A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative:

Paigham-e-Pakistan

By

NATASHA KHAN

Reg. No. 00000277156

Supervised by

DR. MUHAMMAD MAKKI

NUST INSTITUTE OF PEACE AND CONFLICT STUDIES (NIPCONS)

CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE AND STABILITY (CIPS)

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF SCIENCES AND TECHNOLOGY (NUST)

ISLAMABAD

A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative:

Paigham-e-Pakistan

By

NATASHA KHAN

Registration Number: 00000277156

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of MS Peace &

Conflict Studies

Supervisor

DR. MUHAMMAD MAKKI

NUST INSTITUTE OF PEACE AND CONFLICT STUDIES (NIPCONS)

CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE AND STABILITY (CIPS)

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF SCIENCES AND TECHNOLOGY (NUST)

ISLAMABAD

AUGUST,2020

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, THE MOST BENEFICENT THE MOST MERCIFUL

THESIS ACCPETANCE CERTIFICATE

It is certified that the contents and form of the MS thesis titled **"A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative: Paigham-e-Pakistan"** written by Ms. Natasha Khan (Registration No. 00000277156), of Centre for International Peace and Stability has been vetted by the undersigned, found complete in all respects as per NUST status/regulations, is free of plagiarism, errors and mistakes and is accepted as partial fulfillment for the award of MS/MPhil Degree. It is further certified that the necessary amendments as pointed out by the GEC members of the scholar have also been incorporated in the said thesis and have been found satisfactory for the requirement of the degree.

Supervisor: ———————————————
Dr. Muhammad Makki
CIPS, NUST

Head of Department:————————————
Dr. Bakare Najimdeen
CIPS, NUST

Associate Dean: ————————————
Dr. Tughral Yamin
CIPS, NUST
Dated: ————————————————

CERTIFICATE FOR PLAGIARISM

It is certified that this MS thesis titled, **"A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative: Paigham-e-Pakistan"** by **Ms. Natasha Khan** Reg. No.**00000277156** has been examined by me. I undertake that;

a. The thesis has significant new work/knowledge as compared to the works already published. No sentence, equation, diagram, table, paragraph or section has been copied verbatim from previous works. All material used has been duly referenced.

b. The work presented is the original work of the author (i.e. there is no plagiarism). No ideas, processes, results or words of others have been presented as the author's own work.

c. There is no fabrication of data or results. The thesis has been checked using TURNITIN (a copy of the originality report attached) and found within the limits as per HEC plagiarism policy and instructions issued from time to time.

_____

Signature of Supervisor

Dr. Muhammad Makki

Assistant Professor

Centre for International Peace and Stability(CIPS)

National University of Sciences and Technology(NUST)

Islamabad, Pakistan

DECLARATION

I, Natasha Khan hereby declare that this research work titled "*A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter- Narrative: Paigham-e-Pakistan*" is my original work. This work has not been presented elsewhere for assessment. The material used from other sources has been properly acknowledged/ referenced.

_____

Signature of Student

Natasha Khan

MS Peace & Conflict Studies

Registration No. 00000277156

Acknowledgements

Abstract

Prevent violent extremism and counter violent extremism studies have lately taken the much-debated *narrative turn.* This narrative turn reflects the increasing engagement with the psychological and ideological aspects, and subsequently with *narratives* of extremism and terrorism, in order to curb the increase in the numbers of those who overtly and covertly support them. The central tenets of this narrative turn rest on the praxes geared at the delegitimization and demystification of extremist narratives, through their deconstruction. Such praxes have been necessitated by the visible deficiency in the prevention of violent extremist/terrorist tendencies despite the augmentation in (hard) kinetic measures.

While the ideologies and narratives of violent extremism /terrorism have been increasingly subjected to deconstructive and critical inquires separately, the present research makes an argument for combining these two approaches via a systematic, multilevel framework, and applying this to the study of *counter-narratives* and ideologies. This research stresses this in light of the lack of scholarly inquiry into the counter-narratives established in resistance to extremist/terrorist narratives. It is argued that this remains an important task, considering the diversity of the contexts, which these counter-narratives attempt to address and redress, and the lack of appropriate mechanisms to ascertain their efficacy.

In this light, this research explicates the counter-narrative of Pakistan-the Paigham-e-Pakistan (PeP)- by situating it within the broader prevent violent extremism and counter violent extremism discourse of the country. It adopts a combination of a Deconstructive approach, and a multi-level, *micro-meso-macro* Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) framework to inform an 'explanatory critique,' which tests the PeP for textual and contextual validity. The focus of the

research will be both within and outside the text during its course. In working together with CDA, the Deconstructive approach will assist in explicating *how* the PeP acts as a site of social struggle, and how entities/events/processes have been continuously (re)constructed through discourse, as social practice. The research therefore explores not only the asymmetrical power-relations that have gone into shaping the PeP, but also how the PeP itself manifests and projects similarly dominant and unequal representations of the ideal Pakistani (Muslim) citizen and State. This exercise aims to unveil the text's limitations in the face of multiple interpretations and diverse contexts, in order to open up space for its improvement.

Keywords: *Counter-Narrative, Paigham-e-Pakistan, Critical Discourse Analysis, Deconstructive approach, Micro-meso-macro framework.*

Table of Contents

x

List of Table

List of Abbreviations

CDA   Critical Discourse Analysis

CII   Council for Islamic Ideology

HEC   Higher Education Commission

NAP   National Action Plan

NISP   National Internal Security Policy

PVE   Preventing Violent Extremism

CVE   Counter Violent Extremism

P/CVE   Preventing/Countering Violent Extremism

PeP   Paigham-e-Pakistan

VE/T   Violent Extremism/Terrorism

Chapter 1: Introduction

Overview

This chapter introduces the present research that engages in a multilevel and multidimensional Deconstructive CDA of Pakistan's counter-narrative (the Paigham-e-Pakistan) to Violent Extremism/Terrorism (VE/T). The chapter begins with an introduction of the narrative turn within P/CVE policies. It highlights the several international approaches undertaken to construct and disseminate viable counter-narratives. It further outlines the unique landscape of terrorism in Pakistan, while emphasizing its need for a counter-narrative.

Following this, the direction of the inquiry of the research is detailed. It is argued that a critical evaluation of the counter-narrative is imperative in light of the central importance attached to it as a panacea for all forms of VE/T in the country. Such an inquiry is also necessitated by the State's impending plans to incorporate the counter-narrative into the national educational curriculum. This chapter explicitly makes a case for adopting a deconstructive approach to the evaluation of counter-narratives to improve their effectiveness.

1.1. Violent Extremism and a War of Narratives

Contemporary times are undergoing a warfare of information and narratives. The battlegrounds of such warfares stretch across local and national boundaries. One of the most salient of such battlegrounds, and perhaps one which may have the most far reaching implications, is the war of narratives between violent extremist organizations, and their challengers.[1] The traces of such warfare have been observed around the globe, following closely behind the spread of the original

---

[1] Christian Leuprecht et al., "Winning the Battle but Losing the War? Narrative and Counter-Narratives Strategy," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 3, no. 2 (2009): 25-35, 25.

extremist ideas and ideologies. Such ideas and ideologies have been approached as the narratives of extremism, since they present extremists accounts and manifestos. The blurring of boundaries between such ideologies and narratives can be understood in terms of the subjects they address. Ideologies are sets of values and beliefs which guide social, economic, political and religious aspects of the lives of those who believe in them. Narratives, on the other hand, have been widely understood as a string of events tied together in the form of a progressive story, in addition to possessing other elements such as a narrator etc.[2]

The connection linking these two together in the field of VE/T is the method in which these two are made dependent upon one another to serve certain functions. Extremist and terrorist ideologues proclaim the so-called Islamic ideologies of jihad, by constructing and disseminating narratives which can attract audiences towards such an ideology. The construction of a narrative around an ideology therefore facilitates the furtherance of the latter. These practices then empower such ideologues and their affiliated organizations to claim the loyalty of target audiences, and hence enable violent action or financial, emotional, psychological or other kinds of support for their cause. The realization of such recruiting mechanisms has in effect led to a newfound importance of narratives.[3] While the importance of narratives has been widely acknowledged in other fields such as criminology, sociolinguistics and psychology to name a few, its permeation into terrorism and related studies has been quite recent in comparison.

This has resultantly led to a shifting focus from stand-alone kinetics counter measures, to the introduction of counter-narratives to the field of Preventing Violent Extremism (PVE) and

---

[2] Mohamed Feisal Mohamed Hassan, "Investigating the Mind of a Terrorist: Grasping the Nexus between Ideology and Narrative," *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 4, no. 5 (2012): 7-10, 7.

[3] Tom Quiggin, "Understanding Al-Qaeda's Ideology for Counter-Narrative Work," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 3, no. 2 (2009): 18-24, 24.

Counter Violent Extremism/Terrorism (CVE/T). Essential to establishing ideological counter measures, counter-narratives have generally been understood and accepted as narratives constructed with the intention to counter the themes and arguments built into the narratives propagated by violent extremists and terrorists. This novel turn in the praxis of PVE/CVE has been the result of the disability of existing mechanisms in achieving sustainable results.[4] International practitioners have suggested adopting effective counter-messaging alongside contextually driven, development centered measures in order to enhance P/CVE practices, and augment exiting security (especially kinetic measures) centered policies.[5] Thus there has been the turn towards soft policies, operating largely in the psychological and ideological realm. International organizations and world bodies such as the United Nations, European Union, in addition to countries like Saudi Arabia, Malaysia and Bangladesh etc., have all been active participants in this global competition over narratives, and the battle over the hearts and minds of people.[6] However, despite the efforts directed towards the building of such counter-narratives in recent times, such counter-narratives have remained only marginally successful.[7] In addition to the fact that virtually no measures and mechanisms are in place to empirically measure their success, counter-narratives have also remained lacking with regards to their sociopolitical veracity in the various contexts they are meant to target.[8] Yet their appeal is anything but diminishing.

---

[4] "Countering Violent Extremism," Security Council Counter-Terrorism Committee, n.d., https://www.un.org/sc/ctc/focus-areas/countering-violent-extremism/
[5] UNDP, *Preventing Violent Extremism Through Promoting Inclusive Development, Tolerance and Respect for Diversity: A Development Response to Addressing Radicalization and Violent Extremism* (New York: United Nations Development Programme, 2016).
[6] Sara Zeiger and Anne Aly, *Countering Violent Extremism: Developing an Evidence-base for Policy and Practice* (Australia: Curtin University, 2015).
[7] Christian Leuprecht et al., "Winning the Battle but Losing the War?", 32.
[8] Eric Rosand and Emily Winterbotham, "Do Counter-Narratives Actually Reduce Violent Extremism?" *Brookings*, March 20,2019.

1.2. Pakistan's Engagement with Counter-Narrative

Falling in line with such global trends and movements, Pakistan has also joined in the efforts to promote a soft policy towards P/CVE. These soft policy goals have been realized by the efforts directed towards the construction and dissemination of a counter-narrative to VE/T. These efforts have culminated in the form of Pakistan's first national/counter-narrative, the Paigham-e-Pakistan (PeP). Officiated in 2018, this document comprises of both Quranic verses and Prophetic sayings (Ahadith), the two most revered religious/legal sources throughout the Muslim world. These texts have been employed to re-conceptualize the ideas of jihad and provide alternative voices against the bellicose messages of violent action within VE/T narratives.[9] Indeed this has been the realization of a major step towards the eradication of the virulent extremist ideologies that have overtime led to Pakistan becoming one of the countries most blamed for, and impacted by VE/T.[10] The PeP aims to act as a national narrative that guides citizens of the state in religious and political matters. Yet the PeP has been largely one dimensional in the face of the multicausal and multidimensional phenomena of VE/T, and its related manifestations in Pakistan.[11] This renders necessary, a systematic and academic inquiry into Pakistan's counter-narrative which claims to be a panacea for safeguarding the country's ideological borders.

The present study realizes the need for conducting a comprehensive inquiry into the PeP to ascertain its efficacy. To this end, the it explicates the PeP by situating it within the broader P/CVE discourse of the country. It employs a critical analysis which draws upon philosophical

---

[9] "Paigham-e-Pakistan Key to Counter Terrorism," *Nation,* March 21,2018.
[10] Mukarram Baig, "FATF and Pakistan," *News*, February 16,2020.
[11] M. Sheharyar Khan, "Narrative of Counter-Narrative in Pakistan," *South Asian Voices,* July 13,2016 ;and Masood Hameed, "The Need for a Counter Narrative," *Daily Times,* February 13,2018.

and literary critique to enable a textual and contextual analysis of the PeP. These aims of the research are fulfilled by combining Derrida's Deconstructive approach with a multidisciplinary Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). The Deconstructive approach suggests the close (re)reading of texts in order to reveal their inherent contradictions and discrepancies.[12] The foundational underpinnings of this approach are further augmented by the methodological framework of CDA, which helps operationalize such a critical reading through the description and interpretation of the formal features and assumptions embedded in the text. [13]

The CDA approach is employed keeping in view the context of the production of the text, that is, the national institutional level, and its subsequent function (as sociopolitical and pedagogical discourse). This context inevitably positions the counter-narrative at a crossroads where asymmetrical relations of power affect it (as will be elaborated in later sections). The research operates on the basis of making explicit, the interconnectedness between the discourse and the institutional tenets that act as the social determinants that have gone into shaping the PeP. The PeP is also involved in the negotiation and (re)construction of social beliefs and values because it attempts to influence the representation of those concepts of *Islamic State, Muslim, jihad* and *citizen*, which are attacked by the original extremist/ terrorist narratives. In doing so, the counter-narrative (as part of the eclectic P/CVE discourse) attempts to monopolize the concepts and representations associated with the aforementioned notions of state and citizen. It is through this attempted monopolization of the definitional aspect (of core notions under distress) that the text replaces-or attempts to replace- such notions by marginalizing or dismissing the rest (of the interpretations) with its own versions. This suggests that the PeP itself manifests certain

---

[12] Christopher Norris, *Deconstruction: Theory and Practice*, 3rd ed. (London: Routledge, 2002), 18-32.
[13] Norman Fairclough, "CDA as Dialectical Reasoning," in *The Routledge Handbook of Critical Discourse Studies*, ed. John Flowerdew and John E. Richardson (London: Routledge, 2017), pp. 13-25.

asymmetries. These constitute important social effects of the PeP in terms of contextual representation, and from the subject of inquiry of the present study. Therefore, this research explores the social effects and determinants of the PeP, and questions the "universally communicable" representations projected through the counter-narrative. This is done via a comprehensive micro-meso-macro CDA in combination with a Deconstructive approach, which focuses on a textual and contextual analysis to draw out comprehensive findings.

1.3. Research Inquiry and Significance

Pakistan's first official counter-narrative to violent extremism has not yet been evaluated critically. While studies have attempted to judge its contents and impact through the use of frameworks such as narrative analysis,[14] a detailed critical review of the text remains absent. The discursive side of the VE/T studies in the context of Pakistan hence remains inadequately addressed. Such an academic inquiry is especially warranted by the glaring absence of any coherent empirical data which can measure the efficacy of the PeP in actuality. Such an inquiry is also necessitated by the State's impending plans to incorporate PeP into the educational curriculum nationwide. This research, therefore, fills an important gap in the literature of VE/T studies in the context of Pakistan, by critically analyzing the PeP in the light of relevant theoretical underpinnings and a CDA framework, so that potential shortcomings and limitations can be identified and mitigated. The study aims to demonstrate how an explicitly Deconstructive CDA, can help address the relations of power acting on, and enacted through discourse, and unveil the heterogeneous ways in which a text may be interpreted. Understanding the text's limitations in the face of multiple interpretations and diverse contexts can help such important

---

[14] See for example Khuram Iqbal, Saad Kalim Zafar and Zahid Mehmood , "Critical Evaluation of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative Efforts," *Journal of Policing, Intelligence and Counter Terrorism* 14, no. 2 (2019): 147-163.

national discourse to improve its strategies. This will allow it to become contextually relevant and affect positive change, instead of reinforcing rhetoric. The study also makes an argument for adopting multidisciplinary frameworks that exist within the CDA scholarship. In this vein, the study will maintain a two-way focus, both within and outside the text during its course. In working together with CDA, the Deconstructive approach will assist in explicating *how* the PeP acts as a site of social struggle, where entities/events/processes have been continuously (re)constructed through discourse (as social practice).   This research inquires;

i.   What are the main arguments of the PeP?

ii.   What themes and representations are these arguments based on?

iii.   How does the text construct relations between these themes and representations?

iv.   How contextually relevant are these themes and representations, and hence how contextually relevant are the arguments of the PeP?

v.   What are the potential social effects and determinants of the PeP?

This exercise can pave the way for a better informed state response in terms of ideological safeguards against the threats of radicalization, leading to violent extremism and terrorism.

1.4. Methodological Underpinnings

The methodology adopted by this research aims to provide an explanatory critique of the PeP, by shedding light on the *social effects* (effects of discourse on social structures and processes) and *social determinants* (social structures responsible for shaping the discourse) of the document. To accomplish this, the research will draw upon a combination of the Deconstructive approach and CDA[15] to enable a *textual* and *contextual* analysis of the PeP. This will help illustrate how the

---

[15] A detailed elaboration follows in later chapters.

PeP attempts to shape the discourse around VE/T in Pakistan through a system of discursive representations.

Such scrutiny will help answer important research questions about how the discourse attempts to affect the existing power relations by changing or sustaining them, and how it shifts the idea/depiction of power and dominance, from the VE/T agents and organizations, to the State. This research will take into account the main body of the PeP for the purpose of exploration. The six main sections containing the core messages of the document including the 'Preface', 'Islamic Code of Conduct'(Section1), 'Islamic Republic of Pakistan' (Section 2), 'The State of Pakistan and Challenges Faced by Pakistani Society' (Section 3), 'Joint Declaration' (Section 4), and 'Unanimous Fatwa' (Section 5) will form the main focus of the study and research inquiry.

1.5. Thesis Structure and Organization

The thesis will be organized into seven chapters. The first chapter has provided an introduction to the research which adopts a Deconstructive approach to carry out a Critical Discourse Analysis of the counter-narrative of Pakistan. This chapter has detailed the main direction of the research, its research inquiry and methodological considerations. Following this introductory chapter, chapter 2 will elaborate on the literature relevant to the research. It will elaborate upon narratives and approaches to narratives, the trends towards narrative deconstruction and related development of counter-narratives. It will additionally trace the need for a counter-narrative in Pakistan. Chapter 3 will shed light on the theoretical framework adopted by the research. Following this, chapter 4 will highlight the research methods employed during the research. This chapter will also explore some of the methodological issues associated with CDA scholarship. Chapter 5 will commence the analysis of the text. The major themes of the research will be identified in this chapter. It will elucidate the experiential, expressive and relational values of the

lexical and grammatical feature of the text. Additionally, the connective values of formal features of the text will be analyzed. This chapter will also take an account of the relations of equivalence and difference set up in the text. Chapter 6 will offer a detailed interpretation of the textual features and themes outlined in the previous chapter. It will take account of the various assumptions built into the text. It will also consider the local and global coherence of the text. Moreover, the occurrences and degrees of interdiscursivity, mediation of difference and intertextuality will be discussed. It will also elucidate the context and discourse type. Additionally, it will detail the link between discourse and its associated social effects and (institutional) determinants. Specific attention will be paid to the social structures and relations of power influencing the discourse. The concluding chapter, chapter 7, will detail a discussion of the research findings. It will be supplemented by suggestions for improving the counter-narrative.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

Overview

This chapter details the existing literature pertaining to narratives, and the dominant approaches related to the study and applications of narratives. It investigates the introduction of deconstructive practices to narrative studies, especially in relation to counter violent extremism. In this regard, it details the development of counter-narratives to extremism. The necessity of such counter-narratives is also elucidated, specifically in the context of Pakistan. Furthermore, this chapter explores the need for deconstructing counter-narratives.

2.1. Narratives and Approaches to Narratives

Narratives have been cited as being vital to human language and cognition. One definition offered by Klein[16] suggests that narratives need the (additional) elements of an audience and an appropriate response. Elliot [17] establishes three key features of narratives and asserts that they are, chronological (indicating a sequential order), meaningful and social (produced for specific audiences). Abbott defines narratives as "the representation of an event or a series of events".[18] He notes the ambiguities associated with the definition of clear boundaries of narrative; certain branches of the study of narrative require the presence of more than one event, others require a causal connection between events, while still others require the presence of one or more narrators. A narrative then is taken to comprise of two vital elements; a *story*, which is one event

---

[16] Harriet E. Manelis Klein, "Narrative," *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 9, no. 1/2 (1999): 167-69,167.
[17] Jane Elliott, *Using Narrative in Social Research: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches* (London: Sage Publications, 2005),4.
[18] H. Porter Abbott, *The Cambridge Introduction to Narrative,* 2nd ed. (UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008),13.

or the sequence of a number of events, and the representation of those events or *narrative discourse.*[19]

Despite there being such considerable difficulty with delineating the boundaries of narratives, the engagement with narratives has charted a steady course into the social sciences. Narratives and their analyses have been employed widely in the social sciences and related research such as health sociology, health behavior and education, psychology and criminology. As part of the broader literary movements, narrative research has interacted with the humanist approaches arising out of psychology and sociology. Literary movements ranging from structuralism, post-structuralism, postmodernism to deconstructionist movements, have all been visited by the narrative social research practice. Presenting interestingly interconnected layers of meaning, narrative analyses have been employed in assessing individual perceptions about particular social phenomena and thus the latter's impact upon particular groups of people.

In criminology, for example, different methods of narrative analyses have been used in order to unveil patterns of offending and reoffending.[20] Such analyses have helped gauge individual disposition towards crime, and can in turn be useful in addressing and remedying such trends. Such narrative analyses have also proven applicative in studying group behaviors. The post-structuralist trend, for instance, sets the tone for examining the power relations that go into shaping narratives, in addition to examining the conscious and unconscious processes of meaning -making via narratives.[21] Therefore, narrative and related research, lends explanatory prowess to several different forms of inquiry into discourse practices at the spoken and written

---

[19] Ibid.

[20] Elliott, *Using Narrative in Social Research*,5.

[21] Molly Andrews, "Opening to the Original Contributions: Counter-narratives and the Power to Oppose," in *Considering Counter-Narratives: Narrating, Resisting, Making Sense,* ed. Michael Bamberg and Molly Andrews (The Netherlands: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2004), 1-6.

level. Post-structural research, particularly deconstructive studies, have increasingly benefitted from narrative erudition.

2.2. Towards Narrative Deconstruction

Deconstructive approaches, as part of the wider post-structuralist movement, have come to serve different applications in the study of narratives.[22] These approaches have been employed in different ways in order to accommodate a critical and deconstructive reading of the text. Such exercises have helped *unbuild* dominant or monopolizing narratives by enabling an understanding of the ways in which particular narratives further particular interests and versions of reality through storytelling. Paying attention to the formal features of such narratives provides an insight into *how* these narratives can achieve their intended effects. The unbuilding or deconstruction of narratives therefore, has then been carried out to identify such linguistic features as themes, motifs and rhetoric for example, that help establish the credibility of the narratives' version of truth or reality.[23]

Additionally, such incursions enable the deconstructive reader to identify the foundational features of the text which might in reality be inconsistent or incoherent, and thus undermine the apparent seamlessness of narratives. A deconstructive exercise therefore allows the readers to analyze the text in greater depth by "the careful teasing out of warring forces of signification within the text itself."[24] The identification of these can form the starting point from which a broader understanding of the narrative-speech, text or other-can be gained, in turn enabling the demystification of said narrative. This can allow for the creation of the necessary discursive

---

[22] Ibid.

[23] Daniel Punday, *Narrative After Deconstruction* (USA: SUNY Press, 2003).

[24] Sacvan Bercovitch, "Deconstruction and Poststructuralism," in *The Cambridge History of American Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,1996): 354–388,358.

space for alternative or non-dominating narratives. Such alternative narratives can then be used to challenge and change the dominating knowledge and discourse practices within society. While such post-structuralist trends have long postulated the need for taking apart and examining dominant and pervading narratives, this exercise has gained popularity in studies related to VE/T only recently.

2.3. From Narrative Deconstruction to Counter-Narrative: Applications in Counter-Terrorism

The manipulative ability of some narratives towards violent mobilization and action does in fact necessitate a closer, deconstructive look at such malicious narratives. No doubt violent thought and action are motivated by a host of individual and psychosocial factors, and the study of narratives does not offer the sole avenue for understanding such phenomena. Nonetheless, a narrative perspective in studying VE/T and related phenomena can aid in understanding the underlying temporal, spatial and contextual factors that are present at the root of ideals which in turn enable violent action. Studies pertaining to VE/T[25] have thus increasingly stressed on carrying out such exercises with regards to extremist and terrorist narratives.

One branch of such scholarship views the links between VE/T narratives, and the role played by the media in propagating them, whether electronic, print or other. Some of such scholarship strongly suggests that the media in fact aids in the establishment of the *terror* dimension of terrorism by providing room for the exhibition of extremist/terrorist acts, ideas and narratives. Enabling such forms of discourse to reach the mass viewers is what leads to the entrenchment of terror. Such literature resultantly views terrorism and media as existing in a symbiotic

---

[25] See for e.g. Josefin Graef, Raquel da Silva and Nicolas Lemay-Hebert, "Narrative, Political Violence, and Social Change," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 43, no.6 (2018): 431-443.

relationship, whereby each is dependent on the other for its viewership and popularity. Related studies[26] call for recalibrating and reexamining the role played by media and its communicative appendages. Such studies argue for either reducing, or appropriately managing terrorism-related news in order to lessen the psychological impact generated by such accounts.

Another related branch of terrorism studies discusses narratives and their associated psychological expedients in another way. These studies elucidate the psychological impact of terrorist narratives[27] as being more potent than the actual acts of terrorism; such accounts and manifestos induce a constant terror in the hearts and minds of those who are exposed to them, affecting them perhaps to a greater degree than the actual victims of physical violence. Such ideologies, knowledge and the tactful use of threat of violence, are therefore instrumental in furthering the influence of groups which employ them to create widespread panic and fear. This helps spread their influence beyond geographical localities.[28]

In this sense, a careful examination of the ideologies, narratives and life accounts of terrorists, can help understand their fear-inducing properties in groups of people or audiences exposed to such narratives. On the other hand, it has also been stressed that engagement with self-accounts

---

[26] See for e.g. Cristina Archetti, "Terrorism, Communication, and the Media." in *Understanding Terrorism in the Age of Global Media*, ed. Cristina Archetti. (Palgrave Macmillan: London, 2013), 32-59;
Shahira S. Fahmy, "Media, Terrorism and Society: Perspectives and Trends in the Digital Age," *Mass Communication and Society* 20, no.6 (2017): 735-739;
Des Freedman, and Daya Kishan Thussu, "Introduction: Dynamics of Media and Terrorism," in *Media and Terrorism: Global Perspectives*, ed. Des Freedman et al. (London: Sage Publications, 2012), 1-20;
Pippa Norris et al., eds., *Framing Terrorism: The News Media, The Government, And The Public* (New York: Routledge, 2003); and Mehmet Nesip Ogun, *Terrorist Use of Cyberspace and Cyber Terrorism: New Challenges and Responses* (The Netherlands: IOS press, 2015).
[27] The word narrative has also come to define the manifesto or ideology of extremist/terrorist groups in terrorism studies. While such usage of the term is debatable, extremist/terrorist organizations' ideologies and manifestos often do exhibit several qualities of a narrative as understood in terms of discourse.
[28] See for e.g. Cecilia Cassinger et al., "The Narrative Rhythm of Terror: A Study of the Stockholm Terrorist Attack and The 'Last Night in Sweden' Event," *International Journal of Tourism Cities* 4, no.4(2018): 484-494;
Anthony Kubiak, "Spelling It Out: Narrative Typologies of Terror," *Studies in the Novel* 36, no. 3 (2004): 294-301; and John Horgan, *The Psychology of Terrorism*. 2nd ed. (Oxon: Routledge, 2014).

of terrorists can help in understanding not only their self- images and underlying motivations for violent action, but also the various thematic and rhetorical elements that go into the convincing of their followers and sympathizers. In as such, the narrative turn within terrorism studies, claims to open up the means to engage the psychological aspects of terrorism and violent extremism, which render potential victims susceptible to manipulative narratives.[29]

Empirical studies carried out in this regard, analyze some of the most popular extremist narratives, and group results into thematic analyses. A host of such scholarship[30] has in fact been able to provide a model for the typical terrorist mind(so to speak), however, dissenting voices do point to the difficulty of establishing a singular model of the *psychology/pathology* of terrorism. Opinions critical to this approach provide as evidence, the emergence of lone-wolves, distant recruitments and the grievance-frustration paradigm. Such attitudes have all formed the corpus of studies regarding extremism and terrorism as a socially cultured and exacerbated affair.[31] While such opinions hold weightage in their own right, it is in effect true that the in-depth examination of such extremist/terrorist narratives has facilitated policy responses at both the national and international level. The continued commitment to counter-narrative work has therefore paved a steady trajectory in P/CVE policies worldwide.

---

[29] Elis Zuliati Anis, "Countering Terrorist Narratives: Winning the Hearts and Minds of Indonesian Millennials," *KnE Social Sciences* (2018): 189-210, 206.

[30] John Calvert, *Sayyid Qutb and The Origins of Radical Islamism* (UK: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., 2018); Simon Copeland, "Telling Stories of Terrorism: A Framework for Applying Narrative Approaches to The Study of Militant's Self-Accounts," *Behavioral Sciences of Terrorism and Political Aggression* 11, no. 3 (2019): 232-253; Mia Bloom et al., "Depictions of Children and Youth in the Islamic State's Martyrdom Propaganda, 2015–2016," *CTC-SENTINEL* 9, no. 2 (2016): 29-32;Samantha Mahmood and Halim Rane, "Islamist Narratives in ISIS Recruitment Propaganda," *The Journal of International Communication* 23, no. 1 (2017): 15-35;Tyler Welch, "Theology, Heroism, Justice, and Fear: An analysis of ISIS Propaganda Magazines Dabiq and Rumiyah," *Dynamics of Asymmetric Conflict* 11, no. 3 (2018): 186-198; and Farhan Zahid, "Deconstructing Thoughts and Worldviews of Militant Ideologue Mufti Nizamuddin Shamzai**,"** *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 10, no. 7 (2018): 8-11.

[31] Arie W. Kruglanski, et al., *The Three Pillars of Radicalization: Needs, Narratives, and Networks*. (USA: Oxford University Press, 2019).

2.4. Defining Counter-Narrative

Common sensibly, a counter-narrative would be a narrative to counter a pre-existing narrative. In the field of P/CVE, counter-narratives are such narratives which can effectively challenge and undermine the messages propagated by extremist or terrorist narratives. As established in the preceding sections, researching the original narratives of extremists and terrorists, opens up the space for taking a deeper look into the underlying values, beliefs and ideas that these narratives try to appeal to potential followers. This allows for conducting a form of reversal or demystification of such original narratives with the help of alternative or counter-narratives. Such alternative and counter-narratives can counter the underlying themes within the ideologies of extremist and terrorist groups, in turn reducing their appeal.[32]

With increasing attention being paid to the soft side of P/CVE, such counter-narrative work has come to the fore. National and international research and praxis have helped outline certain features and tools which can be employed and harnessed to create better and more effective counter-narratives. The European Union provides a foundational framework for carrying out effective counter-narrative or alternate narrative work. It stresses on creating logical arguments to refute extremist/ terrorist narratives. Its Resolution 2091(2016),[33] addresses, in particular, the flow of foreign fighters around the globe. The resolution also calls for putting a stop to the exploitation of religious, national and ethnic cleavages by such fighters and their groups. Amongst other factors, radicalization is viewed to be the result of exposure to intolerant ideas and narratives.

---

[32] Kurt Braddock and John Horgan, "Towards A Guide for Constructing and Disseminating Counter-Narratives to Reduce Support for Terrorism," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 39, no. 5 (2016): 381-404, 393; and Jolene Jerard and Salim Mohamed Nasir, *Resilience and Resolve: Communities Against Terrorism*. (Singapore: Imperial College Press, 2015).

[33] Full text available at https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-EN.asp?fileid=22482

The Council of Europe calls for preventing such radicalization in online spaces, prisons, and other possible points of contact, by preaching messages that contain values of tolerance and shun hateful speech. Additionally, it is suggested that counter-narrative strategies should target specific audiences with context-specific information, positive ideology, facts, logic and humor.[34] In laying similar stress on the importance of context, the United Nations (UN) has also outlined such provisions in its Resolution 2354 (2017)[35] against terrorism. The resolution provides for counter-narrative techniques that not only rebut the messages and themes in terrorist narratives, but also augment positive messages and address the issues that are faced by populations vulnerable to terrorist narratives. The Resolution has reaffirmed the principles of S/PRST/2016/6, which originally called for the comprehensive international framework to counter terrorist narratives.[36]

Other international organizations such as the East West Institute have also engaged in the field of counter-narrative, and offer additional insights. It has been noted that the selection of language used in developing counter-narratives must also be made with extreme prudence. Counter-narratives and counter-messaging approaches, while rebutting terrorist ideologies, must also take caution not to use language that may discourage those who wish to dissociate from such groups. This can ensure that the way to rehabilitation is open and that the counter-messages can reach not only the populations susceptible to radicalization or indoctrination, but also those populations which have already been affected.[37] Certain practitioners take such approaches one step further by stressing on counter-engagement. The counter-engagement strategy proposes that P/CVE

---

[34] Parliamentary Assembly, *"Counter-narratives to Terrorism,"* Council of Europe. Resolution 2221 (2018) https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-en.asp?fileid=24810
[35] Full text available at http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/doc/2354
[36] Full text available at https://undocs.org/S/PRST/2016/6
[37] Report available at https://www.eastwest.ngo/sites/default/files/ideas-files/Challenging-Extremism.pdf

strategies should not merely provide counter-messaging, but also provide alternative or counter-engagement opportunities and activities. This approach essentially stresses on augmenting the soft policy side with additional measures to halt the spread of extremist ideas and violent action by offering different avenues of dialogue, communication and redress.[38]

2.5. Tracing the Need for a Counter-Narrative in Pakistan

Involvement in the Afghan jihad has opened the floodgates to unprecedented magnitudes of extremism in Pakistan. While participation in the Afghan jihad achieved its intended goal of blocking the encroaching Soviet influence, the unintended outcomes have taken the shape of grave consequences for Pakistan's national security. The inflammation of several sectarian fault lines has been one such consequence. Exploited in the times of war, over time, local sectarian divides and political grievances have morphed into regular outbreaks of violent extremism. Several other *push* and *pull* factors such as grievances and the existence of ungoverned spaces etc., have acted together to nourish the various manifestations of extremism in the country, earning Pakistan the title of being one of the most dangerous places in the world.[39] Resultantly, Pakistan has had to bear colossal political and social costs.

 The country has experienced the worst hit in terms of damage to human life; on one hand direct deaths resulting from VE/T have been particularly high, on the other, scores of people have been injured and displaced due to widespread violence and threat to life. Such negative developments have presented multifaceted challenges, endangering the country's social and economic well-

---

[38] Nafees Hamid, *Don't Just Counter-Message; Counter-Engage* (The Hague: International Centre for Counter-Terrorism, 2018).

[39] See for e.g. S. V. R. Nasr, "The Rise of Sunni Militancy in Pakistan: The Changing Role of Islamism and the Ulama in Society and Politics," *Modern Asian Studies* 34, no. 1 (2000): 139-80; and Zahid Hussain, "Pakistan's Most Dangerous Place," *The Wilson Quarterly (1976-)* 36, no. 1 (2012): 16-21.

being, and its national security.[40] Such extensive damages to the political, economic and social fabric of the country have prompted successive military measures against violent extremist and terrorist outfits. The years 2003 and onwards, witnessed an increase in kinetic operations to counter insurgency and terrorism throughout the country. Notable amongst these were the Wana Operation, Shakai Operation, Operation Sherdil, Operation Rahe Rast, Operation Rahe Nijat, Zarbe Azb and Operation Raddul Fassad.[41] These operations were carried out in different-largely tribal- areas of Pakistan with varying degrees of success. Scores of militants were killed during such operations, while collateral damage in terms of deaths of numerous civilian and security forces personnel also remained high.

While such efforts have been successful in wiping out several militant bases, recruitment centers and fighting forces, there has been the realization that kinetic efforts alone may not be sufficient to curb the growing militancy facilitated by violent and extremist ideologies.[42] The terrorism challenge in Pakistan has evolved rapidly as militant and extremist outfits find themselves fighting for survival. International terrorist outfits have found ways to exchange support with local militant outfits in Pakistan. In addition to logistic support, such groups have also provided each other with ideological backing, encouraging recruits and spreading their appendages far and wide.[43] Quick to adapt, such militant outfits have moved beyond preaching in religious madrassas and seminaries, and have now started targeting mainstream educational institutions

---

[40] Tariq Khan, "The Social, Political and Economic Effects of the War on Terror: Pakistan 2009 To 2011," *ISSRA PAPERS* V, no. I (2013): 65-88, 71.

[41] "Pakistan Army Launches 'Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad' Across the Country," Dawn, (2017, June 21),

[42] See for e.g. Safdar Hussain, *Pakistan's Achievements in War On Terror but at What Cost: A Special Review of the Current Decade* (Islamabad: Pak Institute for Peace Studies, 2019).

[43] Umair Jamal, "Need for A Grand Counter-Narrative in Pakistan's Counterterrorism Strategy," *South Asian Voices,* June 9, 2017.

and cyber spaces. Amidst such developments, there have been vehement calls for establishing a counter-narrative to battle the extremist ideologies of such organizations and outfits .[44]

Resultantly, the government of Pakistan has indulged in developing a counter-narrative.[45] Under the broader P/CVE policy at the national level, the twenty-point agenda, or the National Action Plan document[46] provided the foundational text for necessitating and directing a consorted action against VE/T. This initial blueprint resulted in the National Internal Security Policy I (2014–2018) and the National Internal Security Policy II (2018–2023). These two documents outlined the need for a consorted, national-level effort, and developed the concrete approach to be adopted against the growing VE/T in the country. NISP I stressed upon the need for a counter-narrative, arguing that "Constructing a robust national narrative on extremism, sectarianism, terrorism, and militancy is the corner-stone of an ideological response to non-traditional threats."[47] NISP II, further building upon this clause, stressed that "Reimagining of the society as a tolerant, inclusive and democratic polity will be pursued in order to strengthen a shared vision for the nation" and further predicated that "shared values of acceptance of diversity, debate, and tolerance will be promoted by the State and its institutions."[48]These provisions consequently led to the birth of Pakistan's first official counter-narrative to VE/T, the Paigham-e-Pakistan (PeP).

 The PeP was developed as a result of a collaborative effort between the Council for Islamic Ideology (CII) and the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan. The completion of this

---

[44] Arshi Saleem Hashmi, "Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan: Defining a Common Narrative," *Strategic Studies* 36, no. 3 (2016): 58-77,75.

[45] For a detailed review of international practices see Muhammad Makki and Natasha Khan, "Critical Appraisal of Pakistan's Efforts in (Re) Constructing a National Narrative to Violent Extremism and Terrorism: A Case of Paigham-e-Pakistan," *Pakistan Journal of Terrorism Research* 1, no. 2 (2019):1-31, 9-13.

[46] National Counter Terrorism Authority [NACTA] Pakistan, "National Action Plan, 2014."

[47] Ministry of Interior, Government of Pakistan, *National Internal Security Policy 2014-2018,* Pakistan: Ministry of Interior, 2014,7.

[48] Ministry of Interior, Government of Pakistan, *National Internal Security Policy 2018-2023,* Pakistan: Ministry of Interior, 2018,45.

task was marked on 16 January 2018. While the need for an ideological response in Pakistan has been pursued in tradition with the global call for improving soft policy measures against VE/T, the perseverance of this approach was especially necessitated due to Pakistan's unique VE/T landscape and related narratives[49] as evidenced in the preceding sections. Pakistan's counter-narrative is further distinct due to its widespread acceptance-at least apparently- considering the heterogeneity of the Pakistani religious thought and practice.

The counter-narrative boasts the unanimous agreement of the government and its attached agencies, and several religious scholars from the various religious sects of Pakistan. These scholars officially numbering over 1600, have all endorsed the combination of Hadith and Quranic text which has gone into the building of the counter-narrative to admonish and discourage VE/T in all its manifestations. The document's provisions are laid down in the following words;

> "This unanimously agreed document titled, 'Paigham-e- Pakistan' prepared in accordance with the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an, the Sunnah of the Prophet and the Constitution of Pakistan, reflects the collective thinking of the State of Pakistan. The Message identifies the problems faced by the state of Pakistan and provides a basis to devise a strategy to achieve the goals of Objectives Resolution. Moreover, through this Message, Pakistan is being projected as a strong, united, developed, cultured and modern nation in the international community. This consensus-based document shall be helpful to reconstruct Pakistani society whose core values are tolerance, spirituality, justice, equality, and balance in fulfilling rights and obligations." [50]

---

[49] See f.i. Amil Khan, *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism* (Washington DC: United States Institute of Peace, 2013); and Mujtaba Rathore and Abdul Basit, "Trends and Patterns of Radicalization in Pakistan," *Conflict and Peace Studies* 3, no. 2 (2010): 15-32.

[50] Islamic Republic of Pakistan, *Paigham-e-Pakistan,* Researchers of Islamic Research Institute, IIUI, Islamabad: International Islamic University, 2018, IX.

This national document comprising of over 121 pages, has been widely accepted and disseminated via the platform of the media, and several workshops held across university campuses in the country. The outreach to the youth has been based on the need for safeguarding the ideological borders of the country where they are most permeable.[51] It has been widely praised as an effective shield against the various manifestations of extremism and terrorism in the country. The counter-narrative has been hailed as an effective barrier against the tendencies of violent action based on sectarianism and recriminations against particular groups and people.

The ability of the document to act as a cohesive force in the country by bringing together its diverse populations, has also been praised highly. The values of tolerance and peace enshrined in the document have been deemed as the foundation for promoting the soft image of Pakistan.[52] At a glance, the document seems to have addressed the argument for jihad against the state adequately. It draws upon several quotes from the Quran and Hadith to provide an understanding of the various dimensions of jihad against the state, or jihad without the authorization of the state. In this regard Section 3.2 of the document demonstrates the illegitimacy of war waged against the state or its institutions based upon real or imagined grievances. Similarly, Section 3.4 clarifies the misinterpretations surrounding jihad, especially one waged against the state, its citizens and institutions.

 It also contains provisions for countering hate speech, which has been deemed one of the root causes of inter-sectarian hatred and related violence in the country. The failure of the state to

---

[51] "Workshop under Paigham e Pakistan Initiative Highlights Role of Faculty Members, Ulema in Peace-Building," *News,* October 2, 2018, https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/375466-workshop-highlights-role-of-faculty-members-ulema-in-peace-building

[52] See "Govt Unveils 'Paigham-i-Pakistan' Fatwa Against Terrorism," *Dawn,* January 16,2018.; Rasheed Khalid, "Paigham-e-Pakistan a Shield Against Extremism: MNA," *News,* January 26,2019; and Fawad Maqsood, "National Narrative 'Paigham-E-Pakistan' A Right Step to End Terrorism: President," *Business Recorder,* January 16, 2018.

adequately address such violence inducing fault lines led to the exacerbation of the situation until the apparent wave of sectarian hatred overtook the entire country. Such sectarian animosity has been on the rise in the country since the early 1990s, transcending geographical boundaries and several subsequent government regimes. Certain *narratives of asymmetry* have fueled fear and hatred amongst the public, prompting violent action and support for such action.[53]

Attempts to address this issue are visible in PeP, for example, in Section 3.3 of the document. This section strictly condemns and incriminates censorious declarations and fatwas/rulings against any sectarian group. Such hate speech and hate crime have been denounced as being liable to the strictest punishments. The creation and circulation of hate literature has been strictly reproached. Similarly, the misuse of public spaces such as mosques, and tools such as loudspeakers, to spread intolerance has been admonished. In this regard, the PeP has also established the potential role of schools and other educational institutions in acting as platforms for disseminating the values of tolerance and diversity. While this document has been widely circulated and appreciated, a critical reflection upon it is still absent.

At an initial glance, PeP seems to be a very context specific counter-narrative, as it takes into account the chief drivers of VE/T in the country such as sectarian-based violence, anti-state jihad and hate speech against religious minorities. However, a deeper look reveals that the document is in fact, quite lacking. VE/T in Pakistan has been the product of several complexly interrelated factors, [54] including but not limited to, the import of foreign religious ideals with political undertones, local intolerance and political aims disguised as religious movements, to name a few.

---

[53] Khaled Ahmed, *Sectarian War: Pakistan's Sunni-Shia Violence and its Links to the Middle East* (Pakistan: Oxford University Press, 2011).

[54] Muhammad Feyyaz, "Conceptualising Terrorism Trend Patterns in Pakistan –an Empirical Perspective," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 7, no.1 (February 2013):73-102.

The growth of such extremism has also been regarded as the by-product of the failure of the state's social contract with its citizens and related horizontal inequalities.[55] The appearance of complicated alliances between extremist/terrorist groups and several ungoverned spaces has also been cited as one of the factors.[56]

Reflections upon these alarming issues remain absent from the text of PeP. A preliminary reading of the text reveals a monotonously constructed document, which seems foremost to defend the religiousness of the state, based upon historical claims. Lacking the meaningful depth necessary for a weighted narrative, the document largely sweeps over the rhetoric of violence against the state, without addressing accurately the issues that lie at the heart of such displays. It remains unclear whether such a narrative can carry any resonance with what may be established as a Pakistani identity (provided that a uniform identity may even be establish-able in the first place).

Amidst such arrears, several prominent voices point to the dangers of promoting a poorly constructed counter-narrative which fails to succinctly take contextual realities into account.[57] Scholarly research, critically examining the document, also remains alarmingly absent considering the vehemence with which the document has been popularized, and the amount of time it has spent in existence. Amidst talks of PeP representing the values of the nation and making it a part of the educational curriculum at the national level,[58] there is an imperative need to critically appraise the document, not just with regards to its structure as a narrative, but also

---

[55] Sadia Malik, "Horizontal Inequalities and Violent Conflict in Pakistan: Is There a Link? " *Economic and Political Weekly* 44, no. 34 (2009): 21-24,24.
[56] Farhan Zahid, "Waiting for Resurgence: Al-Qaeda Core in Pakistan," *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 9, no. 9 (2017): 1-4,3.
[57] See f.i. Makki and Khan, "A Case of Paigham-e-Pakistan," 26-30.
[58] "Anti-extremism Narrative Be Made Part of Syllabus," *News,* January 30,2019; and Pakistan Institute for Conflict and Security Studies*,* "Paigham-E-Pakistan to Be Incorporated into The Syllabus,"*,* January 28,2019.

with regards to its textual and contextual validity. While this may seem like a daunting task considering that the document comprises of the two most revered texts of the Islamic world (the Quran and Hadith), it remains necessary nonetheless. The language of construction and the underlying themes incorporated within the document must be passed through a critical evaluation in order to understand what sort of messages it aims to promote beyond its apparent claim of promulgating values of equality, tolerance and acceptance.

2.6. Why Should Counter-Narratives Be Deconstructed?

The aforementioned literature sheds light on the recent permeation of deconstructive practices into the study of VE/T. Targeting the psychological and ideological side of VE/T, several governmental and non-governmental actors have indulged in deconstructive expeditions to demystify and resist VE/T narratives. Such a focus on the ideological foundations of VE/T narratives has offered a rich tradition and literature to enable counter-narrative work. Unfortunately, this tradition lacks the ability to measure the success of counter-narratives in an established, systematic fashion. Consequently, the counter-narratives generated because of such deconstructive practices have gone mostly unevaluated.

While there is a lack of shared methods to measure the contribution of counter-narratives to the field of VE/T, a general consensus stresses appraising the contextual validity of counter-narratives.[59] Unfortunately, such exercises remain virtually non-existent despite the popularity of counter-narratives; deconstructive exercises particularly, have remained limited to original VE/T narratives. A constant re/evaluation of counter-narrative work is important to ensure that it is effective in the contexts where it is employed. In this respect, this research proposes extending

---

[59] Alexander Ritzmann and Marije Meines, *RAN Guidelines for Effective Alternative and Counter-Narrative Campaigns (GAMMMA+)* (Radicalisation Awareness Network, 2017).

the deconstructive approach to the study of counter-narratives. Expanding such efforts to the area of counter-narratives can help further in informing reformative and corrective measures towards counter-narrative work. This research aims to fill such a gap by critically analyzing Pakistan's counter-narrative. The case of Pakistan offers a unique sample for such a study considering the previously mentioned, intricate nature of VE/T in the country. This research, proposes that the national counter-narrative thus produced, must also inhabit all the arguments and counters necessary to refute the kinds of messages propagated by such multidimensional narratives of the diverse VE/T landscape of Pakistan, if it is to be successful.

Chapter 3: Theoretical Framework

Overview

This chapter aims to elaborate the theoretical-explicative framework employed in the present research. Following a Post-structuralist tradition, this research adopts the Derridean deconstruction, in combination with a Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to explicate the truths and values fixed through the counter-narrative (PeP). It examines the counter-narrative as part of the wider chain of the VE/T discourse in Pakistan, and problematizes its claims to representing universally communicable notions.

3.1. Critical Discourse Analysis and Society

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is an approach to studying the interrelationship between discourse and society. The main aim of this approach is to scrutinize the role of discourse as being determinative of, and determined by its social context.[60] While it has overtime branched out into several disciplines, comprising of diverse theoretical and methodological frameworks, it retains its focus on questioning discourses of *inequality* in all their forms. It looks in particular, at the role discourse plays in creating and maintaining unequal power relations between social actors. [61] This focus enables CDA not only to question existing totalitarian discursive practices, but also to open up space for diverse voices that can account for heterogeneous social realities.

The present study draws upon two different branches of CDA in order to fulfill similar aims; the main guiding framework is that of the 'explanatory critique' by Fairclough. This framework develops in three interrelated stages of *description, interpretation and explanation,* and aims to

---

[60] Social context in the case of the present research is taken to mean the context of the production of the (PeP) discourse, and the social context which the discourse attempts to address; both of these contexts converge in the social setting of Pakistan.

[61] Ruth Breeze, "Critical Discourse Analysis and Its Critics," *Pragmatics* 21, no. 4 (December 2011): 493-525, 496.

influence changes in the existing social reality by taking discourse as one point of entry into the wider social praxis. The CDA method developed by Fairclough sets as its target, the social reality where discourse functions in relation to other social elements which include power relations (and their inequalities), political narratives and ideologies to name a few. In this respect, CDA offers both a critique and an explanation of discourse and its related *social effects* and *determinants.* [62]

This complements the aims of the current study by enabling a detailed analysis of the PeP. The PeP inhabits the qualities of both a narrative and an ideology; it is a narrative in as far as it manifests different representations of events, people and institutions. It implicitly functions as an ideology when it contributes to the (hegemonic) struggle over such representations[63] and attempts to influence social relations[64] between the citizens, institutions and the state, through the redefinition of such representations. In order to explicate such features and functions of the PeP, the CDA framework adopted here involves the interpretation, evaluation and critique of discourse "in terms of contradictions between what it is claimed and expected to be and what it actually is." [65] CDA provides further utility because it benefits from interdisciplinary forms of analysis[66] and is "issue oriented rather than paradigm oriented" [67] which allows it to draw upon varying (transdisciplinary) theoretical and methodological approaches.

---

[62] Norman Fairclough, *Language and Power,* 3rd ed. (New York: Routledge, 2015),171-199.

[63] These discursive representations (as part of the political discourse) are all aimed at persuasion in the face of the changing social realities in which the citizens relate to their state. However, these representations become problematic when they fail to establish themselves firmly within the text, or relate to their immediate social reality.

[64] Norman Fairclough, *Discourse and Social Change* (UK: Polity Press, 1992).

[65] Fairclough, *Language and Power,* 9.

[66] Teun A. van Dijk, "Multidisciplinary CDA: A Plea for Diversity," in *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis,* ed. Ruth Wodak and Michael Meyer (London: Sage Publications, 2001):95-120, 96.

[67]———."Aims of Critical Discourse Analysis," *Japanese Discourse* 1, no. 1 (1995): 17-27, 17.

Operationalizing this aspect, the current study blends the Fairclough framework with the concept of social representations which take up central importance in the socio-cognitive approach of van Dijk. Within this approach, social representations are viewed as "(self) presentation strategies, or social attributions of different kinds" [68] which construct relations between different actors, events and institutions. This combination allows the exploration of various interrelated and symbiotic manifestations (of entities/processes/ events) in discourse as part of representations. The operationalization of this concept of representations is guided by a Deconstructive approach which is reflective of the general leanings of this research towards the exploration of social (discursive) constructions in the absence of intrinsic and steady meanings.

3.2. Deconstructing Texts: Tracing The Play of Signs

Deconstruction is a critical approach that scrutinizes "the functioning and disfunctioning" [69] of a text and as such has been evoked as both a philosophical tradition, and as literary critique. Often(unwittingly) seen as a destructive discipline, deconstruction has been perceived as an approach which calls for the destruction of meaning and structures. It has been seen as attacking language (and by extension text), and claiming that language is intrinsically void of meaning. Deconstruction, however, proposes quite the contrary; it brings attention not to the meaninglessness of language, but the *instability* of language, especially as written work. Derrida puts forward this proposition by problematizing the boundaries and internal structures of language. He argues that language lacks a stable center, and that this issue starts to manifest

---

[68] ———. "Social Cognition, Social Power and Social Discourse," *Text &Talk* 8, no. 1-2 (1988): 129-157, 135.
[69] John D. Caputo**, "**The Villanova Roundtable," in *Deconstruction in A Nutshell: A Conversation with Jacques Derrida*, (New York: Fordham University Press, 1997), 9.

"when its limits seem to efface themselves, at the very moment when it ceases to be firm in itself, contained and hemmed in by the infinite signified." [70]

 Deconstruction problematizes the notion of signs as proposed by the structuralist tradition, which maintains that signs (the basic linguistic unit) exist in negative relations or difference to each other.[71] Deconstruction targets this very notion of negative or binary difference. Its departure from a system of binaries manifests in the terminology of *différance.* The usage of this term allows deconstruction to combine two diverse aspects of *differ* and *defer* into one. Deconstruction proposes that while signs may be understood in a relation of difference (that of differing or being different), they must also be understood to exist in a relation of deferred presence (of other signs). This means that no sign is merely either/or, presence/absence, but also a delayed and deferred presence of another.[72] This leads deconstruction to resist the supposed fixity of language. Deconstruction proposes that language (and hence texts) inhabit a variety of interpretations through a play of signs.

Deconstruction claims that this is so because the field of language is "a field of infinite substitutions" missing "a center which arrests and grounds the play of substitutions."[73] Deconstruction prompts that the origin or center of language lacks a "natural site" and is merely a function of infinite "sign-substitutions."[74] This play of *infinite substitutions* or *infinite signified* points towards the fallibility of language and the heterogeneity of texts. Deconstruction, therefore, is a recognition of the absence of totality, and acts as a method to question and 'shake'

---

[70] Jacques Derrida, *Of Grammatology,* trans. and ed. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2016), 6.
[71] For a detailed commentary on signs see Hugh Bredin, "Sign and Value in Saussure," *Philosophy* 59, no. 227 (1984): 67-77.
[72] See f.i. Peter V. Zima, *Deconstruction and Critical Theory*, trans. Rainer Emig (London: Continuum, 2002), 43.
[73] Jacques Derrida, *Writing and Difference*, trans. Alan Bass. (London: The University of Chicago, 1978), 365.
[74] Ibid.,353.

totalizing and authoritarian texts and discourses. The direction of deconstruction, as a tool of critique, is aimed from *within* such texts and discourses; in Derrida's own words "Deconstruction is not a method or some tool that you apply to something from the outside... Deconstruction is something which happens and which happens inside; there is [a] deconstruction at work within." [75] Deconstruction, therefore, calls for close reading and rereading of text in order to reveal its aporias, heterogeneity and the play of infinite substitutions at work within.

3.3. Signs as Representations

It is at this junction that Deconstruction crosses paths with CDA. Both methodologies offer a critique of texts from within the texts themselves. Both approaches argue for the heterogeneity of texts and the ways in which they remain open to (perhaps endless) interpretation. Paying attention to the structure of text, therefore, allows one to come across moments where the seams of (language and) text come undone, and its foundations lack a solid resting place. In addition, the Deconstructive and CDA approach both present a case for the 'dialogicality' of texts; reduced or absent dialogicality is a sign of hegemonizing discourses which subvert the voice of the other. It is this voice or presence which both approaches wish to highlight for its absence or presence, and hence explicate how inequalities may be discursively embedded and promoted. [76] The present research borrows from a combination of these two approaches and further develops these in analyzing how the PeP establishes meanings and deals with dialogicality.

This draws attention to the various categorizations and representations within the text. The notion of representation here draws upon the different theoretical and methodological frameworks at work within the research. The notion of (*infinite) signs* (i.e. concepts) in

---

[75] Caputo, *Deconstruction in a Nutshell*,9.
[76] Fairclough, *Analysing Discourse,* 42; and Caputo, *Deconstruction in A Nutshell,*13-14.

Deconstruction, suggests looking within the text to unveil the heterogeneity of texts. While

engaging similarly with the heterogeneity of texts, CDA relies upon the concept of *members*

resources (especially in the Fairclough framework). Fairclough's member resources include

"knowledge of language, representations of the natural and social worlds they inhabit, values,

beliefs, assumptions, and so on." [77] Both these terms (sign and member resources) focus on the

aspect of 'representations' in language.

While Deconstruction deals with sign in the sense of being the basic unit of language, the CDA

framework goes a little further to include various aspects of knowledge and beliefs into the

concept of member resources. The ideas proposed by van Dijk especially, elaborate further on

what he terms *social representations*. These *social representations* are viewed from the

dimension of power relations, and it is proposed that discourses attempt to control social

representations, social beliefs and attitudes,[78] and such struggle over social representations is

evident of the (re)production of power and consensus.[79] Deconstruction similarly view the binary

conception of signs, as subverting and marginalizing the "other which is forever absent.*"* [80] This

suggests a point of intersection between the notion of representations in both of the above

mentioned critical approaches, which attach importance to how different entities, events and

assumptions etc., are constructed and reconstructed within the text, in relation to one another,

and how these reconstructions are influenced by, and further influence inequalities of social

relations and structures. The terminology of representation in the present study draws upon all of

these definitions and takes representations to constitute of the definitions and categorizations of

entities/processes/events. This concept is the operationalized to show how the different notions

---

[77] Fairclough, *Language and Power*,57.
[78] Teun A. van Dijk, "Discourse and Manipulation," *Discourse & Society* 17, no. 2 (2006): 359-383, 369.
[79] ———. "Social Power and Social Discourse," 129-157,148.
[80] Derrida, *Of Grammatology,* xxxv.

of agency, social identities, institutions and events negotiate meaning in the absence of originally

stable or standard meanings in the PeP.

Chapter 4: Research Methods

Overview

The aim of this chapter is to elaborate on the methodological framework and methods employed in the critical analysis of the PeP. The focus of the research will be both within and outside the text during its course. In working together with CDA, the Deconstructive approach will assist in explicating how the PeP acts as a site of social struggle, and how entities/events/processes have been continuously (re)constructed through discourse, as social practice. The sections below outline some of the challenges associated with the CDA method, and detail how the present study develops its framework in order to overcome these issues.

4.1. Critical Discourse Analysis: Political Discourse and Representations

4.1.1 Methodological Issues

Some CDA studies [81] carried out around similar concepts of political discourses and representations indicate further issues. These studies addressing such themes as national identities, discourse and the politics of representations, draw upon diverse methodological and theoretical approaches under the broader CDA framework. These choices are guided by the researches' scope, research subjects, research objectives and research questions. However, a number of these studies have consequential limitations; some of these limitations are reflective of the issues faced by the broader CDA scholarship. For instance, while these studies draw upon

---

[81] C.f. Ana Caballero-Mengíbar, "Critical Discourse Analysis in The Study of Representation, Identity Politics and Power Relations: A Multi-Method Approach," *Communication & Society* 28, no. 2(2015): 39-54; Anita L. Wenden, "The Politics of Representation: A Critical Discourse Analysis of an Aljazeera Special Report," *International Journal of Peace Studies* 10, no.2 (2005): 89-112; Fawwaz Al-Abed Al-Haq and Nazek Mahmoud Al-Sleibi, "A Critical Discourse Analysis of Three Speeches of King Abdullah II," *US-China Foreign Language* 13, no. 5 (2015): 317-332; and Hassan Al-Momani, "Political Discourse of Jordan: A Critical Discourse Analysis," *International Journal of English Linguistics* 7, no.2 (2017):90-98.

a host of different methodological and theoretical frameworks, they often omit systematic frameworks for analysis and findings and skip from micro to macro-structures. Additionally, some of the reviewed studies appear to have chosen from the broad framework of CDA, only those tools which help confirm initial hypotheses about 'power', 'ideology' and inequality'. While CDA aims to expose the relations of inequalities within discourses, it need not remain limited to such endeavors. Confining CDA research to such skewed notions limits the scope of some of the reviewed studies. Some of such limitations stem not only from the individual research approaches but also from the open-ended nature of CDA.

CDA offers little recourse in terms of an all-around theoretical and methodological framework. This has often been deemed a serious limitation to a rigorous scholarly enterprise grounded in standardized practices. Other critiques against CDA stem from the tendency of studies carried out under this approach, to limit themselves to homogenous or transparent discourses (in terms of manipulation) and engage in shallow micro-macro analyses, which analyze linguistic features and then link them directly to 'power', 'hegemony' and 'ideology'. This tendency results in foregoing the understanding of how discourse may contribute to meaning generation. In this vein, CDA has often also been accused of assuming a negative stance from the outset. [82] The present study builds upon the existing studies by addressing the heterogeneous discourse of the PeP, which exhibits a high degree of intertextuality and draws upon various orders of discourse. It further makes attempts to address the overall critique levelled against the broader CDA approach.

The CDA approach primarily studies discourse in all its forms, across a range of disciplines. Since discourse lies at the heart of such critical research, limiting the approach to any one of the

---

[82] Breeze, "Critical Discourse Analysis and Its Critics," 493-525, 516.

disciplines would limit the potential of the method. CDA helps challenge totalizing and rigid discourses and opens up space for not just competing, but complementing voices. By incorporating an explanatory critique, it also helps understand the consequences that may result from the absence of such complementing voices (in heterogeneous contexts). Moreover, the present study focuses on the processes of semiosis that take place in the text in relation to its context. This enables it to move systematically between a *micro*, *meso* and *macro* focus (alternatively a description, interpretation, explanation based inquiry).

 The study attempts to demonstrate that adopting a critical deconstructive approach does not translate into a polemical enterprise, but instead allows exploring the text for meaning-making processes in the absence of originally stable concepts and meanings. It does not assume a preoccupation with rigid notions of power, inequality and dominance, but treads farther in exploring the discursive variations that exist within these broader themes (in the text). The study is critical where it looks at the text as situated dialogically within its context; it explores not only the power asymmetries that have shaped the PeP, but also how the PeP itself manifests further asymmetrical representations of its context. Alternatively, it considers how the text represents the context which it aims to influence, and how contextually valid its representations are.[83] The study aims to demonstrate how an explicitly Deconstructive CDA, can help unveil the different ways in which a text may be interpreted. Understanding the text's limitations in the face of multiple interpretations and diverse contexts can help such important national discourse to improve its strategies so that it can become contextually relevant instead of reinforcing rhetoric.

---

[83] Such conclusions are drawn against the backdrop of the existing studies which address the causes of extremism/terrorism in Pakistan.

The study also makes an argument for adopting multidisciplinary frameworks that exist within the CDA scholarship. This suggestion is made in light of the recognition that while CDA practices draw upon multiple theoretical backgrounds and methods, these often remain unsatisfactorily explored during such research. This leads to encumbered frameworks that produce generalized findings which lack clarity, and tend to be confirmatory. The present research attempts to overcome these issues by drawing upon the analytical model of Fairclough and combining this with the notion of social representations presented by van Dijk. A detailed analytical framework is teased out of Fairclough's successive works on *Language and Power, Discourse and Society,* and *Critical Language Studies and Intertextuality,* as part of his approach to CDA. In addition, van Dijk's socio-cognitive weave of social representations guides the (interpretation) meso and (explanation) macro phases of the research. The following section presents a detailed framework of the methods employed.

4.2. Research Framework

The multi-level CDA analysis developed by Fairclough offers applicability in exploring categories of ideology, legitimation, and identity within the text, and has been adopted to operationalize the research. Fairclough's analysis of the political discourse of Thatcherism,[84] and tracing of ideology and identity change in political media[85] provide precedents for examining texts which engage in the mixing of genres and discourses. This aids in explicating the incongruities of discourse and sociocultural practice which manifest in such heterogeneous texts. The present analysis focuses on the themes of *Justice, Muslim, State, Pakistan, Pakistani, Jihad, Islam and Islamic,* as part of its wider concept of *representations*. Borrowing from Fairclough's

---

[84] Fairclough, *Language and Power*,177-199.
[85] Norman Fairclough, "Ideology and Identity Change in Political Television," in *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*, 2nd ed. (Oxon: Routledge, 2013):146-159.

related works[86] in which he explores the various dimensions of discourse and social elements, the three-tier analysis developed in *Language and Power* has been fused with additional categories to contribute to the present study's framework of analysis.[87] This analysis will develop in three interconnected stages which will focus on the linguistic (micro), intertextual(meso) and contextual (macro) levels of analysis.

Each of these levels will focus on distinct categorizes corresponding to different formal features of the text (see below Table 1 for a comparison between research stage and level of analysis). Yet it must be noted that the three stages of analysis-linguistics, intertextual and contextual-all overlap to some degree with regards to the categories they explore. Several lexical features flow into the grammatical structure of the text, while these grammatical features further go on to translate into the overall structure of the text. In this way, each level of the textual analysis contributes to the next and is inextricably tied into its formal features. This reflects the need for mapping the systematic analyses of "texts onto systematic analyses of social contexts."[88] Recognizing this, and the need for creating a fluid framework of analysis, the current research adopts a method which moves between these three stages to inform a more flexible analysis.

The first micro-stage of linguistic analysis will help explore the lexical and grammatical features of the text of PeP. The documentation of such features aids in identifying and categorizing the literary devices used within the PeP to construct and present certain ideas, values and beliefs. In doing so, the text relies on the creation of values of several kinds for its readers. The three main

---

[86] Norman Fairclough, *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research* (UK: Taylor & Francis Routledge, 2003).
———. *Discourse and Social Change* (UK: Polity Press, 1992).
———. "The Dialectics of Discourse," *Textus* 14, no. 2 (2001): 231-242.
———. "Intertextuality in Critical Discourse Analysis", *Linguistics and Education* 4, no. 3-4 (1992):269-293.
[87] See below Appendix A for the detailed questionnaire.
[88] Norman Fairclough, *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language* (London: Longman Group Limited, 1995),187.

types of value creations (in the text) include the relational value, experiential value and expressive value. At the lexical level, experiential value is gauged by paying attention to the use of vocabulary such as the use of synonyms and antonyms. The relational value of words is gauged from the formality of words used. Relational value can also be gathered from the use of euphemisms. Paying attention to the use of pronouns and positive/negative words helps gauge the expressive values of words. These three values also flow from the lexical to the grammatical level. As part of the grammatical level, the experiential values are further understood in terms of coding relationships and events, and the processes and participants involved in these. Such an understanding is drawn from elucidating textual features such as the use of active/passive voice. Similarly, the use of nominalizations and positive versus negative sentences helps understand the treatment of agency and causality in a text. Since agency and causality can be ideologically motivated, they can serve as a basis for manipulation or legitimation through text and are important features to be watchful of. These observations guide the understanding of the various representations of *subjects* in the PeP.

The grammatical level inquiry also takes account of the relational and expressive values, which taken together, can provide an understanding of how a particular discourse or text-in the present case, the PeP- lays claims to knowledge and authenticity. Relational values allow for elucidating how the authors or text producers relate to their audience, and are understood by interpreting the use of pronouns and modes of sentences. The identification of the use of pronouns is also helpful in assessing the inclusion and exclusion of subjects and thus relational modality. Similarly, expressive values indicate the text producers' evaluation of the world. This evaluation is visible in the type of classification schemes which the text producers draw upon. Expressive value may

be additionally adduced from the presence of expressive modality.[89] This helps elucidate the text producers' evaluation of the truth, through the representation of the world or reality.[90] The expressive, relational and experiential values of the formal features of text, code social identities, social relations, and beliefs/ knowledge respectively (within the text).[91] In addition to these three values (experiential, relational, expressive), grammatical features often possess connective value. This connective value is indicative of the values of a text's formal features in connecting its different parts with each other. In this regard, it possesses an internal character and accounts for formal features such as the use of connectors, reference words and conjunction, all of which contribute to cohesion in the text. Connective value, however, also retains an external character where it helps look at the relationship between the text and its context (the situational context or intertextual context).[92]

The inquiry into such connective features of the text will form the point of transition between the linguistic and intertextual levels of the research. The exploration of the connective value enables an analysis of the large-scale structures and semantic relations; hence explicates recurrent and discernable characteristics of the text. Similarly, it helps exhume the underlying presuppositions cued in the text through such formal features. Such presuppositions help to tie together a text whilst simultaneously creating a collective-sense[93] for the readers. This information, taken together with an intertextual direction, will direct the analysis towards the meso level. This phase

---

[89] Relational modality (authority of participants in relation to each other) and expressive modality (author's evaluation of truth or a representation of reality) often overlap because the textual features used to identify the two overlap.

[90] Fairclough, *Language and Power*,130-145.

[91] Ibid.130-131.

[92] Ibid.,145.

[93] Collective-sense has been used interchangeably with shared-sense in this research. The terms refer to shared, common or collective knowledge, as created by language (of the PeP).

will act as the meeting point of the linguistic and intertextual analyses (which together form textual analysis).

The linguistic analysis focuses on such areas as lexicology, grammar, semantics, and aids in exploring the local and global coherence of the text, including relations between particular parts of a text, and relations that tie the whole text together. The intertextual analysis, on the other hand, helps analyze texts for potential *historicity* with regards to other texts, and *creativity* with regards to orders of discourse.[94] These orders of discourse make up the conventions which dictate text production and are the link between the discursive and the social; orders of discourse are the social ordering of the various linguistic variations that dictate meaning-making (such as genres, discourses, styles).

In addition, this exercise helps view the text as social practice. This is to suggest that text(as language), is a *socially conditioned process*.[95] It is both, shaped by the existing social reality, and helps shape social reality, which is dependent upon implicit assumptions and the creation of a shared or common sense. The creation of this common sense is based on the creation of different kinds of relations between social actors, processes, events,[96] (referred collectively to, as *representations* in the research). At this meso-stage, the research will detail an account of such *representations* which will be explored with regards to their interrelations, and contribution towards the realization of the major aims of the PeP. This will make apparent how the discourse of PeP (as part of a particular series) perpetuates particular types of *truths* by systematically building and blending them into its structures and meaning-making processes. Most importantly, this exercise will help uncover how the PeP constitutes the site of mediation of difference,

---

[94] Fairclough, *Language and Power,* 37-38.
[95] Ibid, 55-57.
[96] ———. *Analysing Discourse,* 24-28.

changing power relations and social struggle.[97] However, at this stage, the link between the PeP and related social elements will only be identified, not explicated.

The third and final macro-stage of the contextual analysis will help uncover the role played by PeP as a social practice, which can help sustain or change social structures and relations. These *social structures* are taken to be *the relations of power*, while *the social processes and practices* are taken to be the *processes and practices of social struggle*. The social structures are also the determinants of discourse; power relations which determine the discourse. While the processes are taken to be the effects of discourse. This symbiotic relationship between discourse and social structures will be further viewed at the three levels of social organization, which are the societal, institutional and situational levels. This will help investigate how the PeP is determined by social structures, and how it affects the social practices at the three levels (the situational, institutional and societal).[98] This altogether will constitute the contextual analysis. The macro-stage, will hence bring together the textual analysis form the previous research stages with the contextual analysis. Together these will help elucidate how assumptions about, and representations of, the various research themes explicated earlier have been determined through the discourse of PeP, as influenced by particular social structures and processes. Alternatively, light will also be shed on how these various representations can act to sustain or change these social structures and processes. This stage will therefore make explicit the link between discourse, social structures and processes. Additionally, this stage of analysis will enable an account of not only the implicit and explicit presence of certain elements and representations in the text, but also their absence.

---

[97] Fairclough, *Language and Power,* 101-126.
[98] Ibid.*,*172-176.

Certain texts can influence their surroundings by deliberately or non-deliberately concealing certain representations (and truths), which are a part of the social context in which these texts are generated, and the social contexts which these texts address. Such absences (together with certain presences) help promote the aims of discourse and affect social relations (of power). The macro-stage will therefore also account for such absences, subjugation and exclusion of the (other) representations which can handicap the meaning-making ability of the text, in addition to the generation of certain biases and inequalities of representation. Such an explanatory and descriptive CDA, taken together with a Deconstructive approach will generate a thorough understanding of the PeP in relation to its context. This will elucidate the PeP's limitations and open up space for further improvement.

Table 1. Research stages

Research stage, level and corresponding features of text

Analysis		
Stage	Level	Features
Micro	Linguistic	Experiential, Expressive and Relational Values of words and Grammatical features
		Connective Value of text
Meso	Intertextual	Assumptions
		Coherence
		Interdiscursivity
		Intertextuality
Macro	Contextual	Situational, Institutional and Societal determinants and effects

Note. This table demonstrates the three research stages and their corresponding levels in the three-tier analysis. It also describes the formal features of the text which will be explored at each level/stage.

4.3. Research Limitations

The foremost limitation of the present analysis is the inability to gauge the responses of text consumers. This limitation arises primarily out of the constrained dissemination of the PeP and its limited audience at the time of research. Hence the analysis lacks (interview) responses. In order to overcome this limitation, this research focuses on a thorough linguistic analysis, which has been theoretically grounded by drawing on a combination of relevant, critical theories and methodological frameworks. Additionally, it relies on existing research[99] which has critically analyzed the document in light of the responses of policy experts and the discourse participants (text producers) involved in the production of the PeP.

The research was similarly limited by issues of space. The micro-meso-macro design adopted in the research can be further expanded to include a variety of categories, and generate a more detailed analysis. However, the analysis had to be limited by prioritizing certain categories at the linguistic and intertextual levels. Furthermore, the quantity of the data analyzed within these categorized, was also confined due to space considerations.

---

[99] Makki and Khan, "A Case of Paigham-e-Pakistan," 1-31.

Chapter 5: Linguistic Analysis (Micro Level)

Overview

This chapter commences the first stage of the textual analysis. This linguistic (micro level) analysis explores the formal features of the PeP at the lexical and grammatical level in order to reveal the experiential, relational, expressive, and connective values of the PeP. This chapter acts as the foundation for the next level of the textual analysis, the intertextual analysis (at the meso level).

5.1. Experiential Values of Words and Grammatical Features

5.1.1. General Themes

The general themes in the text have been assimilated by observing the classification schemes, repetitions and collocations of certain terms throughout the text of the PeP. The tables below highlight some of these recurring themes of *justice, Pakistan/i, Muslim, terrorist activities and Islam.* Most of these themes (and terms) are present in relations of collocation and over wording (with each other). This suggests that these terms are the site(s) of ideological struggle, since the text repeatedly tries to naturalize them through collocation and the construction of interdependent meaning relations. (These terms have been adduced through the observation of some of the repetitive themes in the text and are not statistically calculated data.)

Extract 1 to 6. Theme of Justice
This consensus based document shall be helpful to reconstruct Pakistani society whose core values are *tolerance, spirituality*, ***justice***, *equality and balance* in fulfilling rights and obligations. (Preface, p. IX)
In this system of social ***justice***, non-Muslims, women and children are specifically *protected* (Section 1, p.14)
The Objectives Resolution also provided a framework for the constitution of Pakistan and established that the principles provided by Islam such as *democracy, freedom of speech, equality*, *tolerance* and social ***justice*** shall be the foundations for the constitution so that people of Pakistan could live their

individual and social lives in accordance with the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 2, p.23)
These rights include equality in status and opportunities, equality before law, socio-economic and political *justice*, *rights of expression, belief, worship and freedom of assembly*.(Section 4, p.40-41)
Building upon Islamic principles, the reconstruction of Pakistani society is imperative where *democracy, liberty, equality, tolerance, harmony, mutual* respect and *justice* are ensured. (Section 4, p.46)
Construction of Pakistani society, in the light of the Constitution of Pakistan is needed where the trends of hatred, bigotry, intolerance and false accusation are curbed and resultantly a society is formed that rejoices *tolerance, brotherhood, mutual respec*t and offers a comprehensive system of *justice.* (Section 4, p.49-50)

Extracts 1 to 6 indicate how the theme of *justice* has been presented in the text of the PeP. This theme appears first in the context of the Pakistani society. It is represented as both inhabiting and striving for justice and the positive values associated with justice. Justice is collocated throughout the text with positive values such rights of *expression, freedom, equality* and *tolerance.*

Extract 7 to 22. Theme of Terrorist activities
use of force, **armed escalation** against the state, **terrorist activities** and all forms of **anarchy** that our country is facing, are strictly prohibited in Shari'ah and considered **rebellion**. (Section 3,p.26)
According to the principles of Shari'ah these elements are rebels and committing **heinous crime** of hirabah (waging war against society). (Section 3, p.27)
terrorism is one such **crime** that is punishable under the category of **hirabah**. (Section 3, p.28)
extremists are conducting **suicide attacks** on innocent people and against general public. In accordance with the teachings of Islam, these acts fall under dual **crime**; suicide and killing of innocents. Suicide is **prohibited (*Haram*)** in Islam. (Section 3, p.30)
Terrorism and **suicide attacks** have no place in Islamic history. Such cruel and inhumane **attacks** started in 1789 (Section 3, p.31)
In Ulama's opinion **terrorism related crimes** fall in the category of "**hirabah**" (Section 3, p.31)
There is no justification in Shari'ah to launch any armed activity against them. This type of action, according to Islamic teachings, is considered a heinous **crime** and **rebellion**. (Section 4, p.42)
use of power, armed struggle against the state, **terrorist activities** and **all forms of anarchy** that our country is confronted with (Section 4, p.42)

Sectarian hatred, **armed sectarian conflict** and imposing ones ideology on others by force is in clear violation of the injunctions of Shari'ah and is **disorder on earth**. (Section 4, p. 43)
Further, it is a **national crime** as per the law (Section 4, p.43)
these groups attract the youth for an **armed uprising** against the state, terming it as **jihad**. (Section 5, p.52)
However, **taking up arms** to achieve this purpose is to **mischief on the earth** i.e. "**fasaad fi'l-Arz**". (Section 5, p.56)
Suicide is unacceptable in Islam and considered a grave **sin.** (Section 5, p.57)
such **suicide** is like committing a **double crime**; one for committing **suicide** and the second for **killing** another person (Section 5,p.58)
The suicide attacks which are being carried out in Pakistan, constitute three different types of **grave crimes**; first, the **suicide**; second, **killing** an innocent person; third, **rebellion** against an Islamic State. (Section 5, p.59)
declaring them disbelievers and calling for armed struggle against them is **not jihad but mischief on the earth** (fasaad fi'l-Arz) and **rebellion** (*baghawat*). (Section 5, p.61)

Terrorist activities and suicide attacks are constantly collocated with negative values throughout the text. These negative values are drawn from a legal and religious perspective. According to law, these are classified as *crimes, killing, anarchy and rebellion*. Drawing upon religious law, they are classified as *fasaad fi'l-Arz, hirabah and Haram*. Terrorist activities are thus portrayed as something both immoral and illegal. These terms are used to create relations of synonymy between terrorism/ terrorist activities and the rest. Similarly, relations of hyponymy are being generated where such terms are grouped together under the category of hirabah and mischief on the earth or "fasaad fi'l-Arz" (Extract 12,22).

Extract 23 to 35. Theme of Pakistan and Pakistani society
Moreover, through this Message, **Pakistan** is being projected as a **strong, united, developed, cultured** and **modern nation** in the international community. (Preface, p.IX)
This consensus based document shall be helpful to reconstruct **Pakistani society** whose core values are **tolerance, spirituality, justice, equality** and **balance** in fulfilling rights and obligations. (Preface, p.IX)

As a result of this struggle, on 14 August 1947, **Pakistan** was created as an **Islamic Republic**. (Section 2, p.21)
Pakistani society was to prove that even today humanity needs Islam and it is possible to establish a robust **Muslim country** that holds tight to the true teachings of Islam and also meets the requirements of a **modern nation**. (Section 2, p.21-22)
Immediately after the creation of **Pakistan**, Quaid-e-Azam and his team embarked on a mission where a **modern, democratic Islamic country** could be built. (Section 2, p.22)
Moreover, local cultures and languages be embedded into **Pakistani culture** in the light of **Islamic principles**.(Section 2, p.22)
The land of **Pakistan** is a **sacred trust** from God. (Section 4, p.45)
All this is to ensure that **Pakistan** shall progress as a **modern Muslim state** and becomes prominent in the world community. (Section 2, p.24)
In contemporary world, **Pakistan** is a country where maximum legislation took place according to **Islamic teachings and principles**. (Section 2, p.24)
The Constitution of 1973 ensures prosperity of **Pakistan** which is **Islamic** as well as **liberal** in nature representing all segments of Pakistani society. (Section 2, p.24)
We have already mentioned that the Objectives Resolution is the base for **Pakistan's Islamic** and **democratic identity**. (Section 2, p.25)
The 1973 Constitution of Islamic Republic of **Pakistan** is **Islamic** and **democratic** and it is a social contract between all Units of Pakistan that has been unanimously endorsed by all the political parties as well as ulama-o-masha'ikh of all schools of thought. (Section 4, p.40)
Islamic Republic of **Pakistan** is an **Islamic state** and its constitution begins with the national oath that sovereignty belongs to Allah, the Almighty alone and He is the Supreme Ruler of the world and the authority bestowed upon people of Pakistan to govern and decide matters is a sacred trust which should be practiced within the prescribed limits. (Section 4, p.41)

The word *Pakistan/i* appears in collocation with the *Islamic, modern and democratic*. The

Extracts 23 to 35 indicate that Pakistan is collocated repeatedly with Islamic state, modern

nation, democratic state. It is depicted as "Islamic as well as liberal" (Extract 32). The over

wording surrounding Pakistan, also suggests that this term (or definition) is being regulated by

the text in order to subdue opposing definitions. Similarly, the term Pakistani is collocated with

terms such as *spiritual, Islamic, tolerance and modern* (Extracts 24,26,28).

Extract 36 to 44. Theme of Islam
Islam means **peace** and **submission** to the will of God. (Section 1, p.3)
By accepting **Islam** one completely **submits** to the **obedience** to Allah and promises to spend his life according to the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 1, p.3)
The social pillars of **Islam transcend** all boundaries of **bigotry** and rests upon the **principles of respect** for all human beings (Section 1, p.6)
Moreover, **Islam** seeks and asks to **refrain** from responding the evil with an evil (Section 1, p.8)
The **golden principle** "There is no compulsion in the religion" was, in fact, first introduced by **Islam.** (Section 1, p.12)
It is imperative for Muslims to bring others towards **Islam** only through convincing argumentation, while practicing their own religion **independently** and **freely**. (Section1, p.12)
Tyranny, arrogance, oppression, intolerance and other such acts **are evil** and are declared **prohibited** in **Islam**. (Section 1, p.14)
Islam teaches that even if you have the ability to take revenge you should **forgive** and **be good** with the others as it is preferable command of the Holy Qur'an (Section 1, p.15)
It is proven through religious teachings that the fundamental lesson of **Islam** is the **protection of human dignity** and **preservation of human life**. (Section 1, p.15)

Extracts 36 to 39 associate Islam with positive and peaceful and submissive values such as *"peace and submission"* (Extract 36), "obedience" (Extract 37), "refrain" (Extract 39), and protection and "preservation of human life" (Extract 44). These positive values are constantly placed in collocation with Islam throughout the text. On the other hand, negative and evil values are placed in relations of opposition with Islam where *"Islam transcend all boundaries of bigotry"* (Extract 38), and "Tyranny, arrogance, oppression, intolerance and other such acts" (Extract 42), are declared to be unacceptable in Islam.

Extract 45 to 51. Theme of Muslim
Muslims started their struggle to **achieve** an independent state (Section 2, p.21)
Muslims of the Indian subcontinent **created** Pakistan (Section 2, p.21)

Therefore, it is imperative on **Muslims** in general and the people of Pakistan in particular **that they do their own struggle** against those elements who are fighting against Pakistani armed forces. (Section 3, p.28)
peaceful efforts for the **implementation** of the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah is the religious obligation of every **Muslim.** (Section 4, p.41)
And undoubtedly, **peaceful and constitutional struggle** for its attainment is an important **responsibility** of every **Muslim.** (Section 5, p.56)
In this regard, it is also obligatory on all **Muslims** to **support** and **assist**, within one's means, armed forces of Pakistan in their operations. (Section5, p.60)
implementation of shari'ah is a **responsibility** upon **Muslims** and no one should have any objection to it. (Section 5, p.63)

Extract 45 to 51 indicate how the PeP (re)presents the image of Muslim. Muslim(s) are depicted as active agents who *"started their struggle"* (Extract 45) and *created Pakistan* (Extract 46). The text further states that Muslims must "do their own struggle" (Extract 47). Muslims are also portrayed as having certain *responsibility* (Extract 49, 51). Further, it is *obligatory* that they "support and assist" Pakistani forces (Extract 50). The text therefore portrays Muslims as being responsible and contributing members of their society.

Extract 52 to 56. Theme of Anti-state forces and Extremists
Anti-state forces rebelled against the State of Medina, immediately after the death of the Prophet, which Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him) crushed successfully. (Section 3, p.26)
In the era of the fourth Caliph Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) some **extremist elements** tried to declare Ali's political strategy as infidelity and declared the killing of those who accepted his strategy legitimate. (Section 3, p.26)
Unfortunately, the same thought prevails these days among **extremist elements** and they are declaring bloodshed of Muslims permissible. (Section 3, p.27)
Some **fundamentalist and extremist groups** gain power to achieve their political goals in the name of Commanding Good. (Section 3,p.36)

> These conflicts are causing weakening of country, state and nation and these conflicts benefit **anti-Islam and anti-state forces**.(Section 4,p.42)

Extremists groups active in Pakistan have been established as enemies of Muslims (Extract 54), and the country (Extract 56). They have been represented as *anti-state forces* (Extract 52,53), trying to pursue their selfish political agendas (Extract 55).

5.1.2. Attribution of Agency and Causality

Section 2 of the PeP details a transition of agency, from the Muslims to the British. As with other descriptions of Muslims (Extracts 45 to 51), only positive values are associated with the Muslim rulers of the subcontinent, who never used *coercion* (Extract 57). The downfall of these Muslim rulers is also attributed to the *fiasco* of the 1857, while no mention is made of their possible incompetence.

Extract 57. Attribution and transition of Agency from Muslims to colonial powers

Muslims ruled subcontinent for centuries but they never tried to convert its inhabitants to Islam by coercion. At the time when Muslims took over the rule in the subcontinent, during their reign and after the end of their rule in the region non-Muslims remained in majority. British colonialism snatched the right to rule from Muslims over subcontinent; consequently, colonial powers always considered Muslims their enemies. Muslim rule collapsed in the subcontinent after the *fiasco* of War of Independence in 1857 and the region went under absolute colonial rule. British government either abolished the entire political, defence, social and economic institutions of Muslims or made them defunct. This process made rulers ineffective and humiliated and consequently they lost their power to British. (Section 2, p.20)

Agency is also clearly attributed where the PeP describes anti-state forces and extremist elements (Extracts 52 to 56). Terrorist and extremist elements are named and depicted as active agents engaged in violent activities. They are described as being in violation of the national law, and the Islamic (Shari'ah) law (Extract 58). Over wording "conducting, inciting, facilitating, financing and promoting" (Extract 59) is used to stress that these elements act as responsible, active agents,

who are fully cognizant of their actions. This is then used as the basis to authorize and encourage State action against them (Extract 59).

Extract 58 to 59. Attribution of Agency to Extremist Elements
It is clear from the above three points that all those people involved in violent activities against the government, in the name of implementation of Shari'ah or in the name ethnic groupings are infact committing High Treason against an Islamic State, as per the Islamic injunctions. (Section 5, p.59)
In our opinion, those who are conducting, inciting, facilitating, financing and promoting such heinous acts are rebels and the State of Pakistan has legitimate authority to take all possible measures against them. (Section 5, p.67)

5.1.3. The Use of Positive and Negative Sentences

While most of the sentences of the PeP are positive, negation is used in certain places, such as 'not' in the several examples below, as a way to challenge and reject certain assumptions and values. Values such as injustice and killing of innocents are rejected. *Enmity or hatred* are rejected as the basis for withholding justice (Extract 60). The relationship of non-Muslims with a Muslim state is stated with regards to their rights as citizens. The PeP stresses on the protection of their life in times of war and peace (Extract 61). Extract 62 describes provisions related to the treatment of humans, animals and plants. Killing and harming them is prohibited in relation to Islamic law and practices. Similarly, negation is used to prohibit sectarianism amongst the different juristic schools of Islam (Extract 63) and "Muslims are warned" against sectarianism (Extract 64). The use of negation is also made to discourage "hostile military education" (Extract 65) and unjustified violence and war (Extract 66 to 68).

Extract 60 to 68. Use of Negation
Enmity or hatred towards someone *could not* hinder in delivering this justice. (Section 1, p.14)
Eminent Ulama are of the opinion that non-Muslims who enter into a Muslim state with the

permission of its authorities are innocent and such people even ***could not*** be killed during war, slaying them in peace time is a sin of greater degree, therefore strictly prohibited. (Section 3, p.30)
After the death of the Prophet (peace be upon him), when Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him) became the Caliph he sent troops to Levantine and instructed them ***not to*** kill any woman, child or old person and ***do not*** cut fruit trees, not to destroy any population center and ***not to*** kill or injure any animal unless you need it for your food. (Section 3, p.30)
Although the Constitution of Pakistan allows people to follow their own juristic school but this privilege ***should not*** be used to spread sectarianism.(Section 3, p.31)
Likewise, Muslims are warned that sectarianism is the practice of idol worshipers and ***not*** of Muslims. (Section 3, p.33)
All public and private educational institutions ***must not*** impart any hostile military education or training, hatred, extremism and violence. (Section 4, p.43)
Terrorists ***do not*** differentiate between Jihad and traditional wars. (Section 3, p.34)
In light of the above-mentioned Qur'anic verse, Muslim jurists ***do not*** justify every type of war (Section 3, p.35)
Therefore, these attacks are ***not*** justified through any interpretation. (Section 5, p.59)

5.2. Expressive Values of Words and Grammatical Features

Expressive values of words can be found in the vocabulary which expresses positive/ negative evaluations made by the text producers. The general themes elucidated in the preceding section (Extract 1to 56, Section 5.1.1.), express such evaluations by the text producers. For instance, *armed escalation against the state* is repeatedly classified as *heinous crime, anarchy* and *rebellion* (Extract 7 to 22). Such choice of words indicates the negative evaluation of such processes. On the other hand, *Islam* is repeatedly collocated with positive values such as *obedience, preservation and peace,* however, it is set in opposing relation to negative values such as *oppression and hatred* (Extract 36 to 44). This reflects a positive evaluation of Islam by the text producers.

Correspondingly, expressive values of grammatical features become apparent in the modalities which signal the text producers' evaluations and representations. They indicate the text producers' commitment to the discursive representations in terms of *truth*. Modalities comprise of a) epistemic modalities (modalities of probability) and b) deontic modalities (modalities of obligation and necessity).

5.2.1. Epistemic Modalities

Epistemic modalities indicate probability or possibility with regards to some kind of knowledge, belief or truth as perceived or believed by the text producers. The extracts below (69 to 75), indicate such various beliefs on the part of the text producers about the role of the state, citizens and the rulers of the state.

Extract 69 to 75. Epistemic modalities
all citizens of Pakistan shall enjoy equal status and everyone **should** have equal opportunities to excel and progress. (Section 2, p.23)
Muslims ruled subcontinent for centuries but they **never** tried to convert its inhabitants to Islam by coercion. (Section 2, p.20)
According to Islamic jurists, no activity leading to war **can be** initiated without the consent of the state ruler or his appointed commanders. (Section 3, p.35)
Therefore, it is required that qital **should** only be declared by the State. (Section 3, p.34)
And the one who believes in Oneness of God (Tawheed) and has faith that Muhammad (peace be upon him) is the Messenger of Allah and accepts all what is revealed from Allah, the Almighty, but due to his human limitations and negligence, acts contrary to what is ordained **can not** be pronounced a disbeliever. (Section 5, p.61)
armed struggle against Pakistani government or its armed forces **certainly** fall within the category of rebellion that is categorically HARAM (illegal) as per the Shariʻah. (Section 5, p.55)
May the political rulers of Pakistan fulfill their constitutional responsibility of implementing shariʻah in its entirety in Pakistan, Aameen. (Section 5, p.64)

5.2.2. Deontic Modalities

Deontic modality is concerned with both permission and obligation, and is generally expressed by text producers with regards to some action(s). These obligations are expressed through the use of words such as *should, must, be* and *shall.* The PeP dictates the responsibilities of the state and its citizens through the use of deontic modality, for instance, *"the state **should** use its powers"* to "maintain social harmony*"* (Extract 78), and *"every Pakistani **must** fulfil his/her oath of loyalty"* (Extract 82). Similarly, the PeP declares it the responsibility of the of the government and its institutions, to eliminate extremist elements from the country (Extract 84 & 86). It also prohibits un-Islamic laws (Extract 85).

Extract 76 to 86. Deontic Modalities
Islam teaches that even if you have the ability to take revenge you **should** forgive and be good with the others as it is preferable command of the Holy Qur'an (Section 1, p.15)
Moreover, local cultures and languages **be** embedded into Pakistani culture in the light of Islamic principles. (Section 2, p.22)
To curtail such tendencies, the state **should** use its powers to eliminate these elements and maintain social harmony and juristic diversity. (Section 3, p.32)
the authority bestowed upon people of Pakistan to govern and decide matters is a sacred trust which **should** be practiced within the prescribed limits. (Section 4, p.41)
Although the Constitution of Pakistan allows people to follow their own juristic school but this privilege **should** not be used to spread sectarianism. (Section 3, p.31)
Ulama **must** play their role, where sectarianism and grouping is discouraged and all the mosques and madaris are used only to either perform prayers or to disseminate education to our young generation in the light of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 3, p.32)
Moreover, every Pakistani **must** fulfil his/her oath of loyalty with the State of Pakistan in every situation. (Section 4, p.40)
Ideological differences among various schools of thought are reality which can not be denied, however, these differences **must be** restricted within the limits of scholarly and ideological debates. (Section 5, p.60)
We demand that government institutions **should** take all possible measures to eliminate these activities. (Section 5, p.66)

No law **shall be** passed which is against the teachings of Islam and existing laws shall also be brought in conformity with the injunctions of Islam. (Section 2, p.24)
Therefore, it is **not only** permissible for the Government of Pakistan and its armed forces, by restraining themselves within the limits of Shari'ah, to fight against these rebels **but** is obligatory under Qur'anic injunctions. (Section 5, p.59-60)

5.2.3. Metaphors

The PeP represents itself as a mirror which is reflective of the opinions and sentiments of the citizens of the state (Extract 87). Islam is represented as a structure or building which is supported by its "social pillars" (Extract 88), and is built upon certain supporting structures of *peace, harmony and love* (Extract 90). Islam is further represented, as an active participant with the agency to *seek, ask* something of someone and *encourage* certain kinds of behaviors (Extract 90). The constitution is similarly conceived as a building or construction which requires foundations for survival and strength (Extract 92). The metaphor of "single body" indicates unity and represents the Muslim Ummah as being a physical and interdependent system; something alive and constantly growing and changing, as opposed to being a static community or concept (Extract 91). The usage of "rooted out" likens violent activities (such as anarchistic tendencies) to weeds and unwanted growths which need to be destroyed (Extract 93). Such violence has also been likened to a destructive natural phenomenon, characterized by *surge* and *wave* (Extract 94,95). Such choice of words can also signify the enormity and magnitude of terrorism, as a force with the possibility of wreaking havoc.

Extract 87 to 95. Lexical Metaphors
"Paigham-e-Pakistan," prepared in accordance with the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an, the Sunnah of the Prophet and the Constitution of Pakistan, **reflects** the collective thinking of the State of Pakistan. (Preface, p.IX)
The social **pillars** of Islam transcend all boundaries of bigotry and rests upon the principles of respect for all human beings (Section 1, p.6)

The **edifice** of Islamic civilization was **built** on peace, love, harmony and tolerance instead of the use of force. (Section1, p.17-18)
Islam **seeks** and **asks** to refrain from responding the evil with an evil; instead **it encourages** the use of good deed in correcting an evil (Section 1, p.8)
These prayers also provide an opportunity for Muslim Ummah to **get united into a single body** and be part of the sufferings and pains of others. (Section 1, p.7)
One such example is 1973 Constitution that has "Objectives Resolution" as its preamble, a resolution that provides Islamic **foundations** to the Constitutions. (Section 2, p.24)
For the stability and defence of Pakistan all such anarchistic tendencies should be **rooted out**(Section 4, p.49)
Surge in sectarianism is another challenge for Islamic Republic of Pakistan. (Section 3, p.31)
Hence, the current **wave** of terrorism against the state and general Muslims according to the Holy Qur'an, is a declaration of war against Allah, the Almighty and against His honoured Messenger (peace be upon him) and is mischief on the earth. (Section 5, p.62)

Pakistan has been personified as a passive agent which was "ripped of" certain rights (Extract 96). Pakistani society is viewed- in similar vein to the Islamic society- as a structure which can/must be constructed or *reconstructed* (Extract 97,98). Most of the grammatical metaphors used in the text make references to buildings, constructions and structures. Such metaphors are repeated throughout the text to represent the state, society and Islam as structures that are strong but also as structures that need to be built or constructed.

Extract 96 to 98. Grammatical Metaphors
Pakistan was **ripped** of its economic and financial rights (Section 2, p.22)
Reconstruction of Pakistani society demands that Pakistanis neither demean other religions nor humiliate the founders of other religions. (Section 1, p,12)
Construction of Pakistani society, in the light of the Constitution of Pakistan is needed (Section 4, p. 49)

5.3. Relational Values of Words and Grammatical Features

Relational values illuminate how the usage of words is dependent on social relations between participants, and how it helps create them. This usage of words helps negotiate relationships between the different discourse participants.[100] These values look at such features of the text which exhibit formality, and the use of pronouns and euphemisms. These features identify how discourse participants are constructed or conceived in relation to each other, within the text.

5.3.1. Formality

The formality of the text determines the nature of the relationship between the discourse participants. PeP embodies a high degree of formality since it is a national narrative and policy document. This formality places participants in the formal relations of state authorities corresponding to the citizens, whereby the authors assume the role of educators before a silent or passive audience. Similarly, the means of communication, written, imbues a great degree of formality. The vocabulary of the text indicates additional formality; the use of the word **shall,** occurs 41 times in the document. The formal tone is employed especially in places where the document addresses legal provisions. Some other instances of formal speech are recorded in the extracts (Extract 99 to 107) below.

Extract 99 to 107. Expressions of formality
This unanimously agreed document titled "Paigham-e-Pakistan," *prepared in accordance* with the injunctions of the Holy Qur'an, the Sunnah of the Prophet and the Constitution of Pakistan, reflects the collective thinking of the State of Pakistan. (Preface, p.IX)
This consensus based *document shall be helpful* to reconstruct Pakistani society whose core values are tolerance, spirituality, justice, equality and balance in fulfilling rights and obligations.(Preface, p.IX)
Therefore, *in order to ensure the peace and security* of Yasrib during the first year of hijrah and to bring in order the affairs of the inhabitants of that land, He took several important measures. (Section 1, p.8)

---

[100] Participants refers to text producers and consumers who and interact and participate in a particular discourse.

This legal *system shall help establishing a* society that considers peace, tranquility, security, economic and social development and social similarities as their basic traits. (Section 2, p.22)
Therefore, *it is imperative on Muslims* in general and the people of Pakistan in particular that they do their own struggle against those elements who are fighting against Pakistani armed forces. (Section 3, p.28)
To curtail such tendencies, the state should use its powers to eliminate these elements and maintain social harmony and juristic diversity. (Section 3, p.32)
In accordance with the provisions/requisites of the Holy Qur'ān, Sunnah and the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan the declaration of the following steps is presented through Paigham-e-Pakistan (Section 4, p.40)
Ethics of disagreement *shall be made part* of the curriculum of public and private educational institutions. (Section 4, p.46)
Response to the questions *is as under* (Section 5, p. 54)

5.3.2. Use of Euphemisms

Extract 108.Euphenism
Despite several achievements of Pakistan, we are still far from achieving our goals and objectives that were set in the Objectives Resolution. There are some challenges towards achieving our goals that we have highlighted in ensuing paragraphs. (Section 2, p.25)

The PeP states "we are still far from achieving our goals and objectives that were set in the Objectives Resolution" (Extract 108), instead of formulating something along the lines of 'Pakistan has failed to comply with the Objectives Resolution'. A euphemism is thus used in order to convey a less negative image.

5.3.3. The use of Pronouns

Extract 109 to 117. Pronoun 'we'
We have already mentioned that the Objectives Resolution is the base for Pakistan's Islamic and democratic identity. (Section 2, p.25)
we seek refuge from Allah – declaring them disbelievers and calling for armed struggle against them is not jihad but mischief on the earth (*fasaad fi'l-Arz*) and rebellion (*baghawat*). (Section 5, p.61)

With the above mentioned details, **we** endorse and approve this fatwa and pray that may Allah protect Pakistan from all types of terrorism, chaos and mischief. (Section 5, p.63-64)
In light of the Holy Qur'an and the Sunnah, **we** the Religious Scholars and the Muftis of Pakistan representing all schools of thought unanimously issue the following Fatwa (Section5, p.65)
We unanimously reject extremist ideology and extremism in all its forms and manifestations. (Section 5, p.65)
We believe that spreading sectarian hatred, armed sectarian conflict and imposition of one's religious ideologies by force are contrary to the Shariah/teachings of Islam; tantamount to creating chaos and mischief in the country (Section 5, p.66)
We demand that government institutions should take all possible measures to eliminate these activities. (Section 5, p.66)
We the scholars representing all Masalik/schools of thought unanimously declare that suicide attacks are forbidden "HARAM", in the light of Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 5, p.66-67)
We strongly support the military operations initiated to strengthen the security and stability in Pakistan. (Section 5, p.68)

The pronoun (*we*) has been used to explicitly indicate the presence, opinions and authority of the Islamic scholars. It also functions as an inclusive pronoun which acts to subvert difference of opinions amongst the various scholars, especially as made explicit in "**We** the scholars representing all Masalik/schools of thought unanimously declare" (Extract 115). This authority is then used to present the arguments of the text producing authority; violent extremism in both behavior and belief is strongly rejected (Extract 112). It also indicates the support of the Islamic scholars for the military and the government authorities as a way to lend (religious) legitimacy to them (Extract 117).

Extract 118 to 126. Pronoun 'our'
use of force, armed escalation against the state, terrorist activities and all forms of anarchy that **our** country is facing, are strictly prohibited in Shari'ah and considered rebellion. (Section 3, p.26)

Likewise, the use of Friday sermons to propagate one's own sectarian motives is dangerous for **our** society and is adversely affecting the unity of the nation. (Section 3, p.32)
Ulama must play their role, where sectarianism and grouping are discouraged, and all the mosques and madaris are used only to either perform prayers or to disseminate education to **our** young generation in the light of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 3, p.32)
In the name of implementation of Shari'ah, use of power, armed struggle against the state, terrorist activities and all forms of anarchy, that **our** country is confronted with, are strictly prohibited in Shari'ah and considered rebellion. (Section 4, p.42)
This mindset, wherever it exists, is **our** enemy. (Section 4, p.44)
Juristic and ideological discussions, on the basis of reason and proof, are part of **our** Islamic intellectual wealth and shall remain so. (Section 4, p.46)
Several armed sectarian clashes are also taking place in **our** country aiming to impose one's ideology on others by force. (Section 5, p.53)
In this regard, it is **our** duty to respect the sacredness of all the Prophets (peace and blessings of Allah be upon all of them), the Companions (Allah's pleasure be with them), the wives of the Prophet (peace be upon him) and members of the family (Ahl-e-Bayt). (Section 5, p.60)
Use of force to impose Shari'ah in Pakistan, armed struggle against the Pakistani state and all other forms of terrorist activities to which **our** country is confronted with are "HARAM" and forbidden under the Islamic laws. (Section 5, p.66)

The PeP attempts to establish a common ground, and relations of solidarity and partnership between the different discourse participants. The use of *our* is made to indicate collective possession and ownership of the country, society and religion as social practice. It is used to build solidarity, by highlighting that "our society" (Extract 119) and "our country" is facing problems and adversity (Extract 118,121,124,126).

Extract 127 to 129. Pronoun 'us'
Thus, the Qur'an and Sunnah, the Treaty of Medina and the last sermon of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him) provide **us** ample examples from Islamic injunctions about Islamic doctrines, payers, ideology, society and interaction among the human beings. (Section 1, p.17)
Life of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him) teaches **us** that qital is an exception (Section 3, p.34)
Whereas, many national and internal problems are due to deviation from the promise made by **us** with Allah, the Almighty. (Section 4, p.41)

The use of *us*, is also made to build solidarity amongst the discourse participants. The readers are addressed in an inclusive manner, where the PeP states that religious texts "provide us ample examples" (Extract 127), and teach *us* about qital (Extract 128). It also attributes national problems to the collective "deviation from the promise", by the discourse participants (Extract 129).

5.3.4. Modes of Sentences

The PeP uses mostly declarative and assertive modes of sentences. The use of the declarative and assertive mode suggests that the subjects are positioned in a relation of information giver (text producer) and receiver (text consumer). The predominantly declarative and assertive grammatical mood presents most of the authors' commitments and representations of the world as factual statements and evaluations. The authors deny any justification in Islamic law for launching any kind of armed activity (Extract 130), and stress on the enforcement of the *Pakistan Penal Code* (Extract 131).

Extract 130 to 131. Assertive sentences
On the basis of such negligence there is no justification to declare personnel of the government, military or other security agencies as infidels. There is no justification in Shari'ah to launch any armed activity against them. (Section 4, p.42)
Sections 295-298 of Pakistan Penal Code shall be fully enforced in its letter and spirit through state institutions. (Section 4, p.44)

However, in certain places, the interrogative mode is used to evoke the attention of the readers by posing the text producers' evaluations and opinions as questions about the nature of the State (Extract 132), and the justification of armed rebellion against State authorities (Extract 133).

Extract 132 to 133. Interrogatives sentences
Whether Pakistan is an Islamic state or an un-Islamic state? Further, can a state be declared un-Islamic and its government and armed forces as non-Muslim if Shari'ah is not implemented in its entirety? (Section 5, p.52)
Under the given circumstances, is an armed rebellion against the government or army permissible, in the name of struggle for implementation of Shari'ah? (Section 5, p.52)

5.3.5. Relational Modality

While relational modality overlaps with expressive modality at quite a few instances, certain occurrences of relational modality are discernable by observing the authority claims (implicit or explicit) behind the signaling of permission or obligation. The text producers (particularly religious scholars) implicitly claim authority while warning that "educational institutions **must not** impart any hostile military education or training, hatred, extremism and violence" (Extract 65).

5.4. Relations of Equivalence and Difference Set Up in the Text

The use of classification schemes (Extract 1 to 56), indicates that two coetaneous logics are being generated throughout the PeP. One is the logic of equivalence which subverts difference, and the other is the logic of difference which creates difference between the various representations processes, institutions and individuals in the text.[101]

5.4.1. Processes

The process of *terrorism* and *violent extremism* (Extract 7 to 22), is repeatedly collocated with terms such as *use of force, armed escalation against the state, terrorist activities, heinous crimes, national crime, rebellion (baghawat), fasaad fi'l-Arz and hirabah.* This allows for building of relations of equivalence between the various terms by subverting possible divisions or

---

[101] Fairclough, *Analysing Discourse*, 88.

differences of meaning through creation of meaning inclusion or hyponymy. On the other hand, the term is contrasted with 'jihad' in order to highlight the difference.

5.4.2. Institutions and Individuals

Muslim(s) is repeatedly collocated with constructive processes such *support, assist, struggle, create,* and *implement.* This suggests that relations of equivalence are being established between the Muslim identity and constructive, positive actions (Extract 45 to 51).

Pakistan is constantly collocated with terms such *modern, liberal, democratic Islamic country.* This helps to create relations of equivalence between the different terms, and depict Pakistan as a country that encapsulates the features of Islam, modernism and democracy (Extracts 23 to 35). Any differences between modernism and Islam are subverted. According to the PeP, Islamic refers to following the Shari'ah, which is made synonymous with peaceful dialogue and practice, and not with conflict (Extract 141 to 142). However, it remains unclear, exactly what is entailed by modernism. Despite any possible differences in their meanings, the two are grouped and collocated together continuously throughout the text. In addition to collocation and relations of synonymy, the use of additive connectors (Extract 138 to 140), also helps create relations of equivalence between the Islamic legal system and the Pakistani legal system.

Relations of equivalence are also set up between modern, Islamic values, and the Pakistani society. It is associated with values such as *tolerance, equality and justice* (Extract 24, 26). Whereas relations of difference are set up between negative values such as "hatred, bigotry, intolerance" and what is aspired to as the ideal "Pakistani society." Consider the extract (134) below:

Extract 134. Pakistani society
Construction of *Pakistani society*, in the light of the Constitution of Pakistan is needed where the trends of *hatred, bigotry, intolerance and false accusation* are curbed and resultantly a society is formed that rejoices *tolerance, brotherhood, mutual* respect and offers a comprehensive system of justice. (Section 4, p.49-50)

5.5. Connective Value of Text

5.5.1. Connectors

The predominant semantic relations between sentences and clauses are causal and persuasive/ additive, with a few instances of contrastive/concessive.

Extract 135 to 137. Causal connectors
This civilization adopted the principle of revival and had no hesitation in accepting positive developments from other ancient civilizations. **Due** to deviation from the Islamic traditions, this civilization could not maintain its supremacy among the world civilizations and its downfall began. (Section 1, p.18)
Moreover, the five objectives of Shari 'ah also guarantee these fundamental rights. These rights include (1) preservation of life, (2) preservation of religion, (3) preservation of intellect, (4) preservation of progeny and (5) preservation of property. **Therefore**, any attack on innocent people that violates the above-mentioned ends of Shari'ah is prohibited and is a crime. (Section 3, p.39)
Thus the groups active against the state in the name of lingual, regional, religious and sectarian prejudices are all against the teachings of Shari'ah and are root cause of national disintegration. **Therefore**, it is imperative for the state institutions to take strict action against these groups. (Section 4, p.43)

Commenting on the Islamic Civilization (622 CE), the PeP states that the downfall of this civilization was "Due to deviation from Islamic traditions" (Extract 135). While elaborating upon the five basic human rights guaranteed by the Shari'ah, the PeP states that "any attack on innocent people" or a violation of these rights is prohibited and a crime (Extract 136). It similarly establishes extremist groups as violators of Shari'ah, and uses this reasoning to encourage state action against them (Extract 137).

Extract 138 to 140. Persuasive/ Additive connectors
This document is further improved after consultation with ulama of all the Wafaqs of Pakistan and faculty members of several prominent universities of Pakistan. **Moreover,** the joint declaration and the unanimous fatwa have also been made part of this document. (Preface, p. X)
This Objectives Resolution was made part of the Constitution with the consensus of all religious and political parties and remained part of every constitution from 1956 to 1973, and does exist as such in the current constitution. **Additionally,** Article 31 of the Constitution provides detailed policy principles to enable the Muslims of Pakistan to order their lives in accordance with the Islamic way of life. (Section 5, p.54)
Indeed Islamic Republic of Pakistan is an Islamic State according to its Constitution (Section 5, p.54)

The document stresses that the PeP incorporates the agreement of academic and religious authorities alike. *Moreover,* the two documents containing the agreement of all the different juristic schools of thought, constitute the basis of the document (Extract 138). This accentuates the validity of the PeP. The PeP commenting similarly on the Constitution of Pakistan, states that in addition to the Objectives Resolution, "Article 31 of the Constitution provides*"* the basis for Pakistani Muslims to pursue an Islamic life (Extract 139). It persuades the readers that the Islamic Constitution of Pakistan is "Indeed" the basis for Pakistan being an Islamic State (Extract 140).

Extract 141 to 143. Contrastive/concessive connectors
Tyranny, arrogance, oppression, intolerance and other such acts are evil and are declared prohibited in Islam. **Whereas,** humbleness, modesty, kindness, tolerance and other such attitudes are commendable and are declared Islamic moral values in accordance with the injunctions of Islam. (Section 1, p.14-15)
All schools of thought are permitted to propagate their doctrines, beliefs and juristic ideologies as per the Shari'ah. **However**, in accordance with the Islamic teachings and the law of land no one is permitted to speak or write against any person, institution or school of thought using insolence, hatred or baseless allegations. (Section 4, p.44)
One such example is 1973 Constitution that has "Objectives Resolution" as its preamble, a resolution that provides Islamic foundations to the Constitutions. **Apart from** this, "Islamic Provisions" have been made part of the Constitution. (Section 2, p.24)

These connectors contrast provisions of Islamic law with negative values such as tyranny and arrogance (Extract 141). Further, Islamic law and teachings are depicted as allowing diversity. But it is warned that difference of opinion should not be allowed to manifest as insolence and hatred (Extract 142). The PeP, comments on the Islamic nature of the Constitution of Pakistan, which "Apart from" the Objectives Resolutions, also contains "Islamic Provisions" (Extract 143). Together, these guarantee that the Constitution sufficiently incorporates the Islamic legal system into its substance.

5.5.2. Conjunctions

In addition to establishing cohesion, subordinating conjunctions help embed assumptions within the text.[102]In the PeP, several of such backgrounded assumptions, build a shared-sense for the readers about the nature of the institutions and processes discussed in the text. Assumptions backgrounded in the PeP address the Islamic nature of the Constitution, which is both *Islamic* and *liberal* (Extract 144). The PeP assumes that extremists carry out violent attacks "in order to take revenge" from their opponents (Extract 145). It further maintains that such groups justify violence against Pakistani authorities because the Government of Pakistan has "yet to implement Shari'ah in its entirety*"* (Extract 146). The PeP highlights the presence of religious rulings against such people who rebuke Muslim rulers and forces, "while they" are believers (Extract 147). To counter such notions, assumptions about the unlawfulness of these activities against the state, are also present in the PeP (Extract 148,149).

Extract 144 to 149. Subordinating conjunctions
The Constitution of 1973 ensures prosperity of Pakistan which is Islamic *as well as liberal in nature representing all segments of Pakistani society.* (Section 2, p.24)

---

[102] Fairclough, *Language and Power*, 146-147.

These days, in order to take revenge from one's opponent, extremists are conducting suicide attacks on innocent people and against general public.(Section 3, p.30)
In the name of implementation of Shari'ah, these groups allege that the Government of Pakistan and its armed forces are infidels and apostates *as they have yet to implement Shari'ah in its entirety*. (Section 5, p.52)
The Holy Qur'an, Hadith and Islamic fiqh provide ruling about the groups who start declaring Muslim rulers and personnel of armed forces as disbelievers merely due to their human shortcomings *while they believe in Oneness of God (tawhid) and the Prophethood of Muhammad (risalat)*.(Section 5, pp.61-62)
In light of the above-mentioned Qur'anic verse, Muslim jurists do not justify every type of war, they specifically warn against waging war only to gain power, *as terrorists are doing nowadays, even though they bring farfetched religious arguments in support of their actions*. (Section 3, p.35-36)
In their opinion, *if a group challenges the writ of the government*, that group is also committing the crime of hirabah and is liable to the same punishment that is mentioned in the Holy Qur'an. (Section 3, p.28)

Chapter 6: Intertextual Analysis (Meso Level) and Contextual Analysis (Macro Level)

Overview

This chapter commences the second stage of the textual analysis. This intertextual (meso level) analysis explores the assumptions and values embedded into the PeP. Additionally, it elucidates the coherence (local and global), interdiscursivity and intertextuality of the PeP. It also identities the links between the PeP and the social context in which it operates. Following this, the chapter progresses to the contextual (macro level) analysis and examines the PeP discourse as part of the wider social structures and processes. It elaborates not only the "social determination of language use but also the linguistic determination of society"[103] which has shaped the PeP. In this regard, it looks at the various social relations of power and processes of struggle, which have shaped the PeP.

6.1. Assumptions Embedded in the Text

Most of the assumptions made in the PeP are ideological in nature because they promote a particular worldview and philosophy about the nature of Pakistan, the Pakistani society, terrorism and the role of the State in dealing with it. The text also promotes certain assumptions about its own existence, which form the basis for it to draw authority and legitimacy. Such assumptions work to establish a collective-sense which may in reality, be at odds with the collective-sense of the readers (about the various representations in the text). These assumptions have been divided into existential (what exists), propositional (what is, can, or will be the case), and value assumptions (what is good or desirable).[104] The existential assumptions made about the

---

[103] Fairclough, *Language and Power*, 53.
[104] Fairclough, *Analysing Discourse*,55.

PeP as being a product of consensus, attempt to enforce the idea that the document itself is not a site of struggle or regulation, but is merely a summary of the *collective* and unproblematic thinking of the various-religious, government and academic-authorities, and the general public (Extract 150 to152).

Extract 150 to 152. Existential Assumptions
This unanimously agreed document reflects the collective thinking of the State of Pakistan. (Preface, p.IX)
The Message identifies the problems faced by the State of Pakistan and provides basis to devise a strategy to achieve the goals of Objectives Resolution. (Preface, p.IX)
This consensus based document shall be helpful to reconstruct Pakistani society whose core values are tolerance, spirituality, justice, equality and balance in fulfilling rights and obligations. (Preface, p.IX)

The propositional assumptions about the *Pakistani society* imply at the same time that Pakistan is a country that follows Islamic values, and suggest the further need for implementing Islamic values in the country (Extract 153 to 155). The PeP also assumes that the objective of the country's educational institutions "is enlightenment, schooling and character building" (Extract 156).

Extract 153 to 156. Propositional Assumptions
Reconstruction of Pakistani society demands that Pakistanis neither demean other religions nor humiliate the founders of other religions. (Section 1, p.12)
it is imperative to revive Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him) as per the guidance of an Islamic State. This revival shall strengthen the ideological foundation of Pakistan. (Section1, p.18)
Since 95% laws of the country are already Islamic, therefore, declaring Pakistani laws un-Islamic shall not only be misleading but also is a proof of their ignorance of the Constitution. (Section 2, p.25)
The core objective of all the educational institutions in Pakistan is enlightenment, schooling and character building. (Section4, p.43)

The value assumptions indicate the role of the state and administration as perceived by the text producers. The text producers express the obligations the State and its institutions need to fulfill, through the use of *should* (Extract 157, 158). The PeP also expresses the desirable conditions for the declaration of *qital* (Extract 72). Similarly, it suggests that extremist tendencies must be "rooted out" for the stability of the country (Extract 93), and that the government should take "all possible measures" towards this end (Extract 84).

Extract 157 to 159. Value Assumptions
To curtail such tendencies, the state *should* use its powers to eliminate these elements and maintain social harmony and juristic diversity. (Section 3, p.32)
Arrangements *should* be made to use the occasion of Friday sermon for the welfare of the society and to promote high moral values. (Section 3, p.32)
It is imperative to take administrative steps and do intellectual jihad against extremist mindset. (Section4, p.44)

6.2. Coherence

The overall coherence of the PeP can be judged from its local and global coherence.

6.2.1. Local Coherence

Local coherence alludes to the local relations within particular parts of a text. This form of coherence can be illustrated from the *cohesion* within a text (connective value of text, Extract 135 to 149). Local coherence can be additionally adduced from the implicit assumptions made within the text. The PeP contains a host of such assumptions which can be observed in the usage of conjunctions which subordinate and background certain information (in addition to the previously identified existential, propositional and value assumptions). Assumptions made about the PeP create coherence amongst several parts of the text, which presuppose the authority of the document because it is "unanimously agreed" upon (Extract 99). Similarly, propositional

assumptions made about the Islamic nature and legal system of Pakistan occur throughout the text and produce coherence. Similar is the case with value assumptions made about the role of the state and its institutions which provide coherence in the text, and enable it to lay down further provisions.

Coherence is also observable in the repeated use of certain metaphorical expressions. Metaphors of foundations, building and construction are used throughout the text to represent Islam, state and society. Similarly, metaphors of natural phenomena are used to represent terrorism and extremism (Extract 93 to 95). Such metaphors help create coherence in the text with regards to the various themes and representations it addresses.

6.2.2. Global Coherence

Global coherence draws from local coherence and helps uncover the 'point' of a text. It further looks at the overall cohesion and larger-scale structures of the text. Inquiry into the local coherence of the text reveals that it contains elements of cohesion and coherence within different parts of the text, and is closely textured[105] due to clustered ties between textual features such as reference, collocation, repetition and conjunctions. Similarly, repeated patterns of metaphors and assumptions create coherence, not just within individual parts of the text, but also *between* different parts.

Following a narrative structure, the PeP has adopted a storytelling method in the first few sections, where it explicates the history of Islam and Pakistan. Additionally, it has followed a cause/ effect and problem/solution style of writing. The first three sections build a historical narrative around the progression of Islam as a religion and the resulting Islamic polities.

---

[105] Michael Alexander Kirkwood Halliday and Ruqaiya Hasan, *Cohesion in English* (London: Longman Group Ltd., 1976), 296.

Following this, the fourth section narrates the history of Pakistan and the challenges faced by the state, and transitions to legal provisions. The fifth section elaborates further on such legal provisions by comparing and equating them with religious provisions; it is organized in the form of a declaration and fatwa.

While such transition between the text's various sections may seem seamless at first, specific arguments of the text are in fact quite problematic. At such instances, the PeP reveals its discrepancies and disfunctioning. While addressing the Islamic Civilization, the PeP tries to establish its greatness by suggesting that it was a diverse civilization which assimilated *positive developments from other civilizations.* However, the PeP then goes on to suggest that it was *due to deviation from Islamic values,* that this civilization dissipated (Extract 135).

Comparably, while the document repeatedly stresses upon the Islamic nature of the State, it also implies that the failure of the State to act in conjunction with Islamic values should not be a cause for declaring it un-Islamic (Extract 160). An apparent statement in defense, therefore, acts as a refutation of the claims of the document.

Extract 160.
Based upon the foregoing, Pakistan, without any doubt, is an Islamic State and merely due to some functional issues, declaring the country, its government or its armed forces as infidel is not permissible, rather it is a sin. (Section 5, p.55)

6.3. Interdiscursivity (Orders of Discourse)

The counter-narrative is a part of the larger genre chain of the anti-VE/T discourse. However, it cuts across the several modes and genres of discourse and draws upon several discourse conventions (legal and religious discourses, genres, styles) in order to establish its own new order of discourse. Resultantly, it is hortatory expository because it delivers information and

instructions about the issue of VE/T, and recommends certain values and behaviors to the readers; it is also a narrative (by explicit admission and) by the way it constructs a story for the readers. Additionally, it is argumentative in that it simultaneously draws upon religious and legal texts to build its arguments for and against certain representations of institutions and subjects. Therefore, several genres and styles of writing can be seen at work within the text; it acts as a national policy document, a religious text and a legal text. It, therefore, possesses a high degree of interdiscursivity.

6.4. Mediation of Difference

The PeP mediates and accentuates difference throughout its text by drawing upon religious texts such as Ahadith and Qur'anic verses. In addition, it represents the religious scholars of various denominations as being one-voiced in the definition of such terms. Since these representations lie at the interpolation of both the political and religious spheres, the PeP draws simultaneously upon legal texts such as the Treaty of Madinah and the more contemporary constitutions of Pakistan and its Penal code. PeP's representations constitute a site of struggle between the major subjects- state authority and what it regards as rebels or *Kharijites*- and revolve around the struggle over definition and meaning of the main themes addressed in the text. This struggle over meaning ultimately translates into a struggle over power (of representation and thus ideology).

The PeP tries to mediate difference over the religious and legal representations, by establishing relations of equivalence between the definitions of the various legal and religious sources it draws upon, by pushing forward its own representations (and in the process, assigning discursive power to the subjects such as the leadership of the State and the religious scholars). Contrastingly, differences over definitions and representations of such terms as *jihad* and *violence* are accentuated where the PeP highlights the difference between its own definitions and

74

those of the anti-state elements. In such cases, the PeP accentuates the difference between the representations of its own text (and by extension, of the state authorities and scholars) and that of the *rebels*. PeP draws legitimacy from (reference-based) evidence and consensus-building amongst the various religious and legal discourses.

6.5. Intertextuality and Traces of Struggle

The PeP embodies a high degree of intertextuality. In addition to directly quoting the Qur'an (37 times) and Ahadith (3 times), the PeP provides the exegesis of several Qur'anic verses and Shari'ah rulings (Extract 136). It also makes use of several borrowed terms from the Shari'ah law. Elements of several other legal texts, such as the Treaty of Medina, Objectives Resolution 1949, and the Constitutions of 1956, 1962 and 1973 and Pakistan Penal Code, are also referenced in several places. Additionally, it also refers to International Law. These *other voices* are used to lend support to the arguments of the text surrounding the central themes such as jihad, violence and Shari'ah rulings. Some of the examples and occurrences of such intertextuality are provided below (Extract 161 166):

Extract 161 to 166. Intertextuality
Thus, the Qur'an and Sunnah, the Treaty of Medina and the last sermon of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him) provide us ample examples from Islamic injunctions about Islamic doctrines, payers, ideology, society and interaction among the human beings. (Section 1, p.17)
Rights of Muslims and non-Muslims are guaranteed in the Objectives Resolution and it had been decided that all citizens of Pakistan shall enjoy equal status and everyone should have equal opportunities to excel and progress. Social, economic and political opportunities shall also be provided on equal grounds without any discrimination and everyone shall be equal before the law. (Section 2, p.23-24)
Not only this, but in the Constitutions of 1956, 1962 and 1973 the country was named "Islamic Republic" and it was declared that no law shall be enacted against the teachings of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah. (Section 2, p.25)
Such cruel and inhumane attacks started in 1789 during French revolution but in 1973 they were declared crime as per International Law. (Section 3, p.31)

Sections 295-298 of Pakistan Penal Code shall be fully enforced in its letter and spirit through state institutions. The law shall take its course against anyone who by words, either spoken or written, or by visible representation or by any imputation, innuendo, or insinuation, directly or indirectly, defiles the sacred names of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him), the other Holy prophets (peace be upon them), any wives (Umm ul-Mu'mineen), or members of the family (Ahl-ebayt), of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him), or any of the righteous Caliphs (Khulafa-e-Rashideen) or Companions (Sahaaba) of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him) and Islamic spheres.(Section 4, p.44-45)
The same ruling is mentioned in Surah al-Hujurat where Allah, the Almighty says "then fight ye (all) against the one that transgresses until it complies with the command of Allah;" (Qur'an 49:9). One form of "exile from the land" is to put the offender in jail. (Section 5, p.63)

Borrowed words also indicate reference to Shari'ah:

Extract 167 to 173. Borrowed words
hirabah (waging war against society). (Section 3, p.27; p.28; p.31)
qital (Section 3, p.34)
Farz kifayah (Section 3, p.34)
institutions of muwakhat and mu'amlat (Section 3, p.36)
HARAM (Section5, p.55; p.60; p.66; p.67)
mischief on the earth i.e. "fasaad fi'l-Arz" (Section 5, p.56; p.61)
ta 'zir (Section 5, p.67)

In addition to texts supportive of the PeP's argument, oppositional texts are also drawn upon and reformulated throughout the document. Consider the following example of extremists' narrative which the PeP addresses:

Extract 174.
The youth is usually misled by the anti-state elements by deluding them that governing system of Pakistan is un- Islamic and constitution of Pakistan is not in accordance with the teachings of Islam. This awry thought is farfetched from the reality. (Section 2, p. 24-25)

This reformulation of an oppositional discourse indicates one of the instances of the textual trace of struggle between the text producers and their opponents (Extract 174). Other instances of textual struggle are indicated by emphatic assertions on part of the text producers (Extract 175). The word HARAM is stressed by way of capitalization in a number of places throughout the text.

Extract 175.
Use of force to impose Shari'ah in Pakistan, armed struggle against the Pakistani state and all other forms of terrorist activities to which our country is confronted with are "HARAM" and forbidden under the Islamic laws. (Section 5, p.66).

6.6. Values and Truths Built into the Text

The values and truths built into the text can be extrapolated from the modalities (section 5.2.1 to 5.2.2, Extract 69 to 86) and assumptions (section 6.1, Extract 150 to 159) within the text. Modalities indicate the text producers' commitment to certain beliefs and truths in their representation of the world, while assumptions systematically build a collective-sense through the backgrounding of certain information. Both of these classify existing subjects, processes and institutions, according to their own particular representations, or make a case (implicitly and explicitly), for what should ideally happen or is deemed desirable; in this sense, the two can be seen as ideological.

The text addresses the kinds of activities which constitute as a legitimate and illegitimate use of force; the characteristics of Muslim rulers; duties and rights of Pakistani citizens; the role of religious scholars; legal provisions from the Constitution and Qur'an; and the current and desirable future role of the Pakistani state and society. In this regard, the text attaches central

importance to Islamic and democratic values. The text explicitly stresses on values of equality, justice and tolerance, whereas aggression and conflict are criminated.

6.7. Context and Discourse Type

6.7.1. Situational and Intertextual Context

The *situational context*[106] is determined by the environment of the discourse together with the discourse participants, and the relations between such discourse participants. The contents of the PeP are determined by the activity type, which is exchange of a narrative/policy document between state authorities and the general public of Pakistan; the topic is the communication of national counter violent extremism and terrorism policy to the general public, and the purpose namely, communication and awareness building on the topics of the document.

The main subjects as identified earlier are the discourse producers and consumers. However, these can be further classified by their roles and domains; subject positions for the text producers include research scholars, religious scholars, academicians, politicians and national leaders, while the subject positions for text consumers include the general public which can be further divided into religious followers of certain religion or sect, different ethnic groups and different class groups etc. The audience or text consumers therefore belongs to diverse social, political, economic and ethnoreligious groups. While it is only commonsensical that text producers are aware of such heterogeneity of the audience, the language of the PeP suggests that it assumes an unvaried readership, or assumes that its message can in fact cut across such divides. The discourse is seen as an extension of national policy, aimed at the readers or the general public, as

---

[106] This research retains a greater focus on the *context or social conditions of production* of the PeP, in comparison with the context or social conditions of interpretation. Also refer to
Fairclough, *Language and Power,* 57-59.

facilitated and mobilized by the medium of print media. This provides an understanding of why the narrative-as-policy assumes an unvaried 'general public' readership.

In this vein, it is also assumed on the part of the text producers that this general public is situated in a particular *intertextual context*. What this means is that the- religious and legal- texts referred to within the PeP are assumed to be common ground or common knowledge for the members of the general public. This assumption leads the producers of the text to formulate the discourse(PeP) in a certain way, and dictates the choices to foreground and background certain kinds of knowledge and information. Such assumptions, in addition to texts supportive of the PeP's arguments, also dictate how oppositional discourses are drawn upon (section 6.5, Extract 161 to 175). The role played by language in building connections within the text (section 6.2) is evident in the use of particular genres (the narrative form), and the channels of communication (written). Such a genre and channel of communication are employed in order to provide complete control to the text producers, who mediate and control the discourse, since language is being used to provide information about certain processes, events and entities such as State, Muslim and rebels etc. This role of language is instrumental in achieving the goals of the discourse which aims to communicate and establish certain representations as part of the wider collective-sense.

6.8. Mismatches Between Subject Position of the Text Producers, Text Consumers and Their Social Relationship

The position of the producers is problematic with regards to the subject matter of the discourse. This is so because there is a considerable discrepancy between the text producers' collective-sense representations of the world and the reality. The first discrepancy arises in the representation of Pakistan as a modern, democratic and Islamic state. Such a representation

cannot possibly constitute the collective-sense for all of the inhabitants of the state; while some may consider Pakistan to be an Islamic state, others may not. Similarly, by constantly collocating modern with Islamic, the text producers feel the need to reinforce the presence of the 'modern' which makes Islam by itself appear archaic and in need of modernization. This leads to the second aspect in which the text producers' position is problematic, with regards to the subject positions and social identity of the text consumers.

The text tries to create a commonality of ideology amongst the different sections of the population. It is on the basis of such a commonality of ideology that it tries to appeal to the loyalty of the text consumers. This is problematic because as pointed out earlier, while the text may assume a homogeneity amongst the text consumers, this is not the case. Pakistan comprises of heterogeneous populations in terms of religious beliefs, ethnicities and economic classes. Such diverse populations hold different subjective views of religion and related phenomena. This suggests a disagreement over representations of, for e.g., Pakistan, which is represented as simultaneously being a modern and Islamic state. This attempt at bridging the gap between the Islamic and the modern, in fact, acknowledges the disagreement over interpretations and hence a breakdown and destabilization of the existing discourse conventions (which functioned on widely shared representations).

This destabilization of shared representations is also evident from the degree of interdiscursivity of the text. The PeP, instead of simply narrating existing truths or representations, prompts the readers (Extract 132, 133) to think about the nature and identity of the State as Islamic. On other occasions, it asserts certain representations (Extract 130, 153-156). The PeP also draws upon legal texts in order to reassert certain representations of the state and citizen (Extract 162 to 166). Several different types of familiar discourses, such as the historical narrative of Islam and the

subcontinent, the Objectives Resolution, the 1973 Constitution and the Penal code are restructured and re-contextualized in certain combinations to establish a particular narrative, with particular representations.

Such recontextualization (and representation) also dictates certain implicatures of the type of social relationship that exists between the text producers and consumers. The strategic use of pronouns such as *We* and *Us* uncover the relationships built into the text. The use of *We* is made in places where the text wishes to communicate the solidarity between the religious scholars. It is also used as a way to communicate their religious authority (flowing from their solidarity) which enables them to pass judgements and issue the declaration and *fatwa.* Similarly, the use of *Us* and *Our,* communicates joint ownership and responsibility of the society and country between the text producers and consumers. These pronouns act to bridge distinction and build social relationships of inclusiveness. In most cases then, the PeP's identificational meanings-its representations of social identities-are in the form of collectivities.

6.9. Social Determinants and Effects of Discourse

The PeP can be seen in a dialectical relationship with the institutional, societal and situational structures and processes between the different discourse participants. These discourse participants comprise of both active (those involved in shaping the discourse) and passive (not directly involved in shaping the discourse) participants. The passive participants are generally the audience or text consumers, who view the discourse as a finished product and not as a real-time exchange between themselves and the text producers. The text producers retain control over the discourse and its elements and comprise mostly of different levels of state, religious and academic authorities. The following elaboration discusses the institutional, societal and situational matrices individually for the PeP.

6.9.1. Institutional Level

The institutional matrix of the PeP cuts across several *structures*; it has been ideologically determined by the collaboration between the religious authorities (CII), and the academic/educational authorities like the HEC and the Islamic Research Institute under the International Islamic University. Further involved, are the different religious institutions such as Madaris etc., different media institutions such as the publishers and distributors, and political parties and political institutions, all of which are overseen by the national government of Pakistan. *Institutional processes* which are determinant of the discourse comprise of the struggle of interpretation between the above mentioned institutional structures. The discourse constitutes the site of such struggle in terms of the authority to define the identity of Pakistan and legal/religious provisions related to VE/T. This institutional struggle is mediated by the final authority of the national government through consensus building over such diverse interpretations and opinions. While such institutional structures determine the discourse, the discourse also contributes to the ideological determination of such institutional structures and processes. It creates the precedence of the state as a political institution which is superior to all others, not just in the production of discourse, but also as represented in the discourse. Religious and academic institutions are established in a supportive role to the state and its law-making organs. The final authority and prerogative of decision making and punishment are attributed to the state, which is also decidedly the ultimate recipient of individual and group loyalty.

6.9.2. Societal Level

The societal matrix for the PeP comprises of the social relations between the state and its citizens. At the societal level, the discourse is ideologically determined by the *structures* that exist between state authorities (the rulers) and their subjects (the ruled), which are the general

public/citizens. The discourse is decided by the consensus-building authority of the national government, which is the final state authority. The hegemony of the state authorities thus dictates the controlled production of the discourse and representations approved by them. The societal *process* here thus is the regulation of relations between the state and citizen.

In turn, the discourse is ideologically determinative of social structures because it affects the existing dynamics of the state authority in relation to the general public. It not only reconstructs the social identity of the Pakistani citizens (as an ideally homogenous and Muslim identity), but also prescribes the roles and responsibility of the citizens, academic institutions, armed forces, religious authorities and state authorities in relation to each other. In this respect, the text (re)establishes a social relationship based on religiously guided (and thus legitimate) leadership which exists in both solidarity and authority to the Pakistani citizen.

6.9.3. Situational Level

The *situational matrix* for this discourse comprises of the *process* of struggle and relations between the state and non-state authorities; it is a struggle over establishing dominance in terms of the discursive (and actual) representations of political and religious themes surrounding state and jihad. The discourse is ideologically determined by the *situational relations of power* that exist between the state and non/anti-state elements. The changing nature of such relations, which is the growing support for the latter's authority and the shrinking gap between the relative support for the two,[107] is what prompted the production and subject matter of the discourse. The discourse then, attempts to determine these relations by criminating and subjugating non/anti-state elements and reinforcing the authority of the state.

---

[107] See f.i. Khalid Aziz, *Swat: The Main Causes of the Breakdown of Governance and Rise of Militancy* (Norway: Norwegian Institute for International Affairs (NUPI), 2010).

Hence the discourse is a product of the process of struggle between the state and non-state actors. The discourse is the result of the struggle to negate the representations of non-state actors (terrorists and violent extremist) and entrench the definitions and categorizations of such representations as decided by the state. Further, diverse religious and political authorities (under the guidance of, and in collaboration with the state authorities) are engaged in a struggle of representations of religious concepts like holy war or jihad, and political and institutional entities such as the armed forces and the state of Pakistan.

The discourse is also determinative of the social struggle between the state and non-state actors, since tries to promote the representations of the state authorities over the non/anti-state elements. It attempts to establish the discursive precedence of the former, by promoting its representations over those of the non-state elements.

6.10. Discourse in Relation to Representations

The representations generated in the PeP are categorically classified according to Islamic teachings. However, because the discourse operates in a problematic situation (whereby it is attempting to bridge the differences in representations of the discourse participants), it transforms the representations it draws upon, by invoking various kinds of discourses, and in the process, establishing a *new order of discourse*; a narrative/policy/pedagogical text as determined by a political and religious social hierarchy. The PeP is therefore in *creative relations* to these representations. For instance, *terrorist activities* (as they are common sensibly known) constitute the *use of violence* and *armed escalation*. However, the PeP categorizes them additionally as *hirabah* and *Haram,* thereby introducing a religious side.

Additionally, these representations are aimed at establishing particular social and power hierarchies which work to (re)establish and sustain certain power relations, and overcome certain

social struggles between competing forces. Hence most of such representations possess an ideological character because the assumptions about social identities (Muslim, Pakistani), relations(state/citizen), society (Muslim/Pakistani society) and culture (Islamic culture) are determined by the power relations in the country, and contribute to the struggle to transform some, and reinforce other power relations. The PeP, consequently, reproduces its own social determinants (state authorities' ascendency) while also transforming them (recalibrating power between state and non/anti-state elements).

Chapter 7: Discussion and Conclusions

The thesis has made a case for introducing deconstructive and critical practices to the study of counter-narratives. It has specifically studied Pakistan's counter-narrative, the Paigham-e-Pakistan. It has drafted an *explanatory critique* focused on the *micro-meso-macro* levels of analysis, which inform a thorough textual (linguistic and intertextual), and contextual analysis. This has allowed a scrutiny of the formal features of the PeP which fulfill the aims of the discourse as a counter-narrative, and situate it in the wider discourse-social nexus. In addition to drawing out the underlying assumptions and value systems within the PeP, this analysis has focused on the discursive representations which carry forward the central arguments of the PeP in the delegitimization and demystification of extremist/terrorist narratives. The PeP lies at the nexus of complex institutional, societal and situational processes and structures, which exist in dialectical relations, and are both *determinative of,* and *determined by* the discourse of the PeP.

These complex structures and processes cut across various religious, political, legal and academic fields, and are affected primarily by a struggle over meaning-making and the regulation of certain norms. The social structures (relations of power) at the national level, have determined the production of the discourse, which has travelled from the top-down; the authorities at the national level have dictated the production of the PeP. This discourse is also the product of an overt struggle for dominance between the state and non-state authorities.

As a result, the PeP has attempted to affect the existing relations of power by reasserting state supremacy. Broadly, this has involved the discursive maintenance of the state (political and religious) authorities' ascendancy through the control over the construction of representations, and the depiction of such state supremacy in the discourse (via discursive representations).

These representations are taken to be the units of categorization and reference for various social entities (individuals, organizations and institutions), events and processes. The main representations addressed in the research are *Muslim, State, Pakistan, Pakistani, Jihad, Extremists, Islam and Islamic,* which have been distilled from the broad themes of the legitimacy of violence in religion, the legitimacy of violence against the state (due to real or perceived inadequacies in implementation of Shari'ah), and the various forms of violent extremism, including the ones against religious minorities and different sectarian denominations.

The PeP, in (re)constructing these representations, links them together as different parts of a singular system of values and beliefs, which based on the religious and legal provisions, become mutually defined and mutually inclusive. The PeP has attempted to build a collective-sense underlying these representations, by invoking what is believed to be the widespread consensus and acceptance of homogenous religious values. In this sense, the PeP is not only a product of the hegemony of certain value-systems, but also manifests and generates further inequalities through its representations.

Concurrently, despite (apparently) being highly intertextual, and establishing a new order of discourse (legal and religious, pedagogical narrative), the PeP consists of repetitive assumptions and representations. This undermines its attempts becoming an intertextually inclusive discourse. It makes assumptions about the nature and role of individuals and state institutions such as the *Muslim rulers of the state, the armed forces* and the *religious scholars.* These assumptions are cued by rhetorical arguments which stress on religion primarily, and law (derived from religion) secondarily, being the defining factors of the *Islamicness* of the various representations. Especially pertinent in this regard is the representation of the Pakistani state as an Islamic state, which is the basis for convicting opposition to it.

Such discursive representations address a diverse context, where their acceptance or rejection is influenced by complex subjective factors. This context indicates that in addition to the categorizations of entities, the manifestations of violent extremism identified in the text are not exhaustive. Neither are the causes attributed to these. For instance, while sectarian violence is motivated by violent ideologies, these violent ideologies are just one dimension of the host of complicated factors (for instance grievance), which fuel sectarianism. Similarly, the PeP attempts the binary categorization of especially Muslims and Pakistani citizens, who are supplied religiously defined roles and duties, without due regard to what rights these citizens have over their state. Similarly, the categorization of Pakistanis as primarily Muslims also subverts the existing differences and heterogeneity of the nation. Since the role of the PeP is to educate the masses and convince them to halt support for extremist ideologies, it must present arguments based on reality which can resonate with the citizens. In this sense, merely insisting upon the religious precedents is surely insufficient.

Correspondingly then, it is also necessary for the counter-narrative to appeal to the audience based on some credibility, or at least present a true picture of, and address the major causes and drivers of such violence. The inability to sufficiently address the underlying civil and political issues, and the repetition of (religiously defined) assumptions, suggests an absence of certain dialogicality from the text; the site of the extremist narratives is haunted not just by the shrewd definitions of religious concepts, but also by an acute manipulation of non-religious lines of contention between the state and its disgruntled citizens. As a result of this absence of dialogicality, the representations in the PeP lack the necessary depth and meanings which can build consensus.

Additionally, the repetitive metaphors likening the state to a building or structure aim to reinforce the idea that the citizens are part of a nation which must work and strive together for the construction and development of their country. Nevertheless, legitimacy does not come from metaphors but concrete realities. The analysis also uncovers that the narrative appears to contest itself in several places, thereby revealing the moments of *unbuilding* within the text. Foremost of these is the failure of the document to live up to its own claim, which states: "The Message identifies the problems faced by the State of Pakistan and provides basis to devise a strategy to achieve the goals of Objectives Resolution."[108]

As argued above, the Message has failed to adequately account for the problems faced by the State of Pakistan. Other contentions in the PeP are attached with the definition and categorization of Pakistan as an Islamic state and its rulers as *true* Muslim rulers. While the PeP dictates obedience to the state based on its Islamic identity, it reveals in several places that the failure of the state to act in accordance with Islamic teachings, does not warrant rebellion. This reveals a flux, in not just the discursive representations, but the existence as such, of a truly Islamic state, thus undermining the PeP's message.

While the discourse may make magnanimous claims, the Islamic socio-political identity of the state and its institutions can only be achieved through a continuous process of conscious struggle. However, this struggle must be visible from the actions of the state and not just its discourses. Narratives, which try to build legitimacy through rhetoric and metaphor appear particularly faltering in the face of the social, economic and political realities of the country which demand sustainable policy solutions more than rhetorical historical narratives.

---

[108] *Paigham-e-Pakistan*, p. IX.

It must be realized, that the true spirit of the Islamic culture is based on inductive reasoning and concrete knowledge, instead of mere speculation and theoretical claims. In this respect, the individual must be the focus of the state (in terms of welfare and strengthening of state's social contract with the individual citizen), in order for the state or its narratives to hold *true* legitimacy in the eyes of the citizens. The stress, therefore, must not be on building a social order with weak and dubious foundations, but on strengthening the individuals through concrete policies and reforms since mere "false reverence for past history and its artificial resurrection constitute no remedy for a people's decay."[109]

In conclusion, the present research has explicated two main courses of criticism; the first problem lies within the discourse's textual features which reveal several contradictions. The second problem manifests in the inability of the discursive representations built into the text, to sufficiently address their context. It is suggested that instead of addressing the multi-dimensional causes of VE/T in Pakistan, the PeP merely propagates the discursive dominance of rhetorical notions. It is proposed that discourses which do not adequately acknowledge their context only appear as unconvincing arguments, and not as realistic narratives or believable visions for the future.

The purpose of this critical deconstructive endeavour has not been merely to denigrate the counter-narrative realized in the form of PeP. Instead, this inquiry attempts to illustrate that there is much room for improvement which must be addressed to increase the efficacy of the PeP in dealing with the country's problems of VE/T (at least discursively). However, this research is by no means exhaustive and can be expanded further to inform more detailed textual and contextual

---

[109] Muhammad Iqbal, *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam,* ed. M. Saeed Sheikh (Pakistan, Lahore: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, 2011), 120.

analyses which can generate increased understanding, and help reform counter-narrative practices. This is especially warranted in the case of Pakistan which has always struggled with competing narratives and is most prone to violent outbreaks in the face of multifarious fault lines.

APPENDIX A

(Micro)

(With regards to vocabulary)

- What experiential, relational and expressive values do words have?

- What metaphors are used?

(With regards to Grammar)

- What experiential, relational and expressive values do grammatical features have?

- Is the agency clear or unclear?

- Are causality and responsibility clear or unclear?

- Are sentences negative or positive?

- Are there instances of grammatical metaphor?

- What forms of modalities are used?

- What do authors commit themselves to in terms of truth (epistemic modalities)?

- Or in terms of obligation and necessity (deontic modalities)?

(The above outlined questions related to modality account for both relational and expressive modalities since these two are indicated by similar modal auxiliaries.)

What connective values do formal features of text have?

- What are the predominant semantic relations between sentences and clauses (causal – reason, consequence, purpose; conditional; temporal; additive; elaborative; contrastive/concessive)?

- What logical connectors are used?

- Are there higher-level semantic relations over more extensive stretches of the text (e.g. problem-solution)?

- Are particularly significant relations of equivalence and difference set up in the text?

- What is the predominant grammatical mood (declarative, interrogative, imperative)?

(Meso)

Coherence

- What are the markers and features of local coherence?

- What are the markers and features of global coherence?

Difference

- How does the text realize or mediate difference, struggle over meaning, norms, power and other inequalities between the major subjects?

Intertextuality and interdiscursivity

- What discourses/styles/genres are drawn upon in the text, and how are they textured together?

- Is there a significant mixing of discourses?

- Of the other relevant texts/voices, which are included, which are significantly excluded?

- How are other voices textured in relation to the authorial voice, and in relation to each other?

- What are the features that characterize the discourses/styles/genres which are drawn upon (semantic relations between words, collocations, metaphors, assumptions, grammatical features)?

Assumptions

- What existential, propositional, or value assumptions are made? Can these assumptions be seen as ideological?

- To what values (in terms of what is desirable or undesirable) do authors commit themselves?

Problematizing producers position

- Are there any struggles for the discourse producer(s) in the process of production, due to mismatches between the subject positions of text producers, consumers and their social relations?

(Macro)

- What institutional, societal and situational processes does this discourse belong to, and how is it ideologically determined and ideologically determinative?

- What power relations at the situational, institutional and societal levels help shape this discourse?

- How is this discourse positioned in relation to (overt/covert) struggles at the situational, institutional and societal levels?

- Does it contribute to sustaining existing power relations, or transforming them?

- Was the text successful in addressing the problems it originally set out to address?

- How well does the text resonate with the social context which it aimed to address?

- In addition to those present, what elements (concerned with the social context) are absent from the text, and how do they affect the discourse?

REFERENCES

Abbott, H. Porter. *The Cambridge Introduction to Narrative.* 2nd ed. UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

Ahmed, Khaled. *Sectarian war: Pakistan's Sunni-Shia Violence and its Links to the Middle East.* Pakistan: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Al-Haq, Fawwaz Al-Abed and Nazek Mahmoud Al-Sleibi. "A Critical Discourse Analysis of Three Speeches of King Abdullah II." *US-China Foreign Language* 13, no. 5 (2015): 317-332.

Al-Momani, Hassan. "Political Discourse of Jordan: A Critical Discourse Analysis." *International Journal of English Linguistics* 7, no.2 (2017):90-98.

Andrews, Molly. "Opening to the Original Contributions: Counter-narratives and the Power to Oppose." In *Considering Counter-Narratives: Narrating, Resisting, Making Sense,* edited by. Michael Bamberg and Molly Andrews,1-6. The Netherlands: John Benjamins Publishing Company,2004.

Anis, Elis Zuliati. "Countering Terrorist Narratives: Winning the Hearts and Minds of Indonesian Millennials." *KnE Social Sciences* (2018): 189-210.

Archetti, Cristina, ed. "Terrorism, Communication, and the Media." In *Understanding Terrorism in the Age of Global Media*. Palgrave Macmillan: London, 2013.

Aziz, Khalid. *Swat: The Main Causes of the Breakdown of Governance and Rise of Militancy*. Norway: Norwegian Institute for International Affairs (NUPI), 2010.

Baig, Mukarram. "FATF and Pakistan." *News*, February 16,2020. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/614777-

Bercovitch, Sacvan. "Deconstruction and Poststructuralism." In *The Cambridge History of American Literature,* 354–388. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,1996.

Biesta, Gert. "Chapter 4: From Critique to Deconstruction: Derrida as A Critical Philosopher." *Counterpoints* 323 (2009): 81-95.

Bloom, Mia, John Horgan and Charlie Winter. "Depictions of Children and Youth in the Islamic State's Martyrdom Propaganda, 2015–2016." *CTC-SENTINEL* 9, no. 2 (2016): 29-32.

Braddock, Kurt, and John Horgan. "Towards A Guide for Constructing and Disseminating Counternarratives to Reduce Support for Terrorism." *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 39, no. 5 (2016): 381-404.

Bredin, Hugh. "Sign and Value in Saussure." *Philosophy* 59, no. 227 (1984): 67-77.

http://www.jstor.org/stable/3750695

Breeze, Ruth. "Critical Discourse Analysis and Its Critics." *Pragmatics* 21, no. 4 (December 2011): 493-525. doi: 10.1075/prag.21.4.01bre

Caballero-Mengíbar, Ana. "Critical Discourse Analysis in The Study of Representation, Identity Politics and Power Relations: A Multi-Method Approach." *Communication & Society* 28, no. 2(2015): 39-54.

Caputo**,** John D., ed. *Deconstruction in A Nutshell: A Conversation with Jacques Derrida*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1997.

Calvert, John. *Sayyid Qutb and The Origins of Radical Islamism*.UK: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., 2018.

Cassinger, Cecilia, Jorgeen Eksell, Maria Mansson, and Ola Thufvesson."The Narrative Rhythm of Terror: A Study of the Stockholm Terrorist Attack and The 'Last Night in Sweden' Event." *International Journal of Tourism Cities* 4, no.4(2018): 484-494.

Copeland, Simon. "Telling Stories of Terrorism: A Framework for Applying Narrative

Approaches to The Study of Militant's Self-Accounts." *Behavioral Sciences of Terrorism and*

Political Aggression 11, no. 3 (2019): 232-253.

Council of Europe. *"Counter-narratives to Terrorism."* Parliamentary Assembly. Resolution

2221 (2018). https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-en.asp?fileid=24810

Dawn. "Pakistan Army Launches 'Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad' across the Country." February 22,

2017. https://www.dawn.com/news/1316332

Dawn. "Govt Unveils 'Paigham-i-Pakistan' Fatwa Against Terrorism." January 16,2018.

https://www.dawn.com/news/1383306

Derrida, Jacques. *Of Grammatology.* Translated and edited by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak.

Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2016.

Derrida, Jacques. *Writing and Difference*. Translated by Alan Bass. London: The University of

Chicago, 1978.

Elliott, Jane. *Using Narrative in Social Research: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.*

London: Sage Publications, 2005.

Fahmy, Shahira S. "Media, Terrorism and Society: Perspectives and Trends in the Digital Age."

Mass Communication and Society 20, no.6 (2017): 735-739.

Fairclough, Norman. *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*. UK: Taylor &

Francis Routledge, 2003.

Fairclough, Norman. *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. London:

Longman Group Limited, 1995.

Fairclough, Norman. "CDA as Dialectical Reasoning." In *The Routledge Handbook of Critical Discourse Studies,* edited by John Flowerdew and John E. Richardson, 13-25. London: Routledge, 2017.

Fairclough, Norman. *Discourse and Social Change.* UK: Polity Press, 1992.

Fairclough, Norman. "Ideology and Identity Change in Political Television." In *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. 2nd ed. Oxon: Routledge, 2013.

Fairclough, Norman. "Intertextuality in Critical Discourse Analysis." *Linguistics and Education* 4, no. 3-4 (1992):269-293.

Fairclough, Norman. *Language and Power.* 3rd ed. New York: Routledge, 2015.

Fairclough, Norman. "The Dialectics of Discourse." *Textus* 14, no. 2 (2001): 231-242.

Feyyaz, Muhammad. "Conceptualising Terrorism Trend Patterns in Pakistan –an Empirical Perspective." *Perspectives on Terrorism* 7, no.1 (February 2013):73-102.

Freedman, Des, and Daya Kishan Thussu. "Introduction: Dynamics of Media and Terrorism." In *Media and Terrorism: Global Perspectives.* Edited by Des Freedman et al. London: Sage Publications, 2012.

Makki, Muhammad and Natasha Khan. "Critical Appraisal of Pakistan's Efforts in (Re) Constructing a National Narrative to Violent Extremism and Terrorism: A Case of Paigham-e-Pakistan." *Pakistan Journal of Terrorism Research* 1, no. 2 (2019):1-31.

Maqsood, Fawad. "National Narrative 'Paigham-E-Pakistan' A Right Step to End Terrorism: President." *Business Recorder,* January 16, 2018.https://www.brecorder.com/2018/01/16/393336/national-narrative-paigham-e-pakistan-a-right-step-to-end-terrorism-president/

Graef, Josefin, Raquel da Silva, and Nicolas Lemay-Hebert. "Narrative, Political Violence, and

Social Change." *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 43, no.6 (2018): 431-443.

https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2018.1452701.

Halliday, Michael Alexander Kirkwood and Ruqaiya Hasan. *Cohesion in English*. London:

Longman Group Ltd., 1976.

Hamid, Nafees. *Don't Just Counter-Message; Counter-Engage.* The Hague: International Centre

for Counter-Terrorism, 2018. https://icct.nl/publication/dont-just-counter-message-counter-

engage/

Hashmi, Arshi Saleem. "Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan: Defining a Common

Narrative." *Strategic Studies* 36, no. 3 (2016): 58-77.

Hassan, Mohamed Feisal Mohamed. "Investigating the Mind of a Terrorist: Grasping the Nexus

between Ideology and Narrative." *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 4, no. 5 (2012): 7-10.

Horgan, John. *The Psychology of Terrorism.* 2nd ed. Oxon: Routledge, 2014.

Hussain, Safdar. *Pakistan's Achievements in War On Terror but at What Cost: A Special Review

of the Current Decade*. Islamabad: Pak Institute for Peace Studies, 2019.

Hussain, Zahid. "Pakistan's Most Dangerous Place," *The Wilson Quarterly (1976-)* 36, no. 1
(2012): 16-21. Iqbal, Khuram, Saad Kalim, Zafar and Zahid Mehmood."Critical evaluation of
Pakistan's Counter-Narrative Efforts." *Journal of Policing, Intelligence and Counter
Terrorism* 14, no. 2 (2019): 147-163. https://doi.org/10.1080/18335330.2019.1574020

Iqbal, Muhammad. *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam.* Edited by. M. Saeed
Sheikh. Pakistan, Lahore: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, 2011.

Islamic Republic of Pakistan, *Paigham-e-Pakistan,* Researchers of Islamic Research Institute,

IIUI, Islamabad: International Islamic University, 2018.

Jamal, Umair. "Need for A Grand Counter-Narrative in Pakistan's Counterterrorism Strategy." *South Asian Voices,* June 9, 2017. https://southasianvoices.org/counternarrative-pakistan-counterterrorism-strategy/

Jerard, Jolene and Salim Mohamed Nasir. *Resilience and Resolve: Communities Against Terrorism*. Singapore: Imperial College Press, 2015.

Khalid, Rasheed. "Paigham-e-Pakistan a Shield Against Extremism: MNA." *News.* January 26,2019. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/423787-paigham-e-pakistan-a-shield-against-extremism-mna

Khan, Amil. *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism.* Washington DC: United States Institute of Peace, 2013.

Khan, M. Sheharyar. "Narrative of Counter-Narrative in Pakistan." *South Asian Voices,* July 13,2016. https://southasianvoices.org/narrative-of-counter-narrative-in-pakistan/

Khan, Tariq. "The Social, Political and Economic Effects of the War on Terror: Pakistan 2009 To 2011." *ISSRA PAPERS* V, no. I (2013): 65-88.

Klein, Harriet E. Manelis."Narrative." *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 9, no. 1/2 (1999): 167-69.

Kruglanski, Arie W., Jocelyn J. Bélanger, and Rohan Gunaratna.*The Three Pillars of Radicalization: Needs, Narratives, and Networks*. USA: Oxford University Press, 2019.

Kubiak, Anthony. "Spelling It Out: Narrative Typologies of Terror." *Studies in the Novel* 36, no. 3 (2004): 294-301.

Leuprecht Christian, Todd Hataley, Sophia Moskalenko, and Clark McCauley. "Winning the Battle but Losing the War? Narrative and Counter-Narratives Strategy." *Perspectives on Terrorism* 3, no. 2 (2009): 25-35.

Mahmood, Samantha and Halim Rane. "Islamist Narratives in ISIS Recruitment Propaganda." *The Journal of International Communication* 23, no. 1 (2017): 15-35.

Malik, Sadia. "Horizontal Inequalities and Violent Conflict in Pakistan: Is There a Link?" *Economic and Political Weekly* 44, no. 34 (2009): 21-24.

Maqsood, Fawad. "National Narrative 'Paigham-E-Pakistan' A Right Step to End Terrorism: President." *Business Recorder,* January 16, 2018.https://www.brecorder.com/2018/01/16/393336/national-narrative-paigham-e-pakistan-a-right-step-to-end-terrorism-president/

Ministry of Interior. Government of Pakistan. *National Internal Security Policy 2014-2018.* Pakistan: Ministry of Interior, 2014. https://nacta.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/National-Internal-Security-Policy-2014.pdf

Ministry of Interior. Government of Pakistan. *National Internal Security Policy 2018-2023.*Pakistan: Ministry of Interior, 2018.http://digitalrightsmonitor.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/National-Internal-Security-Policy-2018-2023-1.pdf

Nation. "Paigham-e-Pakistan key to Counter Terrorism." March 21,2018. https://nation.com.pk/21-Mar-2018/paigham-e-pakistan-key-to-counter-terrorism

National Counter Terrorism Authority [NACTA] Pakistan. "National Action Plan, 2014." https://nacta.gov.pk/nap-2014/

Nasr, S., V., R. "The Rise of Sunni Militancy in Pakistan: The Changing Role of Islamism and the Ulama in Society and Politics." *Modern Asian Studies* 34, no. 1 (2000): 139-80.

News. "Anti-extremism Narrative Be Made Part of Syllabus." January 30,2019. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/425382-anti-extremism-narrative-be-made-part-of-syllabus

News. "Workshop under Paigham e Pakistan Initiative Highlights Role of Faculty Members, Ulema in Peace-

Building." October 2, 2018. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/375466-workshop-highlights-role-of-faculty-members-ulema-in-peace-building

Norris, Christopher. *Deconstruction: Theory and Practice*. 3rd ed. London: Routledge, 2002.

Norris, Pippa, Montague, Kern, and Marion Just, eds. *Framing Terrorism: The News Media, The Government, And The Public.* New York: Routledge, 2003.

Ogun, Mehmet Nesip. *Terrorist Use of Cyberspace and Cyber Terrorism: New Challenges and Responses.* The Netherlands: IOS press, 2015.

Pakistan Institute for Conflict and Security Studies. ""Paigham-E-Pakistan to Be Incorporated into The Syllabus." January 28,2019. https://www.picss.net/paigham-e-pakistan-to-be-incorporated-into-the-syllabus/

Pakistan, Islamic Republic of. *Paigham-e-Pakistan.* Researchers of Islamic Research Institute, IIUI, Islamabad: International Islamic University, 2018.

Punday, Daniel. *Narrative After Deconstruction.* USA: SUNY Press, 2003.

Quiggin, Tom. "Understanding Al-Qaeda's Ideology for Counter-Narrative Work." *Perspectives on Terrorism* 3, no. 2 (2009): 18-24.

Rathore, Mujtaba and Abdul Basit."Trends and Patterns of Radicalization in Pakistan." *Conflict and Peace Studies* 3, no. 2 (2010): 15-32.

Ritzmann, Alexander and Marije Meines. *RAN Guidelines for Effective Alternative and Counter-Narrative Campaigns (GAMMMA+)*. Radicalisation Awareness Network, 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/networks/radicalisation_awareness_network/about-ran/ran-c-and-

n/docs/ran_cn_guidelines_effective_alternative_counter_narrative_campaigns_31_12_2017_en.pdf

Rosand, Eric, and Emily Winterbotham. "Do Counter-Narratives Actually Reduce Violent Extremism?" *Brookings*, March 20,2019. https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2019/03/20/do-counter-narratives-actually-reduce-violent-extremism/

Security Council. "Countering Violent Extremism." Counter-Terrorism Committee. n.d. https://www.un.org/sc/ctc/focus-areas/countering-violent-extremism/

UNDP, *Preventing Violent Extremism Through Promoting Inclusive Development, Tolerance and Respect for Diversity: A Development Response to Addressing Radicalization and Violent Extremism* (New York: United Nations Development Programme, 2016).

van Dijk, Teun A. "Multidisciplinary CDA: A Plea for Diversity." In *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis,* edited by Ruth Wodak and Michael Meyer, 95-120. London: Sage Publications, 2001.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Aims of Critical Discourse Analysis." *Japanese Discourse* 1, no. 1 (1995): 17-27.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Social Cognition, Social Power and Social Discourse." *Text &Talk* 8, no. 1-2 (1988): 129-157.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Discourse and Manipulation." *Discourse & Society* 17, no. 2 (2006): 359-383.

Welch, Tyler. "Theology, Heroism, Justice, and Fear: An analysis of ISIS Propaganda Magazines Dabiq and Rumiyah." *Dynamics of Asymmetric Conflict* 11, no. 3 (2018): 186-198.

Wenden, Anita L. "The Politics of Representation: A Critical Discourse Analysis of an Aljazeera Special Report." *International Journal of Peace Studies* 10, no.2 (2005): 89-112.

Zahid, Farhan. "Waiting for Resurgence: Al-Qaeda Core in Pakistan." *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 9, no. 9 (2017): 1-4. http://www.jstor.org/stable/26351549

Zahid, Farhan. "Deconstructing Thoughts and Worldviews of Militant Ideologue Mufti Nizamuddin Shamzai." *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* 10, no. 7 (2018): 8-11.

Zeiger, Sara, and Anne Aly. *Countering Violent Extremism: Developing an Evidence-base for Policy and Practice.* Australia: Curtin University, 2015.

Zima, Peter V. *Deconstruction and Critical Theory*. Translated by Rainer Emig. London: Continuum, 2002.

Plagiarism report

A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistan's Counter-Narrative: Paigham-e-Pakistan