for this dissertation.

Yin (2003) noticed that in case study design, the research can either be single or multiple case study. It was highlighted by Yin that the rationale for choosing single case study is because it adds to theory and knowledge building. Secondly it also focuses on understanding the behaviors of employees within organization (Yin, 2014) and this study is concerned with understanding how generations work within organizations with respect to HR practices. Furthermore, according to Yin (2013) "revelatory case" is another rationale behind single case study. Studying millennial generation's is suitable as the exploratory information collected will be revelatory as the researcher is given access to situations and information that was not accessible previously for investigation. Therefore, a single company was selected by using qualitative inductive methods approach in order to gain in-depth insights regarding millennials and HR practices.

Greenwood and Miller (2010) in their research emphasized that there is a need to focus on organizations as a whole again and suggested that for researchers to fully understand the complexities of an organization and to understand the behaviors of the workforce, they should use multiple theoretical lenses to understand the phenomenon. Hence the current study incorporates the self-categorization and social identity theory to understand how different generations exist in the workplace to make sense of who they are and how they interact with each other. A pluralistic

view has been adopted in this research and by doing so the researcher admits that multiple actors have different needs, preferences and beliefs that effect the relationship of employee and company and individual level outcomes as well.

As this research is implying multiple perspectives hence unit of analysis is required at more than one level (Yin, 2013). Embedded case design is adopted for this research that would help in allowing multiple perspectives in the study and the embedded sub units are selected through the sampling technique. Case study designs are used for the aim of co constructing data and includes interviews, observations, focus groups and documentation (see Yin, 2014; Stewart, 2014) but semi structured interviews are considered the most appropriate as they help in collecting maximum information hence for this study semi structured interviews are used to get perspectives of multiple stake holders (refer to appendix). For ensuring construct validity, the researcher looked at multiple sources of evidence like reviewing company's documents, hand books, manuals etc and also let the participants review their interview transcripts. Secondly for the purpose of maintaining reliability of the research findings a data base of case study was developed and a chain of evidence was maintained. Data for this research was collected in a single point in time (Saunders, 2011) making this a cross sectional study and involving views of different stakeholders at a point in time hence offering an in-depth qualitative discussion about millennials and HR practices.

### **3.4 SAMPLING PROCEDURE FOR QUALITATIVE RESEARCH**

#### **3.4.1 Sampling strategy**

Purposive sampling is the technique suitable in order to answer the research questions and meet the objectives of this study. According to Lewis (2006) Purposive sampling provides robust data and selection of cases in this case is guided by Research Questions. In this study “researchers intentionally select participants who have experienced the central phenomenon or key concept being explored in the study” (Creswell and Clark, 2017). In qualitative research, this technique is preferred because the researcher relies on his own judgement and a pre-determined criterion is used for selection which helps in contributing towards the achievement of objectives.

### 3.4.2 Selection of the Participating Company

There are three criteria which have been developed to select a suitable company. First, a company that has an influx of millennial generation working side by side with older generations. Second, a company willing to provide access to take qualitative interviews and to let researcher gauge perspectives of different employees. Third, a company that helps researcher to achieve its research purpose and provide company-reported data in addition to employee self-reported data. The research data from its field investigation is triangulated with the company policies, documents, staff handbook, and other secondary material to build credibility of research findings, and strengthen the construct validity.

Presently the landscape of Pakistan Banking sector is such that there are five public sector banks, four foreign banks, four specialized banks and thirty-two local private banks (Omer, 2019). The specialized banks support growth objectives of government and are not included in the category of commercial banks. Besides all these, there are many microfinance banks that help in promoting the financial intermediation. Islamic banking is also provided by 6 Islamic banks and there are also 16 branch Islamic banks that are owned by conventional banks (Ibid, 2019). These Islamic banks carry out financial transactions keeping in mind the shariah injunctions.

Currently, the banking industry is dominated by older employees, but they realize that in order to stay successful they need to attract millennials to their workforce unfortunately they aren't entirely sure how to do that. It is reported that out of 4, 1 bank executive reports dissatisfaction by the way their bank attracts and retains the talent necessary for future success (Fernandes, 2018), although many banks have started MTO programs which focus on hiring fresh graduates that happen to be from the millennial generation. The bank selected for this thesis is "Pakistan Bank", which is a fictional name and the real name is not being used due to permission and privacy issues. Pakistan Bank is a public bank which has MTO program for both graduate and master level students who are looking for making career progress in the banking sector. It advertises MTO posts for someone who is enthusiastic and sharp and who will undergo a rigorous selection process and trainings and then will be placed in respective posts all over Pakistan Bank. The selection criteria are also very tough requiring a GPA above 3.00 out of 4.00 from top institutes of Pakistan. As Pakistan Bank has an extensive MTO program every year in which an influx of new hires works with the older generations, hence taking interviews from millennials, managers and generation X from this bank



would provide a good idea of how both of these generations perceive each other and whether HR practices have changed according to the new generation's needs or not. Since the selection process and criteria is very tough it also makes sense to see whether MTO's who do get hired are satisfied after they start working at Pakistan Bank or not.

### 3.4.3 Selection of Interviewees

Interviews were considered as the preferred research design and interviews were conducted with millennials, HR managers and Gen X members. Interviews are chosen over other methods as In depth interviews help in collecting rich and in-depth information about participants experiences (DiCicco-Bloom and Crabtree, 2006). Walliman (2017) states that interviews add a human dimension to data and as this research required human dimension, conducting interviews is deemed the suitable strategy. Another benefit of conducting interviews is that it provides much more detailed information than other data collecting methods and provide a more relaxed environment in which to collect information from respondents (ibid, 2017). The interviews are conducted using a conversational style that focuses on the topic and helped in getting both verbal and nonverbal cues from the respondent (Thiel, 2019).

This study is using in depth semi structured interviews in which the interviewer had a checklist of the discussion points and the goal was to let the interviewee talk at their own terms hence the questions that are asked are not very specific and allow for a range of responses. The questions were not asked in a specific order rather in a way that developed the conversation. It was kept in mind that all questions in the research guide were asked but in a way that suited each subject case. A general interview guide was used to in order to keep the interaction focused but also allowing for the individual perceptions and expectations. The first group to be interviewed was of employees from the millennial generation, either in MTO positions or as general hires. The second group was of HR managers as they influence the decisions regarding the HRM policies and practices. The third group was that of older employees who constituted generation X as the research also wanted to study perceptions of older generations about millennials.

Organization	Millennials	HR managers	Generation X	total
Pakistan Bank	6	4	3	13

**Table 3: Number of members interviewed from each generation**

#### 3.4.4 Sample size and saturation

Researchers have specified the number of interviews to be taken in a qualitative study that would result in reliable and valid results. Adler and Adler (2011) have recommended a number anywhere between 12 and 60, keeping 30 interviews as a mean number. There is a huge debate on sample size in qualitative research study (see Malterud et al., 2016) and sample size in qualitative research is much smaller as compared to quantitative research (see Creswell and Clark, 2017). On the other hand, some researchers like Glaser and Strauss (1967) suggest it is not about the specific number of interviews rather it is when one reaches saturation in their data, which is when you should stop taking further interviews, which is the phenomenon of theoretical saturation. Saturation is defined as a stage in data collection process where additional data is not adding any new useful information (see Glaser and Strauss, 2017). Creswell and Clark (2017) further suggested that objective is to keep dataset large enough which allows the sufficient emergence of themes in the qualitative study. The debate is ended by accepting that researcher herself is in a best position to confirm the saturation point for current study, instead of following any prescribed formula. However, unless the sample is sufficient, it may not achieve content validity which is seen as a scientific issue for subsequent interpretation of research data (see Francis et al., 2010).

#### 3.4.5 Sample Summary

For this research a total of 13 interviews are taken as saturation point was reached after the 13<sup>th</sup> interview. Interviews lasted of 40 - 45 minutes each depending on position, title and the discussion. Pseudo-names have been assigned to all employees that were interviewed

Pseudo-names	Details
<b>M-A</b>	MTO
<b>M-B</b>	MTO
<b>M-C</b>	Manager credit operations
<b>M-D</b>	Assistant auditor
<b>M-E</b>	MTO
<b>M-F</b>	MTO
<b>HR-A</b>	Manager recruitment
<b>HR-B</b>	HR manager
<b>HR-C</b>	HR manager
<b>HR-D</b>	Assistant HR manager
<b>GX-A</b>	SVP
<b>GX-B</b>	VP
<b>GX-C</b>	Branch Manager

**Table 4: Job titles of Employees interviewed**

#### 3.4.6 Data analysis

To analyze data in the research study, thematic analysis is being used which is the most widely used method in analysis of qualitative data. Thematic analysis is a qualitative research method that is used across a range of epistemologies and research questions and is also a method useful to identify, analyze, organize, describe and report themes that are found within a data set (Nowell et al., 2017). No analysis software is used as data amount is small and translation issues exist as some parts of the interview were translated from Urdu to English hence softwares like Nvivo might not be able to pick research themes properly and could have led to forced categorization of themes

during the analysis phase. Main themes are identified using extensive literature review and these themes served a perimeter to design the interview guide.

The interviews undertaken were recorded and then transcribed for analysis to be done. Furthermore, as dissertation is of subjective nature, Braun and Clarke (2006) identified certain steps to implement the thematic analysis effectively, which included identifying, analyzing and reporting themes within data. Researcher kept those steps in careful consideration while doing analysis of the research findings. The interviews were constantly transcribed and analyzed during the interview process in order to search for relevant and emerging themes. During the interview process, questions were constantly refined and adjustments were made according to the responses. After transcribing data, in certain situations, candidates were interviewed again to clarify particular concepts and gain deeper insights. In order to gain the authentic sources of information, transcribed interviews were sent back to participants to check for any errors or mislead information and data gathered from the interview process was constantly revised in order to search for new themes.

Theme	Sub theme	Quote
HR practice of compensation	Compensation according to education	<i>you know banking sector is always a step down from other sectors. If someone at managerial level with my education is sitting in telecom sector, he would be getting paid much more so I think it's a sector constraint</i>
	Satisfaction of millennials with their salaries at Pakistan Bank	<i>I would say when I joined this organization as an MTO was really happy but now after 3 years of working, the pay progression is not good at all</i>

Example of themes

## **CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS**

The following chapter will present analysis of data, which was collected by using semi structured interviews. Respondents were divided into three groups' i.e. millennial employees, HR managers and generation X employees and three different interview guides were formed keeping in mind the literature and the themes that emerged out of it. As a result, thirteen semi structured interviews were taken in which respondents were asked about millennials, millennials way of working, differences in generations and HR practices of recruitment, compensation and training.

The research is comprised of four themes and then under it are sub themes which are segregated by following the thematic network (Attire, 2001). After searching and reviewing, they were categorized as Perceptions of millennials in the workplace, HR practice of recruitment, HR practice of compensation and HR practice of training. This helped in organizing, which further helped in putting relevant data under the headings while making report for dissertation. Examples from raw primary qualitative data were used and incorporated in the study as suggested by Gephart (2004), represented using verbatim quotations that are extracted from the interviews. Following is theme wise explanation of research work.

<b>perceptions of millennials in the workplace</b>
<b>HR practice of recruitment</b>
<b>HR practice of compensation</b>
<b>HR practice of training</b>

**themes of the research**

## 4.1 PERCEPTION OF MILLENNIAL GENERATION IN THE WORKPLACE:

The first theme that emerged was the perception of millennial generation in the workplace.

<b>Conceptualizing the Term “Millennial Generation”</b>
<b>Difference in Personality and Behaviors</b>
<b>Millennials Need for Guidance</b>
<b>Conflicts between Generations</b>
<b>Techno-holics</b>
<b>Importance of Work Life Balance and Flexibility for Millennial</b>

### **Perception of millennial generation in the workplace (theme 1)**

#### **4.1.1 Conceptualizing the Term “Millennial Generation”**

In order to understand whether people in the organization had an idea about the term “millennial generation”, millennials, generation X and HR managers were asked to define the term with no prior information given. Most respondents did not have an idea about this term and some had a very vague understanding. As most of the millennials mentioned that they have heard the term on the internet but do not really know what it means.

*“As far as I remember I think it is the generation born after 1990’s? The generation that comes after generation Y I think? I have studied about it in my marketing course in MBA” (M-C)*

HR Managers had a slightly better idea about the term and knew that millennial generation is the young generation that is adaptive, computer literate and tech savvy. They also noticed that these millennials tend to shorten up the work done by their elders and do the same thing in much less time and much more effectively as older generation preferred to work manually.

*“It is the generation below the age of 40. Ranging from 25 to 35 years of age and below who were born after 1980. These are the people who are more inclined towards IT and soft wares, mobiles etc” (HR-B)*

An HR manager stated an interesting concept that age is what qualifies you to be a millennial but no two millennials are alike because your behavior and way of life depends on experience, education, exposure and surrounding more than the year of your birth. There are many people who are not exposed to the things that others are and they might belong to the same age group, but exposure might be entirely different, it does not mean all millennials will be techno-holics.

#### **4.1.2 Difference in Personality and Behaviors**

A generation X member stated that as there was very little usage of computers and IT in their era hence, they had higher IQs making the previous generation sharp and conscious. He further added Millennials lacked a deeper insight and as they do not follow protocols hence their attitude in life is dangerously casual. Although millennials are generally friendly, social and very positive minded but they prefer to live in the “Now” and when you talk to millennials they do not want to go way into the past or way into the future. HR managers also had similar views and have noticed that in terms of personalities and behaviors millennials are restless, mentioning that older generation is very stable in their approach.

***“I frankly believe this generation lacks work ethic. I have been conducting interviews of this generation, people from LUMS and IBA, they are all looking for shortcuts, they do not want to get their hand dirty in order to reach somewhere, let’s say that they want the cream and nothing else” (HR-D).***

On the contrary, a millennial stated that in her opinion millennials have a more professional attitude, people from older generations followed old practices and are very reluctant to learn and adopt new practices whereas millennials have more knowledge of IT and learn and adapt things fast. It was noted by one of the HR managers that millennials when they get hired take work seriously and responsibly although during and before the interview process their attitude is casual, she added

***“You know ma’am, banking is a big responsibility, people have a hard time trusting you with money and here we play with money and millennials take on this responsibility well” (HR-C).***

### 4.1.3 Millennials Need for Guidance

From the interviews it could be deciphered that millennials need constant guidance in the workplace. The HR managers, generation X and the millennials all agreed to this. According to generation X, the jobs in banking industry have gotten complex and guidance is needed. This statement was also validated by HR managers as one remarked

***“Exactly, they do need guidance because they have little to no experience because of their young ages” (HR-C).***

It was also evident by remarks of a Millennial as she commented

***“Obviously, it is not like the older generation is totally clueless and know nothing, of course they are more experienced than us and know a lot more as well. An older experienced worker and a new young energetic person can work together to form a best team. You can’t just depend on one thing” (M-A)***

Needing guidance also depended on the work and operation that they are doing. For example, people working in operations department did not need their boss’s guidance as much as people working in trade department as there was a lot of international dealing hence employees in trade department need more guidance. Millennial stated that at the start elders used to look down upon them and they were perceived to be hyper, aggressive and having little knowledge but now perceptions are changing. Previously, elders gave them guidance as mentors and bosses but now they guide them as team members (M-C).

The responses on how millennials respond to this guidance were varying. HR manager remarked that millennials response to guidance depended on which university they were coming from. According to him some universities like LUMS, IBA inculcate superiority complex in their children, and the students of these universities think they know everything but are not aware of the ground realities hence they can’t stay in an organization for more than 2 years. So, to him, response to guidance depended on the educational institution the millennials are coming from. He further asserted that response to this guidance depends upon the attitude of the employee, if the incumbent



is trained by their educational institutions on employment ethics and how to spend first 2 to 3 years in the organization, they will develop a learning attitude

#### **4.1.4 Conflicts between Generations**

HR manager stated that people from the age 20 to 60 are working in Pakistan Bank and there is a 50-50 split between younger and older employees. There are two extreme age groups working in the banking sector, one age group being extremely young and other being old. Older employees are those that started working in 80's and young started working after 2010-2011. According to him

***“One cannot really find middle aged people, they are very less in number, mostly older people are working in banking sector though” (HR-D)***

Next, millennials were asked if they faced any conflicts while working with employees from older generation. Most of the millennials stated that they faced no conflicts as elders are generally very supportive and seniors are always there to help. Therefore, simply being from different generations did not have anything to do with conflicts rather when you have a diverse team, conflicts are bound to arise

***“In Pakistan Bank, we take these conflicts as a positive thing because it is a learning process because you learn a lot from these conflicts but obviously when you have people working under you who are older than you, it becomes a hurdle” (M-F)***

Conflict arises when older generation cannot mentally accept the fact that they are reporting to a younger male or female. At Pakistan Bank, although it is a challenge but it is not taken too seriously. Most millennials when they join are very young and because they are better educated, they come on positions senior to those who have been working in banks since 20 to 25 years, hence acceptance level is low. It was observed by one of the millennials that the reason for conflicts not arising could be due to cultural factors

***“Unfortunately, in our society it is asked from us to respect elders, that doesn’t mean I am against it but this phenomenon is also abused a lot. You might be doing the right thing but just because you’re young you cannot speak up in front of your seniors and if you do say something you are considered rude and arrogant.” (M-C)***

He corroborated the above statement by saying that people abroad are much bolder and straightforward than people of south Asia because their culture allows them room to do that, therefore generational conflicts are normal there. Generation X also were of the view that conflicts do not really arise as millennials do not believe in lobbying and grouping. Millennials are good listeners and do not let elders feel that they are not being heard to.

#### **4.1.5 Techno-holics**

All generations agreed that millennials are technologically advanced, they are said to have more knowledge of IT and are more used to it, they also learn and adopt new things fast but people belonging to older generation are not as computer literate or adaptable. One millennial also remarked that millennials grew up in a time when there was an IT boom hence expectation is also higher from them that they should be technology proficient as they are young (M-E). HR manager remarked

***“They are more adaptive towards IT systems and automation and have a good understanding of banking softwares.... they are also good at debugging of glitches arising in normal routine work” (HR-A)***

The reason for this was explained by him later on in the interview, according to him these computer skills are knowingly and unknowingly inculcated in 15-20 years in millennials, since they have spent their lives in IT Boom and they are used to using softwares.

***“I will give you an example of Word and Excel, the older generation in our organization is still using 2003-2004 version although we have asked to use the 2013 and above version but they say***

*we are more easy using older versions as they don't find changes good and don't accept them easily".*

All generations were asked whether they think millennials are better suited for today's dynamic and ever-changing workplace and the answers were in unison. Millennials agreed that the world of today is developing at a very fast pace and for that you need an attitude of accepting change. Since their generation grew up in this environment, they are equipped to tackle it and rightly programmed for the jobs of today. They further added that in their opinion the older generation is slow paced compared to them. Another reason for millennials being more suitable was that older generation grew up working manually hence when they are made to sit in front of computers, they are mostly clueless although today's workplace depends on technology in every matter. It was also suggested that as banking sector is moving towards a new era of E-banking it automatically means the generation which is more technologically progressive is more suited.

#### **4.1.6 Importance of Work Life Balance and Flexibility for Millennials**

Millennials give immense importance to Work life balance. This generation does not believe in sacrificing family in lieu of work as they want to balance both their professional and personal lives. As a millennial stated

*"We work for our family; we want to see our kids grow old. I mean if you can't be there for your family and think that work is going to give you all the satisfaction you need, then you are living in a fool's paradise" (M-F)*

Millennials are of the view that employers should not ask employees to work and sit after their 8-hour shift and if inevitable employees should be compensated on overtime but in Pakistan Bank that is not the case. Even if one works overtime, they are not paid for it (M-E). Millennials stated that they cannot work 24/7 like previous generations but in Pakistan Bank Work life balance is not present at all

*"You can say the ratio is 70-30, 70% being work and 30% time for yourself, it should be 50-50" (M-F)*

On the other hand, some millennials were of the view that Pakistan Bank provides work life balance as timings are from 9 to 5 30 and its very rare that one has to stay after work hours but if an emergency appears during office hours there should be a policy of flexi hours available. It was also stated by the male interviewee's that Pakistan Bank is biased towards female employees as none of the female employees, from any department is ever asked to stay after work hours. Male counterparts commented that although their female colleagues might be on the same role and department as them, but they are never asked to stay overtime or come on weekends. This creates a sense of unfairness in the minds of male colleagues and results in negativity.

## 4.2 HR PRACTICE OF RECRUITMENT

Recruitment is the process through which a company searches for prospective clients and hires the best and most qualified candidate for the job. Millennials are said to be a challenge for organizations today to recruit and motivate. In the research, it was asked from candidates on how they wanted to be recruited Vs how they were actually recruited. Following sub themes emerged;

### Millennials On-line job search

#### Recruitment Process at Pakistan Bank

#### MTO Recruitment at Pakistan Bank

### HR practice of recruitment (theme 2)

#### 4.2.1 Millennials On-line job search

All participants stated that the job search is now online, and social media is the way to attract this new techno-holic generation. Although, many social media sites are used for job hunting like Rozee.pk, Bayt.com and Facebook but LinkedIn is the most used, as all members named it. LinkedIn is professional in its approach because it is created for keeping a professional network. A millennial validated that all his friends use social media for the purpose of job searching

*“We don't even look at newspapers, funny thing is even my job was posted on newspaper but I read it on online on some portal and then applied” (M-B)*

Millennials also mentioned using Facebook but it was added that Facebook mostly has just job ads with an email id and is not very reliable. LinkedIn is the most efficient way to hire people because when one goes towards newspaper advertising it takes extensive time, people who are not even qualified apply and one gets a lot of junk and someone has to go through all those resumes manually but with LinkedIn you can pick and choose as the candidate's whole profile is in front of you.

An HR manager spoke along the same lines and claimed that it is better to advertise through social media than newspaper as things have become systemized and time constraints have become less, a candidate simply fills in the information and all the data analysis that was previously done manually is now done through software. He further added

*“Previously where two people were working on it now one person has to work, making the cost less and benefits more’ (HR-C)*

#### **4.2.2 Recruitment Process at Pakistan Bank**

Pakistan Bank advertises jobs on its webpage and by posting on newspapers like JANG and DAWN (GX-C). A millennial commented on recruitment practices of Pakistan Bank mentioning they can attract a better pool of millennial candidates if they have a better presence online because presently, they just use newspaper and post the same advertisement on the webpage. Millennials are the “social-media generation” hence Pakistan Bank should hit this point and revamp their online presence. This young generation relies heavily on pull strategies by the organization as they have very less attention spans. Pakistan Bank does not even run ads on the TV and newspapers are not read by millennials, hence the strategies used by Pakistan Bank are weak.

When asked why it is necessary to post an ad in newspaper, an HR manager remarked

**“Banks are answerable, we get asked questions like you hired this person, how did you hire them? If you do not give an ad it raises eyebrows so we have to give an ad in newspaper to prove that the induction was done on merit. Newspaper advertisements make it justifiable that someone wasn't hired on reference and make the whole process free and fair” (HR-D)**

When HR managers were asked why Pakistan Bank does not use social media to attract millennials despite knowing they are the social media generation, he (HR-A) commented that previously Pakistan Bank used to hire by referrals or newspaper advertisement only but now social media is slightly entering into Pakistan Bank's recruitment system although it hasn't taken the form of formal recruitment and mostly reliance is on newspaper ads. Although changes are being incorporated, they are incremental and not at the pace of other modern organizations.

*“Two ads were given on maximum in the newspaper but since I joined the organization in 2009 things have changed a little bit, we are finalizing a contract with Rozee.pk soon, we also do rigorous hiring through NTS. So, I think to accommodate millennials the strategies are changing since past 10-15 years”*

#### **4.2.3 MTO Recruitment at Pakistan Bank**

According to an SVP from generation X, millennials are freshly hired as MTO's on much higher pays than other inductees and are considered the cream of the organization. In Pakistan Bank an MTO is paid around 60,000 PKR at joining. He also added that Pakistan Bank's MTO recruitment program suits millennials and is an adequate program as they undergo a 4-6-month training at the start.

HR manager explained the hiring process for an MTO as follows; first there is an add given in newspapers and selected people go through an NTS. Those who are on merit are called for panel discussions on different topics. While hiring MTO's every aspect of an MTO's personality is looked at

*“Last time we had 46 people who were on merit, out of those we made groups of 6 people each for group discussions and at the end only 2 people were selected, that is how rigorous our process is” (HR-D)*

The recruitment process for MTO program is an efficient process starting from the NTS test as it has different portions like verbal reasoning, written essay, general knowledge, IQ and analytical reasoning. Whoever scores more than 50% is shortlisted and invited to panel discussions (HR-B).

According to him there's one constraint in the whole process which arises during panel discussions which is that different regions have different criteria and different people marking the discussion, Hence, a person from Lahore might be stricter in his marking than someone from Multan. Problem with this is that then at the end sometimes less deserving person from Multan might get hired rather than from Lahore, so this human error affects quality of millennial pool. In 2006, Pakistan Bank to get rid of this problem just asked students from shortlisted universities to apply. This was done to attract candidates from only those universities that had more focus on research-based studies and presentations and made sure that people who were shortlisted were from good universities (HR-C)

***“If we talk about Islamabad, we shortlisted NUST, Fast and Quaid e Azam, from Peshawar IMS and from Lahore we chose Lums, LSE and PU”.***

A millennial stated that she saw the ad on an online newspaper and sent her CVs and during the panel discussion, very senior people were with them too, the group heads gave them a topic and every participant had 8-10 minutes to speak. She stated that there were 3 group heads present during the panel discussion, group head HR, group head retail banking and head of distribution and the topic of panel discussion was “role of banking in developing economy like Pakistan” (M-A). Millennials were also of the view that the MTO recruitment process is very rigorous and ends up in detection of the best candidates as the inductees are tested on various levels and skills. When asked if this MTO process can be made better, they stated that if the advertisement phase of the recruitment process is made to suit millennials, this process will be satisfactory not only for millennials but also for Pakistan Bank.

### 4.3 HR PRACTICE OF COMPENSATION

The third theme that emerged was compensation. Millennials claimed to be dissatisfied with their salaries however the perks and benefits at the bank were said to be one of the best provided. Following is the tabular representation of sub themes that emerged

#### Compensation in banking sector

Satisfaction of millennials with their salaries at Pakistan Bank

Compensation According to Education

Perks and benefits at Pakistan Bank

Salary Vs Benefits & Perks

Compensation: Reason for millennial job hopping

#### HR Practice of recruitment (theme 3)

##### 4.3.1 Compensation in banking sector

All generations commented that compensation in banks is comparatively lesser compared to other sectors. A millennial MTO commented that banking sector is always a step down from other sectors in Pakistan, if someone at managerial level with the same education is sitting at telecom sector, they would be paid more because it's a sector constraint. Young professionals are made to work on an average 12 hours without any overtime pay which is in contradiction with Pakistan's labor laws

*“Banks in Pakistan work like they are doing bonded labor and us young people are the most victimized by it... not just in Pakistan but abroad too” (M-D)*

Another millennial stated that the reason for low pay could be that other sectors have gone great technological shifts whereas banking sector is the same as it was, some software might have changed for which trainings are provided but the processes have rarely changed. Although banking sector in Pakistan generally pays less, it was noted that within banking sector, Pakistan Bank pays



better than other banks but if one moves towards other sectors then petroleum and telecom sector pay much better.

HR manager were asked why Pakistan Bank has not revamped their compensation for millennials, he stated that although banking sector generally pays lesser than other sectors but the benefits at Pakistan Bank are the same as someone from PIA or Pakistan railways. Employees get loans at a lesser markup hence they can have a good house, good car and less expensive education for kids, a normal banker has all of these facilities available whereas in private organizations these benefits are not provided but millennials only look at take home salary and think that compensation is not up to par.

#### **4.3.2 Satisfaction of millennials with their salaries at Pakistan Bank**

A millennial remarked that initially when he joined Pakistan Bank as an MTO he was happy with the compensation package but after 3 years of working he is not satisfied anymore. The same views were shown by another MTO that the pay at which she was hired was satisfactory at joining because she was being paid well according to industry standards however after 3 years her increments have not grown subsequently as the pay progression as an MTO is not satisfactory. There might have been growth in her career but not in compensation.

The satisfaction of non-MTO hires was found to be much less than MTO's. Millennials in non MTO positions claimed to be highly dissatisfied with their salaries, according to them this amount is less than the pocket money they received from homes (M-E). They accepted the job so they do not have to sit at home unemployed and if they find a better opportunity they will switch. At joining, non-MTO fresh graduates are hired at a salary of 25,000- 30,000 PKR. HR manager commented on this

***“Millennials say that we can make this much money at home, doing freelance work or something, so in my opinion they should be paid better because this will help them in becoming stable and not job hop as much” (HR-D)***

### 4.3.3 Compensation According to Education

All six of the millennials who were interviewed had done their Masters, hence the next question asked was whether they think they are being paid according to their education level and whether millennials should be paid better than other generations at the start of their careers, the answers to which were mixed. One millennial added that one's pay has more to do with the economy than the education level

***“As Pakistan’s economy is taking a downward spiral so salaries have not increased and have become very stable although inflation has increased exponentially, so now education is not really a big factor in determining pay” (M-D)***

Another added that before joining the organization he was a big advocate of being paid according to education level but when he stepped inside the organization the reality was much different, no matter how well educated one is they do not know the processes of the organization till they step inside the organization and that is where one realizes experience counts more than education. He added that although he had education from top institutions of Pakistan, he really did not know how anything worked and that is when he changed his point of view as theory is very different from reality.

When asked why millennials are not being paid according to their education as research suggests, HR managers claimed that it would be commendable to pay millennials better at the start of career because of their education as it would result in giving this restless generation stability but it is not entirely possible as they are already being paid better than others when they join as MTO's. Most organizations pay fresh graduates around 20-25k which is very low and millennials can make more than this amount by free lancing but the problem is that when an MTO joins on OG-2 level so gets around 60k salary but sometimes a more experienced person who has experience of 15 or so years is getting around the same amount. When the senior person watches the millennial, who is much younger and less experienced, getting more pay than him, he might get dissatisfied.

***“Millennials do not realize this problem and start comparing their salaries with other sectors but they should know banking sector has different constraints” (HR-A)***

#### **4.3.4 Perks and benefits at Pakistan Bank**

At Pakistan Bank, all permanent employees get free medical, provident fund, insurance, loans (General purpose finance, housing finance and transport finance) and TADA (in case of out of station assignment). HR manager from Islamabad stated that perks and benefits at Pakistan Bank also include regular bonuses which are given on both Eids, performance-based bonuses, Insurance, health, provident fund and gratuity. In addition to that if the employee is AVP level or above Pakistan Bank also sponsors LUMS MBA which costs around 22 lacs.

Millennials were asked which benefit is most important for them, the interviewee's chose either medical or loans. All candidates suggested that medical should also include parents of the candidate as they need it the most presently, it includes employees only spouse and children and has a cap limit of 4 lac 50 thousand. Perks and benefits provided by Pakistan Bank were praised and employees validated the fact that all the perks and benefits are communicated properly to all employees at the time of joining and then via emails.

HR-B stated that in his view millennials give a lot of importance to trainings and certifications.

***“If someone is sent on training from Pakistan Bank there is a 100% reimbursement of payment. So, this benefit and yes LUMS sponsored MBA is a hot perk for them. Attending all these trainings and certifications increases employee's employability”.***

#### **4.3.5 Salary Vs Benefits & Perks**

From the interviews it could be inferred that five out of six millennials preferred salary over perks & benefits. A millennial stated that he would opt for a good salary package as other benefits automatically depend on salary, if salary is good then benefits would automatically be good (M-A).

***“Millennials like to live in the now and do not plan that far ahead hence for him a good salary package is much better. My point being I have so much to do and so many things to buy right now, I cannot keep waiting for my pension or other benefits” (M-C).***

According to HR manager the main reason for choosing salary is because salary is fixed but perks can vary, plus there is an additional increment on salary every year. On the other hand, perks are because of your post and may differ for the same post for example if there's one SVP who is not a regional head his perks will be different from someone who is an SVP and also a regional head so one's job postings can change the perks one receives (HR-D). Millennials care about what they can take home which in this case is salary.

A generation X member commented that for them provident fund is the most beneficial benefit for which every employee is eligible. Some amount is cut from the salary and at the end of career a lump sum amount is given but millennials do not see the benefit of it and think that their salary is being taken away from them as they do not want to plan so far ahead (GX-B).

#### **4.3.6 Compensation: Reason for millennial job hopping?**

In order to understand whether compensation was the sole and biggest reason for millennials job hopping the respondents were asked to give their perspective. According to a member of generation X, millennials are “On the Go generation”, meaning that millennials are always looking for jobs, taking seconds to decide to switch wherever it's better for them and whenever they get a chance. She further added that millennials usually stay a year or two and are very difficult generation to retain because of their restless. The reason for this restlessness is because society has become very hostile and the inflation keeps on increasing hence, they are worried about their finances.

All respondents unanimously agreed the reason for this job hoping was not only because of compensation but due to many other reasons.

***“Mostly the reason for job hopping is compensation but it is not the only reason. In my experience if this generation are in a good bond with seniors and they are in a comfort zone with seniors then they do not leave. Oh, also if you involve them in decision making then they also tend to stay” (GX-B)***

As per HR managers, millennials leave because of their bosses. It was noted that in Pakistan Bank some older bosses have become very stagnant and are not adaptable to change so when millennials leave, they leave their bosses as sometimes bosses become very insecure if a young person comes and performs better than them. The second reason for millennials job switching is over confidence, since millennials are knowledgeable, they find themselves less vulnerable compared to older generations. Older generations when joined an organization would mostly stay with it till retirement without caring for personal development but millennials are not faithful to the organizations, they are faithful to their careers and as they are skillful, they know they can sell themselves. The third reason noticed is personal development, when they have opportunity for it they tend to stay longer. Therefore, working environment is of most importance to this generation

***“working environment... Working environment is very important to retain millennials, if it is satisfying then maybe even salary would not matter to them. If the environment is such that they are being mentally tortured, then you can give them amazing salary and would still be unable to retain them. I have noticed they would rather stay somewhere where salary is less but they have mental satisfaction and feel like they are being listened to” (HR-B)***

Millennials also validated the statements by HR managers as one stated that if they are not getting professional growth, their bosses are not good and they are not being heard in the organization then even if they get a good salary they would switch as career growth is just as important to them. A millennial claimed that the bargaining power has now moved from employer to employee

***“The momentum has shifted because people of our generation are more aware of themselves and their powers compared to elder generation, I think HR practices of today accommodate employee more” (M-C)***

#### **4.4 HR PRACTICE OF TRAINING:**

Training is not just important to the company but also vital. Pakistan Bank had a training department by the name of LNDC however the focus on trainings was exceptionally low with all generations being extremely dissatisfied with the type of trainings provided.

Trainings at Pakistan Bank
Millennials response to training
Digital Vs Instructor Led Trainings

## HR Practice of training (theme 4)

### 4.4.1 Trainings at Pakistan Bank

According to HR manager who deals with trainings at Pakistan Bank

***“if we talk about ratio, last year it was 0.6 trainings per year for one person but it should be brought to at least 1 training per year per person” (HR-D)***

On an average all respondents claimed to have had less than 3 trainings since they have joined Pakistan Bank. Many respondents said that in Pakistan Bank employees are “named for the training”, as an employee stated that those people who have to attend the training get an email and then they have to attend it. Employees whose names are chosen by their Bosses get to attend the training without keeping employee’s willingness in mind. Reason for doing this as explained by HR manager is because if trainings are left on the employees to attend, no one would attend them.

MTO’s in Pakistan Bank have to undergo a 4-month long training at joining which is divided into two parts, on the job training and class room training. The duration of both trainings is 2 months each. When asked if they had to go through any trainings after that MTO’s claimed that they did not undergo any training but generally staff members go through 2-3 trainings per year, which is mandated by LNDC. LNDC is a department of Pakistan Bank in Lahore which manages trainings held in Pakistan Bank all over Pakistan

***“The classroom training was not beneficial at all, people just come and explain stuff and we were not interested at all. On the job training was practical and beneficial and I still remember what I did back then, and it was so effective. Classroom training was simply useless” (M-A).***

#### 4.4.2 Millennials response to training

Older generation viewed trainings provided at Pakistan Bank to be useless and repetitive. A member of generation X commented

***“Trainings are useless here; they are instructor led. We are delivered a lecture by an instructor. I have myself delivered some trainings and no one learns. Same mistakes are repeated and attendees call us later on same issues on which trainings were given” (GX-C)***

They are of the view that in Pakistan Bank, trainings are so useless that no one even discusses about them and treat it just like any other task. The statement of HR manager in this regard was that trainings provided at Pakistan Bank are basically like a chore to them and the reason for this is that people from older generation have a lot of experience in their jobs and they know more about the trainers as most jobs in banking sector are monotonous. Seniors have repeatedly done those jobs repeatedly and hence these things become muscle memory for them. (HR-D)

On the other hand, millennials are interested in trainings if it makes sense to them and appeals their minds , if training provided succeeds in doing that they enjoy it. At Pakistan Bank trainings were said to not be beneficial as they are either enforced by seniors or by state bank hence being reduced to the status of a “chore”. The response to these trainings is also tepid as they are compulsory to attend. A millennial added

***“trainings here are so useless , everyones sleeping through them and no one is paying attention. Millennials are not interested in these trainings. We are restless, we need something exciting, something that will grab onto our attention but seminars and presentations do not do that” (M-A)***

The HR managers were of the view that millennials response to training is admirable and they take the trainings seriously as it is more attractive and new to them, especially trainings about banking systems. Older generation has become experts therefore they do not have a lot to learn from these trainings as sometimes the trainer himself is less experienced than the older generation. Although

millennials have a positive response to trainings but in Pakistan most trainings are not on par to them. For example most of the trainings given here are through old approaches and old tools and millennials are more learned and modern in their approaches to be engaged by these old training processes.

#### 4.4.3 Digital Vs Instructor Led Trainings

In Pakistan Bank the trainings are instructor led rather than being digital. These trainings are in the form of a lecture delivered by an instructor either as a presentation or a seminar (M-A). A millennial interviewee stated that the focus of Pakistan Bank on trainings is very low and everyone is expected to learn by trial and error. When asked why Pakistan Bank's focus on training is so low, it was because Pakistan Bank is cost conscious, good trainings and courses are costly and Pakistan Bank is not ready to spend a hefty amount on it (GX-A). All millennials were of the view that Pakistan Bank should move towards digital trainings as presentations and seminars do not add anything in one's knowledge. On the question of how Pakistan Bank can improve its training process a millennial added

***“we are so easy using portals and are computer literate, we should take trainings online but older people are inexperienced when it comes to computers, sometimes they just close the computer programs in the middle of the trainings by mistake and that makes us really laugh” (M-E)***

HR managers were of the view that digital technology can not really be used in banks as one stated

***“yeah digital trainings are good but I think in digital trainings you cannot take feedback of the employees. In presentation and seminars, trainees are in front of you and you can see their facial expressions and their response and correct them right away” (HR-B)***

He was of the view that instead of using digital technology, the current form of training can be improved by hiring better trainer and by providing better material to the trainees. During trainings millennials should be made to do everything with their own hands in order to understand the processes and should be given a free hand so they learn by trial and error. Another HR manager stated that Pakistan Bank is trying to incorporate digital trainings as some trainings and



certifications are being uploaded on the Pakistan Bank's Portal. He was also of the view that improvement in trainings can be made more activity based and role based and can be done by mixing seminars and presentations with other forms of trainings like role based and case study based trainings. (HR-D).

## **CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

The previous chapter presented an in depth analysis of how millennials are perceived in the organization and whether HR Practice of recruitment , compensation and training are designed by HR managers keeping in mind this new generation. This chapter will cover general discussion about the research findings and theme wise explanation of study. In the end, this chapter will discuss the contributions made to literature by this study and the limitations of the study guiding directions for future research.

### **5.1 PERCEPTION OF MILLENNIALS IN THE WORKPLACE**

The first line of inquiry for this research was how are millennials perceived in the organization compared to other generations and how millennials perceive themselves. According to this research, the term “millennial generation” was not commonly used in Public sector Bank and employees had a very weak idea about this term. On the contrary, organizations world wide are trying to understand this generation and to explore their work life preferences in order to identify the work place attributes that are attractive to this generation (Zaharee et al., 2018). This generation was raised to believe in themselves, are great at multi tasking and are highly collaborative. Furthermore, they grew up with internet hence they are comfortable with technology and social media. Findings revealed that millennials in Pakistan like all over the world have same expectations from their workplace; they would prefer recruitment to be online, want digitalized trainings and want good compensation and working environments for themselves.

This showed similarity with western literature (Kurz, Li, Vien., 2019) however, as Pakistan is a developing country, majority organizations, with the exception of few multi nationals, are not able to provide the same employment and working conditions. This results in millennials being dissatisfied and eager to leave the organization for better prospects. From my analysis we can conclude that millennials in Pakistan are also perceived as techno-holic, restless generation that is over confident and prefer flexible working environments but public sector has been unable to design HR practices according to this new generations preference.

### 5.1.1 Millennials technology dependence

One of the biggest distinguishing factor of millennials from other generations is their use of technology. Managers and generation X stated that this dependancy on technology is a double edged sword, since they are so used to technology when they step in proffessional environments they have problems with traditional modalities like talking face to face or not always being able to rely on the internet. They are used to fast modes of communication through internet and social media hence in a non virtual environment they become complacent and bored. This goes in accordance with studies by (Canedo et al., 2017) and (Bauman and Sherbina, 2018). Their attention spans are also much lower than their predecessor generations hence they also lack insight and critical thinking.

### 5.1.2 Co-existing generations

Research suggests that conflicts between generations arise due to the power gradient between them, which can increase or decrease. If there is a rise in power of the younger generation this results in conflict between generations (Connoly, 2019) hence younger and older generations remain in a constant power dynamic and conflict because of career channels. It is reported in the western world that the conflict between different generations working together is increasing leading to organizational problems as currently there are three different generations working together (Bako, 2018) however in Pakistan this generational conflict was not commonly seen. This is due to the cultural aspect of respecting elders in Asian countries like Pakistan, India, China etc also known as “felial piety”, in which collective values are supported by general respect to elderly.

In these cultures, providing provisions to elders sometimes results in unfavorable conditions for the younger generations (Chan and Wang, 2019). According to Yeh et al (2013) recently it has been noticed that although this principle is weakening but it is still socially unacceptable to speak against it in these Asian cultures. Although seniors did get insecure if younger employees perform better than them but this does not result in serious conflicts as younger employees respect them and do not misbehave. Research findings highlighted that unlike western countries where people are bold, millennials in Pakistan cannot speak up to the elders and sometimes this felial piety results in abuse of power against youngsters but generally both generations work in harmony with

each other. Millennials expressed that although they are more educated than the previous generation but they still need guidance from them and the perception of their generation is also changing, in the start they were perceived as restless and aggressive generation but now they are perceived as subordinates by elders.

## 5.2 HR PRACTICES IN PUBLIC BANKS OF PAKISTAN

The second line of enquiry was whether “HR practices and policies (Compensation, recruitment and training) designed by managers keeping in mind the millennial workers in the workplace? How and why?” The findings of the study concluded that Public banks in Pakistan still follow old HR practices and have not designed them according to the millennial generation. Recruitment and trainings are still done traditionally, and compensation is also not up to the mark however reasons of why public banks show reluctance in designing HR practices according to millennial generation are discussed below

HR PRACTICES	ALIGNMENT OF HR PRACTICES WITH MILLENNIALS PERCEPTIONS	REASONS FOR MISALIGNMENT IN PUBLIC BANKS OF PAKISTAN
Recruitment	No	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Actively job searching youth in Pakistan resulting in a large pool of candidates</li> <li>• Pakistan’s demographic Digital divide</li> <li>• Generation Based Digital Divide with two distinct generations working together</li> </ul>
Compensation	Somewhat	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost constraints for public banks</li> <li>• Influx of fresh graduates resulting in a large pool of candidates for public banks</li> <li>• Public banks provide long term benefits hence millennials keep working for them</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Public banks provide greater job security</li> </ul>
<b>Training</b>	No	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost consciousness of public banks</li> <li>• Two distinct generations with differing needs and wants</li> <li>• Lack of open communication with employees</li> </ul>

**Table 5: Summary of discussion**

### 5.2.1 RECRUITMENT

An efficient recruitment and hiring system is necessary for an organization to stay in business by resolving challenges faced by employees. These practices help in improving employment relations, workers well being and also over all employee performance. However effectively utilizing the human capital has not gained much attention in Pakistan (Khattak & Ilyas, 2019). In recent years, the issue of integrating millennials in the job market has become a great concern world wide as they will account for 50% of the total workforce by 2025 (Pinzaru, Mhalcea & Zbucea , 2019). Therefore it has put enormous pressures on HR managers to change the processes and strategies and find ways to recruit and attract this young generation. When it comes to millennials in Pakistan, they also prefer modern recruiting techniques over traditional ones owing to their ease with technology and internet.

However according to this research, Pakistani public banks are still following traditional recruitment practices with little to no use of e recruitment as advertisements for jobs are given in national newspapers with an email id, the screenshot of which is also posted on their official websites. Candidates are asked to email their CV to the given adress. After this, if the candidate is selected they receive a call from the bank for the test or interview, if not selected the candidate does not get any call. The candidates then undergo a test and a panel interview and are selected for the post. However, the use of internet in all this process is minimal whereas millennials want this process to be through modern ways. Although Public banks show reluctance in going towards online recruitment it does not mean E-recruitment is non existent in Pakistan. Telecom sector,

which is said to be the fastest growing sector in Pakistan does most of its hiring via online job portals and websites. Most of these companies outsource recruitment to save cost. Companies like Huawei are also using global university recruitment plan which allows it to hire students from universities via an online portal. According to Hassan, Aftab & Shujaat (2015) Pakistan is still at the lower end of the e recruitment spectrum owing to lower literacy rate of general population and dearth of IT professionals however there are plenty of Pakistani companies like Huawei, Nestle that have used technology in the recruitment process and have reaped benefits in terms of cost by using social media like Facebook and LinkedIn in addition to traditional recruitment ways.

Studies show (for example Dalessandro, 2018; Pinzaru et al., 2017) that Western literature has shown that organizations give due importance to millennials and design HR practices accordingly but has remained quite about developing eastern countries which do not develop HR practices according to millennials and the reason as to why it happens. This study aims to highlight the reasons, such as actively job searching youth and generational and demographic divide due to which public banks do not feel the need to move towards modern recruitment practices and makes major contribution towards existing pool of knowledge.

#### **a) Actively Job Searching Youth**

Batu (2016) explained unemployment as when a person is actively looking for a job but is unable to find one and according to studies the youth unemployment rate is about two times higher than adults and is a pressing issue for both developed and underdeveloped countries. In Pakistan there is a need to address unemployed youth as the problem is paramount and is multi faceted including higher youth unemployment rates, young people working unpaid, unemployed female youth and casual wage workers etc (Faisal, Hyder and Zaidi, 2019). Very often young people do not have guidance on how and where to look for jobs therefore when a single vacancy appears, thousands of people from all over the country apply for it. This is due to an excessive number of actively job searching youth which is eager to get a job and hence apply rapidly to vacancies. Shakeel, Jadoon and Bashir (2019) state that high unemployment rate in Pakistan which was recorded at 4.45% in 2019 is making it tough for youth to land jobs as the number of jobs that are offered are much less than the number of job candidates. A report published by Cho & Majoka (2020) claimed that amongst those unemployed in Pakistan, 49% showed desire to be employed in government sector rather than private whereas only 5% jobs are available in the public sector. Due to all these reasons,

the public sector banks do not feel the need to go towards online recruitment as they are getting a big pool of candidates even without it.

#### **b) Pakistan's demographic Digital divide**

Digital divide is the gap that exists between those who can efficiently use technological tools such as internet and those who can not. Pakistan is one of the developing countries of the world having modern cities like lahore, islamabad and karachi in which internet is easily accesible and then there is a large population living in rural areas without basic facilities and internet. It has a population of 180 million out of which 36% live in cities and 64% live in rural areas and out of this 64% only 16% are said to be using internet (shokat et al.,2018). People in AJ&K, baluchistan and Gilgit baltisan have very limited internet facilities but newspapers are easily available all over Pakistan as there are 707 newspapers in total in 2019 according to Pakistan Bureau of statitsics. The Landscape of Pakistani media is multi linguistic and class divided and there is a division between Urdu and English media where Urdu newspapers are consumed in high numbers especially in rural areas (Alam and Jallandhary, 2019). Therefore, due to this digital divide public sector banks are reluctant to go towards online recruitment as most of the population would not be able to have access to job postings posted online where as newspapers are readily available all over Pakistan. Another reason for public banks preffering to recruit through newspapers was highlighted in this research. They further clarified that because a large population in Pakistan still does not have access to internet if the job is just posted online, many people are unable to access it and it makes the whole process biased and raises ethical concerns.

#### **c) Generation Based Digital Divide**

There is no denying the fact that internet has become an integral part of our lives. According to studies, more than 95% youth in USA and switzerland and making use of internet and technology (Konig, seifert and Doh., 2018). According to this research, the same stands true for Pakistan, millennials are actively using the internet including social media sites and have shown ease in handling technology. However older generation showed reluctancy when it comes to digital technology. This has also been noted in developed countries, like Switzerland, where people of age 60+ are less proeficient in using internet (Ladhani, Gontheir and Lajante,2019). The findings suggest that two distinct generations are working in the Bank, the millennials and the

generation X. The older generation openly showed reluctance when it came to internet usage and modern processes, therefore in an organization where both generations are working side by side, it becomes difficult to go towards a pure online system when one generation has openly expressed their unease and difficulty using it.

### 5.2.2 TRAININGS

Plenty of studies in recent years have started to look into what kinds of trainings are beneficial and which environments can millennials be trained in. As a result, it has been concluded that traditional training methods and techniques like lecture style formats is ineffective for this generation (Waljee Chopra and Saint,2020). Presentations on power point also do not seem to interest them hence it has become important to incorporate technology like gamifications in trainings to make them more fun and interesting. Millennials want the learning environment to be collaborative, interesting , purposeful and intellectually challenging.

According to this study millennials prefer training as it develops them and gives them opportunity to grow in the future as these millennials are said to be more loyal to their careers than their organization. They are especially interested in online trainings as these individualized trainings give the trainee an opportunity to pace through the training at their own pace and in the order they prefer rather than a homogenous training for all participants. However, it was noticed that the organization is not employing any new technology related trainings despite the HR managers knowing that neither millennials nor generation X is interested in them. This resulted in all generations being highly uninterested and indifferent to trainings being provided according to the interviews taken for this study.

Trainings although implemented were through traditional modalities like seminars and lectures and were not up to mark for millennials, hence millennials treated them as a chore and were not excited about it which resulted in no learning, this goes in accordance to studies by Bernardez, Guzzo and Madera (2019). The number of trainings is also very low, with an average of 2 to 3 trainings per person in a year. Mostly when a training has to be given, the manager names their subordinates for training whether the subordinate wants to attend the training or not, which according to millennials decreases their interest in the training as it is forced. It is also noted that millennials prefer online trainings over traditional methods because online methods allow them to move at their own pace and in the order of their preference.



Western culture has a lot of research on training methods suitable for millennials however South Asian literature remains quiet in the aspect of the kind of trainings millennials in these countries want from their jobs and the kind of trainings provided to millennials. This research will add to the literature and try to explain the reason as to why public banks are reluctant to go towards modern training practices

#### **a) Cost Consciousness**

According to this research, Public sector Banks still have a long way to go as lectures are still the most used form of training. This is done to save costs because Public sector banks are state owned and they are pursuing cost efficiency (Bonin, Hasan and Watchtel, 2005). For Public banks, training is not important enough to spend millions on it as the same can be done through lectures or through trial and error as banking jobs are mostly monotonous. Secondly, this research claimed that organizations are of the view that online trainings cannot incorporate feedback as trainees are not in front of the trainer, however that is not the case, research suggests online training is in fact cost effective as this can provide skills and knowledge to all employees at a lower cost without geographical constraints, helping training reach a wide audience at a lower cost (Maguire et al., 2019). For online trainings one doesn't need to hire a trainer and a specific venue. Furthermore, elements like interactivity and feedback can also be incorporated in these online trainings which optimize the effect of training.

#### **b) Two Distinct Generations**

Although millennials want the trainings to be online, for an organization having a large generation X population, it can be a double edged sword. Different generations have different learning styles hence it is important to develop training techniques to suit preferences of the trainee (Urick, 2017). When trainings are given it is important that every employee of the organization can absorb necessary information regardless of the generation they belong to. This research found significant differences between the two generations, including less enthusiasm and participation of older employees in trainings. The findings suggested that the young generation is more likely to be perceived as being comfortable with technology based trainings, by themselves, generation X and HR managers. The older generation claimed to be less technologically proficient claiming

technology based training would not be as helpful to them. However even older generation was not satisfied with the trainings being provided to them.

### **c) Lack of Open Communication**

Pakistan is known to have a closed culture, where communication is kept secretive and decision making is done behind closed doors. This results in voices of employees not being heard. When it comes to training, all millennials were extremely dissatisfied with the traditional trainings provided and wanted to move towards online or e-trainings. Although generation X showed their unease with e trainings but they were also dissatisfied and uninterested in the trainings being provided to them in the form of lectures and seminars. This lack of enthusiasm was due to instructor led trainings as they are experienced and sometimes even have more expertise and knowledge than the instructor himself. Despite all of this, the organization is paying no attention to its employees and continues with its old training policies. The higher management and HR managers decide the trainings and without getting feedback incorporate it in the system.

### **5.2.3 COMPENSATION**

Compensation is the reason people work as without it a majority of people would not be interested to do their jobs. If money was absent from the equation, people would be more interested in areas that are enjoyable rather than those needed by society (Lazear, 2018). When it comes to millennials, research suggests that they look for meaningful work more than other generations however they are also interested in materialistic rewards (Johnson and Ng, 2016). This research concluded that millennials are interested in well paying pays but are also interested in a good working environment and the reason for switching is mostly unfavourable working conditions rather than compensation. Millennials claimed that if the working environment is positive and they feel heard they would not have to job hop as much,

It has been established that in Pakistan public sector banks pay less than private sector banks, however there are some reasons why millennials still work for these banks and what are the constraints due to which public banks pay less

### **a) Public sector bank**

According to studies in developed countries, on average public sector pays 5.1% more hourly wage compared to private sector (Mahuteau et al., 2017). However this is not the case in underdeveloped countries where researches have concluded that on an average private sector employees have higher wages than public sector employees. In Pakistan, it's a common misconception that a large share of GDP goes towards the salaries of public sector employees but according to work bank statistics, Pakistan spends less than 1% of its total GDP on wages of public sector employees which is much lesser than 9 and 10% that UK and USA spend respectively. Pakistans neighbouring country Bangladesh spends 1.7% of its GDP on public sector employees despite being an underdeveloped country. Hence all public organizations in Pakistan face a cost constraint and have to pay lesser wages compared to private sector.

### **b) Job security**

Although public sector pays less, people still prefer to work for them, the biggest reason for which is Job security. Public sector almost always promises job security irrespective of the dedication and level of work put into the job. Having the security that one would not lose there job in a good or bad circumstance is a dream of any job seeker as a public sector job promises a secure future. In private sector organizations although the wages are more but there is no job security, most of the employees are hired on contractual basis and the organization reserves the right to dismiss any employer on a 14 days notice. Another disadvantage of working in private sector organizations whether large or small is they can close down anytime, this chance is very low in government owned organizations where the chance of government closing down are almost negligible.

### **c) Long term benefits**

In Pakistan, Mostly middle class and lower middle aspire to get these government jobs as they provide job security, promotions, increments and retirement benefits. Research findings highlighted that almost all generations, including millennials working in the bank were highly satisfied with the perks and benefits given by the organization. In the past, public sector used to pay higher than private companies but in the recent years private organizations have increased their

salaries. However, in public organizations employees have a monthly salary plus other perks and benefits. Many government jobs offer free medical, housing and even a vehicle is allotted at higher posts. Despite these benefits, there is also fuel, educational allowance and TADA. Some private jobs offer these benefits too but are mostly not at par with a public organization. Hence according to this study, public banks are of the view that even if their salaries are lower than other sectors, the perks and benefits provided by them are much better than private organizations and hence employees can have the same standard of living as their private counterparts.

#### **d) Influx of fresh graduates**

Pakistan has a problem of unemployment and is an underdeveloped country. If you do not have a job the government would not be responsible to provide basic necessities like food, clothing, shelter etc unlike welfare states which provide a monthly stipend to unemployed citizens. Other than that there is a large number of graduates produced every year in the market by universities but the jobs are not available readily. Therefore, in countries like Pakistan people are also willing to work low paying jobs. This sometimes makes the organizations take unfair advantage from employees, making them work long hours and not paying them according to their education level etc. In Public banks although MTO's are hired at a market competitive salary, general hires are hired on a very less pay despite being highly educated having a bachelors or Masters degree.

### **5.3 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS**

This dissertation makes contributions to literature in different ways. First, it focused on considering the perceptions from different perspectives i.e., millennials, generation X and HR managers in the developing body of literature. Focus of the study was on millennials as the research findings are intended to help employers understand how to recruit, compensate and train millennials in the workplaces. The interviews consisted of 12 semi structured interviews in order to understand the millennials' workplace expectations and the practices they prefer in terms of HR practices of recruitment, training and compensation. This was done to understand whether the millennial generation of a developing country Pakistan, is any different from millennials of developed countries. Since this research focused on millennials, their views were of utmost importance in the

HR practices debate because their perceptions would give an idea about the actual occurrences in the organization. Hence contributions in literature are made by inviting the voice of millennial generation.

Secondly, as mentioned, interviews were also taken from the older generation and HR managers so an in depth understanding of the issue could be taken from other employees as well. HR managers were able to tell whether HR practices have been designed keeping the millennial generation in mind and if not then the reasons for it. This was done to elaborate how the millennial generation and their behaviors are perceived through the lens of various stakeholders. Interviews taken from generation X helped in gauging how millennials are different from their generation. This research helps in further diversifying the literature available on millennial and HR practices.

Thirdly, research extended the literature by responding to the calls of Urick et al., (2017) that suggested that more work should be done on the context in which different individuals understand the term “generation” and the process through which these meanings are formed. This would help to understand the uniqueness in older and younger generation’s understandings. Hence, one of the purposes of this research was the exploration of how different members in the workplace look at the concept of generation. To do this, different generations were asked how they understood their and the other generation and what differences they noticed. Therefore, this paper helped in considering how individuals understand the term “generation” and then made contributions to understand the generational differences present in the organization. It was noticed that every participant had their own meaning attached to the concept of generations and had their unique understanding about the term which suggesting that this concept is more complex than previously thought of.

Lastly, extension in literature has been done by considering Asian context in literature, which was previously skewed towards Western countries. This study responded to the calls of researches who stressed that there was a need to understand the context specific HRM practices keeping in mind the millennial generation (Kheran & Malik., 2018). Researches done previously on millennials and HR practices are considered less helpful when applied in the context of developing countries like Pakistan. Contributions are made by using context specific approaches which would help both practitioners and scholars to understand the unique values of south Asian countries like Pakistan. Another main contribution of this study is that it is exploring the public sector Bank of Pakistan in

order to understand the HR practices present there and whether public banks have changed their HR practices as this new generation stepped inside the workplace with entirely different behaviors and values.

Furthermore, Researchers like Urick et al., (2017) recommended for future research to be more qualitative and from different industries. For this purpose, single case study design method is selected which helped in collecting rich immersion of data that expanded our understanding beyond what is currently understood which would not be possible using quantitative methods. Therefore, this study still serves as a decent funnel, allowing academics and practitioners within the field to gear their research directions toward the crucial, yet under-examined, aspects of the generational phenomenon.

#### **5.4 LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE RESEARCH DIRECTIONS**

In order to understand the full understanding of the subject, few obstacles were faced. The first limitation was that the participants that were interviewed were only millennials in an urban city belonging to middle and upper class hence their values and experiences might be different from millennials belonging to rural areas. Future research could also try to incorporate the millennials from smaller cities and lower social strata. Second limitation could be the presence of social desirability bias, as interviews were taken face to face and participants knew the audio was being recorded the participants may have given positive experiences and accounts in order to appear favorable to the researcher.

Furthermore, as they knew the importance of the study being conducted, there is a chance of interviewees being more critical of their answers as they had an idea, they would be making contributions to something significant. Future research could carry a mixed method study which would result in higher validity and reliability and could include things like demographic, the class and the gender to see if this results in different values and behaviors. Third limitation is that only one public sector bank was selected to carry out the study and other banks were not targeted since it was a single case study, hence future research could be carried out to target other public and private sector banks so that the results of the study can be generalized across the whole sector.

## CONCLUSION

The word millennial is used for individuals born between the years 1980 to 1994. The literature reviewed talked about different perspectives and views on how millennials are different from other generations claiming that they differ in terms of values, beliefs and technology usage. It is because of these differences that this generation should be treated differently. However, the organization researched upon in this thesis has not been able to gain and sustain advantage using this generation. The results of this study indicate that millennials perceptions and behaviors in Pakistan about Human Resource practices are just like perceptions of millennials in the western world and developed countries. Values, behaviors and attitudes of millennials are also quite similar to millennials in other parts of the world despite Pakistan being an underdeveloped country however they are being managed in Public banks using old HR practices. Public banks have been unable to bring about changes in their HR keeping in mind this generation which has resulted in this generation being unsatisfied with the banks policies.

The purpose of this research was to find out how millennials perceive HR practices in the banking sector of Pakistan and whether HR managers keep this generation in mind while designing the HR practice. For this purpose, millennials and generation X was interviewed and the HR managers making the policies were also interviewed. This research is drawn primarily upon generational identity theory and the experiences of employees are conceptualized at individual level. This research study has been able to shed light on the perspectives of millennials and the complexities facing the public banks in Pakistan due to which they are unable to design HR policies suiting millennials. By considering millennials at the heart of the new workplace the researcher has presented a broad and compelling landscape for further development in the field of generational studies.

## REFERENCES

- Alam, R., & Jullandhary, S. (2019). Coverage of Baluchistan Issues in leading Newspapers of Pakistan. *Journal of Media Studies*, 32(2).
- Antwi, S. K. & Hamza, K. 2015. Qualitative and quantitative research paradigms in business research: A philosophical reflection. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 7, 217-225.
- Ashforth, B. E., Harrison, S. H. & Corley, K. G. (2008). Identification in organizations: An examination of four fundamental questions. *Journal of management*, 34, 325-374.
- Barreto, A. R. A. (2018). *How to attract Millennials & Generation Z into an organization in the business area in Portugal*.
- Beauchamp, M. R. (2019). Promoting exercise adherence through groups: A self-categorization theory perspective. *Exercise and Sport Sciences Reviews*, 47(1), 54-61.
- Bencsik, A., Horváth-Csikós, G. & Juhász, T. (2016). Y and Z Generations at Workplaces. *Journal of Competitiveness*, 8.
- Bernard, H. R. (2017). *Research methods in anthropology: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*, Rowman & Littlefield.
- Boehm, S. A., Kunze, F. & Bruch, H. (2014). Spotlight on age-diversity climate: The impact of age-inclusive HR practices on firm-level outcomes. *Personnel Psychology*, 67, 667-704.
- Brack, J. & Kelly, K. (2012). Maximizing millennials in the workplace. *UNC Executive Development*, 22, 2-14.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Byles, J., Tavener, M., Robinson, I., Parkinson, L., Smith, P. W., Stevenson, D., Leigh, L. & Curryer, C. (2013). Transforming retirement: New definitions of life after work. *Journal of women & aging*, 25, 24-44.
- Calk, R. & Patrick, A. (2017). Millennials through the looking glass: Workplace motivating factors. *The Journal of Business Inquiry*, 16, 131-139.
- Calloway, C. (2018). Recruiting and Retaining Generations X and Y in Organizations.
- Campione, W. A. (2015). Corporate Offerings: Why Aren't Millennials Staying? *Journal of Applied Business & Economics*, 17.



- Cantrell, M. A., & Farer, D. (2019). Millennial Nursing Students' Experiences in a Traditional Classroom Setting. *Journal of Nursing Education*, 58(1), 27-32.
- Carlsson, G. & Karlsson, K. (1970). Age, cohorts and the generation of generations. *American Sociological Review*, 710-718.
- Chan, R. K., & Wang, L. R. (2019). Generational conflict and provisions for the elderly in Hong Kong: The relevance of position-based interest and values. *Asian Social Work and Policy Review*, 13(1), 25-35.
- Clark, K. R. (2017). Managing multiple generations in the workplace. *Radiologic technology*, 88, 379-396.
- Connolly, J. (2019). Generational conflict and the sociology of generations: Mannheim and Elias reconsidered. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 36(7-8), 153-172.
- Costa, A. S. (2018). *Neuromarketing in Ireland-an investigation on millennials attitudes towards neuromarketing in the era of GDPR*. Dublin Business School.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications. David, M. and Sutton, C. D. 2004. *Social Research: The Basics*. London: Sage Publications.
- Dalessandro, C. (2018). Recruitment Tools for Reaching Millennials: The Digital Difference. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 17, 1609406918774446.
- Davis, J. L., Love, T. P., & Fares, P. (2019). Collective social identity: Synthesizing identity theory and social identity theory using digital data. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 82(3), 254-273.
- Deloitte, I. (2017). Predicciones sobre tecnología, medios y telecomunicaciones: <https://www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/cr/Documents/technology-media-telecommunications/estudios.TMT-Predictions-2017-spanish.pdf>.
- Diccico-Bloom, B. & Crabtree, B. F. (2006). The qualitative research interview. *Medical education*, 40, 314-321.
- Donmoyer, R. (1990). Generalizability and the single-case study. In Eisner, E. W. & Peshkin, A. *Qualitative inquiry in education: the continuing debate*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Dutta, D. (2014). Tweet your tune - social media, the new pied piper in talent acquisition. *Vikalpa: The Journal for Decision Makers* 39(3), 93-104.

- Easterby-Smith, M., R. Thorpe, and A. Lowe. (2002). *Management Research an Introduction*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Farghaly, A. (2018). Comparing and Contrasting Quantitative and Qualitative Research Approaches in Education: The Peculiar Situation of Medical Education. *Education in Medicine Journal*, 10.
- Fernandes, C., Farinha, J., Martins, F. V. & Mateus, C. (2018). Bank governance and performance: a survey of the literature. *Journal of Banking Regulation*, 19, 236-256.
- Finkelstein, L. M., Gonnerman Jr, M. E. & Foxgrover, S. K. (2001). The stability of generation identification over time and across contexts. *Experimental aging research*, 27, 377-397.
- Fiona B., Deborah, A. B., Michael, E., Janine, L., & Damian, W. (2015). Can enhanced performance management support public sector change? *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 28 (2), 271 – 289.
- Follmer, E. H., Talbot, D. L., Kristof-Brown, A. L., Astrove, S. L. & Billsberry, J. (2018). Resolution, relief, and resignation: A qualitative study of responses to misfit at work. *Academy of Management Journal*, 61, 440-465.
- Fry, R. (2016). Millennials overtake Baby Boomers as America’s largest generation. *Pew Research Center*, 25.
- Fuks, M., Paulino, R. O. & Casalecchi, G. A. (2018). Socialization and Political Regimes: the Impact of Generation on Support for Democracy in Latin America. *Brazilian Political Science Review*, 12.
- Gallardo-Gallardo, E. and Thunnissen, M. (2016). Standing on the shoulders of giants? A critical review of empirical talent management research. *Employee Relations*, 38(1), 31-56
- Gephart, R. P. (2004). Qualitative Research and the Academy of Management Journal. *Academy of Management Journal*, 47(4), 454–462. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amj.2004.14438580>
- Gibson, J. W., Greenwood, R. A. & Murphy Jr, E. F. (2009). Generational differences in the workplace: Personal values, behaviors, and popular beliefs. *Journal of diversity management*, 4.

- Gibson, L. A. & Sodeman, W. A. (2014). Millennials and technology: Addressing the communication gap in education and practice. *Organization Development Journal*, 32, 63-75.
- Giles, H. & Turner, J. C. (1981). *Intergroup behavior*, Blackwell Oxford.
- Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. L. (1967). *Discovery of grounded theory*. Mill Valley, CA: *Sociology*.
- Goldman, A. (2004). Epistemology. *Fundamentals of Philosophy*. Routledge.
- Goldstein, I. L. & Ford, J. K. (2002). *Training in Organizations: Needs Assessment, Development, and Evaluation, 4th ed.*, Wadsworth, Belmont, CA.
- Gong, B., Greenwood, R. A., Hoyte, D., Ramkissoon, A., & He, X. (2018). Millennials and organizational citizenship behavior: The role of job crafting and career anchor on service. *Management Research Review*, 41, 774-788.
- Greenwood, R., & Miller, D. (2010). Tackling Design Anew: Getting Back to the Heart of Organizational Theory. *Academy of Management Perspectives*, 24(4), 78–88. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amp.2010.24.4.3655970.a>
- Gregg, G. S. (2017). *Social Values and Moral Intuitions: The World-views of "millennial" Young Adults*, Routledge.
- Hamilton, D. E. (2020). *Retention and Turnover of Millennials in the Workplace: A Qualitative and Phenomenological Methodology* (Doctoral dissertation, California Baptist University).
- Hansen, J.-I. C. & Leuty, M. E. (2012). Work values across generations. *Journal of Career Assessment*, 20, 34-52.
- Heizman, K. E. (2019). *The Effect of Workplace Characteristics on Millennial Worker Organizational Commitment*.
- Hershatter, A. & Epstein, M. (2010). Millennials and the world of work: An organization and management perspective. *Journal of business and psychology*, 25, 211-223.
- Herzig, A. & Treffler, J. (2018). *Cohabitation in Multigenerational Workplaces: Leader-Follower Relationships between Millennials and Baby Boomers*.
- Hesse-Biber, S. & Leavy, P. (2011). An invitation to qualitative research. *The practice of qualitative research*, 3-14.

- Hogg, M. A. (2016). Social identity theory. *Understanding peace and conflict through social identity theory*. Springer.
- Holden, M. T. & Lynch, P. (2004). Choosing the appropriate methodology: Understanding research philosophy. *The marketing review*, 4, 397-409.
- Hughes, J. A. & Sharrock, W. W. (2016). *The philosophy of social research*, Routledge.
- Huynh, Q.-L., Benet-Martínez, V. & Nguyen, A.-M. D. (2018). Measuring variations in bicultural identity across US ethnic and generational groups: Development and validation of the Bicultural Identity Integration Scale—Version 2 (BIIS-2). *Psychological assessment*, 30, 1581.
- Hyman, H. (1959). Political socialization.
- Jackson, V., Stoel, L. & Brantley, A. (2011). Mall attributes and shopping value: Differences by gender and generational cohort. *Journal of retailing and consumer services*, 18, 1-9.
- Jha, N., Sareen, P., & Potnuru, R. K. G. (2019). Employee engagement for millennials: considering technology as an enabler. *Development and Learning in Organizations: An International Journal*.
- Joshi, A., Dencker, J. C., Franz, G. & Martocchio, J. J. (2010). Unpacking generational identities in organizations. *Academy of Management Review*, 35, 392-414.
- Kaur, M., Oney, K., Chadbourne, J., Bookman, K. & Beckman, B. (2018). An Analysis of the Factors which Effectively Attract College Graduates.
- Khattak, A. N., & Ilyas, M. (2019). Recruitment Process and Recruitment Outcomes: An Empirical Study of Business Organizations of Pakistan. *Indonesian Journal of Contemporary Management Research*, 1(2), 140-150.
- Khera, S. N., & Malik, S. (2017). Conceptualizing and measuring life priorities of generation Y: Evidences from Indian context. *Industrial and Commercial Training*.
- König, R., Seifert, A., & Doh, M. (2018). Internet use among older Europeans: an analysis based on SHARE data. *Universal Access in the Information Society*, 17(3), 621-633.
- Krauss, S. E. (2005). Research paradigms and meaning making: A primer. *The qualitative report*, 10, 758-770.

- Kullgren, J. T., Troxel, A. B., Loewenstein, G., Asch, D. A., Norton, L. A., Wesby, L., Tao, Y., Zhu, J. & Volpp, K. G. (2013). Individual-versus group-based financial incentives for weight loss: a randomized, controlled trial. *Annals of internal medicine*, 158, 505-514.
- Kultalahti, S. & Viitala, R. (2015). Generation Y—challenging clients for HRM? *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 30, 101-114.
- Ladhari, R., Gonthier, J., & Lajante, M. (2019). Generation Y and online fashion shopping: Orientations and profiles. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 48, 113-121.
- Lancaster, L. C. & Stillman, D. (2002). *When generations collide: Who they are, why they clash, how to solve the generational puzzle at work*, HarperCollins New York.
- Lazear, Edward P. (2018) "Compensation and Incentives in the Workplace." *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 32, no. 3: 195-214.
- Lee, A. S. (1989). A scientific methodology for MIS case studies. *MIS Quarterly*, 13(1), 33-50
- Leitch, C. M., Hill, F. M. & Harrison, R. T. (2010). The philosophy and practice of interpretivist research in entrepreneurship: Quality, validation, and trust. *Organizational Research Methods*, 13, 67-84.
- Lewis, J. L. & Sheppard, S. R. (2006). Culture and communication: can landscape visualization improve forest management consultation with indigenous communities? *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 77, 291-313.
- Loveland, E. (2017). Instant generation. *Journal of College Admission*, 235, 34-38.
- Lyons, S. & Kuron, L. (2014). Generational differences in the workplace: A review of the evidence and directions for future research. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 35, S139-S157.
- Lyons, S. T., Ng, E. S. & Schweitzer, L. (2014). Launching a career. *Generational diversity at work: New research perspectives*, 148-163.
- Lyons, S., Urlick, M., Kuron, L. & Schweitzer, L. (2015). Generational differences in the workplace: There is complexity beyond the stereotypes. *Industrial and Organizational Psychology*, 8, 346-356.
- Maguire, S., Li, A., Cunich, M., & Maloney, D. (2019). Evaluating the effectiveness of an evidence-based online training program for health professionals in eating disorders. *Journal of eating disorders*, 7(1), 14.

- Mahuteau, S., Mavromaras, K., Richardson, S., & Zhu, R. (2017). Public–private sector wage differentials in Australia. *Economic Record*, 93, 105-121.
- Mannheim, K. 1970. The problem of generations. *Psychoanalytic review*, 57, 378-404.
- Marcie Zaharee, Tristan Lipkie, Stewart K. Mehlman, & Susan K. Neylon (2018). Recruitment and Retention of Early-Career Technical Talent, *Research-Technology Management*, 61:5, 51-61
- Mariasavery, L. (2020). Contemporary Human Capital Issues and Challenges at Modern Workplace-Conceptual Frame Work: A study. *International Journal of Humanities, Management and Social Science*, 3(2), 68-78.
- McGinnis Johnson, J., & Ng, E. S. (2016). Money talks or millennials walk: The effect of compensation on nonprofit millennial workers sector-switching intentions. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 36(3), 283-305.
- Mochi, F., Bissola, R., & Imperatori, B. (2019). Identity and behaviors in the era of social recruiting: The Millennials’ perspective.
- Myers, K. K. & Sadaghiani, K. (2010). Millennials in the workplace: A communication perspective on millennials’ organizational relationships and performance. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 25, 225-238.
- Ng, E. S., Schweitzer, L. & Lyons, S. T. (2010). New generation, great expectations: A field study of the millennial generation. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 25, 281-292.
- Nishii, L. H., Lepak, D. P. & Schneider, B. (2008). Employee attributions of the “why” of HR practices: Their effects on employee attitudes and behaviors, and customer satisfaction. *Personnel psychology*, 61, 503-545.
- Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International journal of qualitative methods*, 16(1), 1609406917733847.
- Padilla-Díaz, M. (2015). Phenomenology in educational qualitative research: Philosophy as science or philosophical science. *International Journal of Educational Excellence*, 1, 101-110.
- Paravano, J., & Schwerha, D. J. (2019). Assessment of Commonly Used Training Techniques and their Overall Effectiveness on the Younger Workforce.

- Pinzaru, F., Mihalcea, A. & Zbucea, A. Recruiting And Motivating Millennials: Empirical Insights For Managers. Proceedings of the INTERNATIONAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE, 2017. Faculty of Management, Academy of Economic Studies, Bucharest, Romania, 729-737.
- PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS, P. (2011). Millennials at Work. Reshaping the Workplace. URL: [http://www.pwc.ru/en\\_RU/ru/hr-consulting/publications/assets/millennials-survey.pdf](http://www.pwc.ru/en_RU/ru/hr-consulting/publications/assets/millennials-survey.pdf) (дата обращения).
- Pyöriä, P., Ojala, S., Saari, T., & Järvinen, K. M. (2017). The millennial generation: a new breed of labour?. *sage Open*, 7(1), 2158244017697158.
- Robertson, S. (2017). The Millennial Generation and Philanthropy: The Time for Engagement is Now.
- Van Rossem, A. H. (2019). Generations as social categories: An exploratory cognitive study of generational identity and generational stereotypes in a multigenerational workforce. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 40(4), 434-455.
- Ryder, N. B. (1965). The Cohort as a Concept in the Study of Social Change. S. 9-44 in: William M. Mason und Stephen E. Fienberg (Hg.), *Cohort Analysis in Social Reserach. Beyond the Identification Problem*. New York/Heidelberg/Toronto: Springer.
- Ryder, N. B. (1985). The cohort as a concept in the study of social change. *Cohort analysis in social research*. Springer.
- Sakdiyakorn, M., & Wattanacharoensil, W. (2018). Generational diversity in the workplace: A systematic review in the hospitality context. *Cornell Hospitality Quarterly*, 59(2), 135-159.
- Salas, E., Tannenbaum, S. I., Kraiger, K. & Smith-Jentsch, K. A. (2012). The science of training and development in organizations: What matters in practice. *Psychological science in the public interest*, 13, 74-101.
- Saunders, M. E. (2017). *Gamification in Employee Training and Development: Millennial Perspectives*. The University of the Rockies.
- Shaw, J. D. & Gupta, N. (2015). Let the evidence speak again! Financial incentives are more effective than we thought. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 25, 281-293.

- Shokat, S., Riaz, R., Rizvi, S. S., Riaz, F., Aziz, S., Hussain, R. S., ... & Shabir, S. (2018). Impact of Web 2.0 on digital divide in AJ & K Pakistan. *International Journal of Advanced Computer Science and Applications*, 9(2).
- Silva, R., Dutra, J., Veloso, E. F. R., & Trevisan, L. (2020). Leadership and performance of Millennial generation in Brazilian companies. *Management Research: Journal of the Iberoamerican Academy of Management*.
- Singh, A. & Shukla, T. (2016). Workplace Dynamics: A Millennial Perspective. National Conference on Paradigm Shift in Innovative Business Management.
- Smith, J., & Garriety, S. (2020). The art of flexibility: bridging five generations in the workforce. *Strategic HR Review*.
- Stake, R. (1982). Naturalistic generalization. *Review Journal of Philosophy and Social Science*, 7(1-2), 1-12.
- Stanford, J., Simonsen, S. & Baksh, L. (2016). Fertility treatments and adverse perinatal outcomes in a population-based sampling of births in Florida, Maryland, and Utah: a cross-sectional study. *BJOG: An International Journal of Obstetrics & Gynaecology*, 123, 718-729.
- Stein, J. (2013). Millennials: The me me me generation. *Time magazine*, 20, 1-8.
- Taylor, C. R. (2018). Generational research and advertising to millennials.
- Thompson, K. H., Ellis, D., Soni, S. & Paterson, S. (2018). Attributes influencing clothing store choice for an emerging market's Generation Y Twitter customers. *The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research*, 28, 157-173.
- Tremblay, R. E. & Côté, S. M. (2019). Sex differences in the development of physical aggression: An intergenerational perspective and implications for preventive interventions. *Infant mental health journal*.
- Tsoukas, H. & Chia, R. (2002). On organizational becoming: Rethinking organizational change. *Organization science*, 13, 567-582.
- Twenge, J. M., Campbell, S. M., Hoffman, B. J. & Lance, C. E. (2010). Generational differences in work values: Leisure and extrinsic values increasing, social and intrinsic values decreasing. *Journal of management*, 36, 1117-1142.
- Urick, M. (2017). Adapting training to meet the preferred learning styles of different generations. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 21, 53-59.



- Urick, M. J., Hollensbe, E. C., & Fairhurst, G. T. (2017). Differences in understanding generation in the workforce. *Journal of Intergenerational Relationships*, 15(3), 221-240.
- Van Solinge, H. & Henkens, K. (2018). The Meaning of Retirement. How Late Career Baby Boomers Envision Their Retirement. *Innovation in Aging*, 2, 585.
- Venter, E. (2017). Bridging the communication gap between Generation Y and the Baby Boomer generation. *International journal of Adolescence and Youth*, 22, 497-507
- Yeh, K. H., Yi, C. C., Tsao, W. C., & Wan, P. S. (2013). Filial piety in contemporary Chinese societies: A comparative study of Taiwan, Hong Kong, and China. *International Sociology*, 28(3), 277–296. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580913484345>
- Wheeler, S. A. (2017). Thriving Millennials: The next generation of industry professionals. *The Journal of Equipment Lease Financing (Online)*, 35, 1-6.
- Yap, W. M., & Badri, S. K. Z. (2020). What Makes Millennials Happy in their Workplace?. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 25(1).
- Yeo, J. (2019). Social Identity and Incentives in Workgroups.
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Applications of case study research*. sage.
- Yin, R. K. (2013). Validity and generalization in future case study evaluations. *Evaluation*, 19(3), 321-332
- Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. CA: Publications Thousand Oaks.
- Zemke, R., Raines, C., & Filipczak, B. (2000). *Generations at work: Managing the clash of Veterans, Boomers, Xers, and Nexters in your workplace*.

## APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW GUIDE: MILLENNIALS

1. Can you give me a brief introduction about yourself?
2. What is your Education?
3. How many years is your working experience?
4. Since when are you working in this job?
5. What is your job title?
6. Can you tell me about the composition of employees in your organization? Age ranges.
7. What is your understanding about millennial generation? Can you please explain it for me?
8. In your opinion, do you think you belong to the millennial generation in terms of how they work and their general behaviours? Please explain.
9. How do you think millennials are different from previous generations in the workplace?
10. In your organization, do you work in teams with other generations? What is the composition of those teams?
11. While working in teams, what hurdles and conflicts did you see that arose because of generational differences?
12. Have you ever faced a problem because of your age where older generations had pre made assumptions about your generation and looked down on you?
13. Do you think respect in organizations is based on age?
14. Do your bosses think you need constant guidance because of your age and the generation you belong to?
15. Do you feel the perception of millennials is changing in the banking sector compared to the previous years? Why do you think so?
16. Why you think the conflict arises when different generations work together and how can this conflict be managed?
17. Do you think millennials are better suited for today's workplace than other generations? If yes, how?
18. In your opinion, have HR practices in the workplace changed according to millennials?

## RECRUITMENT

1. How did you find out about this job?
  - Please talk about how you normally look for jobs
  - Have you applied for jobs through social media? Which social media website do you mostly use for this purpose?
2. As per your understanding is the banking sector using the right techniques to attract millennials?
  - how can banking sector improve the way they advertise to attract a better pool of candidates?
3. Can you tell me about the recruitment process here, step by step?  
When you came for hiring, how many people were there with you?
  - Were there any people from older generations or all were around your age?
  - Did you face any issues during the hiring process? If yes, please elaborate issues.
4. Does this process suit millennials? If not, what changes can be made to attract a good millennial workers pool?
5. How do you think the recruitment process has changed over the years?

## COMPENSATION

1. What is your current salary package?
2. Are you satisfied with your current compensation package?
3. Are you being paid according to your education?
4. Is your current compensation package according to industry standards?
5. What other perks and benefits are provided to you?
6. Which benefit is the most and least important for you and why?
7. What perks and benefits would you like that are not offered in your organization?
8. In your opinion does banking sector pay well compared to other sectors?

9. Research states that millennials should be paid more even in the start of their career because they are better educated than previous generations? Do you agree?
10. Are the perks and benefits offered to you as per your requirements and perceptions?
11. Do you think the benefits are communicated to you properly or are you unaware?

Does banking sector provide free medical? If yes, in your opinion is it as important for you as it is for people older than you?

- Would better perks and benefits would make you move to another organization?
5. As a millennial what matters to you more, a good salary or other preferred benefits and work life balance?
    - How important is work life balance for you?
    - Would you switch to another company if they provide slightly less salary but have a more open and flexible environment?
  6. Is pension more important for you or a good current salary package?

## TRAINING

1. Why is training important for millennials on job?
2. Have you ever gotten any training since you are working here? On average how many trainings are given per year?
3. how was the training given to you beneficial?
4. Which kind of training is more beneficial according to you, technology-based training or instructor led training?
5. Can you tell me a little about the last training you got? What was it about and what was your experience?
  1. Do you think seminars and presentations are a good form of training?
  2. Are the trainings offered to you digital?
6. How do your seniors from other generations respond to trainings?
  1. how do they respond to the training, are they actively involved in the training?

2. Have you ever had an incident where a senior told you the training provided was not beneficial for their generation?
7. How can trainings given in banks be improved to better suit people of your age?
  1. What is the response of people from your own age group to the trainings imparted?
8. Does training provided motivate you and make you perform better?
9. If your job does not meet your expectation for personal and professional growth, will you consider switching?

## **APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW GUIDE HR MANAGERS**

1. Please give me a brief introduction about yourself.
2. What is your Education?
3. How many years is your working experience?
4. Which age groups are working in your organization?
5. What is your understanding about millennial generation? Can you please explain it for me?
6. Previously older generations were working but now because of MTO programs there's an influx in the number of millennial generations, what differences have you noticed?
7. What do you think are the positive and negative points of millennials?
8. How do you treat millennials differently from other generations?
9. Do millennials take work seriously?
10. While working in teams, what hurdles and conflicts did you see that arose because of generational differences?
11. Do you think millennials are better suited for today's dynamic and ever-changing workplace than other generations? If yes, how?
12. Is there a conflict of millennials and older generations in your workplace, how and why?
13. In your opinion, have HR practices in the workplace changed to accommodate millennials?

## **RECRUITMENT**

1. How does your organization attract good candidates especially from the millennial generation?  
What mediums do you use to advertise? What is the procedure to apply for a job opening in your organization?
2. How is social media used to advertise for jobs? Which site is most commonly used?  
Why Is it better than advertising through newspapers and television?
3. Through which medium do most millennials apply?
4. How has the hiring process in your organization changed over the years to accommodate the new generation?
5. Please explain how your hiring process differs if you have to hire a senior person compared to when you have to hire a young professional?
6. State issues faced during the hiring process when hiring millennials?

## COMPENSATION

1. Do you think millennials are satisfied with their compensation packages in your organization?  
Are they paid better in your sector compared to other sectors?
2. What other benefits and perks are offered in your organization?
3. Research states that millennials should be paid more in the start of their early career because they are better educated than their previous generations? Do you agree?
4. In your opinion, are millennials more interested in preferred benefits or salaries?
5. It is said that millennials job switch a lot, do you think it is because of compensation or there are other reasons?

How long does a millennial worker normally stay in your organization?

6. Despite giving good compensation package what other things do you think are most important to retain millennials?

## TRAINING

1. Can you tell me about the last training you remember that was given to the employees? What was it about and who attended?  
How many trainings a year do you offer in your organization.
2. Why do you think trainings are important in banking sector?
3. What is millennials response to the trainings being given, both during and after the training?  
Is the millennial response to training different than the response of older generations?
4. In your opinion are seminars and presentations good forms of training or should they be replaced by digital technologies?  
what kind of digital trainings does your bank offer?
5. In what ways can training given be improved to better interest millennials?
6. Are millennials easier with technology-based training when compared to older generations?

7. Do you think the training given motivates millennial employees and makes them perform better or do you notice no difference?



## **APPENDIX C: GENERATION X INTERVIEW GUIDE**

1. Please give me a brief introduction about yourself.
2. What is your Education?
3. How many years is your working experience?
4. Which age groups are working in your organization?
5. What is your understanding about millennial generation? Can you please explain it for me?
6. Previously older generations were working but now because of MTO programs there's an influx in the number of millennial generations, what differences have you noticed in this generation when you compare them to yourself?
7. What do you think are the positive and negative traits of millennials?
8. Do you think millennials need constant guidance while working because of their ages and behaviours? How do millennials respond to this guidance?
9. Do millennials take work seriously?
10. While working in teams, what hurdles and conflicts did you see that arose because of generational differences?
11. Do you think millennials are better suited for today's dynamic and ever-changing workplace than other generations? If yes, how?
12. Do you think the HR practices (compensation, recruitment & trainings) of the past work with millennials?
13. have HR practices in the workplace changed to accommodate millennials?

## **RECRUITMENT**

1. how do you normally job search?
2. How does BOP advertise their jobs?
3. Do you think a millennial looks for jobs the same way that you do?
4. Can you explain the recruitment process through which you were hired?
5. Were you satisfied with your hiring process?
6. Would the process you were hired through suit millennials? What changes can be incorporated to attract a good millennial workers pool?
7. How has the hiring process in your organization changed over the years to accommodate the millennial generation?

## COMPENSATION

1. Are you satisfied with your compensation packages?
2. Do you think millennials are satisfied with their compensation packages?
3. What perks and benefits are offered in your organization?
4. Are these perks and benefits same for you and young people?
5. Research states that millennials should be paid more in the start of their early career because they are better educated than their previous generations? Do you agree?
6. In your opinion, are millennials more interested in preferred benefits or in good salaries? Why?
7. How long do you normally stay in an organization? What factors would make you switch the job?
8. It is said that millennials job switch a lot, do you think it is because of compensation or there are other reasons?

9. How long does a millennial worker normally stay in your organization?
10. Despite giving good compensation package what other things do you think are most important to retain millennials?

## TRAINING

1. Can you tell me about the last training you remember that was given to the employees? What was it about and who attended?
  - a. How many trainings a year does BOP offer.
2. Why do you think trainings are important in banking sector?
3. What is millennials response to the trainings being given, both during and after the training? Is the millennial response to training different than the response of your generations?
4. In your opinion are seminars and presentations good forms of training or should they be replaced by digital technologies?  
what kind of digital trainings does your bank offer?
5. In what ways can training given be improved to better interest millennials?
6. Are millennials easier with technology-based training when compared to your
7. Do you think the training given motivates millennial employees and makes them perform better or do you notice no difference?