

Evolving Dynamics of FATA's Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario



By

Maryam Tariq

NUST201664806MCIPS79516F

Supervisor:

Dr. Tughral Yamin

Centre for International Peace and Stability (CIPS)

NUST Institute of Peace & Conflict Studies (NIPCONS)

National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST)

Islamabad, Pakistan

August 2018

Evolving Dynamics of FATA's Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario



By

Maryam Tariq

NUST201664806MCIPS79516F

Supervisor:

Dr. Tughral Yamin

Head of Department:

A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements for
the degree of *Master of Science* in
Peace and Conflict Studies

Centre for International Peace and Stability (CIPS)
NUST Institute of Peace & Conflict Studies (NIPCONS)
National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST)
Islamabad, Pakistan
August 2018

Declaration

I certify that this research work titled “*Evolving Dynamics of FATA’s Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario*” is my own work and has been generated by me as a result of my own original research. I confirm that this work was done wholly or mainly while in candidature for a Master of Science degree at NUST. The work has not been presented elsewhere for assessment.

I have clearly stated where I have consulted the published work of others. It has been always clearly attributed where I have quoted from the work of others, the source is always given. With the exception of such quotations, this thesis is entirely my own work. I have acknowledged all main sources of help.

I acknowledge that an electronic copy of my thesis must be added to the digital library system of the Centre for International Peace and Conflict Studies.

Maryam Tariq

NUST201664806MCIPS79516F

Copyright Notice

- Copyright in text of this thesis rests with the student author. Copies (by any process) either in full, or of extracts, may be made only in accordance with instructions given by the author and lodged in the Library of NIPCONS, NUST. Details may be obtained by the Librarian. This page must form part of any such copies made. Further copies (by any process) may not be made without the permission (in writing) of the author.
- The ownership of any intellectual property rights which may be described in this thesis is vested in CIPS, NUST, subject to any prior agreement to the contrary, and may not be made available for use by third parties without the written permission of CIPS, which will prescribe the terms and conditions of any such agreement.
- Further information on the conditions under which disclosures and exploitation may take place is available from the Library of CIPS, NUST, Islamabad.

Plagiarism Certificate (Turnitin Report)

This thesis has been checked for Plagiarism. Turnitin report endorsed by Supervisor is attached.

Maryam Tariq

NUST201664806MCIPS79516F

Dr. Tughral Yamin

Supervisor

Acknowledgements

First of all, I am immensely grateful to Almighty Allah, whose blessings have been the focal reason for the accomplishment of my study and His Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), the most perfect among all human beings ever born on the surface of earth, who is forever a source of guidance and knowledge for humanity as a whole.

I owe my profound gratitude to my supervisor Dr. Tughral Yamin, who incessantly steered me towards avenues to source material as well as guided me with his insightful and scholarly suggestions. With his encouragement, sense of devotion, experience, positive criticism and keen interest in my work; it was because of his inspiring guidance and dynamic cooperation during entire study program that I could complete this study.

Lastly, I am grateful and much indebted to my family. I would like to thank my parents with the bottom of my heart because without them nothing would have been possible. Especially to my mother for bearing with me all these years, without her I am nothing she is my lifeline. I am most earnestly appreciative to my father whose love and care never seems to lessen. I am thankful to him for supporting my every decision and standing beside me in whatever thing I choose. In the end I am obliged to my siblings for bearing with my tantrums. I want to mention one more person without whose unwavering support I would never have been able to complete my study, my dear friend Noor Irshad. Thank you Noor, for always listening to my rants and for being a guide and my friend! In the end, I am immensely grateful to everyone who has helped me in any way without each one of you my life could never have been as it is, so I would like to thank all of the people in my life though words are not enough to show my gratitude.

Dedicated to my exceptional parents and adored siblings whose tremendous support and cooperation led me to this wonderful accomplishment.

Abstract

The tribal areas of Pakistan have a remarkably unique culture, customs and administrative structure. This region has key significance since it swaddles the border with Afghanistan. After independence the area was governed by laws prevalent during the colonial period. The established status quo was disturbed as a result of the outbreak of insurgency and subsequent counter insurgency operations since 2003-04. Pakistan Army has been actively involved in the process of reorientation and reconciliation in this area in the post- conflict period.

This research covers the events leading to instability in the region (Protracted Social Conflict) and role of the Army in ending the conflict. In the end recommendations on post conflict reconstruction through introduction of reforms have been given in context of Security Sector Reforms (SSR). It is stressed that now is the right time to implement administrative, economic, political and judicial reforms in the region; so that it should be given the representation in the mainstream society it truly deserves.

Keywords: Internal Security (IS), Security Sector Reforms (SSR), FATA, Pakistan Army, Post-Conflict Resolution.

Contents

Declaration	iii
Copyright Notice	iv
Plagiarism Certificate (Turnitin Report)	v
Acknowledgements	vi
Abstract	viii
Glossary of Acronyms and Abbreviations	xi
CHAPTER ONE	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY.....	1
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEM	3
1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	4
1.4 OBJECTIVE OF THE RESEARCH.....	4
1.5 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH	5
1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	5
1.6.1 Research Design.....	5
1.6.2 Population of the Study	5
1.6.3 Sample Distribution of the Study.....	6
1.6.4 Distribution of the Sample	6
1.6.5 Instrumentation	6
1.6.6 Method of Data Analysis.....	6
1.7 DELIMITATION OF RESEARCH	7
1.8 SCOPE OF THE STUDY.....	7
CHAPTER TWO	8
CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	8
2.1 PROTRACTED SOCIAL CONFLICT	8
2.2 SECURITY SECTOR REFORM	9
2.2.1 The Elements of the SSR	11
2.2 SSR IN POST- CONFLICT SCENARIO	14
2.2.1 Challenges to SSR in Post- Conflict Setting	15
2.2.2 SSR and Local Ownership.....	17
2.3 SSR IN PEACEBUILDING PRACTICE	19

CHAPTER THREE	23
INTERNAL SECURITY (IS) PARADIGM OF FATA	23
3.1 CONCEPT OF NATIONAL SECURITY- PAKISTAN	23
3.2 FATA- A COLONIAL LEGACY	25
3.2.1 Pukhtunwali- The Code of Pukhtuns.....	26
3.2.2 FCR- Frontier Crimes Regulation	29
3.2.3 Militancy in FATA- Linkages with Extremism	31
3.2.4 Socio- economic Challenges.....	34
3.3 HISTORY OF REFORMS IN FATA- POLITICAL AND LEGAL REFORMS.....	37
CHAPTER FOUR	40
ROLE OF ARMY IN FATA	40
4.1 THE WAR ON TERROR	40
4.1.1 Military Operations- The War Within	41
4.2 IMPLICATIONS OF OPERATIONS FOR PAKISTAN	44
4.2.1 Social Implications.....	44
4.2.2 Psychological Impact.....	46
4.2.3 Political Implications	47
4.2.4 Economic Implications	47
4.2.5 Security Implications.....	48
4.3 DEVELOPMENTS IN FATA	49
CHAPTER 5	52
RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION.....	52
5.1 INTEGRATION OF FATA WITH KPK	52
5.2 A REFORMS AGENDA	54
BIBLIOGRAPHY	60
APPENDIX A.....	67

Glossary of Acronyms and Abbreviations

ADP	Annual Development Plan
BHUs	Basic Health Units
COAS	Chief of Army Staff
CPEC	China-Pakistan Economic Corridor
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
FC	Frontier Corps
FCR	Frontier Crimes Regulation
FR	Frontier Region
GWOT	Global War on Terror
IBOs	Intelligence Based Operations
IDPs	Internally Displaced People
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IS	Internal Security
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LEA	Law Enforcement Agency
NAP	National Action Plan
NGO	Non- Governmental Organization
NISP	National Internal Security Policy
NWA	North Waziristan Agency
NWFP	Northwest Frontier Province
OECD	Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development
PATA	Provincially Administered Tribal Areas

PSC	Protracted Social Conflict
PTM	Pashtun Tahafuz Movement
SSG	Special Services Group
SSR	Security Sector Reform
TCA	Thematic Content Analysis
TSNM	Tehreek-e-Nafaz-e-Shariat-e-Mohammadi
TTP	Tehreek-i-Taliban Pakistan
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNOCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Human Affairs
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
USA	United States of America
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) of Pakistan or more commonly what is popularly known as FATA are the legacy of colonialism. Pakistan, a successor state of a British India, inherited most of the characteristics of governing architecture of the colonial era for FATA. What comprised as FATA has an area of 27194.875 sq. km and it shares about 482.803 km border with Afghanistan. The officially estimated population of area is 4.8 million. Former FATA consisted of seven agencies (Bajaur, Mohmand, Khyber, Orakzai, Kurram, North Waziristan and South Waziristan) and six Frontier Regions (FRs) which are: Peshawar, Kohat, Bannu, Laki Marwat, Tank and Dera Ismail Khan (International Crisis Group, 2006).

Former FATA is populated by different tribes. These tribes have played a role in providing or denying access to Afghanistan. Afghanistan has always been a hurdle for invading armies from Central Asia. The English decided to give it the status of a “buffer zone.” The region despite of its remoteness has been home to two old civilizations of world which are Hinduism and Buddhism. It has occupied the central position in international politics for more than 200 years (Rahman, 2009).

It was the playground for the “Great Game” of colonial supremacy between Russian and the British empires during the 19th century. As Russian influence increased in Central Asia, British decided to bring Afghanistan under their control (Dichter & Popkin, 1967). The British Empire builders were divided on this strategic issue. Some were in favor of a ‘forward policy’ which meant bringing the whole area under control through force, others wanted to create a buffer zone, in area which could help achieve British ambitions in the area but not impact the already established system of governance ("Durand Line Agreement", 1893).

In the end the British administration went ahead with the idea of creating a buffer zone in Afghanistan. It was a less ambitious, closed door strategy that required Afghanistan to act as a

buffer to curtail Russia in return for subsidies. This led to the border agreement of 1893 between Afghan Amir and British India which is known as the Durand Line ("Durand Line Agreement", 1893). This resulted in the tribal uprising of 1897 during which tribes from Waziristan to Malakand attacked British forces. Later in 1901, when it became impossible to stop Pashtun resistance against British forces, it was decided to create an additional buffer to separate Punjab Province from Pashtun populated areas.

This "buffer to the buffer (Afghanistan)" was named NWFP (Northwest Frontier Province) today known as Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, including not only the areas within provincial borders present today but also the adjacent tribal areas. Due to these measures although British gained somewhat stability in the area but their writ was always challenged by tribesmen. In order to control such uprisings against the empire they formulated a system of governance for the area. This system consisted of rewarding the tribal chiefs (*maliks*) that were friendly towards the state and punishing those who were against it through Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR), 1901 (Hussain, 2005).

In 1947, at the time of partition of subcontinent, majority of the tribal Maliks (elders) opted for joining Pakistan under the Article 1 of the constitution. Muhammad Ali Jinnah visited the frontier in April 1948 and promised tribal autonomy that would not be challenged while integrating FATA into Pakistan. He said he wanted the area to become independent instead of being dependent on the state (Cheema, 2005). Sadly these statements did not materialize into reality. Former FATA is one of the most underdeveloped area of Pakistan with 83% of its population being illiterate and 60% living below the poverty line ("Selected Development Indicators for Pakistan, NWFP, and FATA", 2018). The current constitutional position of FATA is based on the Article 246 and 247 of the 1973 constitution. The 1973 constitution states that FATA is to be dealt separately from KPK where it is located although it also decrees that 'there should be no racial, sectarian, tribal and provincial differences between the people of Pakistan' (Raza, 1973, p-73). The merger of FATA was agreed upon during the tenure of the last elected government and the necessary legislation was done to this effect.

The causes of the present abysmal are manifold; they are historical, structural, political, social, economic and cultural. As discussed above the area was distinct to old empires and colonists in order to achieve their ambitions in the region. The current account of FATA started from late

1970s with the Russian invasion of Afghanistan in 1979. FATA faced major brunt of the problems which mainly increased till 90s. Pakistan led from the front during Afghan War with the help of US during which FATA was used as the breeding ground for jihadi forces (Cheema, 2005, p-30). With the aid of USA and help of Pakistani military the area was used as induction base and reinforcement camp for freedom fighters that were waging jihad against USSR.

FATA again came to limelight in the wake of 9/11 when USA launched ‘war against terrorism’ in Afghanistan. Pakistan again sided with US in this war. FATA became a point of concern now for totally different reason i.e. terrorism (Khan, 2013). It was always important due to its strategic location but after the terrorist attacks on twin towers in New York it became point of concern for international community. They were of the view point that FATA serves as a safe haven and breeding ground for the terrorists who are attacking allied forces in Afghanistan (Khan, 2013). So keeping with its policy of supporting the war against terrorism and eradicating any such elements form its own area to ensure law and order; Pakistan launched a military operation in FATA with the sole purpose of ending the menace of terrorism once and for all.

1.2 STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

The influx of terrorism in FATA was rooted in its structural and political infrastructure. The problems in the area that it has faced since partition till date are not only due to the code of the Pashtuns i.e. *Pakhatoonwaali* (see in detail in Chapter 3) but also due to negligence on part of the government. The internal security paradigm of the area has always been problematic because of the inefficient governing structure where the focus was never given to those who were in below positions in the order of the living in society.

This research will highlight the aspects which caused militancy in former FATA. These causes will be explained in terms of the theory of protracted social conflict given by Edward Azar who was professor of government and politics and a renowned author. In this regard the internal security of the area will be discussed which will began the discussion of the arrival of Pakistan Army in the area. The conditions that forced them to take hard measures (operations) in the area and which led us to present situation in the area.

Then the current role the military forces are playing in the area i.e. of rehabilitation and reconstruction will be discussed. This phase along with recommendations will be discussed on

basis of the concept of security sector reform. In the end, research will outline the permanent solution to the problems faced by people of area. Certain reforms that should be introduced in the area will be described along with the change in security paradigm of area from being militarized to return to in civil control.

1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The following questions guided this research:

- (1) What conditions led to militancy in FATA?
- (2) What is the impact of the presence of Army in area?
- (3) What are the challenges that are preventing establishment of peace in the area?
- (4) Under what conditions Security Sector Reforms (SSR) can be introduced as part of peace building process in former FATA?
- (5) What strategies can be adopted to integrate former FATA into national mainstream to ensure long lasting peace?

1.4 OBJECTIVE OF THE RESEARCH

The general objective of the research is to study the internal security structure of FATA and how Pakistan's Army involvement has changed it. This is done by dividing the research into two main part i.e. pre- conflict phase and post-conflict phase. To this end, the following specific objectives will be in focus:

- 1) To study in detail the existing security paradigm in area.
- 2) To discuss the causes of conflict based on the theory of protracted social conflict.
- 3) To explain that the decision to use the Army was based on the concept of National Security.
- 4) To highlight the situation of the internally displaced people and the Army's role in evacuating them from troubled areas and then resettling them back in their native villages and towns.
- 5) To recommend effective reform strategies like SSR for a comprehensive peace building process in the area.

1.5 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH

- 1) The basic significance of this research is to undertake a study based on evaluation of the factors that made former FATA vulnerable to militancy thus making it a hub of terrorism. The research is meant to set the ground for both research and policy prescriptions towards a more effective security paradigm in FATA and to achieve a permanent solution for the problems of area.
- 2) The institutional fragility of the area constitutes a serious challenge to its people. The fact that not only it is safe haven for terrorism but also one of the poorly developed areas of Pakistan is enough to prove the weak governance in former FATA. The research has explored the negligence on part of government in the area and how it has impacted the people living there.
- 3) The research has also provided key policy prescriptions on alternative strategies for security sector as a basis for durable peace, security and stability in the former tribal region. The type of reforms that can bring change in the area and how SSR can be a permanent solution to all the problems in the area.

1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This sub- section discusses the research design and the method utilized in examining internal security and post- conflict transformation in FATA. It examines the research design, population of the study, distribution of the sample, instrumentation and method of data analysis.

1.6.1 Research Design

The study is predicated on empirical evidences (primary data) and secondary sources, which enabled us to understand the reasons of vulnerability of FATA to militancy. The survey method was employed for the study. It helped us ask questions from every group of people residing in the former tribal areas and helped understand their individual viewpoint. It helped us not only to get the required information but also in observing how the respondents feel towards a certain situation.

1.6.2 Population of the Study

As two important variables in the study are internal security of FATA (fixed) and involvement of Army (changing), so the eligible population of the study consisted of the security sector of the erstwhile FATA. The representatives of Pakistan Army, the people of FATA and stakeholders of government in the area were the population for our study.

1.6.3 Sample Distribution of the Study

The sample size (i.e. 20 respondents) of the study covered individual actors involved in security related activities and also the residents of the region who have faced the major brunt of the issue. The technique used to identify the required sample is purposive sampling i.e. it is done on the basis specific characteristics of a population by non- random sampling (Lavrakas, 2008). This technique is useful because it fits a specific purpose.

1.6.4 Distribution of the Sample

Several Army personnel, the people of the tribal areas and government representatives were interviewed. Each of them was asked the questions related to the area concerning them in order to get clear understanding of where each of them was standing.

1.6.5 Instrumentation

The instruments developed for the study were the questionnaires on problems of tribal areas, role of Army in the area and permanent solution of the problem. These were designed to elicit responses from the respondents. Three different questionnaires were designed, one for each stakeholders in order to get a deeper understanding of their individual role in the area. The number of respondents was 20 in total; out of which 15 were residents of the area, 3 were Army personnel and remaining two were government representatives.

In- depth interviews were conducted to learn not only from the information they were giving but also to have a deeper understanding of their behavior and attitude towards the situation. This way we were able to access the respondents' experiences and their inner perceptions and feelings on the subject matter. Each instrument contained a total of six questions, which were open- ended. The main purpose was to let respondents speak their minds in order to keep research valid.

1.6.6 Method of Data Analysis

The method of analysis used for this study is the qualitative method, which relied on the Thematic Content Analysis (TCA). It has to do with a descriptive presentation of qualitative data from the interview transcripts generated from the respondents (Anderson, 2007, p.1). Thus, we were able to group common themes from the responses in order to give meaning to the commonality of reactions from the respondents. This helped us to establish the link between the internal security framework of FATA and how Pakistan's Army involvement has changed it, and what possible reforms can be introduced in the area as a permanent solution.

1.7 DELIMITATION OF RESEARCH

The research could not be conducted in former tribal areas due to the inability to personally go there, thus is not anthropological in nature. All respondents were kept anonymous because of their need for keeping their identity confidential but we did reach the residents of the former tribal areas which are 15; albeit outside the local environment. Main hindrance in data collection was individuals' hesitance towards expressing their viewpoint. Certain people in power requested to use the word 'militancy' in former FATA as it is what it was, according to them. That's why this term is used time and again throughout the research which was also the case in the region. Also the word 'source' is mentioned in certain part of the document; it represents the responses of the interviewees who did not wish to be named. Although the sample size of research is small but the respondents who were selected were the people who were most relevant to the topic of research. Due to the sensitivity and security nature of the research people were apprehensive towards being involved in the study thus the difficulty in collecting more responses.

1.8 SCOPE OF THE STUDY

This study has examined the internal security of FATA, starting from explaining what the importance of security for an area is. We will start from studying the historical background of the area concerned and move towards the study of system of governance in the area. The causes of conflict in the area will be discussed on basis of Edward Azar's theory of protracted social conflict (PSC). After that the reasons which led to the involvement of Pakistan Army in the region will be discussed. The way they handled the situation in the area by trying to establish dialogue and introduction of reforms but in the end were forced to adopt hard measures i.e. operations.

The study will also analyze the current phase of conflict in the area and how Army is playing its role in rehabilitation and reconstruction of infrastructure. Lastly, we will try to suggest possible reforms and solutions in order to improve the security sector of FATA. SSR will be suggested as a possible solution of the problem as they have proven to be successful practice during post-conflict transformation in other conflict stricken societies.

CHAPTER TWO

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This chapter will focus on the theoretical and conceptual basis of the research. As described earlier that this research is divided into two parts i.e. Pre- conflict phase and post- conflict phase. Pre- conflict phase will be described on basis of the theory of protracted social conflict (PSC) given by Edward Azar. This theory is selected based on the prolonged nature of conflict in FATA. Consequently, post- conflict phase will be based on the concept of security sector reform (SSR) which is a post- conflict transformation practice. The ongoing rehabilitation and reconstruction in the area and recommendation of reforms to ensure durable peace in aftermath of conflict will be discussed on the basis SSR practice. In order to understand both these concepts, this section will look at their origin and conditions in which they are applicable.

2.1 PROTRACTED SOCIAL CONFLICT

Theory of Protracted Social Conflict (PSC) was given by Edward Azar in 1990s. As indicated by Azar, a PSC, “originate when communal groups (defined by shared ethnic, religious, linguistic, or other cultural characteristics) are denied their distinct identity or collective development needs” (Azar, 1990; viii). Azar also explains this type of conflict in relation to neighboring countries, concept of terrorism and international linkages. He had characterized four groups of factors as prerequisites for PSCs: These are the communal identity of general public, human needs, the state's role and global linkages. Azar considers the identity of a specific group and their way of living, the most vital component of a PSC (Azar, 1990).

According to Azar, in post- colonial societies a number of multi-ethnic groups live together, but usually they are being dominated by a single group which is much stronger than the rest. This dominant group usually disregards the necessities of other members of society, accordingly resulting in dissatisfaction and polarization. In this sense this theory is applicable on case of FATA as they have always felt being marginalized by the governing body and always have felt alienated from rest of country thus leading to conflict.

As far as human needs, Azar contends that all people go for satisfying their (combined) needs through their same identity group. Lack of fulfillment of such needs prompts expanding grievances, which people express by and large. To the extent political access needs are concerned, Azar alludes to the compelling participation of people in politics, marketing, and basic leadership foundations. Azar characterizes security needs as the material requirements for physical security, food and housing, while acknowledgment (acceptance from society) needs point to the requirement for "distinctive identity" and its social acknowledgment (Azar, 1990, p.9).

In particular here, Azar's idea of human needs unequivocally takes up the concept of disparities in power. The predominant group "fulfills" its political access, security and needs of acceptance to the detriment of the requirements of other social (barred) groups (Azar, 1990, p.7). Accordingly, the deprived individuals are disappointed and feel (to an ever increasing extent) marginalized, polarized and excluded from the political, social and economic participation. Same is the case for people of FATA, their collective grievances made them vulnerable to militancy in the area thus leading to violent conflict. In Chapter 3, all the causes of FATA conflict will be discuss in detail, based on the theory of protracted social conflict.

2.2 SECURITY SECTOR REFORM

Since the start of 21st century the establishment of democratic control and introduction of reforms of security sector has become a major concern for international community in post-conflict societies (Malan, 2008, p.6). Keeping this idea of reforms and exercising of democratic control in mind, a new concept to ensure development of security sector in the context of peace building emerged in 1990s which is known as Security Sector Reform (SSR). SSR provides a new description of how a security sector should work unlike the traditional concept of security that states that security lies solely with state or state actors. SSR not only considers state as important actor in security sector but also the individual and communities of which a society comprises. Thus, SSR provides a more people- based approach towards security of a society and is involved in post- conflict peace building (Kwaja, 2016).

It focuses on repositioning the institutions and agencies of the state in order to provide efficient and effective security to its people. It is a rather complex concept that consists of different programs, policies and activities that are carried out by certain stakeholders to work towards

better provision of security and safety to people. In order to understand what SSR is, we have to first focus on describing the security sector of a state. Security sector of a state consists of all those institutions that are responsible for ensuring safety of people, providing them with justice and securing them from fear of any type of violence. These consist of armed forces of a state, the police and intelligence services, paramilitary forces, related ministries and governmental organizations (Ball & Fayemi, 2004).

SSR is a practice used widely in post- conflict societies where the ‘reconstruction’ and ‘reform’ of security sector is required. It is also a part of the international post- conflict agenda which states that the conflict stricken society has to work towards establishing an efficient security sector (England& Boucher, 2009). ‘Reconstruction’ refers to the establishment of a safe and peaceful society for people where they can live without the fear of violence. Whereas the term ‘reform’ refers to the introduction of better living conditions for people and focuses on soft measures like observance of human rights. Both of these concepts are part of post- conflict agenda which essentially focuses on democratization of society, introduction of equal rights, and prevention of any future conflict possibility and promotion of sustainable development conditions (Ejdus, 2006).

In order to have a clear understanding of the concept of SSR; let us start by defining it. This concept has emerged from academic and donor communities and has undergone numerous transformations. It can be defined as process in which security sector actors work to meet organizational and political demands of transformation (Edmunds, 2007, p.25). Another more comprehensive definition is that it is “the efficient and effective provision of state and human security within a framework of democratic governance” (Hänggi, 2004, p.3). This definition lists five essential elements of the concept of SSR, these are: efficiency, effectiveness, national security, human security and democratic governance. It explains that in order to fully incorporate SSR in a society we have to take into account all these elements.

The Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) (2000, p. 16) defines SSR as;

[it] includes all the actors, their roles, responsibilities and actions – working together to manage and operate the system in a manner that is more consistent with democratic

norms and sound principles of good governance, and thus contributes to a well-functioning security framework.

This definition describes clearly that a security sector consists of all public and private sector institutions and entities that work to provide justice and security to people and state as a whole. It also indicates that not only state actors but democratic governance and non- state actors are also important in maintaining an ideal security sector of a state.

2.1.1 The Elements of the SSR

This concept comprises three elements i.e. actors, context, aims and dimensions which are discussed in detail below (Yasutomi & Carmans, 2007).

The element of SSR responsible for ensuring protection of society and state are the organizations which are termed as *actors*. The actors involved in SSR can be categorized as external and local actors. External actors like donor communities work towards establishing a sound security sector in post- conflict societies. Local actors can be defined as those who are members of state's national security like armed forces, paramilitary forces, and intelligence agencies, ministries of interior, defense and justice. Local organizations like NGOs are also included in it. Other researchers have divided the actors in SSR into four main categories by adopting a holistic approach.

First group consists of those actors who have a right to use force. These include police, armed forces, intelligence services and all hard core security forces that legitimately have a right to exercise control and force. Second group consists of statutory actors who do not have a right to use force. This group is directly in charge of management of security sector and includes government, parliament, and Ministries of Defense, Interior, Finance and Judiciary. These actors have a very important role to play as they keep oversight governance over security forces and also ensure democratic civilian control (Karkoszka, 2018).

Third group consists of non- statutory actors who have the right to use force. These include security organizations who work privately like intelligence services, security companies and military associations. Lastly, the fourth group consists of non- statutory actors that do not have the right to use power. These are universities, media, social organization and civil society movements. This approach helps us identify all the actors that can play their role in establishing

a security sector. We have to understand that SSR cannot work efficiently if we only consider the role of security forces as an actor. In order to incorporate a society as a whole we have to consider civil society and private security sector as important of state's security framework. This approach can also help us identify the security sector of a society thus making it easier to implement a long term security policy.

The second important element in the SSR is *context*. SSR is usually described as concept rooted in policy development by international organizations. When the concept was first introduced it was characterized as a mainly policy driven concept. But with the passage of time the numbers of contexts in which it can be used have increased. There are three contexts in which SSR is used in literature i.e. post- conflict, post- authoritarian and developmental (Yasutomi & Carmans, 2007). There is another one that is not used widely but is still relative which SSR in developed states is. All of these contexts have their own particularities and consequences. The post-authoritarian context is the one that demands democratization of society and control of military component to be given in civil government's hands. It also includes catharsis of people who were involved in abuse of human rights. Such issues were faced by states in Eastern and Central Europe after 1989.

The post- conflict context involves the slow and gradual accession of the security sector of state. Conflict stricken societies have a tendency to have recurrent conflicts mainly due to poor economic conditions. So in order to ensure that such things never happens it is necessary to ensure reintegration, disarmament, demining and non- proliferation of weapons. States which are facing such problems are Lebanon, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Syria in recent times. The third context which is developmental which is usually practiced in those countries that are underdeveloped economically. In these countries SSR mostly focuses on working towards reducing the security apparatus of the country and also to reallocate funds. Such problems have been faced by Western Balkans states at the end of the Cold War. The fourth context refers to economically developed that due to proliferation of weapons of mass destruction and terrorism are facing such issues but it is not a wide practice in them.

The third element of SSR is the *goals* or *aim* it strives to achieve. As explained above in various definitions, SSR work towards achieving two main goals. First, is to make armed forces and other security agencies to work effectively and efficiently in establishing a sound security sector.

Second, is to develop essential capabilities and capacity of democratic governance to ensure that security forces are working accordingly (Wulf, 2004). But in order to ensure that in a post – conflict society security sector is working properly we have to first work on economic development of that society. Along with SSR such comprehensive socio- economic reforms should be introduced so that security sector can work in the long term. In post- conflict societies, social and economic instability are the main causes of reemergence of conflicts. These include failed reintegration of ex- combatants, presence of internally displaced people (IDPs) and refugees and imbalanced economy which can threaten the establishment of security sector reform programmes.

The above mentioned two goals of SSR are also known as “operational effectiveness and efficiency aspect” and “democratic governance aspect” (Hendrickson and Karkoszka, 2002). In order to know to what end SSR works, let’s explain what these goals. First aspect as it is clear from its name is concerned with armed forces. It states that all security forces in post- conflict societies should be reformed to work efficiently and effectively in establishing a security sector. The type of reforms can include in assigning particular duties to every security institution along with proper training and equipment. They should be provided with up to date equipment and modern weaponry and a proper chain of command has to be established in this regard.

Second aspect is rather complex and involves the complete surveillance of security forces in order to ensure that they are doing their work properly. It calls for a proper democratic oversight in the security sector. In order to establish an efficient security sector it should be given in civilian control and should not be politicized in any case. A security sector with democratic governance is necessary in order to ensure the establishment of transparency in all departments of a state. Thus in order to have proper scrutiny and management of security forces it is necessary to build a mechanism of good governance. Both these aspects when worked upon carefully will help in achieving other high- end goals.

A well governed and professional security sector can contribute in ensuring socio- economic development, rule of law, equality of gender, human rights, democratization and good governance in a society. So the end- state of SSR is ‘security sector governance’ that consists of good governmental structures, values, processes, and attitudes that shape and implement decisions related to security (Wulf, 2004). The main aim of SSR is to work toward

professionalism in security forces while increasing their capacity building and in order to keep proper check and balance of their activities establishment of democratic governance.

2.2 SSR IN POST- CONFLICT SCENARIO

The research is focusing on implementation of SSR in a post- conflict context which in this case is FATA. We will discuss SSR as a practice in post- conflict settings and will discuss its characteristics. Also the challenges faced by security sector in such societies will also be discussed in detail in this section.

A dimension where SSR has found most acceptance is the post- conflict setting where a society had emerged from internal conflict or inter- state conflict. These are the societies which need reconstructing of almost all of its public setting and administration especially security sector. Most of the fundamentals on which the concept of security sector reform is based apply fully on a post- conflict society. Engaging in such areas in post- conflict reconstruction provides great opportunities for security reforms to work but at the same time they proved to be most challenging setting too. On the one hand, a society emerging from a conflict has almost all of its sectors damaged like their security forces, must have weak governance, and bad economy. But on the other hand they provide a wide ground to work on for security reform sector. Such societies often prove to be more accepting towards accepting external help in their all sector including the one as important as security (Yasutomi & Carmans, 2007).

In interstate conflict this proves to be difficult feat because of the adverse attitude of its people like in case of Afghanistan where people will not be accepting reforms introduction by outsiders. But SSR in post- conflict setting is most successful in case of a civil or internal conflict where people are not as against those who are in power. SSR in post- conflict context follows the same two principles like in other contexts. These are providing security forces with opportunities and reestablishing them so that they can provide efficient and effective security to public. The other one is to establish governmental oversight over security activities and to be given the control of security sector to civil administration. Mostly in a post- conflict context security sector along with reforms requires complete reconstruction.

While in other contexts security sector reform is enough in such context where there is a history of conflict security sector reconstruction is very necessary. Both are almost identical but also

have some differences in their implementation. Security sector reconstruction includes dismissal and reintegration of former combatants, demining of lands, seizing of all types of weaponry whether small weapons or large and entire restructuring of the framework of security forces (Kocak, 2013). These type of SSR had to deal with legacy of armed conflict where there is not only need to adopt soft measure like reforms but also is necessary to take hard steps like downsizing armed forces, ensuring non- proliferation of weapons and prosecuting the perpetrators. Without doing both security sector reconstruction and reform it is impossible to have a safe and secure society in a state having a history of conflict.

SSR has to face certain challenges in its imposition which are mainly between the reformers and the local ownership. Main problem is finding balance between implementation of international practice and domestic culture (Wulf, 2004). In a conflict- stricken society SSR has faced the biggest challenge in finding acceptance from the local community of that area. Often due to cultural barriers and certain traditional lifestyle, they do not accept foreign inclusion in their lives. Also in certain areas local ownership is so strong or in some cases corrupt that they don't want any external involvement in fear of losing their so called established supremacy. Such situations pose great challenges to SSR which will be discussed in detail in the coming section.

2.2.1 Challenges to SSR in Post- Conflict Setting

Scholars of SSR have identified various challenges especially in post- conflict context which are more or less same. According to Wulf (2004, p. 348), in a conflict stricken state although badly structured or damaged security sector is a problem but usually this is not the cause of violent conflict. The real cause of violence is instruments in such situations. So in order to establish an effective and efficient security sector in such society security sector reform efforts have to focus on not only controlling violence but ensuring to curb the underlying causes of unrest. When working in such environments SSR usually considers the violent conflicts symptoms and tries to aim at achieving short term or medium term adjustments in order to initiate the process of reformation. Albeit it doesn't provide necessary conditions for establishment of a long term process of stability, peace, transparency, good governance, development and accountability.

Although the scope of SSR is broadening with the passage of time; but still it has to progress in certain areas of reconstruction and reform of a post- conflict state. The areas that are needed to be taken into consideration concern important issues such as accountability, transparency, local

ownership to local inhabitants, legitimacy and credibility of security sector and especially coordination between external and local actors. One other important area where SSR usually lacks is ensuring the end of structural violence. Structural violence is the major cause of internal conflict in a society and in order to ensure long term effects of SSR it is very necessary to ensure that there must be equality in every section of society. Whether it's ensuring gender equality or providing equal opportunities to every member of society; it is necessary to ensure the end of structural violence. Without it SSR will not achieve the goal it sets out as end result of its implementation.

According to UN Security Council Report of 2006, there are five main challenges that are usually faced by intergovernmental organizations in implementation of their SSR agenda. First challenge is to establish a SSR concept that provides orientation and predominant framework to extent of SSR activities in which intergovernmental organizations are involved. This is necessary if we want to apply SSR programmes in an inclusive manner. Second is that in order to make sure that SSR policy is working effectively there have to be proper implementation guidelines. They can be based on the study of application of SSR in different conflicts in order to provide us with specific guidelines that have been successful in the past. With the help of these existing cases we can be sure to implement the policies that have been fruitful in the past. Third, in order to carry out SSR in an effective manner international organizations have to regulate the organization of material and human resources that are at their disposal. This will require bringing together different departments for work that is usually not accustomed to working with each other (Narten, 2008).

Thus a revised skill set and new forms of country, managerial and sector proficiency are required for SSR implementation. This will have ramifications for training and recruitment policies. Fourth is to ensure that intergovernmental and other entities involved in SSR agenda are capable of working together effectively. This is done to overcome the inefficiencies caused by the previous division of activities between different departments. It can be done by taking example of "joined- up government" as practiced by different national governments in which ministries of foreign affairs, defense and development work together for successful implementation of SSR. Fifth and the last challenge are to make sure that SSR activities are being carried put in an accountable and transparent manner. For this intergovernmental and international organizations

can work together. The oversight is necessary to ensure that SSR is fulfilling its purpose to bring post- conflict development on society. If the SSR will lack legitimacy then there is a chance of revival of conflict.

2.2.2 SSR and Local Ownership

Local ownership is defined as “the process and final outcome of the gradual transfer to legitimate representatives of the local society, of assessment, planning and decision-making, the practical management and implementation, and the evaluation and control of all phases of state-building [i.e. peace-building] programmes up to the point when no further external assistance is needed (Narten, 2008)”. The main difficulty faced in the process of SSR implementation is the absence of agreement between external actors like international organizations and local ownership of the post- conflict state. The local ownership of a post- conflict state consists of its government, parliament, judiciary, various civil society organizations and media. In order to have effective implementation of SSR in peace building process it is necessary to make sure that the relation between local ownership and external actors is of mutual acceptance and cooperation.

In order to have a sustainable post- conflict SSR it is necessary to develop implementation strategies that lead to local ownership. In short it is essential to assess the proceeding of tasks assigned to local actors and that too on their own without involvement of external actors. In a post- conflict society where there is lack of effective and efficient local ownership there are greater chances of violence to outbreak again (Wulf, 2004). According to Tanja Höhe, failure or lack of local ownership can led to collapse of post conflict reconstruction efforts. In order to have a comprehensive and long- lasting establishment of SSR in a post- conflict situation in is necessary to have both local ownership and donor communities on the same page. If not, local actors will always remain in doubt over the intentions of external actors in their society (Yasutomi & Carmans, 2007).

To ensure this cooperation external actors have to consider two main things. One is to ensure transparency and order in implantation and planning of SSR agendas and second is to provide local ownership with enough resources and training so they can work on their after withdrawal of external actors. For this purpose SSR planning and implementation policies should be formulated by keeping in consideration the nature of conflict in the area and characteristics and its local ownership. An effective SSR agenda is the one that considers the condition of the area in which

it is being used, as a generalized framework will never be fruitful for everyone because every society has its own weaknesses and delimitations. Local actors who have their own political and financial interests often pose a threat to this process. They don't want to lose their elite status in the society as SSR works on empowering local population which usually results in their being an obstacle in the peace building process.

Atsushi Yasutomi and Jan Carmans (2007) have thus pointed out five main challenges that are posed by local ownership to SSR implementation in a post-conflict society. The first challenge originates from the difference in implementation strategies and expectations of SSR between external actors and local ownership. Local actors usually have high expectations from the SSR which according to them in short term operations will bring about rapid and long lasting changes. This expectation of local people usually makes it difficult to build local ownership. SSR is a slow process that consists of strategies that are long term and bring about small changes that are often not visible to local actors. Also local ownership becomes difficult when external actors ignore indigenous reform projects and carry out SSR projects in their own way. This undermines indigenous programmes framed by local actors that are better adapted to not only the conditions of an area but also to the needs of its people (Wulf, 2004).

The second challenge is to ensure legitimacy of security sector reform programmes implementation in order to build local ownership for SSR. For this external actors have to ensure legitimacy on three different levels which are; legitimacy from the international community, from the local actor and from the donor country. It is essential to have all stakeholders involved in the reform policy formulation especially actors in sensitive departments such as the security sector. In societies where there is insufficient consent from the domestic circle in donor communities will not only result in lack of funding but also unavailability of personnel to carry out SSR operations. A well established political endorsement should also be available to external actors from the international community like UNSC.

Third is to establish and maintain the coherence in SSR activities operation between all actors involved in the process. It is necessary in establishing coordination between external actors which includes those who take part in SSR efforts and those who have their own separate interests and agendas for intervention. The lack of establishment of an overarching decision making process is the main challenge to SSR. Along with this it is also important to establish operational

coherence between local and external actors. Usually there has been an absence of understanding and coherence between local ownership and external actors in the policies and practices of SSR. External actors are usually criticized for not being inconsiderate of local cultural practices. This in turn results in inefficiency of SSR activities as they tend to ignore the need of local and indigenous community because they have insufficient knowledge of their problems and shortcomings.

Fourth, is to promote training of local institutions and population so they can continue working towards effective development of their society even after the withdrawal of external actors. In this regard civil society organizations are important to keep democratic oversight over other actors involved in security sector. Training and education of both civil society and security sector organization is important to ensure smooth SSR implementation. Usually civil society organizations lack sufficient knowledge of issues related to defense and security which makes it impossible for them to keep check and balance of activities of such sectors. Final challenge the local ownership pose to SSR is to enhance the regional and domestic security in post- conflict states. The revival of conflict in such society can pose a great threat to not only local population but also to all actors involved. In order to restrict the outbreak of violence in such society it is necessary to keep the process of post conflict reconstruction transparent and to ensure that reforms across the society are in political coherence with each other.

2.3 SSR IN PEACEBUILDING PRACTICE

In practice, SSR is usually situated in the broader context of peacebuilding. Lets look at its application in this context in detail. Peacebuilding is the central context in which SSR activities are carried out and it also provides an encompassing framework to SSR efforts. To understand the relation between the two concepts we have to first understand what peacebuilding is. Peacebuilding in simpler terms is a strategic and analytical framework for the promotion of sustainable peace in societies that are either entering, engaged in or emerging from a violent conflict (Kwaja, 2016). In practice it is usually used in the final stages of a violent conflict mostly after the cessation of violence and works towards establishing better social and political structure to ensure sustainable peace. It is an extensive framework that not only studies the causes of conflict but also draws multiple solutions for it.

So it is an analytical practice that works on the reconstruction of institutions and reassurance of sustained peace in a society along with working towards its social development. The UN has played a major part in conceptualizing the concept of peacebuilding not only that it has also explained its application in practice by stating various interests and mandates in it. Former UN Secretary-General Boutros Boutros-Ghali in his 'Agenda of Peace' which was published in 1992 has explained four different but overlapping events involved in the conflict management cycle. These activities are preventive diplomacy, peace keeping, peace-making and peace building. According to him peacebuilding can be defined as "action to identify and support structures which will tend to strengthen and solidify peace in order to avoid a relapse into conflict" (Ghali, 1992).

The above mentioned definition describes the multidimensional and somewhat contrasting role of peace building. On one hand it is involved in ending hostilities between conflicting parties and ensuring security in the area and on the other hand it is also engaged in the consolidation of peace to end the possibility of reemergence of conflict. Other scholar such as Akindele (1987) has also emphasized the use of peacebuilding as a strategy that is sustainable for management of conflicts. Peacebuilding is described as a strategy of conflict transformation and has gained popularity among scholars and practitioners in this context. They find it useful as it not only plays an important role in the establishment of democracy, human rights and also in building peace cultures in drafting solution to conflicts (Kwaja, 2016).

SSR is mostly used under the umbrella of peacebuilding or in other words peacebuilding is an analytical framework that employs SSR to achieve its primary objectives. Agbu (2006, p.38) as attributed the success of SSR with the broader agenda of peacebuilding. Rose (2006) in line with the UN development programmes, has stated that peacebuilding practice ensure not only transformation of a society but also its reconciliation and reconstruction. The above mentioned dimension of peacebuilding clearly represents its use in the reconstruction of infrastructure and security sector of a state that will help its members to thrive in the aftermath of a conflict. So peacebuilding is the overlapping framework under which SSR can work to achieve its objectives in a society and work for reconstruction of the state's security sector (Kwaja, 2016).

OECD has established linkage between SSR and peace building by stating that it ensures the creation of not only a secured environment for people but also is useful in development,

reduction in poverty and establishment of democracy. The above mentioned goals of this practice can be achieved by adopting a holistic approach, which is also people centering in the process of conflict transformation (OECD, 2005, p.58). According to a common viewpoint SSR and peace building are considered as post- conflict practices but they can also be used in pre- conflict stage. In the pre- conflict stage these activities can be used to prevent the occurrence of conflict. So this practice can not only be used for prevention of conflict but also to stop the recurrence of a violent conflict (Carnegie Commission, 1997, p.8).

According to Lederach (2006), the most important aspect is relationship building that not only in some cases proves to be the basis of conflict but also its long term solution. He based his theory of peace building on the notion that the quest for security and peace should be seen as a process which is embedded in relationship building. Thus we can say the practice of SSR and peace building is the pursuits to not only meet the needs of people which are rooted in the establishment of order, security and stability in society. All in all both of these activities whether we study them at conceptual or observe at operational level work towards the establishing peace and security in the societies that have been stricken by violent conflicts (Lederach, 2006).

It has also been argued that SSR is part of a fairly large framework, where it is seen as the final phase of the process of peacebuilding. It is involved in the concept which is known as DDR (Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration). In this context, SSR is viewed as the underlying concept that not only ensures the inception of sustainable peace but also the retaining of security personnel. This goal of SSR is opposed to DDR in the sense that it focuses on reducing instead of retaining personnel (Toft, 2010). Another scholar Karbo (2008) has worked upon the relationship between peace building and SSR. According to him, in order to rebuild or transform state capacity in a conflict stricken area we have to consider all those causes that have led it to this.

Both SSR and peace building, from a post- conflict context, hold similarity in the sense that both strive to ensure human security, stability and justice. All countries to some extent require SSR although the condition in which they have to be applied can be different. So in order to use these reform activities we have to first consider not only the causes of conflict but also the characteristics of a society which are individual to everyone. In this sense it is better to study SSR with the peacebuilding framework because it has its ideal application in that area. Although

both concepts can stand alone but when the goal is to undertake a successful SSR it is necessary to incorporate it within the wider framework of peacebuilding process.

In the upcoming chapters we will first study the pre- conflict and during conflict scenario with the case study of FATA based on PSC. In the end in the post- conflict phase recommendations will be given on the basis of the practice of SSR. It will also be discussed that what type of reforms should be introduced in order to make FATA an efficiently reliable and stable region.

CHAPTER THREE

INTERNAL SECURITY (IS) PARADIGM OF FATA

3.1 CONCEPT OF NATIONAL SECURITY- PAKISTAN

Internal security (IS) has an important part in any country's national security policy. Security is a multidimensional concept that has always been difficult to explain. During Cold War era, scholars usually associated security with the military strength of a state. This means that a state with large and developed military will be more secure than one with the absence of it. Since the end of Cold War although the basic concept of security has remained the same but a lot of other dimensions have added to it. Now the security is not only defined on the basis of military strength but also in terms of economic, identity, social, environmental and more recently human security. But in order to understand it wholly we have to consider different conditions for its application (Mendel, 2011).

According to Wolfers (1952, p. 149), it is necessary to point out the following when studying the concept of security, which are; which values to protect, from which threats, by which means, and at what cost. The concept of security holds the central importance in a nation- state and in the recent years after the declaration of war on terrorism by America after 9/11, it has changed drastically. In the modern era of globalization states are working on improving their national security by keeping the focus on developing comprehensive internal security policies. Emma Rothschild (1995) has also pointed out that it is necessary to have conceptual breakthrough of the concept of security. So that it goes beyond the one dimension of military security to include other dimensions as the security of people in their homes, communities and jobs, etc.

Nowadays whenever scholars discuss the concept of security they base it in the concept of national security. We will focus on the dimension of national security i.e. internal security. Internal security of a state is defined in terms of maintaining peace and tranquility within the borders of a state that is sovereign. It is usually done by ensuring the rule of law and protecting people from various threats to internal security. Internal security thus includes economic, social, political, and environmental aspects of security among others. In simpler terms, we can say that

the concept of security is the ability of the state to work for and ensure the well-being and protection of its citizens. Taking this concept in context of Pakistan, it is the one area on which we have never really worked upon.

Pakistan being a third world state with a colonial legacy has its fair share of problems that are deeply embedded in its history. Generalizing the concept of security emerging from West on the security paradigm of Pakistan wouldn't be fair. In order to understand the security problems of the country we have to consider the causes that led us to our present condition. Pakistan's national security is not only endangered by the presence of certain external threats but also due to the presence of internal threats (Jaffery, 2018). Internal security of Pakistan has to be considered with the development in the economic sector which is more or less the root cause of all its problems. Pakistan has been engaged in war against terrorism for more than a decade that has become a concern for international world considering the national security of country. Threats to national security of Pakistan are not only due to external crises but also due to the internal crises as it is a broader term than defense (Rumi, 2015).

The national security of Pakistan has always faced criticism for being India-centric. In the aftermath of 9/11, the country changed its national security by working on other dimensions like social, political and economic security. Although work done in this regard is very slow as compared to the amounts of threats encountered but still progress is there. When Pakistan declared its role in war against terrorism in 2004 there was no concrete policy that was formulated to govern it. First policy of Pakistan related to its IS came decade later in 2014 in the form National Internal Security Policy of Pakistan (NISP) followed by National Action Plan (NAP) that was a one page document consisted of twenty points formulated in the aftermath of APS Peshawar attack in December, 2014.

NISP (2014- 2018) was a five year plan to cope with security issues in Pakistan. Due to the lack of any security policy at national level for 67 years since the independence cost Pakistan a lot. All the threats to security in the recent times whether those were terrorist attacks throughout the country or separatist movements in Baluchistan or unrest in Tribal areas were the cause of this neglect. Terrorism that has been the biggest issue in the country which has maligned the image of Pakistan in international community; it has its roots in the tribal areas of state. In order to understand the result that we have seen in from of terrorism we have to first consider the causes

that led us to this. Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) was seen as the hub of terrorism in the country considering that they provided a safe haven to all terrorists.

In the next section we are going to discuss the causes that made the tribal areas vulnerable to militancy and terrorism in the light of the theory of PSC.

3.2 FATA- A COLONIAL LEGACY

In chapter one of this research we have discussed the context in which FATA was created during British rule in Indian subcontinent. This entire tribal belt has always been an important area of interest not only from geo- political but also from economic point of view. Its geo political importance lied in the fact that it suffered as a ‘buffer zone’ for British Empire against the expansionist Russia. Whereas it was important from economic point of view as it was a major trade route between different countries and has been used for this purpose for centuries. Present condition of FATA has a lot to do with its colonial history and also certain characteristics of its culture. In order to understand the problems of the area we have to first consider the way its people have lived there for centuries (Cheema, 2005).

Traditionally FATA has been a gateway to invasions from Central Asia and beyond. These invasions were also responsible for several cross- cultural transformations in the region. The present condition of these areas cannot be only attributed to this reason. One of the most important reasons is the culture of former FATA that depicts that people of the area live under primitive customs and taboos due to compulsion instead of choice. The geography and environment of an area are important but in the case of erstwhile FATA they hold basic importance because it was the difficult landscape of the area that led it to become the safe haven of terrorism. It is mostly perceived as “the most sensitive areas in Pakistan and, indeed, in South Asia” (Ahmed, 2013).

Its territorial landscape consists of “a tangle of difficult mountains intersected by long narrow valleys, innumerable gorges and torrent beds, interspersed with cultivable lands” (Ahmed, 2013). There are mountains which are rugged and have barren slopes and they are located in Khyber and Mohmand Agencies whereas there are hilltops and ridges which are difficult and rough in South Waziristan. The mountain ranges are extended over a large area with as high as 1,500 to 3,500 meters above sea level. The highest mountain peak is located on the Afghanistan- Pakistan

border which is about 4,755 meters high and is called Sikaram Peak. As the area get less amount of rainfall throughout year so numerous dry water courses present there hardly get any water. These courses dissect the mountains' length and breadth making it impossible to habituate or the area or to use it for cultivation (Haq, Khan & Nuri, 2005).

There are seven routes that pass through the territory of FATA and serve as border passes between Pakistan and Afghanistan. These are Malakand, Khyber, Gandab route through Mohmand territory, Kohat route through Parachinar, Bangash or Pariwar route through Kurram, and Golam and Tochi routes through Waziristan. Also to the south the renowned Bolan routes is present which passes through Quetta, Baluchistan. All of these routes in one time or other have served as the gateway for invasion and trade between Indus Plain and Central Asian region (Caroe, 1958). Five rivers also run through these areas which are Kabul, Tochi, Kurram, Swat and Gomal. Not only the landscape of the area is difficult but it also experiences extreme climatic conditions.

Plains in the area experience hot climate whereas mountain region are extremely cold while in most of the area it is dry both in summer or winter. The flora and fauna of the region is diverse with large forests in areas that experience major rainfall. Numerous species of birds and wild animals are present in the region making some of the areas rich in different varieties of living things (Ahmed, 2013). The territorial landscape of the area is very rich with having almost all types of climate, flora and fauna and rivers, mountains, etc. But it is also what makes this area difficult for survival but easy if someone wants to hide or do certain illegal activities. These factors can be considered as one of the reason that FATA became what it is today. But on the other hand certain other important factors that are responsible for its vulnerability to terrorism or militancy are its culture or custom of living.

3.2.1 Pukhtunwali- The Code of Pukhtuns

People living in the tribal regions are known as Pathans or Afghans or Pashtuns or Pakhtuns. The way how historians have describes ranges from derogatory descriptions due to their stubbornness or hard headed ways to praise worthy based on their fierce loyalty to their people. They have been called religious fanatics due to their extremist views and also honorable people due to the way they protect and own what they consider to be theirs. Their culture and customs are the characteristic that made them to be seen as being unapproachable or primitive. They were even

today living and abide by the same rules they had centuries ago. This where on the one hand can be a fascinating example of being attached to one's roots but on the other hand it is taken by the world as being an unlearned culture (Ahmed, 2013).

Renowned historians are divided on the way they have described the culture and people of the tribal areas. Winston Churchill and Olaf Caroe have described the Pathans to be fierce and warlike; loyal and traditional to the core and having high regard for anyone who abide by their customs (Arthur, 1967). On the other hand some like Theodore Pannel, a 19th Century missionary, described them as shrewd, treacherous, religious fanatics and extremists (Singer, 1984). Their culture is drastically different from others which is what made them unique as well difficult to understand. It isn't the way they live but also the languages they speak, the traditions they follow, and the way they dress up.

Among all their customs and traditions, the one thing that holds most importance is the code of the Pukhtuns which is generally called Pukhtunwali. It is not only prevalent and influential but also is ambiguous and elusive. It is also referred to as *Pukhtu*- language of the Pukhtuns, or *tarboorwali*- the rivalry between male cousins, and even *nangwali*- which means the code of honor. This code or way of living is a combination of revenge, hospitality and what is commonly called as the need to safeguard honor. Among all of these characteristics that form the code; honor is the most important (Haq, Khan & Nuri, 2005). You will see a Pukhtun giving up anything except their honor. Honor is not only a social obligation but it has to be there at the spiritual level and if someone forsakes it then revenge against them becomes a necessity. This can be explained by a famous Pukhtun proverb: "He is not a Pukhtoon who does not give a blow in return for a pinch" (Ahmed, 2013).

This obsession with honor has led to a lot of bloodshed and rivalry among people that has proceeded through generations. But at the same time Pukhtunwali is also considered as the way of living that makes people to adjust to every lifestyle. So it is not only about honor or revenge but also to have open- minded approach that make the survival easy for them in the world. Pukhtuns take pride in the code and see it as something that is consistent with their Islamic identity. The belief that they have a direct link to Prophet (PBUH) due to common ancestors is what strengthens their concept of being true Muslims. This belief also helps them in masking every activity under the religious cover no matter how tenuous it is. In order to consolidate this

relationship the practices and symbols of Islam are not only respected but also visible in the society.

Some of the prominent aspects of Pukhtunwali are Nang, Melmastia, Bada'I, Nanawatay, Tor, Taboor, Jirga, Teega or Kanrai, Badragga, Lungi, Nagha, Hujra, and Rawaj. Nang means honor and this code make it a compulsion for a tribesman to ensure the safeguard of his and his families honor no matter the circumstances. Melmastia means hospitality, which is to show generosity and cordiality to not only all visitors but also to every tradition. The obligation to protect people also falls under this code which is often abused due to the stubbornness of the natives. This is also one of the practices that led FATA to become a hub of terrorism. Bada'I is revenge that permits no limitation of space or time no matter what are the consequences or what will it cost. Blood enmities and feuds at times last for generations.

Nanawatay is another code that stands for seeking forgiveness. It is to go into the enemy's house to seek forgiveness generally with Holy Quran in hand. But it can only be done in case of relatively smaller disputes because if it is a Tor that is concerned with dishonor of a woman then there will be no forgiveness. Tor means black which is a code of open infamy or guilt. When a woman is dishonored Tor is said to occur and it can only be converted to Spin (white) by death or on agreed conditions of victim. Tarboor means cousin and it is often based on rivalry between cousins for political status or leadership that results in tarboorwali (cousin rivalry) that can result in violent conflicts. Jirga stands for tribal council which is a gathering of tribal elders to decide on certain issues and always give binding verdicts that should be accepted by all parties of conflict.

Teega means ceasefire stone which is the date for suspension of hostilities between tribes as is decided by Jirga. If someone violates this ceasefire then they will be held accountable in front of Jirga. Badragga is the tribal escort that is usually chosen from the tribe through which travellers are passing. If it is violated then it can cause a feud between tribes and an attack on Hamsayais (client or dependent groups) is considered an attack on the protector. Lungi is the allowance that is usually given to leader known as Maliks by political authorities of a tribe. Nagha is the tribal fine which is imposed on the person who has done something wrong and is decided by elders. It can be taken from the wrongdoer by force if necessary. Hujra is the sleeping place for visitors, guests or young males who are unmarried. Pukhtun are famous for their hospitality due to Hujra.

The last one is Rawaj that is a Pathan's daily way of life. It not only consists of customary law known as Rawaj -i- Aam but is also governed by Islamic or Shariat law. In fact, Rawaj is given more importance than Shariat and is widely in practice and preferred over it in most cases. Although Pukhtunwali is an honorable code of living but usually it is glorified and is preferred over all other forms of identity. It is an ideal but in practice the reality is totally different. Due to selfish ambitions of certain individuals it is exploited for personal gains instead for collective good as done by TTP. It shows one's departure from the actual code and using the principles of revenge and honor against the wrongdoers according to their own perception. Many people now are of the belief that people are selfish, corrupt and work for their own interests and that Pukhtunwali is dead (Ahmed, 2013).

3.2.2 FCR- Frontier Crimes Regulation

What was formerly known as FATA today is considered one of the most underdeveloped areas of Pakistan and its present condition can be attributed to negligence on part of government. The stagnation in its growth since independence is due to the failure on part of government to mainstream it. The status quo of colonial era remains intact even today in the governance of region. British divided the areas of region into accessible, non- accessible and protected area by navigation of local systems (FATA Secretariat, 2018). Using the customs of area they divided the governance system into three main pillars which are present till this day: the political agent, the tribal leaders and the 1901 Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR).

First pillar is the *political agent*, it is a person who is in charge of each agency's administration and is a senior bureaucrat by profession. He serves as the judicial, administrative officer and chief executive of the agency. He controls the tribal and irregular forces by extending state policy and also co-opting the tribal influential elders. His power is usually limited in the sense that he has to take decisions while considering the will of tribal elders. The direct check on his power is kept by the Commissioner, who is a supervising authority, a post that was eventually scrapped under the Devolution Plan implemented in 2002. He has a lot of power and authority and is given a lot of funds and has judicial power that makes people skeptical about his intention too.

Second pillar is the *maliki* system; these are the influential elders who work in accordance with the state. They receive muwajibs (hereditary subsidies) and lungi with special additional

privileges. Former governor of NWFP, Mr. Iftikhar Hussain, has described the system of maliks as:

This system of nurturing local elites at the cost of discouraging voices of disagreement did suit the rulers of the past...[today] maliks jealously cut down to size anyone who tries to break the ranks (Javaid & Haq, 2016).

Third and the most important pillar of this system is *FCR* which stands for Frontier Crimes Regulation. It is a law formulated by the British to regulate the tribal people and to exercise control on them.

The British initially formulated certain civil and criminal laws that were extended to frontier regions but due to low rates of conviction they decided to formulate a rather harsh law. The first Frontier Crimes Regulation was imposed in 1871 which is still present in current form being promulgated about a century ago in 1901. It basically encapsulates the tribal code of living, Pukhtunwali, and works on imposing its certain elements like *Rawaj* or customs and the tribal council known as *Jirga*. Some people view this law as the imposition of tribal customs while others view it as its exploitation. These differences on FCR remain even today and make it difficult to arrive at a decision regarding its reforms (Nawaz, 2009).

FCR is the colonial legacy that is in complete contradiction with 1973 constitution of Pakistan and has been watered down through various amendments. Article 8 of the constitution give equal right to all citizens of the state whereas FCR denies their fundamental rights. When a person is declared accused by FCR then he cannot challenge this decision in higher judicial courts. This law has been always under criticism from human rights activists and watchdogs. But still the government of Pakistan allowed its use under the pretext that it is in accordance with the customs and traditions of Pukhtuns. Instead it is not true because if it is in accordance Pukhtunwali then it should work for benefit of the tribesmen. FCR has made it impossible for the area to develop making it educationally, economically, socially and politically underdeveloped.

Initially it was used by British to subdue the unruly tribes and exercise control on them. FCR provided a legal, judicial and administrative framework to govern FATA under the guise of FCR, which was apparently designed according to customary laws. But it was disproportionate in the implementation of punishment and was in practice just a harsh but ready justice to control the

tribesmen. This colonial legacy is still present today and the tribal were governed by using FCR, 1901 till lately. Although a number of amendments were introduced in its regulations in 1928, 1937, 1947, 1962, 1963, 1995, 1997, 1998, 2000 and 2011; but the structures and constituents on which it is based remained same (Javaid & Haq, 2016). It is because of the reason that whenever an amendment was introduced it was of minor nature that didn't make any difference to basic constituents of the law (Ahmed, 2013).

In 1997 the amendment which was introduced contained only the definition of 'governor' and in another amendment where they used the term 'commissioner' was changed by 'court of the commissioner.' All cases whether they are criminal or civil in nature are decided under FCR with the assistance of *Jirga* in FATA. It is a harsh law that is considered as a black law as certain of its provisions are considered as being inhumane and cruel. One of its concepts is called the 'collective responsibility' which means that for the crime of a single individual the entire tribe may face the brunt of the punishment. This conception was also declared as being unconstitutional by Supreme Court of Pakistan. People who suffer the most from this are locals that remain not only suppressed but also marginalized under the shackles of this legislation (Javaid & Haq, 2016).

Law in a society should serve as a bridge between social structures and relationships in it. FCR is that colonial legacy that gives almost all rights to influential people like Political Agents and is responsible for FATA not becoming a mainstream region till now. Due to this law FATA has been unable to harmonize its social structures with its society. 70 years of independence but still today people of FATA are unable to exercise their fundamental constitutional rights (FATA Secretariat, 2018). The irony of the situation is that as on one hand Article 199 and 184 (3) gives Supreme Court and High Courts the right of enforcement but on the other hand Article 247 restricts them to do so (Pakistan Constitution, 1973). Only government can be held responsible for this plight of people of FATA and can do something to end this unjust practice.

3.2.3 Militancy in FATA- Linkages with Extremism

The tribal areas are characteristically a unique region considering the fact that it has been a gateway for invasion not only in history but also as recent as during Cold War and then US war on terrorism, 2001. All of these have impacted the people in one way or another and adding to it is the nature of people of the region. Along with it the absence of interest on part of Pakistan's

government has added to the social and economic grievances of people. It also serves as a buffer zone between Pakistan and Afghanistan and the instability of relations between neighboring countries has adversely affected the natives. People of the region have both ethnic and historical linkages with the people across border in Afghanistan. These linkages and the ungoverned Durand Line allowed extremist elements to settle in various areas of the region. Also due to absence of any definite governing body and lawlessness made FATA the perfect breeding ground for extremist factions (Nawaz, 2009).

Another reason for the increase of militancy is the way extremists have exploited the hospitality of Pukhtuns under Pukhtunwali. Under the code they are not only bound to protect but also help their guests to whatever extent. Resultantly all of the extremist elements became a part of region by either marrying the local women or even by force in some cases. Due to already present socio- economic grievances, mostly the low income class of society gave way to extremists as they had nothing to lose. Hence the unification of all extremists' factions resulted in FATA becoming the 'most dangerous place' in the world (Ahmed, 2013). The factor that made it all the more vulnerable was the absence of any synchronized security system.

Security forces like Levies or Frontier Corps was although present but they were not trained to operate in conditions of extreme violence. Due to the absence of a comprehensive security framework and any proper law enforcement policy it was impossible to control any violent situation. Levies or *Khasadar* force works under Deputy Commissioner and LEAs (Law Enforcement Agency) is not strong enough where FC is not programmed to fight just to stop smuggling. Frontier Core is not given enough power by LEAs to file FIR or even arrest a culprit; instead they are only allowed to fine them. Due to such loopholes in security system extremist factions operate regularly across the lines which apparently divide settled, PATA, Frontier Region and FATA (FATA Secretariat, 2018).

In order to study FATA's vulnerability to militancy we have to keep in mind the human factor of the region. It is a world known fact that the people of region have never accepted outsiders as their rulers. They are the most resilient people in the world who have opposed foreign invasion no matter what it cost. If we analyze the situation carefully, we will find that people of the region have been fighting a hard and long battle for their survival (Yousafzai & Khan, 2014). Adding to their plight is the ignorance on part of administration and they grievance they have faced since

independence. They are living both defensively and offensively at the same time. When they have basic necessities of life they behave defensively but when they have no resources for survival they behave offensively.

This nature of theirs can result in them being involved in violent activities which can lead to them being involved in militancy. Their grievances have helped extremist's faction in exploiting them for their evil purposes. A society like FATA that is suffering from problems like poverty, social injustice, unemployment, illiteracy, etc., is unable to play any type of constructive role in the progression of a nation. Weapons are considered a part of Pashtun culture. A gun is not only a weapon but also a part of their culture and for most people a way to earn their living. Darra Adamkhel had a large gun- manufacturing industry including Nawagai to some extent as well and is a source of income for many people. In Pashtun culture a gun is a symbol of power and strength but now most of Pashtuns have stopped carrying weapons because of increase in violence and killings in the region (Ahmed, 2013).

Militancy in FATA can be attributed to the way Pakistan's independence has been manipulated by the people in power through the years. The concept that Pakistan was created in the name of Islam has been exploited by our leaders since its formation. The masses have always been subjugated in the name of religion and due to which their emotions were manipulated. A very visible example of this can be seen during Afghan War when Soviet Union attacked Afghanistan. During this war Afghan 'Jihad' was waged in which Americans provided Afghan mujahedeen with weapons and Pakistan hosted them. The differences between people based on sectarianism were also exploited that led to social, political, economic problems in the society. They sowed the seeds of enmity and hatred among people which eventually led to the formation of sectarian groups (Javaid & Haq, 2016).

The sectarian divides in the society gave rise to different extremist groups namely Jaish-e-Muhammad, Lashkar-e-Jhangvi, Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), etc. The acts of violence, extremism and terror committed by these groups spread throughout Pakistan especially those regions that were tribal in nature like FATA. Religion was used as a two- way sword in FATA. The concept of 'Jihad' was exploited and people were urged to seek justice against those who were wrongdoers according to extremists. Militants are considered extremists because of their intolerance towards all those Muslims who have belief different then their personal interpretation

of Islam. The Sunni- Shia conflict has caused many deaths in Kurram Agency, Orakzai Agency and the adjacent district of Hangu. Taliban militants are thus aided by certain Punjabi militias like Sipah-i-Sahaba, Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and other extremist groups (Ahmed, 2013).

These and other extremist groups were formed during Afghan 'Jihad' to contain Soviet expansionism in the region. They were given training with Afghan mujahedeen and were manipulated in doing so by exploiting their emotions and beliefs in the name of religion. But when Soviet was defeated the USA and government of Pakistan left them on their own without any surveillance (Nawaz, 2009). They were heavily armed and unsupervised which led them to do whatever they wanted. In post 1979 scenario their ambitions drastically changed with them wanting to setup Taliban government in Afghanistan to Islamisation of FATA to waging war against state of Pakistan. They symbolized waging war against USA and its allies as 'Jihad' and turned their political objective to ideological one thus complicating the already worse situation.

3.2.4 Socio- economic Challenges

FATA has always been subjected to political alienation, economic deprivation and negligence on part of government. This resulted in not only increase of grievances of people but also in their resentment towards the center. The compartmentalized approach adopted by Federal Government further aggravated the situation as it only benefitted the elite or influential people. This approach marginalized the lower class of society thus resulting in a large section of population living below the poverty line. Almost 60% of the population is vulnerable to poverty and other social deprivations. Unemployment rate in the area is about 60% to 80% that has its roots in poor governance and unending conflict which has further deteriorated living conditions in area (Khan & Khan, 2014). The unremitting drone strikes have also added to the miseries of people affecting their agriculture, infrastructure and livestock.

Out of the total 3.8 million population of FATA almost 80% is not only illiterate but also unskilled. Education is the basic right of every human but in FATA people are deprived of this basic right. According to the Report of Annual Statistical 2012- 2013, there were only 5,625 educational institutions in FATA out of which 3,640 were primary schools, 455 middle and 275 high schools. There were only 13 higher- secondary educational institutions, 37 degree colleges, four elementary colleges, 956 community schools, 44 industrial homes and 196 mosque schools. Education system in FATA as other things was adversely affected by terrorism and militancy.

According to Education Department of FATA Secretariat the literacy rate for males is 36.66% and for females is 10.5% (FATA Secretariat, 2018).

The overall rate of literacy is 17.4% with 29.5% for males and only 3% for females which is a lot less as compared to national rate of 43.92% with 32.03% for females and 54.91% for males. Due to certain natural calamities and some man made scenarios the education department of FATA has suffered a lot. Due to terrorism, military operations, 2005 earthquake and 2010 flood a lot of school buildings were destroyed that further declined the ratio of education. Like education, people have also faced lack of health care facilities in the tribal region (Khan& Khan, 2014). Only in the headquarters of every agency basic health convenience is given while the remaining general population of the area is deprived of it. This has resulted in a large number of avoidable and much untimely causality. The number of hospitals in these areas is 45 with 180 dispensaries and only one doctor for a population of 8,189.

Coming on to the infrastructure of the region it will be no exaggeration to say that FATA has one of the worst in Pakistan. Wide range networks of communication like roads and bridges connect not only villages but also towns and cities and bring improvement to lives of people. The road situation in the area has been improving due to allocation of funds by government but it has not done anything to do economic development of the region. There is lack of mobility between economy and roads due to which they are not contributing in social infrastructure of the region. This immobility is due to the fact that the people in top position use the funds given to build roads for only those areas that are useful to them hence depriving the remaining places.

The system of water supply and sanitation is not at par with modern standards in most regions of FATA. The land of region has a mix of arid and semi- arid land but the amount of rainfall received by it is relatively low. The presence of a large number of Afghan Refugees has adversely affected the ecology of the region. As stated earlier FATA is an underdeveloped region that has poor sanitation system and only 10% percent of the total population has proper system of sanitation. In most of area there is shortage or complete non- availability of clean water. A latest survey has indicated that only 43% if the total population can access the potable water facility with about 70% outside and 30% inside the house. Due to underdeveloped infrastructure and institutions it is impossible to provide people with basic life necessity like clean water (Kamran, 2014).

Due to the difficult terrain like mountains and slopes it is really difficult to have water plant installations. Lack of clean water supply has also resulted in promotion of unhygienic culture among people and has also resulted in a lot of diseases. Thus adding to difficulties of people and making their survival more uncertain. The tribal region is rich in several minerals like copper, marble, limestone, coal and also a number of other natural resources. But almost all of them remain untapped because of financial constraints and geographical constrictions. Federal Government in 1970 tried to establish an extensive industrial base in tribal areas but it didn't materialize due to attitude of local people. Industrial activity in the region is mainly based on business units. But these units operate without any supervision of government hence they play no role in economic development of the region.

According to tribal laws an outsider cannot occupy or control regional land. Poor infrastructure and bad condition of roads make it impossible for the delivery of raw materials to people. Another destabilizing agent in this regard are inter-tribal conflicts that makes it difficult for government to start any development projects. Also these types of dispute discourage investors from outside to invest in any projects in the tribal belt. Main hindrance in socio-economic development in the area is the absence of any alternative means of earning and limited agricultural growth (Nawaz, 2009). The agricultural produce in the region is very low as compared to requirement of people thus making it dependent on KPK and rest of Pakistan. Livestock was considered as main source of livelihood for people but due to drone attacks it is also affected adversely.

In order to meet their economic demands people have then resorted to undesirable cultivation of poppy which is causing damages to the society. In ongoing circumstances it has become impossible to have a stabilized industry in the area and also it is impossible to do any exploration of minerals in FATA (Yousafzai & Khan, 2014). All of these problems have not only their roots in the way of living adopted by natives but also due to negligence on part of government. They were never integrated in mainstream thus making them a different group from rest of population of the country. The rise of extremist factions and nationalism resulted in alienating them further from general population. All of these problems combined resulted in prolonged grievances of people that made them vulnerable to exploitation by wrong side of society.

3.3 HISTORY OF REFORMS IN FATA- POLITICAL AND LEGAL REFORMS

Since independence of Pakistan in 1947, the governments over the years have introduced a number of reforms in the area. Reforms introduced were of both political and legal types which were done to bring the region under some administration control. Although the map of Pakistan shows FATA as part of country but most of the population thinks that it is more or less an independent region. In 1947 when Pakistan came into being, FATA became a part of Pakistan through popular vote. The already existing FCR was repealed in NWFP in the year 1956 followed by Malakand Agency in 1975 (Rehman & Khan, 2014).

Although the entire tribal belt was meant to be merged with the state but it didn't happen due to weak administration of Pakistan and lack of consensus on part of tribal leaders. FATA became a point of attraction for the world after Soviet invasion of Afghanistan in 1979. It became a breeding ground for *Jihadis* and served as transit route for transfer of weapons to Afghan militants. FATA before that was a platform for drug trafficking and served as a black market for different elements of society. After the Soviet invasion it became more or less a Jihadis haven thus resulting in further delay in its merger to Pakistan. When USSR was defeated in Afghanistan then people of FATA were once again ignored until it came to light after 9/11 attacks. These events made it a flashpoint for the world and not in a good way making it the most dangerous place in the world.

Pakistan's government since independence has tried to introduce a number of reforms in FATA. Initially on administrative level a special FATA cell was responsible for taking administrative and developmental decisions for the region. This cell used to work under Planning and Development Department of NWFP. But in 2002, a FATA Secretariat was formed which was later upgraded to FATA Civil Secretariat in 2006. It is headed by an Additional Chief Secretary, other directors and secretaries. This secretariat serves as a central entity that work in accordance with President of Pakistan, Governor of KPK and government officials who work to implementation all type of decisions taken under FCR. These decisions can be either of administrative or judicial nature and are impended upon locals of different tribe living in the region. The creation of Secretariat also helped in centralizing the power of federal government in FATA (Aziz, 2017).

The struggle for the right to vote to people of FATA is a long one which was done under the leadership of a movement spearheaded by a coalition of tribes known as Tehreek-e-Itehad-e-Qabail. Their struggles were acknowledged finally in 1996 when government of Pakistan allowed all adult citizens of Pakistan living in FATA the right to vote. This decision of government made them eligible to take part in general elections of 1997. Individual, members of civil society, judiciary and other group of FATA have always advocated for the provision of equal rights to people as they were given in Pakistan. In 2011, acknowledging the efforts of people of FATA government introduced a reform package that called for people's consensus on future reforms in the country. After a long series of meeting for reforms between different actors finally in 2013 about 300 tribal citizens came together as FATA Grand Assembly. This assembly debated on different reforms for the region and finally approved the Citizens' Declaration for FATA Reforms also known as FATA Declaration (FATA Secretariat, 2018).

The FATA Declaration asserts that, "all tribesmen must be guaranteed the same fundamental rights enjoyed by other citizens of the country and guaranteed by the constitution", as per media reports. This was a historic movement in the progression towards better governance in FATA which further led to different judicial reforms advocated by FATA Lawyer's Forum. These judicial reforms called for extension of the jurisdiction of Supreme Court and High Court to FATA. These reforms were important in the sense that it gave people another way of getting justice rather than being dependent only on the shrewd FCR. Many of the political parties of country also supported these reforms and called for implementation of these reforms in FATA (Javaid & Haq, 2016).

Pakistan has faced international pressure due to improper jurisdiction in FATA. International organizations like European Union, Amnesty International and other human rights watchdogs have called for proper introduction of reforms in FATA. FATA committee in this regard presented an 11 point agenda containing all of their demands for change. They had meetings with senior governmental official which led to the formation of a new FATA Reforms Commission. It was established in 2014 and has a mandate that includes proposition for amendments in existing laws, introduction of several legal reforms and certain long and short- term initiatives to establish good governance (Aziz, 2017). It also called the officials to devise certain economic and

development proposals for the region and to point out some necessary changes to the existing FCR.

People of FATA for a very long time have worked and hoped for some change in their way of living. They have hoped for a better lifestyle and proper jurisdiction in the region so that every member of the society will have equal chance at success. We can never understand their grievances; these are the people that are hurt beyond measure. They have faced deprivation of basic human rights since independence and are today facing the worst bout of terrorism across the world. It is the government's job to ensure that they get what they deserve which is to live peacefully not thinking whether they will get food the next day or be alive to see it. Gradually we are getting there but these people have had enough and they deserve all compassion and gratitude we can muster to give them what every human being deserves.

CHAPTER FOUR

ROLE OF ARMY IN FATA

4.1 THE WAR ON TERROR

Over the years terrorism has been employed to fulfill certain political or ideological agendas but what have we seen in today's world has no parallel to its history. A practice that is used to incite fear or terror in others has become more complex and difficult to understand in the changing world. It now stands for different terrorist group working together with an extremist ideology to achieve their objectives. The continuous stream of suicide bombers, mass murders, kidnapping, bomb blasts and many other events are employed to incite fear in people. One of the major victims of this menace is the state of Pakistan. All of this as we know started with the attack of Taliban believed to be led by Osama Bin Laden on World Trade Center. This event changed the course of history and that's why 9/11 will always be engraved in minds of people especially those who were directly affected by it.

Following the terrorists attacks of 2001, United States of America declared Global War on Terror (GWOT) and attacked Afghanistan. US blamed Taliban and Al- Qaeda for this and vowed to vanquish them once and for all. They clearly and loudly warned the whole world that either you are with us (USA) or against us, or if someone is against them then they will be considered an accomplice of Taliban. Pakistan being a prominent member of the world community sided with US. The war in Afghanistan directly affected Pakistan as they share not only the longest border but the area of Pakistan adjacent to Afghanistan have people who have relationships with each other. Taliban regime in Afghanistan was overthrown by the United States in a short time but all those who fled from there took refuge in FATA region of Pakistan (Ahmed, 2013).

Pakistan has always supported its neighbors and has tried to become a useful member of world community. Most of the refugees of Afghan War of 1979 were hosted by Pakistan and the US attack of Afghanistan brought a new bout of them. By the end of 2001 there were about 5 million refugees in Pakistan that later became more than 7 million. Along with these asylum seekers many extremist individuals also entered Pakistan and settled in FATA (Rehman & Khan, 2014). Pakistan was under extreme pressure from international actors especially USA to end all of these terrorist factions. This led to Pakistan declaring its stance on war on terror by starting military

operations in its tribal areas in 2002. But this decision of government has cost us a lot as it turned Pakistan into a country that is severely affected by terrorism.

4.1.1 Military Operations- The War Within

Since 1947 Pakistan Army has fought four wars with neighbors India and had been engaged in a few cross- border clashes with Afghanistan. After the attacks of 9/11 in the United States of America, Pakistan joined the US led War on Terror and broke of ties with the Taliban. Due to its participation in the War on Terror, Pakistan had to carry out a number of military operations against Taliban all of which have been effective (Nawaz, 2009). As of late the armed force has conducted many joint military operations i.e. Operation Al-Mizan, Operation Rah-e-Haq, Operation Sherdil, Operation Zalzala, Operation Sirat-e-Mustaqeem, Operation Rah-e-Raast, Operation Rah-e-Nijaat, Operation Koh-e-Sufaid, and Operation Zarb-e-Azb (Khan, 2014).

First military operation launched by Pakistan Army in FATA was in South Waziristan on 16 March, 2004 titled Operation Al- Mizan. Around then the Army Chief was General Pervez Musharraf, who deployed military in FATA consisting of around 70,000-80,000 soldiers. The security forces loss was around 1200-1500 men as it was the main operation, first of its kind, inside the nation and the armed force confronted an enormous misfortune because of absence of data about the approach of the foe, their forts and hardly any know-how of the territory (Nawaz, 2009). Militants focused on attacking full convoys in the underlying stages causing numerous setbacks. Other than the essential infantry, Special units of the Pakistan Army and the world class Special Services Group (SSG) were equally a part of battle and that too directly. Absence of local support around then made obstacles in the smooth advance of the task.

Conflicts between Pakistan Troops and Al-Qaeda erupted in May, 2004. They were joined by local radicals and master Taliban powers. The offensive was inadequately organized and the Pakistan Army endured substantial setbacks. Following a long conflict of two years (2004-2006), the Pakistan Military arranged a truce with the tribesmen from the district where they vowed to chase down Al-Qaeda, stop Talibanisation of the locals and to stop assaults in Pakistan and Afghanistan. In spite of that, the militants did not keep their pledge and began to modify and assumed control over Lal Masjid in Islamabad. Following a six-month standoff, a battle took place in 2007 when the Pakistan Military chose to utilize the power to handle the Lal Masjid situation. Once the activity was over the recently shaped Tehreek-I-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), an

umbrella gathering of aggressors situated in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) promised vindicate and propelled an influx of assaults and suicide bombings in North-West Pakistan and major urban areas (Nawaz, 2009).

The Taliban extended their base and moved into the Swat Valley thus prompting second military action titled Operation Rah-e-Haq. The principal period of Operation Rah-e-Haq started in November 2007 in a joint effort with local police against TNSM in the Swat Valley. The aggressors anyway continuously invaded into key urban communities. The second stage started in July 2008 and proceeded consistently. This activity brought about 36 security personnel deaths, 9 regular citizens' and 615 militants. The third stage was propelled in January 2009, which finished after a peace accord, known as the Malakand Accord between the Government and TNSM. At that point the Pakistan Army initiated Operation Sher-e-Dil on September 9, 2008 in Bajaur Agency to focus on all groups of militants that undermined Pakistan's security. By the month of December the casualty rate of security forces was 63 along with 1000 militants (Khan, 2014).

Operation Zalzala was the next operation that was launched in South Waziristan Agency (SWA) in January, 2008. It was launched against the then leader of TTP, Baitullah Mehsud and his companions. Approximately 200,000 local people are assessed to have been uprooted, however it cleared the most of the area of SWA and more than 40,000 houses were destroyed. It was trailed by Operation Sirat-e-Mustaqeem initiated in June 2008 however was stopped by the Army on July 9, 2008 in Bara Tehsil of Khyber Agency. This operation was propelled by Pakistan Army's 40m Infantry Division. At that point PM of Pakistan was Mr. Yousuf Raza Gillani, whose legislature requested the Army take severe action against the Taliban powers in Khyber Agency. The prompt trigger for the activity was two kidnappings in Peshawar of six ladies and 16 Christians by the militant group Lashkar-e-Islam. Two terrorists and one security officer were killed in this task. In the end, the main leader figured out how to get away to an obscure area. Subsequently, Army managed to capture the area of Bara Tehsil thus leading to the end of operation (Khan, 2014).

The next operation was Rah-e-Raast in Swat which was started in May 2009 after the failure of a peace accord in the area. Major clashes between Pakistan Army and militants occurred in Mingora at the end of May and in the end they managed to take control of the region. This was

followed by Operation Rah-e-Nijaat, which was launched in the month of October. Main area of concern was South Waziristan with where many militant groups had a stronghold. The significant goal of this activity was to obliterate the stronghold and overbearing presence of militants in the area. The Pakistan Army started another operation against the aggressors in Kurram Agency situated in FATA on July 4, 2011. Koh-e-Sufaid (White Mountain) operation directed activists in Kurram with the foremost target of anchoring and re-opening Thall-Parachinar road communication which had been over and over under assault by Sunni Militants for a long time (Nawaz, 2009).

The Pakistan Army by 2012 took control of the major areas and towns of Malakand Division along with a number of tribal agencies. Only area, then left with the majority of the militants was North Waziristan. Despite the approval by CGS and Corps Commanders the operation didn't start till 2014. The main reason was the uncooperative attitude of locals and lack of preparation of Army considering the difficult territory. When General Raheel Sharif became COAS (in 2013) then he gave the final go for the operation. The operation Zarb-e-Azab was launched in June 2014 and is considered one of the biggest operations against militants. It was carried out against a number of groups of militants which are: Al-Qaeda, East Turkestan Islamic Movement, Tehreek-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), Lashkar-e-Jhangvi, Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, the Haqqani Network and Jundallah.

Zarb-e-Azab is considered a unique military operation. According to a source, Pakistan Army used a four step comprehensive military strategy that borrowed first two of its components 'seek and destroy' from Vietnam War and the last two components 'clear and hold' from Iraq War. Both of these policies were used as one by the Pakistan Army thus making it a successful operation. This strategy was executed in the way that security forces first seek the target and then followed by destroying it completely. The third step was to clear the area of any dead bodies and captured the remaining militants and collected any weapons stored there. In the end they used to keep the control of area for rehabilitation and reconstruction of area post- operation. Phenomenal success was achieved after a period of one and a half years since the start of operation. The backbone of militants was broken and their structure destroyed. The sleeper cells were destroyed with the help of intelligence based operations. This resulted in the greatly improved security

situation and the incidents of terrorism assaults had dropped remarkably for the first time since 2008.

As indicated by insider reports, the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan accumulates around rupees 2 billion in coercion cash from metropolitan Karachi every day and furthermore engaged with creating cash in Karachi from the Pashtun merchants and transporters through blackmail (Intelligence Report Operational Commander, 2014). Zarb-e-Azab has effectively demolished the budgetary base of the fear based oppression, including the feasible arrangements of psychological oppressors. To rejoin the structure and created base aggressors would require a significant time and assets in North Waziristan Agency. They could never transparently challenge the expert Law Enforcement Agencies including Pakistan Army.

If we compare the first military operation with the last one, there is an immense learning process for the Pakistan Military. Other than being prepared as a power for traditional fighting, by and by the military powers have turned out to be all around prepared to not only fight in difficult areas but also change the mindset of locals. In the last decade, however a tremendous loss of citizens' lives and military personnel were seen, but resulted in the Army learning to adapt and overcome no matter what challenges were ahead. More complex weapons have been utilized by the Pakistan Army in the ongoing battle missions. Among all significant military activities in Pakistan, Operation Rah-e-Rast and Zarb-e-Azb have been the best at wiping out the militants groups and eliminating a large number of threats from the region. Currently, Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad is underway that is focused on removing the remaining threats and mainly on rebuilding the infrastructure and rehabilitation of locals and IDPs.

4.2 IMPLICATIONS OF OPERATIONS FOR PAKISTAN

The military activities in FATA and Swat and the security of the western outskirts, have over-extended the Pakistan Army and drove on occasion to disastrous circumstances in different parts of the nation. The situation in the tribal areas has disturbed the basis of the social, political and financial structure of Pakistan all in all, and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa specifically.

4.2.1 Social Implications

As indicated by a study led by the Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies (PIPS), around 18% of Pakistani Madrassas have affiliations with Jihadi associations; around 80% of the general population is against military activities in tribal region; and the 20% of them consider the rise in

terrorism incidents an immediate response to Pakistan's part in the War on Terror. The military activities in FATA and PATA are being seen by individuals in those areas as a risk to their ethnicity and character. Additionally, the military mediation into tribal zones is seen by their leaders as a danger to their power and conventional practices and values. The ascent of Molvi Fazlullah, who is killed in June (2018) in a drone strike in a hideout in Kunar region in Afghanistan, in Swat is one case of such perception. Pakistan confronted an extreme emergency of IDPs in 2009, when about three million individuals from PATA and FATA left their homes in the wake of expanded dangers between the military and the radicals. Around 929,859 individuals were accounted for to be displaced internally in 2014, from NWA because of Operation Zarb-e-Azb.

In late 2009, the emergency heightened after the collapse of a peace treaty between the administration and the local taliban in Swat. Thus, a mass migration of the general population began from Mohmand and Bajaur Agencies in FATA. Before the end of April 2009, approximately 550,000 individuals had enrolled as IDPs in KPK. The strained battling in Bajaur Agency in October 2009 set off another flow of mass displacement and made another 50,000 individuals to leave their homes. In excess of 250,000 regular folks from Bajaur and 180,000 from Mohmand were enrolled as IDPs in Nowshera and Lower Dir by the end of December, 2009. A large scale operation was initiated against aggressors in Swat on May 6, 2009, which constrained about 2.5 million individuals to relocate to camps in various urban communities of the KPK (Rahman, 2009). Ladies and kids endured awfully. Another effect of the operations was the denying of youngsters, both young men and young ladies from getting education which is their right.

Schools and educational institutions are the one place that was extremely targeted by Taliban. Particularly girls' schools were bombed, attacked and destroyed by extremists. The Taliban destroyed 120 girls' schools and 80 different schools in Swat Valley alone. An area which already had a low literacy rate as compared to rest of the country was worst affected by the attacks of terrorists. Education of females has endured most, as young ladies were not permitted by the aggressors to go to schools and universities. The start of a second full-fledged military operation against terrorists in South Waziristan was started in October, 2009. It brought about the relocation of almost 293,000 individuals. The aggregate number of IDPs from the South

Waziristan zone had stretched around 428,000 at the end of 2009. The arrival of IDPs back to their homes was another difficult test (PIPS, 2009).

The fear of the insurgents and the poor financial conditions made the IDPs hesitant to come back to their homes. UNOCHA requested for \$680 million, keeping in mind the end goal to overcome the crisis situation in the area. The United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) in June 2009 stated that 69,000 pregnant ladies were among the populace displaced because of the military operations against the aggressors in Swat and different zones of KPK and were living in camps in extremely awful conditions. Regardless of the best endeavors with respect to Pakistan to eliminate terrorism and militancy in FATA and PATA, Pakistan has been persistently rebuked by Afghanistan for infiltration of their borders (Khan, 2014).

4.2.2 Psychological Impact

The military activities have profoundly disturbed the psychological and social structure of the society in tribal areas. Subsequently, the atmosphere of the area stays tense. The brutality and violence infused by the militants has a direct mental effect on the general population of Pakistan by and large and the general population living in the contention zones of PATA and FATA specifically. Their steady introduction to brutality has induced numerous mental issues, at times as extreme dysfunctional behavior. The terrible sound of guns stays obvious in the minds of individuals, particularly ladies and youngsters, who are suffering with mental issues and psychological trauma. Misery, nervousness, bad dreams and self-destructive propensities have been referred to as some of the most common indications, often due to loss of a relative or of their homes (Khokhar, Kamran, Abbasi & Jafar, 2014).

Although sentiments of frailty, vulnerability, dread and stress are normal among adults and children, who have been displaced, alike; the effect has been all the more on the emotional well-being of kids. Countless in Swat saw demonstrations of viciousness by the aggressors, including the shelling of their schools and the murder of their relatives and teachers or friends. Due to which a lot of children had developed depression and other mental conditions and required guiding. As per the psychological wellness projects of the Federal Ministry of Health, a larger part of the kids who were displaced in the wake of the military activities in FATA and PATA was between the ages of three months to eleven years and they were complaining of issues

including sorrow, fears, intense pressure and stress, PTSD, insomnia and different type of phobias (Khokhar, Kamran, Abbasi & Jafar, 2014).

4.2.3 Political Implications

The managerial structure in FATA has been paralyzed, as has the institutional structure. The military activities in FATA and PATA have, in any case, brought up numerous issues with respect to the inability on the part of the administration of guaranteeing the customary legal framework for the regular citizen populace. The local population has persistently requested the security of their lives and properties. The legislature has, nonetheless, neglected to anchor the lives and properties of the general population, and to give them appropriate equity. In the meantime, numerous groups of criminals have risen in these regions that enjoy wrongdoings like robbery, plundering, looting, pillaging, grabbing and killing of innocent individuals (Rahman & Khan, 2014). The general population of FATA has been denied of their political and social rights. The feeling of political hardship and absence of cooperation in basic leadership has increased grievances among the tribal natives which had influenced the relationship both government and people creating trust issues.

These unfortunate circumstances in FATA worked for the Taliban, who additionally misused basic shortcomings in the innate political and authoritative framework keeping in mind the end goal to make divisions in the tribal society where a few people have begun seeing them as their deliverers and saviors. This presented an immediate test to the writ of the administration. As per a research led by the BBC Urdu Service in April 2009, the civil government had never exercised control on more than 24% zones of FATA. Almost 38% of FATA and PATA were under government control. Many of the hard-hit regions of FATA and PATA, girls' schools, music shops, police headquarters, convoys of military and government structures were the target of Taliban assaults (PIPS, 2009).

4.2.4 Economic Implications

Pakistan has endured an aggregate loss of \$ 45 billion because of military activities from September 2001 to 2009. That has adversely affected the general economy as loss of direct foreign investment, the conclusion of the businesses in struggle zones, decrease in the tourism, in a decrease in exports of industrial products, ascent in inflation, and destruction of agricultural lands. In spite of the fact that foreign reserves expanded from \$10.83 billion out of 2007-08 to

\$14.75 billion in October 2009 but the inflation has also increased 21% in 2009 and 10.3% in 2008. The sharp increment in foreign reserves is to a great extent because of the IMF-endorsed loan of \$11.3 billion which was given to us in November 2008. Due to which total amount of loan resulted in surpassing \$ 50 billion (UNOCHA, 2018).

4.2.5 Security Implications

Pakistan has endured a huge loss of lives due to terrorist attacks and unrest, it brought throughout the country. The years 2001-2011 have seen an increased number of setbacks. The military operations majorly affected the security of the country, with internal warfare inside Pakistan expanding twofold. PIPS security report (2009) reported that 657 psychological militant assaults, including 41 of them were sectarian in nature happened, leaving 907 individuals dead and 1,543 others harmed. The report also stated that Pakistan 60 suicide assaults were carried out amid 2007 which mainly targeted security forces. These resulted in the deaths of 770 and injured another 1,574 people. The report demonstrates a noticeable increment in suicide assaults after the Lal Masjid incident in 2007. 2,148 attacks of terrorism were done in 2008, which resulted in 2,267 deaths and wounded another 4,558. The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (2008) in its yearly report demonstrated that there were no less than 67 suicide assaults all over Pakistan that murdered 973 individuals and harmed 2,318.

As per the reports of certain investigative organizations the aggregate number of suicide attacks in Pakistan since 2002 rose to 140 in 2008, while in 2007 56 suicide assaults happened. Pakistan Security Report (2009) that was distributed by PIPS reported that 2,586 fear extremist, sectarian and terrorist attacks happened, that murdered 3,021 individuals and harmed 7,334.46. Terrorist assaults in Pakistan have caused deaths of more than 35,000 individuals, 5,000 of which are members of security forces. From 2001 to 2011, 423 such attacks occurred in which the military were specifically targeted. All of these attacks killed about 1,322 security personnel and injured another 2,582. This information incorporates the fatalities that happened because of direct assaults either on a military camp, a police check post or a convoy of security personnel. The number of deaths of security forces individuals overall where they were not even the main target was 3, 631 during that time (PIPS, 2009).

4.3 DEVELOPMENTS IN FATA

Improvement works were begun in FATA by the Army as a component of Al-Mizan operation (2002- 2006). At the start a couple of undertakings were undertaken with meager distributions as the writ of government did not extend to the 'No Go Areas.' In this regard detailed assets were given both by GHQ and Federal Government whose distribution was overlooked through the FATA Secretariat (Basharat, 2005). Every year more development projects are executed by Army. A number of small development projects including reconstruction of roads, water supply schemes, sewerage and other community welfare schemes which are underway in the region. Beside these, army officials are visiting schools, colleges and health centers to collect data of teachers and students, doctors, supporting staff and missing facilities.

Pakistan Army's operated cadet college has been opened in this area. More schools and colleges are to be opened. It is also providing free medical care to civilians as well as, who suffered from this war. It is also aimed to make people at ease after long fought war. Pakistan Army also took the initiative to bring sports in this area. Sport festival entitled FATA Peace Games were held under the supervision of Army. The games included in this festival were Badminton, Hockey, Table Tennis, Football, Athletics, Basketball, and Tug of war was played. Pakistan Cricket Board (PCB) in collaboration with Pakistan Army conducted open trials of aspiring cricketers in North Waziristan Agency. More than 12000 youth were enrolled in training centers of the region. Talent hunt trails of FATA youth were held at Younis Khan Cricket Ground Miranshah. Pakistan Army, according to ISPR, has also been involved in about 178 projects in FATA and Malakand region. These are of social, power sectors in nature and are working towards improving social and communication infrastructure in the area.

First main and elaborate survey in order to get know how of public viewpoint about the condition in FATA was conducted in 2010 by other organizations namely Terror Free Tomorrow and The New American Foundation. The outcomes demonstrated that, on the issue of battling militancy in the locale, the general population of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas overwhelmingly supports the Pakistani military. Almost 70% back the Pakistani military stance against Al-Qaeda and Taliban militants in the Tribal Areas. As per a review, when asked how the Federally Administered Tribal Areas ought to be represented, 79% said it ought to be represented by the Pakistani military. According to ISPR, Army is making a 705 km long road communication

network which will cover the areas of southern KPK and FATA region. It will be of international standard and is a part of Central Trade Corridor between Pakistan and Afghanistan to facilitate trade between both countries (ISPR, 2014).

Aside from short term plans the Army has additionally got ADP financing for some significant activities, including the foundation of a few specialized organizations (de-radicalization centers) for militants and reconstruction of infrastructure in FATA. With the assistance of UAE, construction of Sheikh Khalifa bin Zayed Bridge in Swat will help in fulfilling the basic needs of the local population. This initiation satisfies their expectations, which will contribute by investing a brief time of energy to achieve other area by pushing the wheel of financial advancements and enhance the expectations for everyday comforts all across the region of KPK. Road construction was started by the Army's Frontier Works Organization (FWO), which had prior constructed the Karakoram Highway and other challenging routes in the FRs. Where this might be a successful method for connecting South Waziristan with Pakistan there still stay tremendous open doors for the military to include the young people and natives of FATA in these undertakings and development projects.

About 17 percent of the male populace consisting of young people who are between the ages of sixteen and twenty-five, falls somewhere in the range of 300,000 in all of FATA. Roads, dams, and repair ventures offer the fastest strategy for generating employments for people. Medical supplies worth 3 million rupees were dispersed, and an expected 30,000 patients were dealt with in refugee camps. The Army additionally gave Rs. 1.5 million to the Saidu Sharif Hospital, and set up preparing focuses in a joint effort with different elements to work for training of youth for business and employment. Army is still playing a very vital role in FATA; they are not only trying to get rid of the remaining extremist elements but also helping people rebuild what they have lost. It is working towards making the tribal belt one of most developed region of the country but it is also of the viewpoint that in order to do so FATA has to be brought under mainstream politics.

In the present geopolitical atmosphere, FATA can't keep on remaining cut off from the standard of Pakistani society. After an examination of the general political, authoritative, financial and security situations, it can be presumed that there is a need to embrace successful measures to address the concerned issues and start a procedure for incorporation of FATA into the national

mainstream. The suggestions for this will be partitioned into two noteworthy fragments i.e. here and now proposals situated at changes influencing a specific framework and long term suggestions giving out a general combination design. Due to the idea of issue, notwithstanding, at places the refinement between the two might be marginally obscured.

CHAPTER 5

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1 INTEGRATION OF FATA WITH KPK

We have seen a number of teams and commissions set up in the past to propose changes in FATA. A few civil society associations have additionally been dynamic in campaigning for changes in the course of recent years. A few suggestions are basic to every one of these undertakings: these incorporate stretching out legal and parliamentary areas to FATA by changing the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) and revising Article 247 of the Constitution. In any case, implementation appeared a long ways till as of late. Two reasons showed up at the center of non-execution of these proposed changes. The above all else was the state's unwillingness to see FATA through an advancement focused worldview as opposed to a security-focused one. It is basic that the state influences a change in the way they see the security paradigm regarding FATA. The second reason was opposition by a group of people having individual interests in the present regulation which provides them with benefits and privileges (Ghafoor, 2005). FATA is now a part of KP and it is being gradually integrated in the existing systems of governance.

Ample opportunity has already past that a complete structure for the joining of FATA was created by the regular civil government and parliament in discussion with the federal and the KP government. Such a paradigm for FATA ought to incorporate an advancement structure, cultural and social level integration, political mix and authoritative changes. For this to happen, not only the federal but also the provincial governments must reestablish the trust of the general population of FATA. The most vital component in this activity would be the efficient rehabilitation of all the uprooted families from the seven agencies and also effective reconstruction of infrastructure which is currently ongoing but under Army's supervision. The second step is to transfer authority to the civilian administration decided recently (May, 2018) by merging the region with KPK but we have yet to see how soon it will be implemented. In any

case, in case of that occurrence, one could address whether the past managerial structure of political office would even now be pertinent.

People of tribal region as discussed earlier (see Chapter 3), are very traditional and deem the customs imperative to their way of living. It is now important that government when introducing legislation and new political structure in FATA should devise a way of preserving their previous way of living in some form. As in case of Swat the abolition of *Wali* (political ruler), due to introduction of new governing structure has brought a lot of problems so in order to not repeat the same mistake it is important to in one way or other ensure that the new governing structure will be based on the lines of the previous one, In this way people not only will relate to it but also will not perceive any step taken by federation as an attack on their traditions or customs.

There are a lot of opportunities waiting for the people of FATA, the benefits of which can be harvested if the challenges beyond the merger are handled carefully. The K-P Assembly will get 23 more seats after the merger. This will increase the role of the province in the national level decision-making and the bargaining power in terms of resource allocation. Socioeconomic development of areas merged with K-P will create thousands of jobs in the field of education, health, water supply schemes, power supply, mineral development programmes and citizen losses compensation programmes. The establishment of industrial zones with special incentives will attract investors from every part of the country, which will also create technical and managerial jobs. Linking these areas with CPEC will gain the attention of investors from China and other countries and regions such as Russia and Central Asia.

Along with the opportunities mentioned above, there are certain challenges too. There can be mainly two challenges related to post FATA- KPK merger scenario. First, the US drone strikes will create a new situation for the civil-military establishment of Pakistan. The people of K-P may demand strong action against such strikes, remember that the Peshawar High Court had already declared drone strikes illegal in 2013. The second challenge will be the India and Afghanistan supported insurgency. Both countries have been already found involved in terrorist activities in Pakistan, particularly in K-P and Baluchistan. Since the merger is against the wishes of the government and people of Afghanistan due to their claim over the northern areas of Pakistan, a new wave of Indo-Afghan sponsored terrorism is likely to emerge.

An advanced system needs to incorporate here and now measures to take into account the displaced families' prompt needs. Economic open door zones and industrial zones ought to be arranged as midterm measures. FATA's political and protected mix needs legal and parliamentary areas to be stretched out to the territory. While changes in the criminal equity framework were sworn in the National Action Plan, legitimate specialists on FATA can recommend the consideration of those conditions of 'Rawaj' (customary law) for FATA's criminal equity framework that are not in negation of human rights. Training, well-being, transportation and law implementation ought to be taken up on an immediate basis by the government. As an initial step, all agencies of FATA ought to be given prominent role in the KP assembly to regulate law authorization and spending of assets in the area as quickly as time permits. Such portrayal will in the long way help to ensure socio- cultural integration of FATA.

A feeling of ownership and having a place among the general population of the zone is woefully required, which is the basic agenda of SSR and is need of the people of FATA. Nonetheless, the essential for this is the state's key introduction towards FATA experiences and to ensure the movement towards advancement and integrative orientation. There is a great need to work unanimously to achieve the objectives of the FATA- KPK merger. This merger if carefully monitored and kept un-politicized will have long-lasting positive impacts on the life of local people, including Pakistan's economy.

5.2 A REFORMS AGENDA

Introduction of reforms in FATA in very necessary and government is working on it for several years by introduction of phased reforms. Along with this it is important to keep in mind that to bring about a drastic change in former tribal region should not be a goal in itself. Rather, remembering the security circumstance, the administration should gradually supplant the present framework with a thought about option, accentuating sequencing as much as they put emphasis on substance. It is important to introduce instruments through which people of FATA can involve personally in governance and most importantly in the reforms process. In this case Security Sector Reforms can be a good solution to the problems of FATA.

As we all know that government has finally agreed upon adding FATA to mainstream by merging it with KPK in May, 2018, so the first main problem has been overcome. Now the next step should be to introduce a system of reforms that will bring a life- long stability to tribal

region of Pakistan. SSR under peacebuilding framework plays an important role in post- conflict phase as described earlier (see Chapter 2). SSR although is an international practice but it strives for good governance by making all departments of state to work effectively. Its one main objective is to ensure self-sufficiency so even after the removal of any external influence the state can survive on its own. If we apply this framework on case of FATA then it is not any different considering the circumstance.

It is also important to keep in mind that it is a slow process. Like in case of introduction of reforms in Liberia, it took the practice a good 5- 6 years to show results. Although successful, but the long term plans under SSR in Liberia are still underway. Patience is the key in this regard and not only government but people had to play their part it in making it a success too (Kwaja, 2016). The pre- conflict and conflict phase in FATA is over and now ongoing there is the process of post- conflict rehabilitation and reconstruction. Pakistan Army is playing a vital role in ensuring the development of area and resettlement of IDPs. It is important to keep in mind that Army is not going to be always there, the current military paradigm of the region has to be transformed in to civilian control paradigm. In order to do that under SSR government should introduce certain reform agendas as applied in other conflict stricken states.

Keeping in mind the characteristics of people of the area and their way of living, in order to make it an efficiently reliable region several reforms can be introduced. Some of the suggestions in this case are outlined below:

- Road communication development although already being done should be extended to a larger scale. Roads are the backbone for economic and industrial activity and are responsible for carrying out major projects in an area. A system of street correspondence should be created in the form of link roads, farm to market streets (connecting different towns), arterial, linkage with the adjoining territories of Punjab, including the areas of Baluchistan and KPK, along with development of roads for cross border trade and exchange of goods with Afghanistan.
- Expansion of rail link needs to be done on immediate basis. Rail is the least expensive method of transportation yet is costly to create. Railroad interface is accessible till Kohat and Dera Ismail Khan and if the same is stretched out to Thall, Wana and Miran Shah, it

would make a progressive change in the outlook of the former tribal areas as it would associate the belt with the rest of the country.

- In the perspective of the expansive separations included, littler air terminal for supporting activity of light aircrafts construction of airport might be considered at Kurram, Razmak and Wana.
- Needs of energy sector development with a specific end goal to build up the cottage industry of this region; electric power ought to be accessible in the most parts of FATA. In addition, natural gas ought to be accommodated to cottage industry to be used as fuel instead of wood in order to stop deforestation.
- Reforms of judicial and administrative level although have already been introduces but a comprehensive framework needs to be implemented to ensure that they are working. FCR and the centuries old system of tribal Jirga needs to be replaced in a way that people should not feel alienated from their roots. Main problem which is being faced in this regard is lack of funds to ensure that these reforms work effectively and efficiently. In order to ensure smooth dispensation of funds a monitoring committee should be formed that will overview the distribution of funds
- Due to FATA- KP merger, Khasadar force which consists of about 40,000 individuals is uncertain about their fate. Government should work to ensure that these people are either incorporated in Frontier Constabulary or police force. In order to ensure long lasting security in the area it is necessary to make such people a part of security forces who are not only familiar with the terrain of the region but also nature of native population.
- Land records and revenue records ought to be ready and for the settled region as the collective land proprietor in the tribal regions is a noteworthy obstacle in the way of extensive financial development. An ownership framework ought to be developed by current the land settlement framework to advance economic development. Along these lines, aside from advancement in farming and agriculture, individual responsibility for land would empower the general population to look for advances for running business by

selling their territory. Land settlement on individual proprietorship premise would likewise help in enhancing financial foundation, which is generally compromised because of political and innate question like tribal issues, in FATA.

- In order to ensure sustainable development in an area it is important to ensure participatory role of local individuals. Under the reforms, it is necessary to provide such role to individuals of former tribal areas to make the welfare and development of area possible in all sections of the society. In the past only the tribal leaders known as Maliks have gained benefit from development processes in the area keeping the common man neglected.
- Health is another important field which needs immediate reforms for effective functioning. People in FATA have always experienced either lack of or complete absence of any modern healthcare facilities. They are dependent mostly on basic health units or few hospitals which are present in few urbanized regions where rural areas or remote regions are deprived of such facilities. It is imperative now to pay immediate attention to this problem.
- Rejuvenation of existing advancement plans is an extremely sore and appalling part of improvement plan including schools, BHUs, water supply and so on.) In FATA because either these are left fragmented or even if completed these stay latent (Pakistan Participatory Poverty Assessment). Accordingly, these plans end without collecting any advantages to the network. A fiery drive to revitalize every single such plan ought to be propelled and strict measures ought to be embraced to avoid such drastic things from occurring in future.
- To a great degree low literacy rate requires broad changes in training and education sector of the region. Training and human asset improvement ought to be utilized as an intense instrument of financial and political change. To a great degree low literacy rate requires broad changes in training and education sector of the region. Training and human asset improvement ought to be utilized as an intense instrument of financial and political change.

- Unique measures ought to be taken to confer specialized training to the general population of the zone to increase the business openings. This will result in end of unemployment in area and help people play a positive role in economic development of the region.
- Drone strikes by USA have been a major cause of contention between locals of FATA and administration. They have not only damaged the houses and livelihood of people but also have caused deaths of many innocent people. In order to ensure the establishment of long lasting peace, Pakistan government has to take a hard stance against USA on the violation of its borders and try to work towards ending this problem once and for all.
- FATA has remained in shadows for a very long time, where people were event not aware of their basic rights. In this era of digital communication, locals there are unaware of what is even internet. Internet connectivity should be provided to these people so that not only they can get the knowledge of what is happening in the world but also work towards development of the state.

There have been speculations of serious domestic and international magnitude related to FATA for a very long time. Partly it was due to out of date and incapable administration of FATA which is the perfect example of negligence on part of government and has affected global security. The whole world knows that it cannot be cured alone with the help of Arms or by giving aid to people. It is imperative now more than ever to do political and legal mainstreaming of this region into Pakistan as decided by the political administration of the country. As it is agonizingly clear now that one of the reasons of the strength of Taliban's in FATA was the administrations' at the same time oppressive and disappointing presence. The more FATA stays past the full and legal control of the Pakistani government, the more prominent would be the estrangement of its people which will result in more prominent danger from inside and outside.

The government must implement phased reforms in FATA as decided; so that people here can overcome all difficulties they have faced since independence. The chance to graph another course for people of FATA, one that regards the person's voice, guarantees peace, and ensure justice and equity, must not be delayed now. It is not only a security imperative, but also

necessary for preservation of human rights. This region has the potential to become one of the developed areas of Pakistan with its vast mineral resources and the will of its people to do better. The decision taken by Parliament to zim it with KPK should be implemented as soon as possible. People of FATA should be given their due rights and privileges that are enjoyed by every citizen of Pakistan. That way they will not only feel the sense of belonging but also can play an effective role in development of the country.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ahmed, A. (2013). *The thistle and the drone*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press.
- Agbu, O. (2006). *West Africa's trouble spots and the imperative for peace building*, Dakar: CODESRIA.
- Akindele, A. R. (1987). Conflict theory, conflict behavior and conflict control in the international system- A theoretical survey and analysis. *Nigeria Journal of International Affairs*, (p.33-52).
- Anderson, R. (2007). *Thematic Content Analysis (TCA): Descriptive presentation of qualitative data* [Ebook]. Retrieved from <http://www.wellknowingconsulting.org/publications/pdfs/ThematicContentAnalysis.pdf>
- Azar, E. (1990). Edward E Azar – A Theory of Protracted Social Conflict | 1pdf.net. Retrieved from https://1pdf.net/edward-e-azar-a-theory-of-protracted-social-conflict_5857f003e12e899d025c8506
- Aziz, S. (2017). *History of FATA reforms*. Retrieved from <https://nation.com.pk/08-Mar-2017/history-of-fata-reforms>
- Ball, N., & Fayemi, K. (2004). *Security Sector Governance in Africa: A Handbook*. Lagos: Centre for Democracy and Development.
- Basharat S. (2005, July 21). FATA uplift before and after 9/11. *The Daily Mail* (Online Edition), available from <http://dailymailnews.com/200504/10index.html#headlines>.
- Carnegie Commission. (1997). *Carnegie Commission on Preventing Deadly Conflict* [pdf] (p. 8). New York. Retrieved from https://www.carnegie.org/media/filer_public/b2/0e/b20e1080-7830-4f2b-9410-51c14171809b/ccny_report_1997_ccpdc_final.pdf
- Caroe, O. (1958). *The Pathans* (1st ed.).
- Cheema, P. (2005). *Tribal areas of Pakistan* (p. 26). Islamabad: Islamabad Policy Research Inst.[u.a.].
- Dichter, D., & Popkin, N. (1967). *The North-West Frontier of West Pakistan* (p. 2). Oxford:

Clarendon P.

Durand Line Agreement. (1893). Retrieved from

<http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/document/papers/durandlineagrment.htm>

Edmunds, T. (2007). Security sector reform in transforming societies (p. 25). Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Ejdus, F. (2006). Concept of Security Sector Reform [PDF].

Retrieved from [http://www.bezbednost.org/upload/document/\(5\)_ejdus.pdf](http://www.bezbednost.org/upload/document/(5)_ejdus.pdf)

England, M., & Boucher, A. (2009). Security Sector Reform: Thematic Literature Review on

Best Practices and Lessons Learned. Retrieved from https://www.stimson.org/sites/default/files/file-attachments/Stimson_SSR_practicenotes_complete_set_dec09_1_1.pdf

FATA Archives. (2016). United Nations Population Fund (UNPFA) Country Programmes Evaluation: Pakistan (2013-2017).

(FATA), F. (2018). Archives [Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies (PIPS)]. Retrieved from

<https://www.pakpips.com/article/category/federally-administered-tribal-areas-fata>

FATA. (2018). United Nations Office for the Coordination of Human Affairs (UNOCHA). Retrieved from

https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/ocha_pakistan_weekly_return_snapshot_28_february_2018_20180326.pdf

FATA - Official Web Portal. (2018). Retrieved from <https://fata.gov.pk/>

Federally Administered Tribal Areas, Administration System. FATA Secretariat. Retrieved from

http://fata.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=50&Itemid=84

Ghafoor, M. (2005). Impediments to Integrating FATA in Pakistan Mainstream. Retrieved from

<https://www.slideshare.net/fatanews/impediments-to-integrating-fata-in-pakistan-mainstream>

Ghali, B. B. (1992). An Agenda for Peace - A/47/277 S/24111 - UN Documents: Gathering a

- body of global agreements. Retrieved from <http://www.un-documents.net/a47-277.htm>
- Hänggi, H. (2004). Conceptualizing Security Sector Reform and Reconstruction [pdf] (p. 3). Retrieved from <http://52.10.59.203/documents/85097/87432/Conceptualizing+Security+Sector+Reform+and+Reconstruction/9531f42c-0919-45d5-b51c-f6c2a090bb43?version=1.0>
- Haq, N., Khan, R., & Nuri, M. (2005). Federally administered tribal areas of Pakistan. Islamabad: Islamabad Policy Research Institute.
- Hendrickson, D., & Karkoszka, A. (2002). The Challenges of Security-Sector Reform. In Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (Ed.), SIPRI Yearbook 2002: armaments, disarmament and international security. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Höhe, Tanja. (2005). “Developing Local Governance” in Post conflict Development: Meeting New Challenges, Gerd Junne and Willemijn Verkoren, (p. 59–72). London: Lynne Rienner Publisher.
- Hussain, F. (2005). “Testing FCR on the Touchstone of the Constitution,” in FCR: A Bad Law Nobody Can Defend [pdf] (p. 57). Lahore: Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.
- Intelligence Report Operational Commander. (2014). Inter Services Public Relations (ISPR), Pakistan. Retrieved from <https://www.ispr.gov.pk/>
- International Crisis Group. (2006). Pakistan’s Tribal Areas: Appeasing the Militants. [Online] Available at: <https://www.crisisgroup.org/asia/south-asia/pakistan/pakistan-s-tribal-areas-appeasing-militants> [Accessed 2 Apr. 2018].
- Jaffery, S. (2018). Pakistan's Security Paradigm. Retrieved from <https://cscr.pk/explore/themes/defense-security/pakistans-security-paradigm/>
- Javid, U., & Haq, A. M. (2016). Political Challenges and Security Issues in FATA and its impact on Economic Development. *A Research Journal of South Asian Studies*, 31(1), 367- 380.
- Kamran, S. (2014). Rejuvenating FATA: Education as an instrument of Change. Center for Pakistan and Gulf Studies.

- Karbo, T. (2008). Peace building in Africa, in J.D. Francis (Eds.) Peace and Conflict in Africa. London. Zed Books, (p. 113- 132).
- Karkoszka, A. (2018). The Concept of Security Sector Reform. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/ruleoflaw/files/Karkoszka.pdf>
- Khan, M., & Khan. A. B. (2014). FATA: Socio- economic Challenges. Center for Pakistan and Gulf Studies.
- Khan, T. (2013). The Social, Political and Economic Effects of the War on Terror: Pakistan 2009 to 2011 [pdf] (5th ed.). Islamabad: ISSRA Papers 2013. Retrieved from http://www.ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA_Papers_Vol5_IssueI_2013/04-Policy-Paper-Tariq-Khan.pdf
- Khan, Z. (2014). Military operations in FATA and PATA: implications for Pakistan. Retrieved from http://issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/1339999992_58398784.pdf
- Khokhar, N., Kamran, S., Abbasi, M., & Jafar, G. (2014). Evolving Dynamics of FATA: Reflections on Transformations (pp. 29- 97). National Defense University (NDU), Islamabad & the Centre for Pakistan and Gulf Studies (CPGS).
- Kwaja, C. (2016). Security Sector Reform and Peacebuilding in Liberia (pp. 52- 85). Lambert Academic Publishing.
- Lavrakas, P. (2008). Purposive Sample - SAGE Research Methods. Retrieved from <http://methods.sagepub.com/reference/encyclopedia-of-survey-research-methods/n419.xml>
- Lederach, P. J. (2006). Building peace- Sustainable reconciliation in divided societies, Tokyo. United Nations University Press.
- Malan, M. (2008). Security Sector Reform in Liberia: Mixed Results from Humble Beginnings – GSDRC. Retrieved from <http://gsdrc.org/document-library/security-sector-reform-in-liberia-mixed-results-from-humble-beginnings/>
- Mendel, T. (2011). Defining the Scope of National Security: Issues Paper for the National

- Security Principles Project. Retrieved from <https://www.right2info.org/resources/publications/mendel-on-defining-national-security>
- Narten, J. (2008). Post-Conflict Peacebuilding and Local Ownership: Dynamics of External–Local Interaction in Kosovo under United Nations Administration. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/action/showCitFormats?doi=10.1080%2F17502970802436361>
- National Action Plan (NAP) 2014. (2014). Retrieved from <https://nacta.gov.pk/nap-2014/>
- National Internal Security Policy (NISP) 2014. (2014). Retrieved from <https://nacta.gov.pk/nisp-2014/>
- Nawaz, S. (2009). FATA- A Most Dangerous Place. Center for Strategic and International Studies, 13.
- Nawaz, S. (2009). The Pakistan Army and its Role in FATA. CTC Sentinel, 2(1). Retrieved from <https://ctc.usma.edu/app/uploads/2010/06/Vol2Iss1-Art7.pdf>
- OECD Publishing. (2000). the OECD DAC Handbook on Security System Reform (1st ed., p. 16). Paris.
- Pakhtunkhwa (NWFP) FATA | Great Game Pashtun's History. (2018). Retrieved from <https://drksy.wordpress.com/tag/pukhtunkwa-nwfp-fata/>
- Rahman, H. (2009). Why FATA is a Hub of Terrorism.
- Rahman, K. (2009). Situation in FATA: Causes, Consequences and the Way Forward. Institute Of Policy Studies, 6(1).
- Rehman, H., & Khan, J. (2014). Pakistan's Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Pak-Afghan Relations After 9/11 [EBook]. Retrieved from http://www.qurtuba.edu.pk/thedialogue/The%20Dialogue/9_4/Dialogue_October_December2014_326-338.pdf
- Raza, Syed. (1973). Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Islamabad: GF Printing Press.
- Rose, T. (2006). Reflections on peace building and the United Nations development assistance

- framework. *Journal of Peacebuilding and Development*, (p.64- 77).
- Rothschild, E. (1995). What Is Security? *Daedalus*, 124(3), 53-98. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20027310>
- Rumi, R. (2015). *Charting Pakistan's Internal Security Policy* [eBook]. Washington, DC: UNITED STATES INSTITUTE OF PEACE. Retrieved from <https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/SR368-Charting-Pakistans-Internal-Security-Policy.pdf>
- Selected Development Indicators for Pakistan, NWFP, and FATA. (2018). Retrieved from <http://www.fata.gov.pk/subpages/socioeconomic.php>.
- Singer, A. (1984). *Lords of the Khyber*. London: Faber and Faber.
- Swinson, A. (1967). *North-West frontier people and Events 1839- 1947* (p. 18). London: Hutchinson & Co.
- Security Sector Reform (SSR) - United Nations and the Rule of Law. (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/ruleoflaw/thematic-areas/access-to-justice-and-rule-of-law-institutions/ssr/>
- The Department of State. (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/115810.pdf>
- Toft, D. M. (2010). *Securing the peace- the durable settlement of civil wars*, Princeton. Princeton University Press.
- Update Report: Security Sector Reform: Update Report: Security Council Report. (2006). Retrieved from <https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/update-report/lookup-c-glKWLeMTIsG-b-2486441.php>
- Wolfers, A. (1952). "National Security" as an Ambiguous Symbol. *Political Science Quarterly*, 67(4), 481- 502. Doi: 10.2307/2145138
- Wulf, H. (2004). *Security Sector Reform in Developing and Transitional Countries Revisited*. Retrieved from https://www.berghof-foundation.org/fileadmin/redaktion/Publications/Handbook/Articles/wulf_handbookII.pdf

Yasutomi, A., & Carmans, J. (2007). Security Sector Reform (SSR) in Post-Conflict States:

Challenges of Local Ownership. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.460.9688&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

Yousafzai, R., & Khan, A. (2014). Militancy in FATA: The Cultural and Religious Dimensions.

Center for Pakistan and Gulf Studies.

APPENDIX A

Questionnaire- Army Personnel

My name is Maryam Tariq and I am final year student currently pursuing MS (PCS) at Centre of International Peace and Stability, NUST. I am conducting a research study on “Evolving Dynamics of FATA’s Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario.” This research is taken as the necessary requirement for the completion of my MS. I seek your kind assistance in completing the attached questionnaire. Your response will be treated as **“strictly confidential.”**

Q1: What were the deep rooted causes of vulnerability of FATA to militancy?

Q2: How do you see the way Army handled the situation in the area?

Q3: Army has been the key player in bringing peace to the region. What is your viewpoint about it?

Q4: Do you think it is high time to bring FATA under Civil control?

Q5: How according to you the attitude of natives has changed towards state due to the presence of Army in the region?

Q6: What types of reforms are needed in the area to end the grievances people have since partition due to negligence on part of government?

Q7: Army is currently involved in rehabilitation and rebuilding of the area. Comment

Q8: The security paradigm in the area is currently militarized. How soon will Army be able to give it under civil government’s control?

---Thank you---

Questionnaire- Residents of former FATA

Respondent's Name: _____

Profession: _____

Area from where he/ she belongs: _____

My name is Maryam Tariq and I am final year student currently pursuing MS (PCS) at Centre of International Peace and Stability, NUST. I am conducting a research study on “Evolving Dynamics of FATA’s Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario.” This research is taken as the necessary requirement for the completion of my MS. I seek your kind assistance in completing the attached questionnaire. Your response will be treated as **“strictly confidential.”**

Q1: FATA is a land of brave and courageous people. How would you like to comment on it?

Q2: According to you, what were the factors that were responsible for vulnerability of FATA to militancy?

Q3: How do you see the way Army handled the situation in the area?

Q4: Army has been the key player in bringing peace to the region. What is your viewpoint about it?

Q5: Do you think it is high time to bring FATA under Civil control?

Q6: What types of reforms are needed in the area to end the grievances people have since partition due to negligence on part of government?

Q7: Army is currently involved in rehabilitation and rebuilding of the area. Comment

Q8: The security paradigm in the area is currently militarized. Do you think now it should be given under civil government's control?

---Thank you---

Questionnaire- Policymakers

My name is Maryam Tariq and I am final year student currently pursuing MS (PCS) at Centre of International Peace and Stability, NUST. I am conducting a research study on “Evolving Dynamics of FATA’s Internal Security; Pre and Post- Conflict Scenario.” This research is taken as the necessary requirement for the completion of my MS. I seek your kind assistance in completing the attached questionnaire. Your response will be treated as “**strictly confidential.**”

Q1: What is your viewpoint about existing political structure of FATA?

Q2: According to you, what were the factors that were responsible for vulnerability of FATA to militancy?

Q3: Army has been the key player in bringing peace to the region. How would you like to comment on it?

Q4: What types of reforms are needed to bring FATA into the national mainstream?

Q5: The security paradigm in the area is currently militarized. How much time will be required to bring it under civil government’s control?

Q6: Do you think the decision to merge FATA with KPK is the permanent solution to all its problems?

---Thank you---

Evolving Dynamics of FATA's Internal Security; Pre and Post-Conflict Scenario (Maryam Tariq)

ORIGINALITY REPORT

7 %	7 %	0 %	1 %
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	www.issi.org.pk Internet Source	2 %
2	www.liverostrum.com Internet Source	1 %
3	seharkamran.com Internet Source	1 %
4	journals.pu.edu.pk Internet Source	1 %
5	static.cejiss.org Internet Source	1 %

Exclude quotes On
Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches < 1%